

HUMAN TRAFFICKING, PROSTITUTION AND PUBLIC OPINION IN HUNGARY: INTERVIEWS WITH HUNGARIAN UNIVERSITY STUDENTS

By

Margaret Farmer

Submitted to
Central European University
Department of Political Science

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Arts

First Supervisor: Judit Sándor
Second Supervisor: Andrea Petö

Budapest, Hungary

(2010)

Abstract

Once called a bridge between the East and West, situated on the outermost border of the EU, Hungary is an origin, transit and destination country for human trafficking, with an estimated 150,000 persons trafficked through, to and out of Hungary every year. The majority of these victims are trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation, primarily in prostitution, a controversial subject that remains mired in debate. Yet, many argue that the Hungarian government continues to ignore the extent of this phenomenon, and is not dedicating the necessary resources to combating it; in fact they continue to punish street prostitutes, violating their human rights, and ignoring the possibility that they are victims of exploitation and trafficking. Acknowledging the lack of information on public opinion on these issues, this research conducts interviews with twenty-six Hungarian university students residing in Budapest, to discover their attitudes, and the extent of their awareness. By investigating public opinion this research seeks to draw attention, and empathy towards the plight of prostitutes and victims of trafficking in Hungary, finding that the students relate most strongly with the sex work paradigm, and have only very limited knowledge about the deeper intersectionality of factors that lead women into prostitution, and into the hands of traffickers.

Acknowledgments

I would like to express my thanks to the following persons:

My advisors Judit Sándor, and Andrea Petö for their knowledge, thoughtful comments, and support to conduct this research,

Gyorgy Endrey and Adrienn Tothpal for their generous time, being beside me in the field, and revealing the universities of Budapest to me,

Andrea Matolcsi for her support in researching what I believed in, and endless information,

All the professors who helped me along the way, and facilitated me with access to their students,

The students for sharing their thoughts and experiences with me,

And finally, I thank my family, my friends, and Stefan, for their support along the whole path, from moving to Budapest on day one.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	i
Acknowledgments	ii
List of Abbreviations	iv
Introduction	1
Chapter 1. Background on Hungary	4
1.1 Trafficking in Hungary	4
1.2 Prostitution in Hungary	8
Chapter 2. Literature Review	11
2.1 Country Level Analysis.....	11
2.2 The Prostitution Debate.....	13
2.2.1 Reflections in Hungary.....	14
2.2.2 Double Oppression: Risk Factors, and Public Opinion.....	17
2.3 The Value of Public Opinion.....	19
Chapter 3. Methodology	23
3.1 Theoretical Background	23
3.2 Subpopulation of Hungary: University Students Residing in Budapest	24
3.3 Interview Context: “Natural Context”.....	27
3.4 Frame Analysis and Narrative Analysis.....	27
3.5 Prostitution: Meaning Construction and Gender	30
3.6 Interviewing Methodology Specifics	32
Chapter 4. Data and Analysis	35
4.1 Data Basics: The Sample.....	35
4.1.1 Language : Surpassing the Barrier	37
4.1.2 Level of Engagement	38
4.2 Setting the Stage: The Importance of Paralinguistics	38
4.3 Inter-Group Differences	40
4.4 A System of Perplexity, A Theme of Perplexity	42
4.5 Continued Penalization	43
4.6 Prostitution and the Media	44
4.7 The Causes of Prostitution: “Money,” and Many Not Understood.....	45
4.8 Understanding the Client.....	49
4.9 Visible Street Prostitution, and the Internet	51
4.10 Attitudes on the future.....	52
4.11 Trafficking: Seeking a Definition	56
4.12 Trafficking and the Media	58
4.13 Trafficking in Hungary: The Students Opinion.....	59
4.14 A Search for Causes and Solutions	60
Chapter 5. Conclusion	62
Bibliography	69
Appendix I: The Interview	75
Appendix II: List of Interviewees	77
Appendix III: Four Models of Prostitution in the EU, as defined by Transcrime, 2005.....	79
Appendix III: Hungarian Law on Human Trafficking	80
Appendix V: Hungarian Law on Prostitution And Related Offenses	82

List of Abbreviations

1. HPIPA – The Hungarian Prostitutes Interest Protection Association
2. MONA – Foundation for the Women of Hungary
3. NANE – Hungarian Women’s Right Association
4. OSCE – Organization for Security Cooperation in Europe
5. OHIDR - Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights of the OSCE
6. UNODC – United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
7. ENATW - European Network Against Trafficking in Women
8. CATW – Coalition Against Trafficking in Women

Introduction

Once called a bridge between the East and West, situated on the outermost border of the European Union, Hungary is recognized as an origin, transit and destination country for human trafficking, with an estimated 150,000 persons trafficked through, to and out of Hungary every year.¹ Aside from turning persons to numbers in a crime where the number of victims is truly inestimable,² we do know that the majority are women and girls, trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation in its many forms, such as forced labor in stripping, pornography, or peep shows, but most commonly, prostitution.³ In 2008, the head of the human trafficking Bureau of the Hungarian Police said, “90% of [trafficking] cases are related to prostitution.”⁴ His quote verifies in Hungary the inherent interconnectivity between trafficking of women and girls, and prostitution, a correlation that is the subject of enormous debate and research within the global human trafficking literature, and international public space.

In 1993, the Hungarian parliament decriminalized prostitution, yet in 1999, with the creation of Anti- Mafia legislation, a provision on tolerance zones “reintroduced the legal possibility of punishment of prostitutes,” as street prostitution became only condoned in these areas.⁵ Thus, the criminality of street prostitution was caught in the balance as they could now

¹ US Department of State. 2004. Country Narratives Europe and Eurasia, Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2004*. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2004/33192.htm> (accessed June 1, 2010).

² Note: UNESCO reports illuminate that because of its nature as an illegal activity, like other trafficking statistics, the true figures are widely speculated and unknown.

³ *Trafficking in Persons Report 2004, and 2009*. Recognizing the large amounts of other types of trafficking and prostituted peoples, women and girls trafficked for prostitution, and women and girls within prostitution will be the specific focus of this research, as they are the primary trafficked, and primary prostituted group. - US Department of State. 2009. Gender Imbalance in Human Trafficking. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009: Topics of Special Interest*. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/123128.htm>.

⁴ Pecon, Pedro. 2008. Buda-Sex and the Hungarian Porn Industry. *CafeBabel.com*. <http://www.cafebabel.co.uk/article/24888/budapest-sex-pornography-industry-prostitution.html> (accessed December 20, 2009)

⁵ Matolcsi, Andrea. 2009. Conference organized by the Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia, November 23, 2009: Situation of trafficking and prostitution in Hungary in the areas of legislation, victim assistance, government efforts and mechanisms and representation in the media. Zagreb: Centre for Women War Victims.

face a misdemeanor for “standing in the wrong place,”⁶ and in 2006, a Princeton report found that this legislation has been difficult to implement correctly, as even police officials are confused as to its exact legal status.⁷ Ten years later, with this debate still unsolved, the lives of thousands of prostituted women, and an uncountable number of victims of trafficking who are affected by the law, and actions of law enforcement, still hang in the balance. IGO and government reports show that prostitutes continue to be treated like criminals, and denied the feminist notion of citizenship. This research seeks to investigate the extent of public awareness, and understanding about these issues in Hungary, as many scholars, such as Aidan Wilcox, argue that public opinion on prostitution is “an area that requires further scrutiny.”⁸ This research will attempt to understand what level of public policy awareness the public has about these issues, as well as public attitudes and opinions towards prostitution and trafficking. Using a subpopulation of Hungarian society, specifically university students residing in Budapest from four Hungarian universities, I will seek to find whether a dominant social paradigm exists, and how these two topics are framed, and whether separately and/or connectedly in the minds of Hungary’s educated young people. This research will explain the most important debate in the prostitution and sex trafficking literature: that between the sex work and radical feminists. Over the last century, each side has sculpted out a paradigm, created of values, beliefs, and desired norms, of which they use to influence government and society, and change policy to their beliefs. Even as the polarized civil society actors work earnestly to shift policy, it remains stagnant, drawing the focus to the people to see

⁶ Matolcsi, Andrea. 2009. Conference organized by the Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia, November 23, 2009: Situation of trafficking and prostitution in Hungary in the areas of legislation, victim assistance, government efforts and mechanisms and representation in the media. Zagreb: Centre for Women War Victims.

⁷ Choudhury and others. 2005. *Challenges Facing Law Enforcement Officers in Combatting Sex Trafficking in Hungary: How Laws, Structure, and Culture Prevent Effective Intervention*. Princeton: Princeton University. http://www.princeton.edu/research/special_reports/trafficking.pdf. As a very important text to this research, it will be referenced as “the Princeton Study” throughout the paper.

⁸ Wilcox, Aidan, et al. 2009. Tackling the demand for prostitution: a rapid evidence assessment of the published research literature. *The Home Office*. <http://rds.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/pdfs09/horr27c.pdf>

what should and will come next; the paradigm that has been more influential on the beliefs of Hungary's youth will determine the future. The question of what the youth know and what attitudes they hold demands attention, and greater understanding as reform is needed for the protection of the human rights of prostituted women and men. As the UNODC argued about human trafficking, "policy can be effective if it is evidence-based, and so far the evidence has been scanty."⁹

⁹ United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, UNODC. 2009. Global Report on Trafficking in Persons: Executive Summary. http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Executive_summary_english.pdf

Chapter 1. Background on Hungary

1.1 Trafficking in Hungary

Hungary, as a post-communist country in the region of Central and Eastern Europe, shares with other states of this region a common phenomenon as concerns trafficking. After post-communism regime change, and continuing into their transitional periods, the devastating state of the economies, as well as other social and economic changes, combined with the new opportunities for movement of resources, and migration, resulted in an exponential increase in the number of female trafficking victims coming from these countries, arriving in these countries, and moving within these countries. The region continues to be one of the most recognized for human trafficking, especially of women for sexual exploitation. The fact that the majority of trafficked women and girls end up working in the sex industry exhibits the inherent and inseparable attachment of trafficking and prostitution, and when speaking of the trafficking of women for sexual exploitation, we cannot separate prostitution as factor, force, industry, or idea.

Hungary formally made “the sale, exchange, delivery, taking over, and acquiring other persons against compensation” illegal acts punishable by law in their criminal code only as late 1998, coming into force in 1999.¹⁰ Three years later, in 2002, the Hungarian legislation was refined to conform to the aforementioned UN Protocol, creating a new definition of trafficking as “any person who sells, purchases, conveys or receives another person, or exchanges a person for another person, also the person, who recruits, transports, houses, hides or appropriates people for such purposes for another party, is guilty of felony, punishable by imprisonment not to exceed

¹⁰ IOM. Regulating Migration: Hungarian Legislation. *IOM Regional Office in Budapest*. <http://www.iom.hu/bpprojects/rm.html>

three years.”¹¹ The *UN Protocol* on trafficking that informed, and directly affected the Hungarian legislation was a supplement to the *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime*. Yet many sources, such as the US State Dept, and various NGO’s, argue that Hungary is not complying with its duties laid out in these treaties, or paying adequate resources and attention to enforcing these laws. The trafficking situation is deteriorating, with the 2009 US Trafficking in Persons, or TIP Report decreasing Hungary’s status from a Tier 1, to a Tier 2 state.¹² In terms of the Report this means that Hungary is no longer complying with the minimum standards of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act, TVPA, which is an U.S. congressional act that outlines efforts taken in the areas of prevention, prosecution, and protection of victims, with which they use to evaluate other countries.

Jyoti Sanghera notes that in the absence of specific trafficking laws, prostitution laws can be used by states to criminalize trafficking.¹³ This use is positive as criminalization of trafficking is facilitated by these laws, shaped by some basic structural mechanism, and can begin within a country. Yet, this is also negative because they are not synonymous, and trafficking needs its own mechanisms and separation from prostitution in written law, enforcement, and awareness amongst both law officers and citizens, for many reasons such as the recognition of cases as trafficking, and their statistical recording, so that country analysis, comparison, and international studies can be facilitated. Sanghera notes that using prostitution laws to fight trafficking can alert the state that new laws need to be made to combat forced sexual labor as opposed to consensual.¹⁴ Yet, this is not the case in Hungary. The Princeton study (2006) shows that the police do still not yet understand the complete definition of trafficking, and thus fail to

¹¹ IOM. Regulating Migration: Hungarian Legislation. *IOM Regional Office in Budapest*. <http://www.iom.hu/bpprojects/rm.html>

¹² US Department of State. 2009. Tier Placements. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*.

¹³ Sanghera, Jyoti. 2005. Unpacking the Trafficking Discourse. In *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered*. Boulder: Paradigm Publishers.

¹⁴ Ibid.

recognize cases of trafficking when they have them. They often file them under crimes such as pimping, or pandering. The police also fail to recognize many cases of trafficking altogether, or see them as serious, criminal issues. For example, they do not recognize prostitution of underage girls as a major problem,¹⁵ concurrently paying a girl between 14-18 years of age for sex is not a crime in Hungary.¹⁶

The Princeton study, a valuable resource as the only in-depth, academic study done on the opinions and knowledge of government officials and law enforcement on trafficking in Hungary exposes the problem of trafficking as one demanding increased attention, and understanding by the law enforcement body in Hungary. Organizations such as the IOM, NANE, and MONA have begun to give seminars to police on trafficking that have been viewed favorably.¹⁷ They have succeeded in reaching a substantial number of officers, and yet the study shows that even after training, some officers were unable to recognize certain trafficking cases. Yet, we cannot know if the public feels and is informed in a similar, troubling manner, as author Mary Buckley explains, “the growing literature on human trafficking lacks survey data on citizens’ attitudes towards it in states of origin.”¹⁸ For these reasons, I argue that the phenomena of trafficking demands greater attention and recognition by all of society, beginning with the government, and as this research will examine, the need for the media needing to step up its roll as government watchdog and social informer and protector. The police and the government need to realize the gravity of these crimes against women. The population can be a powerful force in motivating the government to act on an issue that continues to be ignored despite the persistence of IGO’s, international and

¹⁵ Choudhury, and others, 2005.

¹⁶ CATW. 2004. From Budapest to Prague. *Coalition Report*. p. 4.
<http://action.web.ca/home/catw/attach/catw04newsletter1.pdf>

¹⁷ MONA. 2010. *Legal and institutional conditions for combating prostitution and trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation– Hungarian and international experiences, March 9th, 2010* Budapest: MONA.

¹⁸ Alikhadzhieva, I.S. 2009. Public Opinion About Prostitution and Measures to Prevent It. *Sociological Research* 48 (4): 82–90.

local NGO's, and other forces such as the US Department of State. It is imperative that these cases begin to be recognized, filed, and prosecuted under human trafficking legislation so the government, and other organizations can be able to review the number of true trafficking victims identified a year (adding those who are not recognized), as well as the number of prosecutions in order to measure effectiveness of the policies over time, comparisons with other states, and any alleviation or intensification of the causes of trafficking in Hungary and abroad. The number of prosecutions that *are* followed through and recorded by the state have disconcertedly fallen between 2003 and 2007, when it is very unlikely the extent of trafficking has also fallen during these years.¹⁹ Out of fifteen European countries in a study from 2009, Hungary had the lowest rate of convictions per 100,000 people at .24 (compared to .844 for Romania, or 1.95 for the Czech Republic.)²⁰ UNODC data also show that from 2005-2007 around 60 Hungarian victims were recovered from three different European countries, (not even including the amount of unrecovered victims, or those unrecognized as trafficking cases, as well as the victims trafficked to the Middle East, the US, and the Far East.) Yet, there is no such evidence that trafficking is happening any less in Hungary. In fact, the UNODC shows that Hungary as an origin country is not slowing at all with "Germany and the Netherlands register[ing] a peak in the identification of Hungarian victims in 2007 and 2008, respectively,"²¹ with Hungarian victims being amongst the highest registered groups. These data demand that Hungary acknowledge that there are traffickers who must be prosecuted, as well as trafficked victims who need protection. Instead, in 2008 they did the opposite, and canceled the lease of one of only two centers for victim recovery in Hungary, offering the organization a building far outside of the city, that cannot serve its

¹⁹ United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, UNODC. 2009. Trafficking in Persons; Analysis on Europe. *UNODC*. 7, http://www.ungift.org/docs/ungift/pdf/humantrafficking/Trafficking_in_Persons_in_Europe-Final_09.pdf

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 9.

²¹ *Ibid.*, 14.

needs.²² Also, the Princeton report exposes that before any thought of punishment of the prostitute takes place, the fact of whether he/she is trafficked and/or underage needs to be investigated, and that is not what we see happening now.²³

1.2 Prostitution in Hungary

After noting prostitution's connection with trafficking, we now turn to understanding the legal framework of prostitution in Hungary. In 1993, after years of being criminal under communism, prostitution was decriminalized. In her book *Magyar Women*, author Chris Corrin explains that during the transition period prostitution and pornography became extremely widespread²⁴. After the major growth of these industries over the years, the state desired to reach the lost tax income, and in 1999, within the creation of an Anti-Mafia law additional legislation on prostitution was created.²⁵ The aim of this legislation was to increase lost state revenues from organized crime, acknowledging prostitution's connection with organized crime, and to help the situation of prostituted women in Hungary. Thus prostitution was framed in the context of organized crime, as a part of it, but not as a serious criminal or punishable part, just as a by-product, that deserved separate judgment.²⁶ Although the act of the prostitute is not a crime, pimping, pandering, and the promotion or advertising of prostitution are criminalized. A Transcrime/EU report states that since 2000, the Hungarian legal model of prostitution can be

²² US Department of State. 2009. Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*.

²³ Choudhury, and others, 2005.

²⁴ Pine Frances. Review of *Magyar Women: Hungarian Women's Lives 1960s-1990s* by C. Corrin, *The Slavonic and East European Review*, Vol. 74, No. 2 (Apr., 1996), pp. 377-379

²⁵ The complete name of the law in English is "The 1999 LXXV law about the steps to be taken against organized crime and related phenomena and about the modification of laws connected to it" (*Hungarian Official Gazette*. Magyar Közlöny (MK) 1999/60, p.3967)

²⁶ Farkas, Zita. 2004. The Critical Points of the Hungarian Prostitution Law: Organized Crime, Morality and the Invisibility of the Client. *Gender Studies*, (03): 118-134.

classified as regulatonism, despite the fact prostitutes can still be “punished by being placed in custody or a fine of up to HUF 150.000,-.”²⁷

Today in Hungary, a report from the Sex Worker’s Rights Advocacy Network (SWAN) from 2009 claims that there are 15,000 prostitutes currently working (while other more outdated sources claim 10,000, and some claim 20,000, although as repeatedly stated, no state research is done.) SWAN also makes the claim that 10-15 percent of them are forced workers, but do not cite a source for this information.²⁸ SWAN, in representing sex workers, has no interest in promoting forced prostitution, in fact it is entirely negative publicity for all claims they promote, therefore the fact that they quoted a figure as high as 10-15 percent, and they also do a substantial amount of contact work with prostitutes, serves as a seriously alarming figure, a true call for concern.

The problem with the legal system concerns street prostitution, due to a part of the law that mandated that visible prostitution was only legal in zones of tolerance to be created ‘based on need,’ of which none were ever created nation-wide. In an interview with Ágnes Földi, the chairperson of the Association for the Protection of The Interest of Hungarian Prostitutes, or HPIPA she explained how her organization brought the state to court in 2001, stating that “those politicians still unwilling to bring the law into force can be accused of infringement of the law by delay (Trencsényi: Népszabadság, 2002.06.07).”²⁹ Winning in the first court, the HPIPA finally lost in 2004, with the state deciding that local governments did not have an obligation to create the zones.³⁰

Földi also corroborated the reports that prostitutes continue to be harassed and penalized at

²⁷ Transcrime. 2005 Study on National Legislation on Prostitution and the Trafficking in Women and Children. *Transcrime*. Brussels: European Parliament. For more information on the classification of legal models of prostitution see Appendix III.

²⁸ Sex Workers’ Rights Advocacy Network in Central and Eastern Europe, SWAN. Hungarian Sex Workers talk to the Press on December 17th. SWAN. <http://swannet.org/node/1684>.

²⁹ Farkas, 24.

³⁰ Interview with Ágnes Földi,. May 25, 2010. Budapest, Hungary.

times by police when found on the street, “sometimes they are good [the police], sometimes they are bad, but mostly they do this,” she stated.³¹ Földi also told a narrative of a small town where the prostitutes follow all the regulations, “they give receipts, they pay bills, they have accounts,” yet the police know “they are living from their sex job,” so they are always oppressing them, “they do not let them live in peace, and do everything to bother them.”³² Thus street prostitutes found outside of these zones continue to be treated like criminals, with police reporting that they continue to fine or jail prostitutes who cannot pay, for unknown amounts of time. MONA estimates that they are arresting hundreds of women a year, based on the arrest reports, although the police do not formally record any of these statistics so like most related statistics, they are unknown.³³ Although not a crime (it is listed in the administrative rules) this misdemeanor or petty offence leads to accounts of police harassment, blackmailing, and corruption, such as demand of use of prostitute’s services in exchange for avoiding the penalties. In one painful account from the European Roma Rights Centre, Roma street prostitutes from Debrecen were victims of severe police harassment, extortion, and brutal violence. Describing their painful experiences in interviews, they told of the police robbing them of their money, taking them to the station, and searching them to nudity if they did not submit, and using possession of condoms to incriminate them, leading street prostitutes to avoid carrying condoms, obviously accentuating the risks to their health.³⁴

³¹ Interview with Ágnes Földi, May 25, 2010. Budapest, Hungary.

³² Ibid.

³³ MONA. 2010. *Legal and institutional conditions for combating prostitution and trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation– Hungarian and international experiences, March 9th, 2010* Budapest: MONA.

³⁴ European Roma Rights Center, ERRC. 2004. You're lucky you are at home" - Testimony by Romani prostitutes in Hajdúhadház, eastern Hungary. *ERRC*. <http://www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=1515>

Chapter 2. Literature Review

This literature review will seek to identify and explain the necessary elements concerning why public opinion research in Hungary is needed about these issues, and in what context this research will fit in the human trafficking/prostitution literature. First, I argue that the primary focus of human trafficking research remains at the international level, or regional level, highlighting a need for state or local level research, with an acknowledged lack of information on Hungary in general. Second, I will explain the prostitution debate, and how it can be used to frame the current state and future of Hungary's prostitution policies. Finally, I will explain what is known about public opinion towards these issues, and then why this research is important to Hungary right now, using authors who illuminate the necessity of public opinion in the formation of informed, responsive policies within a democratic state. The situation in Hungary clearly expresses a need for public opinion awareness and input at this stage of stagnant indecision that is severely hurting the human rights of one specific societal group, within which many intersectional identities are expressed; it is arguably essential for government attention and policy reform.

2.1 Country Level Analysis

As an international problem requiring inter-state solutions, much attention is paid to the international perspective, with an acknowledged lack of detailed research being created on a particular state. The Transcrime report, 2005 claims that "It is almost axiomatic for papers reviewing trafficking to lament the huge lack of statistics and to call for research to fill the many lacunae."³⁵ Confounding the problem of lack of data, global debates persist over the framing of

³⁵ Transcrime. 2005. Study on National Legislation on Prostitution and the Trafficking in Women and Children. *Transcrime*. Brussels: European Parliament. 2.

human trafficking in international treaties; with the most pervasive debate being fought over what effects the prostitution legal model has on the level of human trafficking within a country. Yet, the focus remains on the world map, or even regional maps, creating obvious gaps in research on human trafficking analysis within a specific state. Hungary holds an important, and unique, position within Europe as concerns human trafficking. It is not only an origin country like the countries to its east, but also a destination country like the states to its west, as well as acting as a transit country in between.^{36 37} The situation clearly demands increased attention, yet the Transcrime report, 2005 classifies Hungary in the lowest category concerning level of trafficking data available, as a “low reliability” state.³⁸ The literature clearly illuminates that much research remains to be done on the correlation between prostitution and human trafficking in Hungary, as well as the two topics separately. Many areas lack substantial attention, or any attention at all. Gender expert Anna Betlen, from the Foundation for the Women of Hungary, or MONA, claims that there are no scientific explorations on the lives, history and motivations of prostituted persons.³⁹ There is no regular information about trafficked women and children to Hungary from abroad, or from Hungary to abroad. There is no information on the scale, structure, or activities of the sex industry. In addition, there is also no research done on the client side. Betlen and other experts claim that the government is not making an effort to collect statistics, and other data on

³⁶ US Department of State. 2009. Country Narratives D-K, Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2009*. Washington D.C.: US Department of State.

³⁷ For the purposes of this research trafficking will be defined according to the *UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, of 2000* as: “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (article 3 a).” For a copy of the entire Protocol see:

http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/convention_%20traff_eng.pdf3

³⁸ Transcrime. 2005. Study on National Legislation on Prostitution and the Trafficking in Women and Children. Transcrime. Brussels: European Parliament. ix.

³⁹ Betlen, Anna. 2006. *ENATW Workshop: Trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation-prostitution in Hungary*. Budapest: ENATW.

these issues. In the same report for European Network Against Trafficking in Women [hereinafter ENATW] she claimed that due to a lack of reliable Hungarian information, scholars had to rely on the US government TIP report for time-continuous, current information. Major research gaps exist and this project seeks to take a very small step towards answering the question of what the public knows, and feels about the issue, with the parallel belief that lack of public awareness can also be a contributing factor to the poor situation of prostitutes in Hungary.

2.2 The Prostitution Debate

Outside (and inside) of government reports, feminist literature provides the bulk of human trafficking research, with the most profound recurrent influence in this literature being the debate over prostitution regulation/legalization/decriminalization on what side of the spectrum, vs. prohibition/abolition on the other. For this reason, it is necessary to understand this frame of prostitution legality/illegality that serves as a major informant to this important discourse on prostitution policies themselves, as well as the trafficking of women. Recent authors have begun to be united in their argument that it is hindering anti-trafficking cooperation between relevant entities, and effective legislation creation and reform, often with proposed calls for paradigm change. On one side, the radical feminists define all sex-work as forced labor, violence against women and a threat to gender equality, believing that it must be abolished completely. They can be divided into the prohibitionist, or abolitionist camps. Feminist activists were united under this paradigm until the 1970's with the creation of the prostitute's rights movements.⁴⁰ Originally beginning as an acknowledgment of the many forms of oppression against prostitutes, and their "dire economic necessity," the split became solidified in the 1980's when the sex-work feminists

⁴⁰ Jeffreys, Sheila. 1997. *The Idea of Prostitution*. North Melbourne: Spinifex Press. 66.

began advocating for full legalization, and the recognition of sex work as any other type of work.⁴¹

The research of Andrea Matolcsi focused on how the prostitution discourse influenced the work of NGO's in Hungary.⁴² She identifies six NGO's in Hungary who participate in activities related to both prostitution and trafficking, with 4 being manifestly abolitionist, one seeking neutrality, and with HPIPA being the only regulationist. She argues that almost all the organizations were active in awareness raising, namely for prevention of potential victims, but the abolitionist NGO's also conducted awareness raising directed at society in general, mostly aimed at decreasing demand for prostitution.⁴³ Observably, these NGO's have sought to spread public information about the dangers of trafficking and its connections to prostitution. Of course, this research makes no attempts at a connection between the actions of the NGO's and public opinion, but it is merely informative to know that attempts have been made to educate Hungarian society on these issues, despite lack of government effort, and searching for whether their arguments or narratives have reached the population.

2.2.1 Reflections in Hungary

Personally, I argue that prostitution is a word whose definition and surrounding controversy, remains a thorn in the foot of human trafficking. This thorn makes progression difficult, especially between academics, and the NGO's who frame the debate, and are the most active in the field, working directly with the women, and informing and influencing the policy discourse. These same debates have played out in Hungary during the creation of the Anti-Mafia

⁴¹ Ibid, 66.

⁴² Matolcsi, Andrea, "Discourses on Prostitution and Non Governmental Organizations Dealing With Trafficking In Hungary," MA diss, Central European University, 2006.

⁴³ Matolcsi, Andrea, "Discourses on Prostitution and Non Governmental Organizations Dealing With Trafficking In Hungary," MA diss, Central European University, 2006.

law, as well as the decade since, as actors on both sides of the discourse seek to influence the government, knowing that the current policies are not working effectively, or as they were supposedly expected to. HPIPA is the most outspoken advocate of the regulationist point of view in Hungary, demanding an extension of regulationist policies, while other NGO's such as the Woman's Foundation of Hungary, or MONA are abolitionist and do not want to further extend the law to demand creation of these zones, but would rather retract the legalization of the prostitution system (save decriminalization of the prostitute).^{44 45} This research seeks to identify which view the public identifies with. Yet, the larger issue is not whether prostitution is legalized or not, the most important fact, aside from moral/immoral concerns that seem to grasp the debate, is the violence and oppression against Hungarian prostitutes, and calling attention to human rights violations. According to major human rights conventions such as the New York Convention and the CEDAW convention of which the 6th article states that Hungary has an obligation to "suppress traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women in all its forms."⁴⁶ Yet, authors and activists such as Juhasz and Wirth argue that in Hungary, the legislation continues to contribute to prostitute's exploitation, evidenced in examples such as that the crime of pimping is not even clearly defined, in a law for organized crime, and neither are officials able to recognize all examples of pimping as exploitation in interviews, and the state continues to penalize prostitutes financially, thus the exploitation continues in many forms, one being by the state.⁴⁷

"There is a lot we don't know. We don't know barely anything about Hungary. We don't know how to change the lack of information in public opinion," Betlen said in a human

⁴⁴ For more information on HPIPA see www.prostitutaltak.hu

⁴⁵ For more information on MONA see <http://www.mona-hungary.hu/object.1bb6ec79-ceba-4812-a28b-9691456b58df.ivy>

⁴⁶ Juhász, G. & Wirth, J. 2002. How does the Hungarian state violate the human rights of women in case of prostitution? *Movement for a Prostitution-Free Hungary*. In Hungarian at <http://prostitutacio.hu/cedaw.arnyekjelentes.prostitutacio.reszlet.html>

⁴⁷ Ibid.

trafficking conference in Budapest in February, 2010. According to Betlen, public opinion is uninformed, misinformed, and out of touch with the reality of prostitute's lives.⁴⁸ She claims that the public believes prostitutes choose it freely, can come and go as they wish, and that they use the activity for supplemental income, or only occasionally.⁴⁹

The aforementioned Princeton study further corroborated these beliefs in their 2006 research. This study done in cooperation with ENATW, and for the US Department of State's TIP report provides a dependable resource for understanding what is known about public opinion in Hungary on these issues right now. Even though it is focused on law enforcement and government officials, its use as a resource of comparison to a sample of Hungary's student population is incomparable. The law enforcement officials and officers exhibited misinformed, or uninformed beliefs about subjects from the definition of trafficking, to legal age of consent, to a prostitute's everyday situation. There was a common belief that they freely chose the job because it was good money, unaware of the underlying social, cultural, and economic hardships they faced, and intersectionality of factors whose complexity remain hidden. Many expressed the great amount of money to be made within it, and the prospects of finding rich men.⁵⁰ My research demands what the opinions of Hungary's young and educated actually hold. Are they as salient as Betlen argues? Betlen also says that the public doesn't know what to accept, what to belief as true based on the debate between the two opposing sides. She argues that the sex workers advocates present a powerful argument to the youth, about free choice, and control of one's own body. She says that young people "see it as a job."⁵¹ Betlen did not have studies to cite (to my knowledge) when she quoted these views, which makes her comments seem to welcome verification. Yet, the

⁴⁸ Betlen, Anna. 2006.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Ibid. and Choudhury and others. 2005. *Challenges Facing Law Enforcement Officers in Combatting Sex Trafficking in Hungary: How Laws, Structure, and Culture Prevent Effective Intervention*. Princeton University.

⁵¹ Betlen, Anna. 2006.

Princeton study shows that the police do not cooperate with NGO's, they do not cooperate with other agencies or bureaus. They do not do research, or studies, or have specific standards and organized protocols that facilitate communication and cooperation. The institutions and norms are lacking, such as rehabilitation centers or other services for victims, and any funding as well.⁵²

Many experts also recognize substantial gender inequality in the region as one of the primary reasons underlying prostitution as well as trafficking, but public opinion does not seem to be aware of this. For example, Chris Corrin argues that the abuse of women's human rights in these countries largely result from the "degraded status of women."⁵³ This factor is one of the most influential in leading women into the hands of traffickers, and/or into 'choosing',⁵⁴ prostitution in general. Discrimination against women from early age and on the job market, violence against women and girls, and the low status of women in general, are said to have contributed to the feminization of poverty in this region, and a condition of substantial gender inequality, much to the consternation of related women's organizations such as NANE, MONA, ENATW or CATW.

2.2.2 Double Oppression: Risk Factors, and Public Opinion

Facing an aforementioned lack of country specific information about prostitute's lives in Hungary, it is still important to try and understand the reality of prostitute's lives, as a means of comparison with the attitudes and beliefs of the public. I argue that an analysis of prostitution data from a wide range of other countries can provide information inferable to Hungary. After a survey of 785 prostitutes from nine countries, *The Initiative against Sexual Trafficking*, found

⁵² Taken from Choudhury and others, 2005 as well as conversations with Andrea Matolcsi of MONA.

⁵³ Corrin, Chris. 2005. Transitional Road for Traffic: Analysing Trafficking in Women from and through Central and Eastern Europe. *Europe-Asia Studies* 57 (4): 543-560.

⁵⁴ I put 'choosing' within asterisks as many radical feminists scholars do not see the move to prostitution as taken for granted as a choice. The essence of choice is the nucleus of the debate. Radical feminists see it as a forced choice, due to the conditions noted above.

that 89% of them wanted to escape prostitution.⁵⁵ 68% of the same sample fit the criteria for post-traumatic stress disorder, with the severity of symptoms comparable to “combat veterans, battered women seeking shelter, rape survivors and refugees from state-organized torture.”⁵⁶ A US report that followed 2,000 prostitutes over a 30-year period argues that their results reflect circumstances of the entire US as well as “many other countries.”⁵⁷ It cites the most common causes of death as “homicide, suicide, drug and alcohol related problems, HIV infection and accidents – in that order,” with the homicide rate being 17 times higher than among the general population of equal age, which is similar to results for cause of death found in other state statistics.⁵⁸

On top of the many other noted risk factors present in prostitute’s lives, historically, public opinion has also contributed to this cycle of oppression and abuse. Throughout history, prostitutes have been viewed as outsiders, the “others”, dirty, immoral, diseased, loose, undeserving women, resulting in social exclusion. Essentially, prostitutes are excluded from the notions of citizenship and community belonging. Even the clients with whom they work, converse, and live, usually deny visiting them. Their lives are ignored, historically excluded from public dialogue, and from media coverage. They are ignored by people on the street, like homeless persons. Because of the stigma of public opinion on their lives and work, they usually choose to conceal their true life for fear of further exclusion. Author Peter Dahlgren tells us that

⁵⁵ Initiative against Sexual Trafficking, IAST. Sexual Trafficking Facts. *IAST*. <http://www.iast.net/thefacts.htm>

⁵⁶ Farley, M. (Ed.), 2003. *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*, Binghamton, NY: The Hayworth Maltreatment and Trauma Press.

⁵⁷ Potterat, et al. 2004. Mortality in a Long-term Open Cohort of Prostitute Women. *American Journal of Epidemiology* 159:778-785.

<http://aje.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/content/full/159/8/778?ijkey=5256b2d214944042a36841de95f6d95dc3a6cfb4#KW> H110C34

⁵⁸ Ibid.

recognition is essential to citizenship.⁵⁹ Although Hungarian prostitutes have formal citizenship status in this case, this has not lead to the social equality that democracy advocates claim, the true rights of citizenship are still denied. “Just about all major gains towards a more just and inclusive citizenship have been the result of political struggles,” Dahlgren says, highlighting the fact that prostitution and trafficking need to be brought further into public awareness, and political discourse.⁶⁰

After attempting to understand the difficult situation of prostitutes and prostitution in Hungary, the need for increased attention to human trafficking, and the context of the opposing arguments on prostitution, we see that what both sides of the NGO community in Hungary are arguing becomes clear, that this aspect of Hungarian society demands concentration, awareness and reform. If public opinion is as abolitionists claim, the painful reality of prostitution needs to be raised to public consciousness in general, to a new level of public dialogue and debate after a history of being ignored in the media. Policy change could more easily be affected with a growing public consensus that there was a problem, but this is the first move. Society must demand an acknowledgement of their human rights, and status as citizens, and an overall improvement of the status of prostituted women in society, from criminals to victims, of a greater social, economic and cultural reality, and deserving of the same rights, and dignity as other citizens.

2.3 The Value of Public Opinion

Martin Albrow and Helmut Anheir tell us that “Civil society cannot evade issues of war

⁵⁹ Dahlgren, Peter. 2008. Citizens, Agency and Politics. In *Media and Civic Engagement*, Dahlgren (ed.) 1-10. New York: Cambridge University Press.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

and violence.”⁶¹ A strong civil society is crucial to eliminating human rights abuses, and violence within a society. And in today’s interconnected world, civil organizations, made up of ordinary citizens in their free time, are at the heart of social action and change. Even in 1850, Alexis Toqueville identified the connection between associations and equality.⁶² They are the foundations of civic community, and necessary to “engage with the political system,” author Mark Smith adds.⁶³ Other authors highlight the importance of civil society in democratic consolidation, and strengthening institutional mechanisms within a country. In order for the necessary policy attention and change to take place, the community must organize and take action, and the first step is awareness. It is necessary to see what the public knows about the facts, and what they feel personally on the issues. In essence, what they know, and what they feel are important, are two tightly tied strings. Education is the first step to understanding, compassion and action. The Organization for Overseas Development, or ODI⁶⁴ argues that “communication is crucial to development,” and in many ways, we can see that Hungary is still developing, especially where gender relations are concerned. Gender experts continue to fight for full implementation of gender equality treaties such as CEDAW, illuminating major areas of concern, and neglect by the Hungarian state, with some even arguing that progress has only moved backwards since the fall of communism. The demands of these treaties have not been implemented, because of lack of creation of the necessary mechanisms, the necessary man-power or training, and lack of necessary resources. Non-democratic forces such as corruption are also

⁶¹ Albrow, Martin and Helmut Anheir. 2006. Violence and the Possibility of Global Civility. In the *Global Civil Society Yearbook 2006*.

<http://www.lse.ac.uk/Depts/global/Publications/Yearbooks/2006/Introduction06.pdf>

⁶² Alexis Toqueville cited in Smith, Mark K. 2001. Civic community and civic engagement. *INFED*. http://www.infed.org/association/civic_community.htm

⁶³ Smith, Mark K. 2001. Civic community and civic engagement. *INFED*. http://www.infed.org/association/civic_community.htm

⁶⁴ Hovland, Ingie. Successful Communication: A Toolkit. *Overseas Development Institute, ODI*. www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/155.pdf

still influencing the state. ODI makes a strong argument that communication is not just about information spread, but about creating an “evidence- based policy.”⁶⁵ This idea of “the use of evidence in policy identification, development and implementation,” is extremely progressive, influential and far-reaching. The most successful policies for prostitution and human trafficking can be formed only when the facts are taken into account. It is arguable, that if evidence about the prostitutes and trafficked victims was included in policy plans, the situation could be very different. In order for these issues to move forward, and to change the status of prostitutes in the eyes of the public, we must learn what they know, and where attention needs to be placed for public information campaigns in the future. The long term intended outcome would be to effect actual policy change that will improve prostitutes lives, prevent trafficking before it happens, recover and protect more victims of trafficking, and prosecute more trafficking criminals.

Finally, although prostitution is legal in Hungary, they are not receiving any of the benefits that legal advocates advertise. None of the necessary mechanisms have been arranged, funded or enforced to protect them. Ágnes Földi stated that her organization provides some services for the prostitutes (discounted health screenings, lawyers, education courses) but with no aid from the state.⁶⁶ The prostitutes have no government safety net, and no social assistance, outside what local NGO’s can afford, which is not necessarily continuous.⁶⁷ The prostitutes cannot rent apartments. They have little control over their working conditions, and continue to be exploited by pimps. The police have acknowledged that there are many underage prostitutes, yet

⁶⁵ Hovland, Ingie. Successful Communication: A Toolkit. *Overseas Development Institute, ODI*. www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/155.pdf

⁶⁶ Interview with Ágnes Földi. May 25, 2010. Budapest, Hungary.

⁶⁷ Matolcsi describes an example of aid offered by NGO’s that has been discontinued or lessened due to funds. The Association of Street Social Helpers (USZSE) stopped aiding prostitutes specifically in 2004, due to lack of funds, from “Discourses on Prostitution and Non Governmental Organizations Dealing With Trafficking In Hungary,” MA diss, Central European University, 2006. P. 29-31

the police do not even recognize them as minors in interviews.⁶⁸ The prostitutes still work behind closed doors and on cold, empty highways, even in winter. Law enforcement officials see them as criminals, and not victims of a socialization process, discriminatory history and the social, economic and political system. Their suffering must be brought to the attention of the public, to renew their citizenship as Hungarians, and a part of the community, and restore the dignity and integrity for all people that the UN Human Rights Convention demands. Gender inequality must take a new place in the Hungarian consciousness, along with the painful social issues that it contributes to, such as trafficking in women, and prostitution.

⁶⁸ Choudhury, and others, 2005.

Chapter 3. Methodology

Interviewing is more than just getting answers; it is about understanding our fellow humans, and what they think. To interview, is to seek understanding of the events of the past, the daily lives and stories of the present, and what can or will come in the future. Interviewing is the cornerstone of qualitative methodology in the social sciences: it concerns acquiring, consuming and interpreting the experiences of others to gain a greater knowledge and broader perspective of the world. With a mission to discover and interpret within a theoretical context, and gain a small bit of insight into various opinions and experiences, in-depth qualitative research interviewing was used to investigate these prevalent, painful, and understudied phenomena in Hungarian society. This research is primarily exploratory and preliminary, reaching a small sample with the expressed intention to open up and draw attention to this research area.

3.1 Theoretical Background

This study includes elements from traditional, post-modern and phenomenological interviewing techniques. The basic principles of methodological conservatism, and traditional interviewing theories, validity, reliability and replicability are held in high esteem. The schedule, and creation of interview context and environment were designed to be replicated at each interview. Yet, concomitantly authors such as Charles Briggs argue that aiming to decrease inter-interviewer differences to the smallest extent possible neither increases reliability or validity.⁶⁹ For the purposes of this study, I argue that post-modern interviewing techniques, such as those espoused by Briggs, Mishler, and Riessman, are more likely to result in higher levels of reliability and validity, for reasons explained throughout this chapter, with their final evaluation found in the following Data and Analysis chapter. The research goal has two parts: one is topical, seeking

⁶⁹ Briggs, Charles L., *Learning how to ask: A sociolinguistic appraisal of the role of the interview in social science research*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986. 23-24

to evaluate respondent knowledge on two subjects, prostitution and trafficking, and the other is cultural, to understand the meaning behind responses, as well as respondent experiences, and stories, for which post-modern and phenomenological interviewing techniques were most suited. Finally, identifying the researchers status as social equal, Cicourel's concept of "ecological validity,"⁷⁰ where the researchers methods and context are similar to the everyday reality of the respondents, is most likely to benefit reliability and validity, accepting that standardization could only be achieved if "the *meaning* of the question were the same for each respondent."⁷¹ Author Stan Lester adds that including this "interpretive dimension to phenomenological research, enabl[es] it to be used as the basis for practical theory, allows it to inform, support or challenge policy and action," which will serve well the purposes of this research.⁷²

3.2 Subpopulation of Hungary: University Students Residing in Budapest

In consideration that reaching a representative, randomized sample of the Hungarian population was not feasible due to time and resource constraints, a search for a subpopulation that could be reached representatively began. Researching the thoughts and opinions of the encultured informants, or the experts, on these issues was not acutely necessary, as this information is already accessible to a great extent on the internet, and within academic sources. One source of expertise are the NGO's, recognized as "specialized service providers," with their "collaboration and cooperation" being a necessitated part of government trafficking intervention by international organizations such as the OSCE.⁷³ Yet, they have already been studied in-depth in Hungary as previously noted, by Andrea Matolcsi, who demonstrated how the prostitution discourse has been

⁷⁰ Cicourel (1982a) cited in Briggs, Charles L., *Learning how to ask*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 24.

⁷¹ Ibid., 24.

⁷² Lester, Stan. 1999. *An introduction to phenomenological research*. Taunton: Stan Lester Developments. 2.

⁷³ Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, ODIHR, of the OSCE. Current NRM Developments in the OSCE Region. Warsaw, October 2008. *ODIHR*. http://www.osce.org/documents/html/pdftohtml/36928_en.pdf.html

realized by and between the NGO's. She explains how the debate between the two paradigms has informed the environment, and actions of NGO's in Hungary, by influencing funding to a small extent, the advocacy work that they do, and their relations with each other.⁷⁴

Nonetheless, the question on what the public knows and feels is left unanswered. Essentially, has the regulation or the abolition paradigm been more influential on informing their belief systems? University students, representing a population of young, and curious, academic and educated minds, could arguably be the most knowledgeable and informed about these issues. Although, because the change in the status of prostitution is only eleven years old, it likely occurred before most current students had a conscious political and social understanding, however the debates over zones of tolerance in recent years has surely provided an opportunity for information.

As for trafficking, the explosion of Eastern Europe as a breeding ground for victims and trafficking networks is only a recent phenomenon, as experts associate its rise with the fall of communism. Yet, trafficking remains young especially to the extent that it has been studied, understood, and infiltrated the public space and discourse. In fact, human trafficking in all its forms has only recently started to gain attention amongst the public in any part of the world. Therefore, I hypothesize that the youth would have a better understanding of human trafficking, and hopefully so, with the female youth being at the highest risk for sex trafficking. Not only is there an increased risk of being drawn into trafficking for young women, but also an increased risk of being drawn into prostitution. In recent years, studies and personal confessions have revealed that an alarming number of female students are engaging in prostitution as a way to put

⁷⁴ Matolcsi, Andrea. 2006. Discourses on Prostitution and Non Governmental Organizations Dealing With Trafficking In Hungary. MA diss, Central European University,

themselves through school. Evidence has supported this in various countries of Western Europe such as France, the United Kingdom, the Netherlands, Germany, Switzerland, and Denmark, but also Ukraine and Lithuania have had news stories on this topic.⁷⁵ With its neighbors facing this situation, Hungary can also be hypothesized to be experiencing a similar trend, and by reaching Hungarian students I could understand if, and to what extent this is a reality in Hungary.

Finally, the most important reason for reaching the student population is that they are the leaders of tomorrow's Hungary. They will soon join the community of business executives, lawyers, doctors, engineers, politicians, and social workers, and someday control it. They will determine the future of Hungarian laws, economy, and society. Thus, the lives of prostitutes, and the prevention and prosecution of trafficking will soon be in their hands, as well as the opportunity to help them, the potential to change. It is crucial that they know that these phenomena are happening, and increasing, and that they understand their root social causes in all their complexity. What will be the future of prostitution and human trafficking look like in Hungary? What will be the future for trafficking victims, who currently are ignored by all levels of the state from the police who can't identify them, to a trafficking agency who won't cooperate with local NGO's or collect statistics? It is essential to see what the students know, how they know it, and which paradigm has reached them, in an effort to gather attention to these issues, bring them to a new level of informed public awareness that can inform policy, and bring about the change necessary to improve the human rights of these women.

⁷⁵ Sloover, D Sara. Prostitution as a Student Job- All over Europe. *Europe and Me*, <http://www.europeandme.eu/6baby/351-prostitution-as-a-student-job->. Also see, for France: <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2008/jan/21/internationaleducationnews.france>, Ukraine: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/0,1518,639246,00.html>, United Kingdom: http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/life_and_style/education/student/news/article665019.ece

3.3 Interview Context: “Natural Context”

The idea of natural context, a product of humanist and feminist criticism of traditional interviewing, puts the researcher into the frame of the research, avoiding the pretension that he/she is a distanced, uninterested actor in the study. Acknowledging my role as researcher, I sought to emphasize my role as student researcher, amongst other students in a research environment (the university setting) in the common pursuit of knowledge, understanding and curious internationalism that felt reciprocal between both parties. My social status as social equal was emphasized for its potential on a comfortable, equal research environment. I sought to empower respondents, decrease the power relationship, and replace an artificial context, with a natural conversational context, albeit the still present fact that I did not answer any questions, only ask. Whilst having no desire to appear “in person” in the research, I most importantly sought to admit and monitor potential researcher bias, to be carefully controlled to the extent possible, and shall be transparent, as post-modernist scholars would have it.⁷⁶

3.4 Frame Analysis and Narrative Analysis

The interview itself was created within the methodological context of the research question, as well as the system of analysis as suggested by Tom Wengraf. Wengraf argues that the interview should not be disconnected from the entire context, and idea of the research, but meld into the ongoing conceptual framework as it develops.⁷⁷ The interview was created with context in mind, thus as a conversation between students about aspects of Hungarian society, an everyday sharing of thoughts, experiences, and stories. The experiences of the students were

⁷⁶ Lester, Stan, *An introduction to phenomenological research*. Taunton: Stan Lester Developments, 1999. 2.

⁷⁷ Wrigley, Mike. 2002. Review of Tom Wengraf, *Qualitative Research Interviewing: Biographic Narratives and Semi-structured Methods*. London : Sage Publications, 2001. In *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 3 (4) Art. 4. <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/viewArticle/801/1738> (accessed May 24, 2010). London, http://74.125.155.132/scholar?q=cache:di6XRxkCd_IJ:scholar.google.com/+gabrielle+rosenthal&hl=en&as_sdt=2000

documented with the goal of eventual synthesis and analysis, seeking an overall understanding of their experience, and the reflection and saturation of these issues in their minds. Therefore in analysis, I will be using a frame approach, as well as a narrative approach to understand the attitudes and experiences of the respondents.

Wengraf argues for the maintenance of the link with theory, thus the questions were crafted and placed sequentially in a way that would expose which paradigms were most affluent in their own words.⁷⁸ Each question was arranged to possess within itself a theme to be analyzed, connected by root to theory, and my supposition of it being a major theme within the population. Within the thematic questions, different concepts were expected to arise, some that would be reoccurring in separate questions, and allow for comparison between questions, or within questions, for example, by using probes within the same question that hinted at different perspectives on the same theme. This is also suggested by interviewing specialists to help make lucid to the interviewer the true attitudes of interviewees, and also highlight misunderstandings by the interviewer, contradictions of the interviewee, and areas requiring follow-up. This interview technique worked successfully in retrieving information when a respondent appeared to be stuck, and provided a new type and level of information to be analyzed with narrative analysis. Thus frame, or thematic and narrative analysis meld together, supported by Riessman who explains that in analyzing our data we want to aggregate the repeated themes, and ideas eventually into a “summation,” into a greater whole, with the many similarities and contrasts between participants combining into a group construction, or understanding of one or more

⁷⁸ Wrigley, Mike. 2002. Review of Tom Wengraf, *Qualitative Research Interviewing: Biographic Narratives and Semi-structured Methods*. London : Sage Publications, 2001. In *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 3 (4) Art. 4. <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/viewArticle/801/1738> (accessed May 24, 2010). London, http://74.125.155.132/scholar?q=cache:di6XRxkCd_IJ:scholar.google.com/+gabrielle+rosenthal&hl=en&as_sdt=2000

ideas.⁷⁹

The format of the questionnaire easily facilitated a system of coding the answers post-interview. Coding began with comparing responses to questions between interviewees as each question was already arranged around a theme. As analysis began, many new themes and concepts arose out of the data, certain questions merged into other questions and themes, others were eliminated as unimportant, and other themes just became obsolete due to lack of discourse. Author Catherine Kohler Riessman tells us that in narrative analysis the story itself is our “object of investigation.”⁸⁰ She argues that stories reveal how the respondents interpret the experiences in their lives, and their schematic perspective of the events in question. Furthermore I add that the personality traits exhibited (i.e. shyness, openness), the authenticity, the facial and bodily language, and other visible emotions, the so-called paralinguistic elements, are also important in the telling of the story, and their experience. It is certain that the students will not have perfect information on the topics; they more likely and more often will have narratives, or representations of life to them.

Realizing the deep structures, and opportunities within narratives that many advocates espouse, I specifically sought stories from respondents, especially in a quiet or confused moment, or pause, as soliciting a story allowed often allowed for a new thought, a personal interpretation of their own experience, or even another’s, where they were hard-pressed to find relevant information before.⁸¹ Thus, whenever a thematic question did not elicit a certain level of elaboration (such as a only a “yes” or “no” answer), or the question appeared confusing or unprovocative to the respondent, or the answer failed to be understood by the interviewer, the

⁷⁹ Riessman, Catherine Kohler. 1993. *Narrative Analyses*. London: Sage Publications.13.

⁸⁰ Riessman, 1.

⁸¹ Riessman, 2.

probe of “Can you tell me a story about it?” or “What stories did you hear or do you remember?” were used. This interview technique proved successful in retrieving information when a respondent appeared stuck, and provided a new type and level of information, now to be analyzed with narrative analysis.

Because of the nature of prostitution and trafficking, which are not personally relevant, or directly experienced by a majority of subjects, most of the narratives are impersonal, or stories of “others.” The possibility to tell any related story, allowed the respondent to separate him/herself from his/her perceived knowledge or lack of knowledge, and share an impersonal narrative from the external environment, allowing for what the participants knew to be extracted without it having to be consciously influential or important in their minds, or pertinent to their self-image, or the context of social desirability. Yet ultimately, we must remember that the information elicited is still only a representation, a set of words about what the respondent actually knows or feels. It is only what he/she chooses to share, and one (conscious) way to share it in a certain social context.

3.5 *Prostitution: Meaning Construction and Gender*

Prostitution, more for its sexual nature, and controversiality than its prominence or visibility, is a concept that is surely already framed in the mind of every individual, based on his or her experience, environment, and education. The word itself seems to be chained in place; age-old sayings cannot be forgotten, nor do contemporary debates rip it apart. Throughout centuries, its final judgment has never crystallized; its future has avoided to be pinned down. The historical, political, social, economic, and cultural relevancy of prostitution cannot be discarded, and this multi-dimensional issue continues to boil within all societies. It is unique in the sense that no other phenomenon merits comparison as its equal, and here is where the question of meaning

arises. What comes to mind when it's mentioned, and how do they frame this topic as individuals, and if possible, as a society? Which paradigm have the students used to frame this issue, and which themes are most developed? Do they agree with the system of the government, and do they understand the complexity of the modern context of prostitution today? For example, in one modern discourse, the radical feminist authors see the cause in the depths of gender inequality, a topic still not prevalent within Hungarian society, as noted by international bodies and women's groups. If this is so, in which frame do they see it? Understanding how the word prostitution is constructed in the mind of the individual, and what it means to them, should provide answers to these questions, about individuals, and in aggregate, potentially give a small perspective into the student population as a whole.

"Gender filters knowledge,"⁸² Norman K. Denzin tells us, a quotation that precludes the hypothesized powerful effect that the social construction of gender will have on the responses of interviewees in this study. Because of the sexualized nature of society into identities of masculine and feminine, the sexual nature of the questions, and most importantly the very different roles of men and women in prostitution, and trafficking of women into prostitution, predictably the men and women interviewees would have different responses to the situation. It was hypothesized that the women would be more empathetic, and understanding of the situation of prostitutes, and the men would be more disconnected from the emotional side of the prostitute, seeing only her social, and political roles, and less of her as an individual, or the world through 'her' perspective (empathy.) Also, importantly, the sex of the interviewer (myself), as a female could possibly create a bias, predictably inhibiting men's ability or desire to share their true feelings about prostitution, being an act that typically is associated with a devaluation of women, thus because

⁸² Denzin (1989a), p. 116 cited in *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. 2005, ed. Denzin, Norman K. and Yvonna S. Lincoln. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication. 710.

of the perceived social desirability of certain responses, they might be inhibited from sharing past sexual experience with prostitutes, willingness for future experiences with prostitutes, or negative thoughts about prostitutes in general.

3.6 Interviewing Methodology Specifics

In line with the theoretical framework of the interview, semi-structured, semi-standardized, scheduled (referring to stable word order), interviews with open-ended and close-ended type questions were created. Individual interviews and focus groups type interviews were conducted on site at the universities. My use of focus groups follows the usage of Merton, Fiske, and Kindall (1956) of a “situation in which the interviewer asks group members very specific questions about a topic after considerable research has already been completed.”⁸³ Three different groups of university students were reached: Medical, Social Policy, and Technical Science. Predictably the attitudes between the three groups will be comparatively different, but in what way cannot be predicted exactly. It can be hypothesized that the social policy students will be more educated on the status of public policies and issues of welfare in society in general, and that the medical students will be more knowledgeable on any issues concerning public health, or prostitutes health, such as the mandatory health certificates they must possess (although this is a legal issue as well.) The knowledge and opinions of the BMF technical science students are rather unpredictable, although I predict they will be the least informed on these issues, as their line of study is the farthest removed from social issues of this nature.

In conducting interviews, this research had four primary goals:

1. to assess public awareness about certain elements of prostitution in Hungary,
2. to assess public awareness about human trafficking in Hungary,

⁸³ Fontana, Andrea and James H. Frey. 2003. Interviewing, The Art of Science. In *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, ed. Denzin, Norman K., and Lincoln, Yvonna S. London: Sage Publications. 47-48, 54.

3. to determine what opinions the public holds about these issues,
4. to determine what the public thinks should be done about these issues.

Underlying these questions, is a deeper inquiry as to whether there is a dichotomous break between public conceptualization, and reality or the “social facts” as Briggs calls them.⁸⁴ Mishler also questions how we must understand this relationship between the events “of the real world” and the events of the narrative of our interviewee.⁸⁵ Understanding if there is a dissonance, and its relevance are important topics in question.

Also examined are what biases the Hungarian students hold against prostitutes, and if the assumptions made by some authors that the public hold certain misinformed beliefs about prostitutes are true. I am also seeking whether there is public awareness on specific issues such as that the majority of prostitutes in Hungary are Roma, and that they are the most at-risk group for trafficking within Hungary.⁸⁶

The draft interview was taken to four different Hungarian professors for revision before it was used, in hopes of softening any cultural difficulties or misunderstandings I might have created in it as a non-native. Interview experts such as Rubin and Rubin claim that you want to find interviewees who are knowledgeable on your subject, what they call the “encultured informant[s]” which I sought for my context and understanding of the topic, but not for my

⁸⁴ Briggs, 22.

⁸⁵ Mishler, Elliot G. 1996. *Research Interviewing: Context and Narrative*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. 83.

⁸⁶ US Department of State. 2009. Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2009*. or Forrai, Judit. 2006. AIDS & Mobility Working Group V: Gender issues and HIV/AIDS in migrant communities: Report Hungary. *Sex Education Foundation*. <http://ws5.evision.nl/systeem3/images/WG5%2010.%20Hungary.pdf>. Or, European Roma Rights Center, ERRC. 2004. You're lucky you are at home" - Testimony by Romani prostitutes in Hajdúhadház, eastern Hungary. *ERRC*. <http://www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=1515>

interviewees⁸⁷. I was not searching knowledgeable participants but the average student, and therefore the average level of knowledge.

In forming the interview, it was difficult to decide whether to place trafficking or prostitution related questions first. Whichever of the two categories of questions I began with, the interviewees would relate it to the other category themselves, just by virtue of mentioning both in sequence. I placed the prostitution questions first, because I didn't want them to unconsciously associate prostitution with forced work by my mentioning of trafficking first, I wanted to hear their free ideas on prostitution with no other stimulus beforehand. Generally with interviews the questions are not supposed to be paraphrased or rephrased in any way, but asked exactly the same with each respondent, with the same intonation and interviewing style each time, but as the respondents are non native speakers, repetition by paraphrasing is a necessary component for basic comprehension. (The first, and most commonly used paraphrases are included in the interview questionnaires, as probes.)

⁸⁷ Rubin, Herbert J. and Irene S. Rubin. 1995. *Qualitative Interviewing. The Art of Hearing Data*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Chapter 4. Data and Analysis

The data provide an interesting glimpse into the thoughts and ideas of students, full of telling anecdotes, surprising narratives, and strong opinions. Differences were visible between the three major groups, with the most telling contrast appearing between the Social Policy students and all the rest. Although there was a large diversity of attitudes represented, in the context of the literature certain conclusions present themselves strongly in the data.

4.1 Data Basics: The Sample

During the month of May, 2010 in Budapest, the interviews and focus groups were conducted with twenty-six university students from four different universities in Budapest: Semmelweis University, Eötvös Loránd University (ELTE), The Budapest University of Applied Sciences (BMF), and Pázmány Péter University (PPKE). The breakdown can be divided into six students from Semmelweis, seven students from BMF, twelve students from ELTE, and one student from PPKE, with 11 females and 15 boys represented. All students were between the ages of 19 and 26, with one outlier of age 50.

The students came from a wide range of faculties: Pre-Medical, Pre-Pharmacy, Biology, Egyptology, English, Social Policy, Computer Science, Engineering, and Law. Within this range, there are 3 distinct groups: Medical Science (6), Computer Science and Engineering (7) and Social Policy (8) with the remaining 5 students from random departments. This diverse spread allows a random, varied set of opinions from Hungary's young generation, as well as the opportunity for comparison between the 3 primary groups.

All of the interviews were conducted inside or outside the various campuses of the universities in Budapest. These interviews typically lasted between 25-35 minutes, with

interviews as short as 15 minutes in rare, individual cases, or as long as an hour. Most often the interviews were conducted as focus groups, with myself and 2-3 other people, although individual interviews also occurred, and on one occasion there was a focus group of 5. The reason for varying length and group number was to accommodate students who didn't have much time, and would/could not wait, late students, because of problems of language ability of one or more students, and also to allow for a discussion among students on the issues.

More than half of the time, the interview could not be completed because the respondent did not have enough information to make it to the end of the second part, the questions concerning human trafficking, causing a comparatively lower completion rate of the second part of the survey. This could be seen as low completion rate bias, but because of the nature of the survey, created not only to gather certain information, but explicitly to gather the level of information held by respondents it can here seen as a finding, that a majority of interviewees did not possess enough information to complete the second, short part of the survey, most commonly only completing 3 - 4 of the 6 questions. There were a high number of rejections resulting from the low level of participation of the two classes I attended (see rejection list in Appendix I.), which can be viewed as a high level of non-response bias. For this reason, I ceased to go to classes and just approached students directly at the university setting. Rubin and Rubin⁸⁸ advise to talk to enough interviewees until your results start repeating, and within each Faculty the results began frequently repeating, leading me to believe that by the logic of comparison the results were generalizable within students of the same Faculty.

⁸⁸ Rubin, Herbert J. and Irene S. Rubin. 1995. *Qualitative Interviewing. The Art of Hearing Data.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

4.1.1 Language : Surpassing the Barrier

One of the greatest challenges faced was the obvious fact that none of the students were native English speakers. Thus, instead of facing the sociolinguistic challenges explained by linguist Charles Briggs (1997), who described the trial of understanding a local dialect or vernacular language of a community, my challenge was trying to decipher the meaning behind the usage of certain English words by non-native speakers. Where and how they learned their English (from television, a textbook, studying abroad in a certain Anglophone country) strongly influences the choice of words they have, and use, which must be later interpreted. When certain phrases or word use didn't make sense, I asked them to rephrase or repeat, but sometimes there was only a certain understanding that could be reached, which results in greater subjective interpretation on the part of the interviewer, although this was in all circumstances, still a rare occurrence.

One of the greatest advantages of the focus groups was ameliorating the difficulties created by the language difference. When the interviewee began to suffer from this frustrating lack of the right word/words in English, he/she could demand of the other students, resulting in finding a plethora of related words of which I could use to understand the desired word or phrase. Translating among the students was a common part of every focus group. Thus often it could end up being another or a third person, expressing the thoughts of the first person to me in English. What affects this had on the process cannot be ascertained exactly. Perhaps their thoughts were not always translated correctly whilst filtering through another students mind and language database, but my belief is that this interpretation was most helpful and advantageous, in reaching students who did not have a certain level of English to express their thoughts clearly, and fully.

Much more information was able to be transmitted. There were always different levels of language ability, and different levels of shyness/braveness or willingness to practice their English, and focus groups allowed for more ideas by more students to be reached.

4.1.2 Level of Engagement

The participants that were strongly engaged with the topic were the Social Policy students, and various students from other departments, but only a small proportion. It can be hypothesized that either the students felt uncomfortable with the topic, and the somewhat sexual and/or sensitive nature of the questions, thought the questions unnecessary or confusing, or were genuinely uninterested in the subject. Yet, despite these other hypotheses, when students were not actively engaged with giving substantial, or detailed answers to questions, I have reason to believe that the primary reason was because of lack of self-perceived knowledge on the two subjects, rather than lack of interest or curiosity. The first reason is that they can be frequently quoted as saying that they don't know much about it, they don't know the answer, they don't know about this subject, and just generally relaying a look and feeling of perplexity, and self-questioning of memory. The second reason is that they were all very curious about the subject for whatever reason, which was revealed when I asked at the end, if they had questions of their own, and each time the interviewee had questions about the research, "Why was I studying this?," why was this important, and questions about myself personally as researcher. The survey created a level of curiosity in all of the respondents; they want to know more about these issues, they want to know what's going on. They want to know the answers to my questions.

4.2 Setting the Stage: The Importance of Paralinguistics

In all but two cases I did not tell the students before I interviewed them what the topic

was, as I did not want them to decide to be interviewed based on the topic and their own self-perceived knowledge. When I first mentioned prostitution, in *each* case the reaction can best be described as surprise. Later, when I mentioned trafficking after prostitution, I prefaced the new section by telling the respondent “Now, we are moving to a new topic,” seeking to dissociate the two subjects, and create a new possibility for free association by the respondents, to whatever extent possible. It appeared that many interviewees still associated it with prostitution, in seeking to define human trafficking, or in the stories they related, but often many did not connect the two, for instance, by only defining other types of trafficking.

The first question was designed to open the interview using the concept of free association, where the respondent could give any thoughts he/she had on prostitution. Unfortunately, this idea of a general, autonomous space did not work out as planned; it was too large, and lacked the necessary direction and guidance for students to respond. As was stated in the previous paragraph all students besides two did not know the topic until I asked them the first question. Then, there was always a look of shock in the eyes, a movement of the eyes and head up to the ceiling, around and then down to the floor, and laughter, and/or smiling followed by speechlessness and/ or the repetition of the word “prostitution (?) (!) .” Effectively, not every respondent answered at all, and those who did gave very short answers; the students did not want to say what they really thought, they didn’t want to sound inappropriate, or say anything socially undesirable. What was said shown light on how they felt about prostitutes as people, and whether they saw them as victims, or negatively. After the first few interviews, where barely a word was said, I changed the question from “What do you think about prostitution?” to “When I say the word prostitution what comes to your mind?” I found this question to be more effective, as it didn’t involve “thinking” or having to express a true thought, but it was truly more of a free

association experiment, and gave the respondent more freedom to say anything: any random image, idea, experience. It did not immediately demand their opinion, just whatever popped in, neutralizing the perceived judgment (based on the fact that the students actually began responding at all.) The answers were highly variable, from “They’re like bunnies,” to a few mentions of “Holland’s red light district,” to just the word “bitches.” The gendered nature of the responses became immediately clear: almost every male who responded mentioned, with varied vocabulary the “girls,” as seemingly independent, stand alone representatives of prostitution. Responses included “the girls by the highway,” “girls, sex, money,” “girl who sells her body,” “bitches,” but mostly, simply a reference to girls. While the females answers were much more diverse, and they tended to mention immediately some emotion or feeling towards the act of the prostitute, signifying a more pronounced understanding of her possible mental situation, such as “humiliation,” “it’s a hard job,” “it’s sad,” “using somebody,” or “to be enslaved.” In total, not many complete thoughts were given, while the gender divide was still exposed rather clearly. Yet, the most telling observations of the first question remain in the physical reactions to the subject of prostitution, clearly not a common subject for conversation, and not something that the respondents often talked about, wanted to talk about, or seemed particularly comfortable talking about.

4.3 Inter-Group Differences

The findings on inter-group differences highly support the original hypotheses. The enhanced knowledge on these issues, and the sensitivity of the Social Policy respondents emerged very early on. There were many more stories to be shared, and the focus groups launched into full discussions of the issues, taking over the new questions before I could ask them. A new level of understanding, and empathy was clearly visible, and be seen in comments referring the prostitutes

psychology or protection. Also, here the first critiques of society as a collective whole came up highlighting their sociology background, such as in discourses about society needing zones, but being angry “if the government marked them” and describing Hungarians as shy people, who can’t speak about these issues openly, and that “society judges” them (the prostitutes.) They noted that the public doesn’t understand these women, and were the only group to mention many important concepts such as the fact that young girls coming out of orphanages were at a disproportionately high risk for prostitution, and trafficking, “that the police used them [prostitutes]” or that most prostitutes “were abused in their childhood.” Yet, they were still unaware that the police continue to harass and penalize street prostitutes (in addition to using their services,) and still had a troubling lack of information on all aspects of trafficking, showing less noticeable differences from the other students in this part of the interview.

The Semmelweis students are hard to place. They did not show any greater awareness of medical or health issues as predicted, and neither did they show any greater concern for health issues as so many students mentioned this topic. It can be said that along with the BMF students, they were the least sensitive to, and understanding of the lives of prostitutes, (though compared with the five random students this difference is not so great.) Both BMF and Semmelweis were more likely to be accepting of buying sex, but wanting more exclusion of prostitutes “out of public view.” These two groups were barely distinguishable. In fact, together they are more distinguishable from the other five random students of random departments. Although from three different departments, these random students were more likely to have a nuanced understanding, and sympathy for the prostitutes. This could arguably be because they come from departments of social sciences, Egyptology and English, and one from Law, thus their studies are less scientifically, and more socially focused.

4.4 A System of Perplexity, A Theme of Perplexity

In a country where prostitution has been decriminalized since 1993, and regulated since 1999, we must ask what questions emerge when half of the respondents claim that prostitution is illegal. A bit less than half said it was legal, and the rest said, “I don’t know,” or added, “I don’t know” before or after their choice. Most often, the question on legality lapsed into some discourse on the zones of tolerance, where the respondent explained that there was some “zones where it was legal” or some zones where it is not. However, these dichotomous, or two part answers actually quite adequately express the complexity and perplexity of the Hungarian system. Undoubtedly, the reality is not clear to this sample, and neither in law or practice. Although, it is legal, which half missed, there are zones where it is illegal (near public institutions, churches, etc.) Thus, it is legal almost everywhere (albeit certain legal constraints) with the exception of street-prostitution, which is only legal in tolerance zones that were never created; in conclusion, only street prostitution is illegal. Thus, the complex, puzzled responses actually reflect a complex, and puzzling system. As the direction shifted into the zones of tolerance issue, the answers became even more diverse. When asked how many tolerance zones existed the responses included “everywhere you can find them,” or “A lot” or “12 or 20,” to “very few”, and “one,” with two persons choosing the correct answer of nowhere. Admittedly, nearly two-thirds of the twenty-six respondents said they didn’t know, which I believe reflects willingness for respondents to be honest, and admit lack of knowledge on this very specific question, and lowers the level of “uninformed response bias,” a long plaguing problem of public opinion researchers.⁸⁹ (Adding the option of “don’t know” is an important factor in survey research, and the option and encouragement to say, “I don’t know” was recognized at the beginning of every interview.)

⁸⁹ See Bishop et al. 1980. Pseudo-Opinions on Public Affairs. *Public Opinion Quarterly* 44:198-209. Or Graeff, Timothy R. 2002. Uninformed response bias in telephone surveys. *Journal of Business Research* 55(3): 251.

In discussions, respondents mentioned “red-light districts,” and “secret places that the police want to find but people don’t say anything.” The Social Policy students again addressed society’s role a finding that was not hypothesized but seems clear in hindsight as they are within the Sociology department. They said that, “Society denies the fact that there is a need,” or “Every local government is different, some hate this woman,” or exclude, or segregate her. One male mentioned the temporary area created for a certain car racing event, and another female had a wealth of information on the topic, as she was from Miskolc where a zone was created, and then later dissolved due to citizen pressure, adding that “They [the local govt.] made an area where poor people live, and the sales went down of house, and now there is no zone.” Many mentioned that they had heard about this debate in the news, but it was apparent that the debate never concluded, they never heard the end of it, or the conclusion that no zones were created. And most importantly, they never heard the consequences of this conclusion.

4.5 Continued Penalization

When asked if the students knew whether prostitutes continue to be criminalized (such as fined, jailed, arrested) in Hungary, not a single respondent confirmed that they were. Again about half said, “I don’t know,” with many “no’s,” a few “I don’t think so’s,” and interestingly, one response each of “I don’t care,” “the police just use them,” and “not enough.” One student explained that, “They said they need to make places, but the local govt. did not make places where they can do it legally, but they do it so it’s legal. Maybe that’s why the police don’t care. Police know that the govt. made mistakes.” Other students reiterated this expression of tolerance by the police. A few respondents expressed that maybe for drugs, or alcohol they are apprehended, or “If they do something criminal but not for prostitution.” Consequently, the recurring concept of the “tolerant police” was created by the students whereby the police just left

the prostitutes alone. Although as Foldi stated there are many tolerant police; this is not always the case. These answers reveal not a notion of ‘what is’ but a notion of ‘what should be.’ I believe that in the absence of perfect information (acknowledged by most students) that this is what the students believe the police should be doing; this is what their logic would suggest that the police are doing. The studies mentioned in the literature review affirm that the public is not cognizant of the conditions that prostitutions live and work under; the abuse, suffering and oppression they undergo each day, from clients, pimps, or the state. This study strongly corroborates their argument.⁹⁰ Not one respondent knew about, or could even mention hearing about, the fact that despite legalization, prostitutes continue to be harassed by police, fined enormous penalties, or imprisoned.

4.6 Prostitution and the Media

Which leads into the next point of discussion: What do the students think of the media’s coverage of these events? When asked if there is discussion of prostitution in the media, most students said, “no,” “no, not really,” or “sometimes.” When primed for what stories they heard, many mentioned the zones of tolerance debates, which confirms my hypothesis that this issue has framed the student’s ideas, and the primary source of how they have all come to be informed on the nature of both legality and illegality. Other stories from the media include a small brothel made of wood being found illegally, the debate arising again during a Formula one race, and the inability of the government to deal with the problem (Social Policy.) Two students mentioned that the media frames prostitution as “inhumane,” and the woman as “victims” as the abolitionists do, yet the respondent of “inhumane” also noted that the media “want us to look down on the whole thing,” hinting at a note of condescension or judgment. The students of Social Policy

⁹⁰ Betlen, 2006.

mentioned different stories, such as recurring narratives about the girls in the forest on the side of the road, or the fact that the government has no services to help them. They mentioned the bus, from the “last 5-6 years” that goes around helping them, but said this is “a very young service.” They also mentioned their “trade union,” (the HPIPA) saying, “It’s good for the future,” and “It’s guiding their advocacy.” The only extended narratives came from the Social Policy students, who perhaps might have learned these stories through their school and not the media. The large majority of students stated that the media did not, or rarely discussed these issues, and did not have much information to offer that they had heard, and/or could remember.

4.7 The Causes of Prostitution: “Money,” and Many Not Understood

When asking students why women go in to prostitution, every answer included a reference to “money” (the greater social phenomenon of poverty was mentioned only once, perhaps for lack of the word in English.) With “money” clearly the dominant theme, a diverse set of other causes were also named. Other students mentioned and some struggled to say a lack of opportunities, or a bad family structure. Many students used, or sought the words “social class,” (Respondent: “They are...ghetto?” Researcher: “Of a lower social class?” respondent: “Yes!”) Students mentioned drugs, and alcohol, having to pay for children, or “common girls” who need to pay for university, problems with husbands or parents, or because the person has “screwed their life.” Surprisingly, there was not a real gender divide in responses, with both a few male and female respondents acknowledging that this is “not a choice,” and that “It’s a very desperate last chance to feed kids and costs, and its kind of against their will.” The Social Policy students cited the lack of choice the most frequently. Again, they mentioned the children coming out of state institutes as a “real problem.” They argued that more social workers were needed to help the “disadvantaged families,” and at risk youth, as well as for education in schools. They named

psychological factors, like “They have really a low self esteem, and self confidence,” suggesting it’s deeper than a money issue. Yet, experts argue that the reality is *much* deeper than a money issue, and identify a wealth of causes that were not identified by students, even those studying social work. In her groundbreaking work “The Prostitution of Sexuality” Kathleen Barry finds that “Where sex industries flourish and are legitimized by the state, 80- 90% of the women are controlled by pimps.”⁹¹ This was true for abolitionist states like France as well as regulated states like Germany;⁹² with no reason to believe that Hungary is an exception. A US Human Rights Report of Hungary from 2005 also recognized that the country’s 20,000 prostitutes “were vulnerable to being forced or coerced into the activity by local pimps who keep most of their earnings.”⁹³ Procuring is widely recognized as a major criminal factor of prostitution, a cause, as well as exercising psychological and physical control, and of complete coercion. Yet, only two students in the sample mentioned the social reality of pimping in any way, and both only indirectly within group discourses. One Egyptology female, during a discourse about drug use as a cause, she stated that, “He gave her drugs. He came up to her and she must work for him, she becomes addicted.” Also, one BMF male, in arguing against legalization, said “if we allow them to open these houses or don’t know how to say, we will see more girls on the roads, and more terror, its just a part of terrorism because madams and boys. There will be more pimps,” interestingly equating prostitution as a type of terrorism against these women.

The most troubling point however is that no student mentioned issues of sex or gender in any of their responses. This is especially problematic as the feminisation of poverty, discrimination, violence against women, and the lower status of women in general are noted as

⁹¹ Barry, Katheen. 1995. *The Prostitution of Sexuality*. New York: New York University Press. 228.

⁹² Ibid., 195, 228.

⁹³ US Department of State. 2006. *Hungary*. 2005 Country Report on Human Rights Practices. Washington D.C.: US Department of State. <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2005/61652.htm>

major reasons that drive women both into prostitution and into migration to the west, yet nothing even related was noted by students. Only a few Social Policy students mentioned that a cause was “abuse,” or childhood abuse, when violence towards women, and oppression of women’s rights is noted as a primary cause by women’s rights groups globally. In addition, studies in the US have shown that 80-90% of prostitutes were victims of incest, and other sexual abuse during childhood,⁹⁴ which can be inferable to Hungary as the 2005 US Human Rights Report states that child abuse, and child sexual abuse remained a problem.⁹⁵ A study by ENATW of interviews with public officials show that neither could they recognize gender inequality as a driving force behind prostitution.⁹⁶ And despite reports that Roma are at an increased risk for prostitution, only one respondent mentioned Roma, noting that most street prostitutes “are gypsies.”⁹⁷ Judit Forrai of the Sex Education Foundation of Hungary explains the overlap between Roma women and prostitutes, and also explains the patriarchal male dominance and control of Roma culture.⁹⁸

Some sources find that the public holds an opinion that prostituted women are exhibitionists, sex-addicts, who freely choose, and enjoy their work.⁹⁹ This belief was displayed by a few males, with responses such as “I have no idea, maybe they like to do that kind of job. So, I think it's their own decision, nobody force them to do that,” “Some girls are having fun doing that,” and “They’re like bunnies.” One female added that “There are a lot of girls who likes

⁹⁴ The Council for Prostitution Alternatives. 1991. *Annual Report, 1991*. Portland, Oregon. And, Murphy, Patricia. 1993. *Making the Connections: women, work, and abuse* (Paul M. Deutsch Press, Orlando, Florida) cited in Farley, Melissa. 2000. *Prostitution: Factsheet on Human Rights Violations*. Prostitution Research and Education. <http://www.prostitutionresearch.com/faq/000008.html>

⁹⁵ US Department of State. 2006. *Hungary*. 2005 Country Report on Human Rights Practices.

⁹⁶ European Network Against Trafficking in Women, ENATW. 2006. Implementing gender equality principles to combat trafficking and to prevent sexual exploitation of women and children. *The European network for the promotion of equal opportunity policies*, ENATW. http://www.aretusa.net/V-english/01larete/doc/RICERCA_uk.pdf

⁹⁷ “Statistics show that 22% of the prostitutes in Hungary are younger than 18 years old. As many 60% of prostitutes belong to the Roma minority.” Terres des Hommes Organization, “Country Information: Hungary,” Bitte Storen Campaign (Please Disturb), <http://www.child-hood.com/index.php?id=716>

⁹⁸ Forrai, Judit. 2006. AIDS & Mobility Working Group V: Gender issues and HIV/AIDS in migrant communities: Report Hungary. *Sex Education Foundation*. <http://ws5.evision.nl/systeem3/images/WG5%2010.%20Hungary.pdf>

⁹⁹ Betlen, 2006.

being a kind of prostitute.” In addition, some people who said money as the cause described it in the sense that the women go in for easy money, not in the sense of pronounced monetary need, similar to the finding of police in the Princeton report, though they noted this more commonly. Nevertheless most, or all recognized the primary cause as financial and not for other sexually-perverted, or sexually hyperactive reasons.

As was stated previously, negative attitudes of the public towards prostitutes have been hurting their quality of life for ages. Today, in some respects we can see that continue as many students claimed they don't want to see them, and don't know anything about their lives in many respects. Effectively, their placement on the outside of society, their social exclusion as “others,” has continued. Yet, in many ways the student sample has come to regard their work as legitimate, or at least acceptable (using the term of the survey.) A bit less than half of the respondents (9) found it acceptable, with a third of those adding the stipulation that “only if the women want to,” and the other half found buying sex unacceptable. However, a general pervasive sentiment was exuded that it is tolerable, even by those who said it was not acceptable. Respondents argued that “It's just a job,” and “If there are enough prostitutes and enough people who want to buy then I think it's okay. In a house or in normal circumstances, [but] not in a forest where I want to go with my family to see the birds.” The notion that if a man wants or “needs it” and a woman wants to offer it then they “don't care,” was frequently repeated. Yet, as we can see in the last quote this was also combined with the idea that they do not want to see it, it still should be separated from mainstream society, thus in this sense it remains socially undesirable, and stigmatized, even by those who see it as acceptable. Although not directly asked, nearly all male interviewees expressed that although they felt it acceptable, they themselves would never do it, with no respondent admitting that he/she has in the past, or would. This begs the question if whether, my presence as female interviewer created a response bias, of which I am unsure. When

the opportunity was presented to inquire whether they knew anyone who bought or sold sex, a few male respondents replied that they knew one or more friends who had. Finally, in investigating whether Hungarian students work as prostitutes, four to five respondents stated that they knew someone personally who had or did, or had heard about another student in Budapest who had. Some had read about a case, with nearly no one saying they hadn't heard of this phenomenon. (Also, Földi alleged that she knew many students working as prostitutes as they were facing the same economic crisis as any other prostitute.¹⁰⁰) Overall, the theme that it's tolerable, as long as we don't have to see it, or our children, was the most pervasive in the discourses among student, although running alongside a separate theme that prostitution was not acceptable, morally or otherwise.

4.8 Understanding the Client

In questioning why a client seeks prostitutes, many themes are easily distinguishable. First of all, the most profound theme, which we can call "dirty mind" as one student dubbed it, was that the clients seek something that they cannot get from their wives or girlfriends. Another major theme was the fact that they cannot sustain normal relationships. This theme was also touched by the narrative of the lonely, troubled man, who needed affection and contact, who might just need to talk (as one female heard the clients also seek.) There was also the notion of the lonely husband, particularly after the woman has given birth (mentioned by Social Policy students.) Besides these sympathetic, pitiful judgments demonstrating that these students feel sorry for the clients, and believe they have sad, social problems, many respondents expressed very negative, and harsh judgments, showing that they also hold very critical opinions of them, and an underlying criticism of their behavior. This is the recurring theme of the "dirty mind,"

¹⁰⁰ Interview with Agnes Foldi. May 25, 2010. Budapest. Foldi only acknowledged financial reasons for women going into prostitution, specifically that the "economic crisis" was hitting them the same as everyone else.

where the clients were called “nasty people,” or unattractive men, with “no charm” who couldn’t get a woman without this method, or “psychopaths” who were dangerous, with mental illness. Another male described a friend of his as a “sex maniac” who had a girlfriend, but still bought sex all the time, while others just simply described the clients as “buying joy,” or a new experience. Again, only one female mentioned any gender related ideas, suggesting that the clients paid for sex to have power over the woman. These attitudes point to the fact that society holds a very negative view of the buyers of sex; although they might consider the social phenomenon tolerable, they do not think of these people as normal or respectable members of society. This is an interesting contrast to what is normally perceived, where the prostitute is a “whore” and constantly focused on, and criticized while the client escapes all judgment. Yet, the data still show that about equal parts find it acceptable, and unacceptable in a straightforward question. Multiple respondents mentioned the fact that Hungarian society was shy, and still inhibited and unable to talk about issues of sex, although in recent years, commercial culture in Hungary has become highly sexualized like its neighbors to the West. It can be hypothesized that half of the students are progressives, holding liberal democratic values where they believe in personal liberty and freedom. They have subscribed to the liberal values of Hungary’s western neighbors, who proclaim tolerance and personal freedom to live as you see fit, that sex is out of the realm of the law. Yet, the other half of students still hold some morals of times past, and more traditional views that judge other members of society, and are more willing to criticize and control their actions. These attitudes give support to the idea that the concept of sexual morality is still important to Hungarian youth, who are not all accepting of paying for sex, though it has been decriminalized since 1993, and regulated since 1999. Perhaps, it will become increasingly acceptable in the future, with the younger generations growing up immersed in highly sexualized imagery, music, film, advertising and so many other aspects of the culture. Or perhaps, like the

more traditional half of students, the future will reject this shift in moral values, and continue to find prostitution morally unacceptable.

4.9 Visible Street Prostitution, and the Internet

When asked if the respondents saw prostitutes around the city or country, nearly every student except one said yes, and could name a specific place to support it. Surprisingly, with this simple question many different themes arose as well. Many students mentioned the Internet as the new place for “seeing” prostitution, finding ads for prostitutes on the internet, and also ad’s for jobs, which for one group of BMF students lead to the first telling of the narrative about the Hungarian woman trafficked to Italy, which would be one of the primary recurring narratives in this project. One male called it “the job that can screw you.” The most commonly named places were on highways, and the metros in Budapest, with many different locations named. One male from BMF said he saw them “Everywhere!” and more than one male said something similar to “there are many people on the street so you don’t know who is, who wants,” or “a lot of tiny girls dress like whores” as one male stated, unfolding a theme of men’s uncertainty, about who is a prostitute and who isn’t. (This notion that any woman could be a prostitute based on certain vague characteristics (standing a certain way, a certain place, in certain dress) is extremely problematic for gender equality in broader society, and men’s image and conception of women in general, where men suspect any woman as a prostitute.) The number of locations named by the respondents affirms that although street prostitution is technically illegal, it is very much prevalent inside Hungary, especially along the roadsides. The students commonly noted the Internet as another “place” where they “see” prostitutes, which supports the arguments of organizations that claim that prostitution has increasingly moved behind semi-closed doors to the Internet, such as those of CATW in 1998, which argued that “the scope, volume, and content of

the material on the Internet promoting or enacting....prostitution and sexual exploitation of women and children is unprecedented.”¹⁰¹

4.10 Attitudes on the future

What do these Hungarian students want for the future? Should prostitution be legal, or illegal? This is the most telling question for understanding which paradigm, that of the sex-work or the radical feminists, has been the most influential on their thoughts. An overwhelming majority, 20 of the 26 respondents said that it should be legal, with 13 or half also agreeing that brothels should be opened. There are three major narratives that the students used to support their choices. The most prominent narrative belying the student’s beliefs was that of the virtual necessity of prostitution as “necessary evil.” The students said, “People always did this and will do this.” They explained repeatedly “They will find a way. So basically it can’t be illegal,” and “I think it should be legal, because if something is illegal it’s very hard to stop because we cannot stop a phenomenon that exists for a hundred thousand years in a society and we can control it better.” Often working in cohesion with the “necessary evil” narrative was a mention of the functionality of the system in Holland, such as “it would be easier to legalize this like they did in Holland.” Legality was always believed to have worked well in Holland, even to the point of perfection, “that the women don’t have health problems and these women aren’t afraid of diseases. So it’s more safe.” This theme of public health was offered as support for legality and brothels many times. Another recurring narrative was the demand of “out of public view,” or to legalize brothels just to have prostitutes off the street, so “we don’t have to see them,” or that “if it doesn’t work on the streets and there is no crime around it, then I don’t care.” The females were

¹⁰¹ Coalition Against Trafficking in Women. 1998. *Misuse of the Internet for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation*. CATW.http://action.web.ca/home/catw/readingroom.shtml?x=16286&AA_EX_Session=8301fd835fe54cf4fcb98fb835bbaa48.

more likely to support brothels for the concepts of safety and control, yet both sexes mentioned that brothels could give prostitutes a safer place than the street or highway, though safety was by no means a dominant narrative, save amongst Social Policy students. Also, the Social Policy students again referenced society collectively, saying that “we always do the easiest thing; we don’t want to see them or talk about them so we pretend like they don’t exist, so we do nothing.” Running in cohesion with the narrative of societal “necessity” was the narrative of men’s individual *need*, that males in society would always *need* this. Clearly the students view prostitution as an unstoppable phenomenon and men’s sexuality as uncontrollable, but why? It is questionable how society can condemn other crimes such as burglary, murder and sexual abuse of children as always punishable, no question, even though they have existed for thousands of years, but for some reason “existing for thousands of years” is prostitution’s scapegoat. It can arguably be attributed to its sexual nature, as something uncontrollable; men’s sexuality is decided by nature, and not man himself. The majority of this sample feels that clients have an excuse based in their biological nature, and therefore prostitution is an uncontrollable necessity that must continue to exist, even when other crimes must cease to exist. Besides the biological nature of men’s desires, there are three other important hypotheses for why society accepts this claim: first, because they believe both parties involved, the client and the prostitute, are actually profiting from the act; secondly because, unlike burglary and murder, society sees this as a victimless crime; third, and most importantly, prostitutes are stigmatized, ignored, and excluded from society, thus the reality of their lives is not realized by society, who cannot understand that although they are participants of this crime, they are also victims of it, for reasons explained throughout this research.

Arguably, the visibility and arguments of the sex workers movements have succeeded in framing prostitution as a necessary evil, that can be controlled and function within a system of

regulation. This has undoubtedly been shown as the dominant narrative of the students. This sample of students overwhelmingly believes that legalizing prostitution, and perhaps brothels would improve the situation in many ways. Yet, the frame of the abolitionists was also presented. Out of the students who chose illegality, two females and one male supported their choice in the belief that legality only creates a bigger problem. One of them argued for the Swedish model. The other two respondents reasoned that legality would only exacerbate the situation, not ameliorate it (prostitutes lives, public health, etc.), that it will be “more hard to stop this force.” Although BMF and Medical students typically expressed the most socially liberal views, and unsympathetic views towards prostitutes, one young BMF student recognized that legalizing brothels would be like opening houses of terror, that there will be more forced prostitution, and he mentioned for only the second time in the survey, the use of pimps to control the women.

These responses conclude that most of the sample does not have a complete, nuanced understanding of the situation in Hungary. To illustrate this lack of nuanced understanding, we can take the primary mentioned issue of health, which is just one factor in which prostitutes are vulnerable, whereas the multitude of other important risk factors, were barely mentioned, if at all. Health risks are intersected by a number of other factors, such as control by pimps, who exacerbate health risks by demanding the prostitutes to perform any service, without protection. Also framing the respondent’s conception of health is the idealistic notion that it is even possible to “protect” a prostitute’s health, when protection methods, such as condoms, do not actually protect against all diseases; thus not even a perfectly regulated brothel or health system could provide true prostitute and public health protection.¹⁰²

¹⁰² As one notable example, condoms do not protect against the many types of the Human Papilloma Virus, which the WHO identifies as “the cause” of cervical cancer, the fifth most deadly cancer for women worldwide. World Health Organization, WHO. 2009. Fact sheet N°297: Cancer. *WHO*. <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs297/en/index.html>

Many students have also idealized the system of the Netherlands, and are misinformed of the nature of the current situation. In 2007, Mayor of Amsterdam Job Cohen stated that, “The legalisation of prostitution did not bring about what many had hoped. We are still faced with distressing situations in which women are being exploited.”¹⁰³ The situation in the Netherlands is obviously very complex, and worthy of more study. With this example I seek to show that the students frequent mention of this system of regulation as positive, and beneficial for society shows the influence of the sex work paradigm, and also that the majority are not aware of the failure of full regulationism in the Netherlands. Janice G. Raymond of the Movement for a Prostitution Free Hungary argues that legalization means legalization of pimps, its means creating a bigger, more powerful industry, fueled increasingly by sex tourism from wealthier countries.¹⁰⁴ Her arguments are corroborated by gender and trafficking experts worldwide, and by NGO’s who do the majority of the work in the field.¹⁰⁵ The solution offered by the sex-work paradigm, using the Netherlands as an example shows that it did not gain control of the industry, but the opposite, blatantly visible when Mayor Cohen closed half of the city’s red light district for this reason.¹⁰⁶ And certainly neither did regulation bring prostitution out into the open, with one of the highest rates of trafficking victims a year at 826 victims in 2008, and up to 70% of the prostitutes being illegal immigrants, working behind closed doors, afraid for their lives, and their jobs.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰³ Expatica. 2007. Legalising prostitution didn't help. *Expatica News*. 20 September. http://www.expatica.com/nl/news/local_news/legalising-prostitution-didnt-help-

¹⁰⁴ Raymond, Janice G. Five Points for Not Legalizing Prostitution In Hungary. *CATW*. <http://www.prostitutio.hu/5.point.htm>.

¹⁰⁵ (For example see: CATW, <http://www.catwinternational.org/about/index.php>. Or Prostitution Research and Education, PRE. <http://www.prostitutionresearch.com/c-trafficking.html>. Or Initiative Against Sex Trafficking, IAST, <http://www.iast.net/index.htm>.)

¹⁰⁶ Charter, David. 2008. Half of Amsterdam’s red light windows close. *The Times*, December 27. <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/europe/article5400641.ece>

¹⁰⁷ US Department of State. 2009. US Trafficking in Persons Report: Section: The Netherlands. *US Trafficking in Persons Report*, 2009. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/123137.htm>., and CATW. Factbook on Global Sexual Exploitation: The Netherlands. *CATW*. <http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/netherl.htm>

4.11 Trafficking: Seeking a Definition

For obvious reasons, most students had not heard of the word human trafficking in English, but all besides 2-4 recognized the word in Hungarian (sometimes it was difficult to know, as the students quickly began explaining to the others in Hungarian.) Two students had admittedly never heard about it altogether. The students told many stories about trafficking, with two recurring stories that seemed to frame the topic particularly. They attempted to define trafficking in very simple, clearly not entirely informed terms. The two recurring stories were explications of organ trafficking, and the Hungarian girls who were trafficked for prostitution to Italy a couple years ago. Arguably, the extremely small level of variance in stories could show that not many stories are being heard on this issue, since the respondents hold on to these two stories, even when one is outdated by a couple of years. (It is unknown when organ trafficking was in the media.) Other stories show new concepts, such as a domestic labor trafficking story that concerned 60-70 year old Hungarian men in a small Hungarian village, an example of internal trafficking which the US 2009 TIP Report notes is on the rise in Hungary.¹⁰⁸ Notably, when defining trafficking the majority of students would only mention one type (such as sex, labor, or organ), rarely two, not realizing that there are many types of trafficking. Definitions included: “when people get money by selling others peoples freedom,” and “when they collect poor girls, and tell them we have a good job outside in another country and then they use them,” which although described in simple terms, illustrate well some main concepts. There was a recurring frame of trafficking involving kidnapping, which is not noted anymore as a primary “recruitment” method in Europe, where deception is much more likely. Although organ and labor trafficking were mentioned, when asked to define it, the narratives tended to use females as the main characters. Again, there was a general sentiment of lack of awareness, with students

¹⁰⁸ US Department of State. 2009. Country Narratives D-K. Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*.

appearing rather uncomfortable with the topic, exuding an impression that said that they don't have much information such as, "I haven't heard much about this," with again a lot of "I don't know's" and "I don't know much about this," being said. One particularly troubling response from a BMF male was "I think I only heard about human trafficking in movies, so I don't know how it works in real life, maybe it's just a legend." Clearly, information on a very serious issue is not reaching this sample on an in-depth level.

Students were unable to distinguish trafficking from smuggling, many defining trafficking by explaining the act of smuggling or sometimes mentioning both.¹⁰⁹ John Morrison explains that this distinction was not made until the UN Convention in 2000, and many public officials, as well as the media, continue to ignore the prominent distinction between the two, either being unaware, inattentive, or also as he notes, using the label of trafficking for political purposes as it tends to denote more sympathy for persons in a situation of illegal immigration.¹¹⁰ The essential difference between the two, according to the OSCE is that trafficking can occur within the borders of a state, and also, even if the victim has legal rights to migration. The most important distinctive factor is that it happens for the purposes of exploitation, with the end-result of a slave-like condition.¹¹¹ This inability of students to distinguish between the two, and define human trafficking in any sort of organized, complete attempt corroborates Morrison's claim that the media and public officials are not making significant efforts to either understand, or disseminate this information.¹¹² Arguably other forces could be at work, such as a lack of interest by students,

¹⁰⁹ The UN Convention on Trans-national Organized Crime 2000 defines smuggling as "the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident," and for trafficking definition see page 1.

¹¹⁰ Morrison, John. FMO Research Guide: Human Smuggling and Trafficking. *Forced Migration Online*. Oxford Department of International Development. <http://www.forcedmigration.org/guides/fmo011/fmo011.pdf>

¹¹¹ Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, ODIHR, of the OSCE. Anti-Trafficking. *ODIHR*. <http://www.osce.org/odihr/13475.html>

¹¹² Morrison, John. FMO Research Guide: Human Smuggling and Trafficking. *Forced Migration Online*. Oxford Department of International Development.

or that the students merely do not use media sources, however “the visibility and effectiveness” government awareness campaigns have been questioned by NGO’s such as MONA, highlighting that serious effort is not being made to educate the public on a pertinent, dangerous social problem.¹¹³

4.12 Trafficking and the Media

Reminiscent of prostitution, when asked about media coverage of trafficking the students said they rarely, if ever, hear about trafficking in the media. One male said “I think I heard about it only 3-4 times in the last 8 years,” but most just said very rarely in some words. Some students mentioned that they hadn’t heard anything in recent years. After priming for stories to understand their experiences with the media, one female recounted a story of a Hungarian girl being locked inside the shop of Chinese immigrants in a small Hungarian town. Other respondents mentioned that trafficking was primarily an issue for children in Hungary, with one female noting that many children are kidnapped from her town on the Romanian border. A Social Policy student was concerned that the media had not reached society, informing them of the danger of these “fake jobs.” Many students could recall seeing the promising advertisements, and frequently connected them to the narrative about the Hungarian girls in Italy. When asked whether they thought trafficking was a problem in Hungary, many students connected the question to the previous, adding that they were not given information from anywhere and they did not know, evidenced by the responses: “Not sure. Because we don’t have these numbers,” “I have no data about it,” and “We don’t really know if this is a problem or not.” Another male said “There is not so much people who suffers from this. But we don’t know because if we knew then we could do

¹¹³ Matolcsi, Andrea. 2009. *Conference organized by the Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia, November 23, 2009: Situation of trafficking and prostitution in Hungary in the areas of legislation, victim assistance, government efforts and mechanisms and representation in the media.* Zagreb: Centre for Women War Victims.

something. There are a lot of hidden, human trafficking cases.” Disconcertedly, although at least a number of students could mention the advertisements for jobs, only one female mentioned a PSA warning against trafficking, again supporting MONA’s argument from the previous paragraph that these campaigns are not reaching the target population of young people, or in this case, only one of twenty-six.

4.13 Trafficking in Hungary: The Students Opinion

When the students were asked to what extent they believed trafficking was a problem for Hungary, most students concluded that it was not a big problem, that it was not so common. One student put it into the context of a scale of problems, saying that Hungary has “bigger problems” that should be dealt with first, such as that “the roads are nasty, the people are unsocial [and] impatient,” giving this group of society a very low ranking on his scale of social importance. One female mentioned that in the towns of “Bicske and Debrecen” you hear about it a lot, but then she said “immigrants who have no visa,” meaning she was referring to a different problem, which highlights the difficulty in discussing (and making change on) issues of which we are not properly understood in their own terms. Most students did not think it was a problem, but as discussed previously, they also mentioned that they weren’t sure because they did not have enough information on the subject such as, “It’s not a main problem, it’s a problem. But not so much because maybe in foreign it’s a bigger problem, but I don’t know, I don’t know too much,” or “There is not so much people who suffers from this. But we don’t know because if we knew then we could do something. There are a lot of hidden, human trafficking cases.” This last statement from a BMF male shows the opinion of about five or six other students as well, that perhaps it is a bigger problem than we think, but we just don’t know because of the nature of the act. Some students mentioned that it was a bigger problem in the West, or in the Far East (but

with the Far East they would always describe smuggling.) To illuminate the lack of knowledge on the subject I quote one student, “I think I only heard about human trafficking in movies, so I don't know how it works in real life, maybe it's just a legend.”

4.14 A Search for Causes and Solutions

The last two questions of the survey, concerning the causes of trafficking and the potential methods for combating it could barely be reached due to the level of knowledge required to give critical answers. Generally, after the first or second trafficking question it became clear that the respondent had little information on the subject, and thus the last questions were not attempted, often because the student began to look a bit uncomfortable or embarrassed, and appeared ready to finish the interview, and I did not feel it was right to continue under these circumstances.

Answers that were given about the causes reveal a very basic level of knowledge on the subject. Respondents mentioned the “cruelty” of the traffickers, or that “people want slaves,” or that the traffickers, “they find this human trafficking a really good opportunity to earn some money.”

These might well be true statements, but in comparison with the statements of experts, they have not even scratched the surface. Clearly the information that the experts have been trying to make known are not reaching their target population.

In speaking of what can be done to fight trafficking, the Social Policy students described a need for more social workers going to schools (“but very expensive for the local government,”) and greater education in general, in fact one of them, the 50-year old female had done awareness work before in schools. In a discourse on the topic the respondents built on each other's arguments: “Lots of times it's the mafia, and the government doesn't know how to deal with this,” “The power of the mafia is always bigger than the government,” “It's not typically the job of the

government [to combat this problem], but education and family,” and the last respondent agrees,
“Education, parents and the government. These three pillars.”

Chapter 5. Conclusion

In a news article from January 20, 2010 Amsterdam City Council Executive Lodewijk Asscher declared that '18-year-old girls from Bulgaria, Romania and Hungary are extremely vulnerable.'¹¹⁴ She claimed that an increase in the legal age of prostitution in the Netherlands from 18 to 23 would combat the high number of trafficking victims from these countries.¹¹⁵ Her comments came even before May 17, 2010, with the bust of a Hungarian trafficking network that recovered thirteen Hungarian victims. Trafficking in women for sexual exploitation is a very real problem for Hungary, yet the main finding of this research is that this sample of Hungarian students do not know it. They remain unaware of the extent of trafficking, its definition, as well as its why it is happening in Hungary. The students were unable to identify the underlying causes such as those given by experts like Anne Brandt Christensen, who recognizes “poverty, gender inequality, violence against women, [and] lack of awareness and discrimination;”¹¹⁶ (of which only poverty was mentioned once.) In a country where these young women and men are at risk for sex trafficking and other types of trafficking, it’s a true cause for alarm when the level of awareness is so low, *especially* when, as indicated above, “lack of awareness” is a cause in itself.

This research reveals that within this sample of Hungarian university students, they are not well informed. Major issues in human trafficking were never even mentioned by students, for example, the recurring story of the Hungarian women trafficked to Italy was repeated many times, but only few mentions of other types of trafficking, besides organ trafficking. This discovery that a majority of students had heard about organ trafficking, and sometimes no other type, can be acknowledged as a major finding, and explanations as to how and why remain to be

¹¹⁴ DutchNews.nl. 2010. Increase Prostitution Age to 23. *DutchNews.NL*. January 20.

http://www.dutchnews.nl/news/archives/2010/01/increase_prostitution_age_to_2.php (accessed June 1, 2010).

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

¹¹⁶ Christensen, Anne Brandt. 2010. Human Trafficking and Prostitution in Europe: Course Syllabus. *Danish Institute for Study Abroad*. http://static.dis.dk/files/syllabus/trafficking_su.pdf (accessed June 1, 2010).

ascertained. Also, another major finding is that this sample only views Hungary as an origin country (Two students mentioned smuggling from the Far East to the West, but still did not connect this with Hungary.) Hungary's status as a destination country, mostly of women and children from Ukraine and Romania for the purposes of sexual exploitation, was never mentioned.¹¹⁷ The victims *within* Hungary, who are not Hungarian, have been entirely forgotten. Hungary's third status as a transit country was only noted by one individual, in the form of a question.

It can be argued according to the data that the regulation paradigm has been the most influential on the minds of the youth, for whatever reason exactly, this is unknown, and demands further inquiry. It can be hypothesized that because a majority recalled viewing media coverage of the debates over tolerance zones that the arguments used in these debates could have framed their views. Most of the respondents agreed that prostitution should be legal, with the strongest theme being that of "necessary evil" comprising the arguments that its been around forever, we can't get rid of it, and sometimes to protect the women, although this answer came from women the majority of the time, albeit a few instances. It can be hypothesized that the reason the regulation paradigm can be most strongly identified with by the students, is because of the transition to, and belief in the notion of a liberal democratic society. Growing up during democratic consolidation, with a foundation in the philosophy of liberalism, based in personal liberty or freedom, individuality, tolerance and economic freedom to pursue your own independent goals with your own independent means has arguably influenced half of the students that prostituted women, and clients can do as they want. The views held by this group of students could also be explained by a belief that the regulation paradigm will better protect one or more of three ideas: the prostitute, and/or public health, and/or the notion of 'decency within public

¹¹⁷ US Department of State. 2009. Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*.

space.’ This notion was created by the recurring theme that prostitutes are indecent, based on the repeated idea that most respondents do not want themselves, their children/the nations children to see them on the street. Yet, many students still remain in a more traditional, or conservative culture of times past, viewing prostitution as morally impermissible, or simply unacceptable for a multitude of reasons.

This research reveals that the harsh realities of prostitution need to be raised to public consciousness in general and then further in the future, to a new level of public dialogue and debate. Again, I present the concept of informed public policy, which necessitates first an informed public, as the primary reason supporting public awareness, secondary only to the fact that trafficking and the exploitation of prostitution are legitimate dangers, especially to young Hungarian women. According to this sample, issues surrounding prostitution and human trafficking have a recent history of being ignored in the media, “They don’t speak about it,” one female said. In order to begin to acknowledge their human rights, and status as deserving citizens in dire need of social welfare, protection, and means to leave prostitution, the level of awareness about their lives must be increased. Clearly, the suffering and human rights abuses continue to exist under the public radar of media, and consciousness of this sample, revealing a great need for overall improvement of the status of prostituted women in society, at least from invisible, to visible, from other, to human and citizen.

This research can be supportive of one of two major points about prostitution legislation. The first theory is that the public is confused about the status of prostitution in Hungary. They do not know whether it is legal, or illegal, and do not understand the law’s complexities; admittedly this is not common knowledge, but specific information that undoubtedly some great percent of the population in any country would not know. The second theory is that the public is not confused as to the law’s status, but rather the law is confusing in itself to the point that street

prostitution is neither legal, nor illegal, because within Hungary's borders, it is both at the same time. Thus, both answers to the question are correct, and yet wrong at the same time, concerning street prostitution. Only when the respondent replied one or the other, with the following explanation about the safe zones, and the zones of tolerance issue was their answer logically correct. Aside from legislative details and all debate, prostitution is decriminalized in Hungary, yet street prostitutes continue to be penalized at the will of the police, and are not receiving the supposed benefits of a system of legalization/regulation. As Ágnes Földi believes, the state thinks they can make the laws, and then they don't have to do anything else.¹¹⁸ True protection of all persons in prostitution demands social welfare and health services, and active prosecution of those who exploit and traffic them, however this cannot be seen in Hungary today. Even though the act of the prostitute was decriminalized, because of the 1999 legislation that created zones of tolerance, prostitutes continue to be fined, and jailed under a misdemeanor charge for "standing in the wrong place" in the words of MONA, while the "less visible pimps and clients" are rarely, if ever prosecuted.¹¹⁹ This shows that the real responsibility and power to improve their situation is within reach of the government, starting at the level of law enforcement. Public pressure is the real force needed to persuade the government to stop the harassment and penalization of prostitutes, as well as increase the amount of training the police receive on these issues, which now is being carried out by various NGO's but requires government funds to make substantial change. The necessity of funds to provide social services is another major factor in why public pressure is needed; to demand that proper attention is paid to this issue, not only in word but in funding, the real source of action.

¹¹⁸ Interview with Ágnes Földi. May 25, 2010. Budapest, Hungary.

¹¹⁹ Matolcsi, Andrea. 2009. *Conference organized by the Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia, November 23, 2009: Situation of trafficking and prostitution in Hungary in the areas of legislation, victim assistance, government efforts and mechanisms and representation in the media*. Zagreb: Centre for Women War Victims.

Hungarian NGO's have been attempting to reform the prostitution legislation to their interests since even before the new legislation in 1999. MONA calls for the introduction of the Swedish model, highly acclaimed by abolitionists around the world, which criminalizes only the client, thus avoiding the human rights violations of the street prostitute we see suffered in Hungary. This client centered approach only enforces penalties upon those who are making a free choice to engage in prostitution, based primarily on their ability to spend financial resources on the sexual act, and not the need to earn financial resources from the act. For the regulationists, ever since it became apparent that the zones of tolerance would not be created, or could not be created due to citizen pressure, HPIPA has been fighting for their instatement, as another path to fight the maltreatment of street prostitutes. Yet neither of these Hungarian NGO's have been successful on influencing the government, as has been noted before when mentioning the HPIPA's court case over tolerance zones, and the abolitionists failures to retract or reform the legislation on regulation. In addition, neither has been successful at even getting the government to devote more resources, or manpower to prostituted women in need of aid, or human trafficking. Undoubtedly, citizen pressure, and citizen involvement is requisite for these civic organizations to have effect, towards their separate goals, or their common goal of ameliorating the harsh conditions of prostitutes lives. The social mobilization must extend outside a network of experts, academics, and exceptionally motivated individuals. One specific story highlights the power of citizen awareness and pressure in Hungarian communities. In the city of Miskolc, a zone of tolerance was created, and soon after forcibly closed as the citizens rejected its presence, despite the obvious need. The government reacted quickly and responsively to civic pressure. It illuminates the fact that citizen opinions, values, and demands are important to the government, and the government has the capacity and commitment to be responsive. My study has found that Hungarian citizens want prostitution to be legal, yet they must realize that although they might

disagree with prostitution in their area, if they reject zones of tolerances, the human rights of street prostitutes will continue to be violated, and the system of legalization that they support (for various reasons) will not be realized. If they do not support the zones, then they must demand another way.

This study seeks to draw attention to this issue, and a major failure to inform the public of important issues relevant to their lives and their fellow citizens, as well as the failure of public information collecting by the government. The global trafficking community continues to signal the gravity of the trafficking situation in Hungary, yet Hungarians are largely unaware of what is proclaimed to be happening within and beyond their borders concerning this issue. However a shift must come first, from prostitutes as criminals to victims, with a greater understanding of their lives, and the deeper reasons that lead them to stand on the street.

The deeper reasons that lead to the street, overlapping neatly with those that lead into the hands of traffickers, can be best understood not as separate reasons, but as intersecting factors. Many students noted social class as an important cause, but this barely scratches the surface. Where social class intersects with gender, and race, is where these phenomena really find their roots. Although the majority of prostitutes are women, and clients are men, prostitution and trafficking are not just about women, it cannot be understood solely as a gender or sex issue. Although the majority of prostitutes and trafficking victims come from the lowest social class, these phenomena cannot only be understood as issues of class differences, poverty, wealth, and inequality. In Hungary, where the majority of prostitutes and trafficking victims are claimed by sources to be of the Roma minority, race also plays its role as an intersecting factor. Yet, none of these are the sole cause, but none of them can be separated, they work in coherence to create (mostly) vulnerable women for sexual exploitation in prostitution and trafficking. Essentially, it is about domination and power, where one side controls and has access to the other. Inequalities in

gender, class and race together lead women into these desperate situations, and when analyzing the causes and solutions to these dire social problems, it is essential that the intersectionality of these factors is taken into account to access and understand the complexity of social, political, economic, and cultural issues at stake. Prostitution and human trafficking cannot be understood in simple terms such as financial need, or the idea of choice; the causes touch much deeper, underlying issues in society, that need to be dealt with. Yet, neither issues of gender or race were noted by respondents. Only two interviewees mentioned pimping, or the reality of exploitation found in prostitution, indicating that the exploitation inherent in prostitution is still not lucid.

Today, street prostitutes remain as outsiders, the “others”, seen by some as dirty, immoral, diseased, undeserving women, resulting in their social exclusion. A dominant narrative amongst the students, particularly the Social Policy students was that Hungarians are “very shy” when it comes to sex, they still don’t like to talk about it, or deal with it, much like their discourse on “homosexuals,” one female mentioned. Another student expressed that “We haven’t got any information about it!” Another student argued that “We are not tolerant, many people are against, and can’t understand at all.” Even within this small sample, the views were extremely diverse, interesting and informative, and this study presents a need for much more in-depth research to be conducted to better understand the attitudes and awareness of Hungarian students on this issue.

Bibliography

Albrow, Martin and Helmut Anheir. 2006. Violence and the Possibility of Global Civility. In the *Global Civil Society Yearbook 2006*.

Alikhadzhieva, I.S. 2009. Public Opinion About Prostitution and Measures to Prevent It. *Sociological Research* 48 (4): 82–90.

Barry, Kathleen. 1995. *The Prostitution of Sexuality*. New York: New York University Press.

Betlen, Anna. 2006. *ENATW Workshop: Trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation-prostitution in Hungary*. Budapest: European Network Against Trafficking in Women, ENATW.

Betlen, Anna. 2010. *Legal and institutional conditions for combating prostitution and trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation– Hungarian and international experiences, March 9th, 2010*. Budapest: MONA.

Bishop et. Al. 1980. Pseudo-Opinions on Public Affairs. *Public Opinion Quarterly* 44:198-209.

Briggs, Charles L. 1986. *Learning how to ask: A sociolinguistic appraisal of the role of the interview in social science research*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Charter, David. 2008. Half of Amsterdam's red light windows close. *The Times*. December 27. <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/europe/article5400641.ece> (accessed May 24, 2010).

Choudhury and others. 2005. *Challenges Facing Law Enforcement Officers in Combatting Sex Trafficking in Hungary: How Laws, Structure, and Culture Prevent Effective Intervention*. Princeton: Princeton University.

Christensen, Anne Brandt. 2010. Human Trafficking and Prostitution in Europe: Course Syllabus. *Danish Institute for Study Abroad*. http://static.dis.dk/files/syllabus/trafficking_su.pdf (accessed June 1, 2010).

Coalition to Abolish Slavery and Trafficking, CAST. A serious problem -- around the globe and in the USA. *CAST*. <http://www.castla.org/key-stats> (accessed May 25, 2010).

Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, CATW website. www.catwinternational.org. (accessed June 1, 2010).

Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, CATW. Factbook on Global Sexual Exploitation: The Netherlands. <http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/netherl.htm> (accessed May 20, 2010).

Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, CATW. 2004. From Budapest to Prague: Coalition Report. *CAST*. <http://action.web.ca/home/catw/attach/catw04newsletter1.pdf> (accessed May 25, 2010).

Coalition Against Trafficking in Women. 1998. *Misuse of the Internet for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation*. CATW.
http://action.web.ca/home/catw/readingroom.shtml?x=16286&AA_EX_Session=8301fd835fe54cf4fcb98fb835bbaa48 (accessed May 31, 2010).

Corrin, Chris. 2005. Transitional Road for Traffic: Analysing Trafficking in Women from and through Central and Eastern Europe. *Europe-Asia Studies* 57 (4): 543-560.

Council for Prostitution Alternatives, The. 1991. *Annual Report, 1991*. The Council. Portland, Oregon.

Dahlgren, Peter. 2008. Citizens, Agency and Politics. In *Media and Civic Engagement*, ed. Peter Dahlgren, 1-10. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Denzin, Norman K. and Yvonna S. Lincoln. 2005. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.

DutchNews.nl. 2010. Increase Prostitution Age to 23. *DutchNews.NL*. January 20.
http://www.dutchnews.nl/news/archives/2010/01/increase_prostitution_age_to_2.php (accessed June 1, 2010).

European Network Against Trafficking in Women, ENATW. 2006. Implementing gender equality principles to combat trafficking and to prevent sexual exploitation of women and children. *The European network for the promotion of equal opportunity policies*.
http://www.aretusa.net/V-english/01larete/doc/RICERCA_uk.pdf (accessed May 20, 2010).

Expatica. 2007. Legalising prostitution didn't help. *Expatica News*.
http://www.expatica.com/nl/news/local_news/legalising-prostitution-didnt-help- (accessed May 22, 2010).

European Roma Rights Center, ERRC. 2004. You're lucky you are at home- Testimony by Romani prostitutes in Hajdúhadház, eastern Hungary. *ERRC*.
<http://www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=1515> (Accessed May 22, 2010).

Farkas, Zita. The Critical Points of the Hungarian Prostitution Law: Organized Crime, Morality and the Invisibility of the Client. *Gender Studies* (03-2004): 118-134.

Farley, M. (Ed.), 2003. *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*, Binghamton, NY: The Hayworth Maltreatment and Trauma Press.

Farley, Melissa. 2000. Prostitution: Factsheet on Human Rights Violations. *Prostitution Research and Education*. <http://www.prostitutionresearch.com/faq/000008.html> (accessed May 30, 2010).

Fontana, Andrea and James H. Frey. 2003. Interviewing, The Art of Science. In *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, ed. Norman K. Denzin, and Yvonna S. Lincoln, 47 – 48. London: Sage Publications.

Forrai, Judit. 2006. AIDS & Mobility Working Group V: Gender issues and HIV/AIDS in migrant communities: Report Hungary. *Sex Education Foundation*. <http://ws5.evision.nl/systeem3/images/WG5%2010.%20Hungary.pdf> (accessed May 22, 2010).

Foundation for the Women of Hungary, MONA website. <http://www.mona-hungary.hu/object.1bb6ec79-ceba-4812-a28b-9691456b58df.ivy> (accessed May 11, 2010).

Foundation for the Women of Hungary, MONA. 2010. *Legal and institutional conditions for combating prostitution and trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation– Hungarian and international experiences, March 9th, 2010* Budapest: MONA.

Holli, Anne Marie. 2004. Towards a new prohibitionism? State feminism, women's movements and prostitution policies in Finland. In *The Politics of Prostitution*, ed. Joyce Outshorn, 103-122. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hovland, Ingie. Successful Communication: A Toolkit. *Overseas Development Institute, ODI*. www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/155.pdf (accessed April 5, 2010).

Hungarian Official Gazette, Magyar Közlöny (MK) 1999/60

Hungarian Prostitutes Interest Protection Association website. <http://www.prostitutaltak.hu>. (accessed June, 2010).

International Organization for Migration, IOM. Regulating Migration: Hungarian Legislation. *IOM Regional Office, Budapest*. <http://www.iom.hu/bpprojects/rm.html> (accessed February 10, 2010).

Initiative against Sexual Trafficking, IAST. Sexual Trafficking Facts. *IAST*. <http://www.iast.net/thefacts.htm> (accessed May 31, 2010).

Jeffrey, Leslie Ann. 2004. Prostitution as public nuisance: prostitution policy in Canada. In *The Politics of Prostitution*, ed. Joyce Outshorn. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Jeffreys, Sheila. 1997. *The Idea of Prostitution*. North Melbourne: Spinifex Press.

Juhász, G.& Wirth, J. 2002. How does the Hungarian state violate the human rights of women in case of prostitution?. *Movement for a Prostitution-Free Hungary*. In Hungarian at <http://prostitutio.hu/cedaw.arnyekjelentes.prostitutio.reszlet.html> (accessed May 19, 2010).

Lester, Stan. 1999. *An introduction to phenomenological research*. Taunton: Stan Lester Developments.

Matolcsi, Andrea. 2009. *Conference organized by the Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia, November 23, 2009: Situation of trafficking and prostitution in Hungary in the areas of legislation, victim assistance, government efforts and mechanisms and representation in the media*. Zagreb: Centre for Women War Victims.

Matolcsi, Andrea. 2006. Discourses on Prostitution and Non Governmental Organizations Dealing With Trafficking In Hungary. MA diss, Central European University.

Mishler, Elliot G. 1996. *Research Interviewing: Context and Narrative*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Morrison, John. FMO Research Guide: Human Smuggling and Trafficking. *Forced Migration Online*. Oxford Department of International Development.

NANE Women's Rights Association Website. <http://www.nane.hu> (accessed June 1, 2010).

Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, ODIHR, of the OSCE. Anti-Trafficking. <http://www.osce.org/odihr/13475.html> (accessed May 15, 2010)

Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, ODIHR, of the OSCE. 2008. Current NRM Developments in the OSCE Region. Warsaw, October 2008. *ODIHR*. http://www.osce.org/documents/html/pdftohtml/36928_en.pdf.html (accessed May, 2010).

Pecon, Pedro. 2008. Buda-Sex and the Hungarian Porn Industry. *CafeBabel.com*. <http://www.cafebabel.co.uk/article/24888/budapest-sex-pornography-industry-prostitution.html> (accessed May 2010).

Pine Frances. 1996. Review of Magyar Women: Hungarian Women's Lives 1960s-1990s by Chris Corrin, *The Slavonic and East European Review* 74 (2): 377-379.

Potterat, et Al. 2004. Mortality in a Long-term Open Cohort of Prostitute Women. *American Journal of Epidemiology* 159:778-785.

Poulin, Richard. 2005. The Legalization of Prostitution and Its Impact on Trafficking in Women and Children. *Sisyph.org*. <http://prostitution.procon.org/viewanswers.asp?questionID=000243> (Accessed December 19, 2010).

Prostitution Research and Education, PRE website <http://www.prostitutionresearch.com/c-trafficking.html> (accessed June, 2010).

Raymond, Janice G. Five Points for Not Legalizing Prostitution In Hungary. *CATW*. <http://www.prostitutio.hu/5.point.htm> (accessed May, 2010).

Riessman, Catherine Kohler. 1993. *Narrative Analyses*. London: Sage Publications

- Rubin, Herbert J. and Irene S. Rubin. 1995. *Qualitative Interviewing. The Art of Hearing Data*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Rubenstein, Sondra Miller. 1995. *Surveying Public Opinion*, Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- Sloover, D Sara. Prostitution as a Student Job- All over Europe. *Europe and Me*, <http://www.europeandme.eu/6baby/351-prostitution-as-a-student-job-> (accessed May 24, 2010).
- Smith, Mark K. 2001. Civic community and civic engagement. *INFED*. http://www.infed.org/association/civic_community.htm (accessed April 5, 2010).
- Sex Workers' Rights Advocacy Network in Central and Eastern Europe, SWAN. 2009. *Hungarian Sex Workers talk to the Press on December 17th*. SWAN. <http://swannet.org/node/1684> (accessed June, 2010).
- Terres des Hommes Organization. Country Information: Hungary. *Bitte Storen Campaign (Please Disturb.)* <http://www.child-hood.com/index.php?id=716> (accessed May, 2010)
- Transcrime. 2005. Study on National Legislation on Prostitution and the Trafficking in Women and Children. *Transcrime*. Brussels: European Parliament.
- United Nations. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000.
- United Nations Office On Drugs and Crime, UNODC. 2009. Global Report on Trafficking in Persons: Executive Summary. *UNODC*. http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Executive_summary_english.pdf (accessed May 22, 2010).
- United Nations Office On Drugs and Crime, UNODC. Trafficking in Persons: Analysis on Europe. *UNODC*. http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Trafficking_in_Persons_in_Europe_09.pdf (accessed May, 2010).
- US Department of State. 2009. Gender Imbalance in Human Trafficking. Trafficking in Persons Report 2009: Topics of Special Interest. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/123128.htm> (accessed May, 2010).
- US Department of State. 2004. Country Narratives Europe and Eurasia, Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2004*. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2004/33192.htm> (accessed June 1, 2010).
- US Department of State. 2009. Country Narratives D-K, Section: Hungary. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2009*. Washington D.C.: US DOS. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/123136.htm> (accessed June 1, 2010).

US Department of State. 2006. Hungary. *2005 Country Report on Human Rights Practices*. <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2005/61652.htm> (accessed June 1, 2010).

US Department of State. 2009. Country Narratives L – P, Section: The Netherlands. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2009*. Washington D.C.: US DOS. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/123137.htm> (accessed June 1, 2010).

U.S. Department of State. 2009. Tier Placements. *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2009*. Washington D.C.: US DOS. <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/123132.htm> (accessed June 1, 2010).

World Health Organization, WHO. 2009. Fact sheet N°297: Cancer. *WHO*. <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs297/en/index.html> (accessed May 29, 2010)

Wilcox, Aidan, et Al. 2009. Tackling the demand for prostitution: a rapid evidence assessment of the published research literature. *The Home Office*. <http://rds.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/pdfs09/horr27c.pdf> (accessed May 31, 2010).

Wrigley, Mike. 2002. Review of Tom Wengraf, *Qualitative Research Interviewing: Biographic Narratives and Semi-structured Methods*. London : Sage Publications, 2001. In *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 3 (4) Art. 4. <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/viewArticle/801/1738> (accessed May 24, 2010).

Appendix I: The Interview

I. Qualifiers

1. Is the person currently enrolled as a university student of any level?
2. Is the person Hungarian? (by birth, hold passport, of ancestry, of parentage, by personal attachment?)

II. General and Visible Data

1. Date and time of interview:
2. Place of interview:
3. Gender: M or F
4. University of Student: Bachelors, Masters, or PhD/Year of study:
5. Department of Student:
6. (Age) How old are you? :
7. (Hometown) Where are you from? :

III. The Interview

Part 1: Prostitution

8. What do you think about prostitution? When prostitution comes to your mind what do you think of?
9. Do you think that prostitution is officially allowed, or legal or prohibited and illegal in Hungary?
10. (If they do not mention zones of tolerance already) Have you heard of the zones of tolerance? Y or N
 - II. If Y, do you know how many there are in Hungary?
 - III. (probe: what do you think about them? Can you explain what they are? Do you think the government has an obligation to create them, or left as is?)
11. Do you know if the government continues to penalize/criminalize prostitutes?
12. Do you feel like there is discussion of prostitution in the media?

- II. (Probe: if yes, can you explain on how it is discussed?)
- III. (Probes: in the news, on TV.? What stories do you hear?)
- 13. Why do you believe that women go into prostitution?
 - II. (Probe: voluntarily, or under coercion?)
- 14. Do think it is acceptable to buy sex?
 - II. (Probe: do you think it is moral, or immoral?)
- 15. Why do you think clients seek prostitutes?
- 16. Do you see prostitutes around the city?
- 17. Do you think prostitution should be legal or illegal in Hungary, or some other model?
 - II. (Probe: Why or why not?)

Part 2: HumanTrafficking

- 18. Have you heard about human trafficking? (If not understood use the Hungarian word, first “emberkereskedelem” or if still not understood “nőkereskedelem” or “leánykereskedelem.” If the person hasn’t heard of the Hungarian words, this is the end of the interview.)
 - II. (probe: How would you define it?)
- 19. How did you hear about it?
 - II. (Probes: The news or on television? What stories did you hear about it?)
- 20. (If not answered in 15) What have you heard about it?
 - II. (Probe: What stories can you remember/did you hear?)
- 21. To what extent do you think this is a problem in Hungary? Do you think it is a serious problem?
- 22. Why do you think trafficking exists in Hungary, or what are the causes?
- 23. What do you think needs to be done to fight trafficking in Hungary? How can this problem be solved?

Thank you so much for your time today! I really appreciate it. Do you have any questions?

- 1. Time of finish, length of interview:

Appendix II: List of Interviewees

I. Interviewee Basic Demographics

1. Sex: There were 11 females, and 15 males.
2. Age: They were between the ages of 19 and 26, except one female of 50 years of age.
3. Citizenship: They were all born in Hungary besides one Hungarian-speaking male born in Serbia, who desired Hungarian citizenship.

II. List of Interviewees by University

A. The Budapest University of Applied Sciences, BMF – 7 Students

1. Male, 21, from Hatvan, studying 1st year in Engineering, May 4th.
2. Male, 20, from Pálosvörösmart, studying 1st year in Engineering, May 4th.
3. Female, 20, from Győr, studying 1st year in Engineering, May 4th.
4. Male, 26, from Budapest, studying for BA in Computer Science, May 14th.
5. Male, 25, from Budapest, studying for BA in Computer Science, May 14th.
6. Male, 20, from Budapest, studying 2nd year, May 14th.
7. Male, 20, from Budakeszi, studying 2nd year, May 14th.

B. Semmelweis University - 6 Students

8. Female, 24, from Győr, studying 1st year for PhD in Biology, May 11th.
9. Female, 21, from Budapest, studying 3rd year Pre-Pharmacy, May 11th.
10. Male, 21, from Tata, studying 3rd year Pre-Pharmacy, May 11th.
11. Female, 24, from Balaton, studying Pharmacy, May 11th.
12. Male, 19, from Budapest, studying 1st year Pre-Medical, May 13th.
13. Male, 19, from Eger, studying 1st year Pre-Medical, May 13th.

C. Eötvös Loránd University, ELTE – 8 students

Sociology

14. Male, 25, from Subotica, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
15. Female, 23, from Sátoraljaújhely, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
16. Female, 50, from Budapest, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
17. Male, 21, from Olaszfalu, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
18. Male, 24, from Jászberény, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
19. Female, 22, from Jászárokszállás, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
20. Female, 22, from Vésztő, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.
21. Female, 22, from Dunaharaszti, studying for 1st year MA in Social Policy, May 13th.

Linguistics

- 22. Male, 22, [missing data], studying for BA in Egyptology (and Mathematics), May 11th.
- 23. Male, 22, [missing data], studying for BA in Egyptology (and Latin), May 11th.
- 24. Female, 29, from Miskolc, studying for BA in Egyptology, May 11th.

English

- 25. Male, 24, from Budapest, studying 5th year for MA in English Literature and Linguistics, May 12th.

D. Pázmány Péter University – 1 student

- 26. Female, 23, from Veszprém, studying law and religion, May 11th.

III. Rejections

A. Semmelweis

- 1. Class of students (approximately 8.) Stated reasons: didn't speak English, other reasons: didn't choose to stay for unknown reason.
- 2. Male, stated reason: busy.
- 3. Male, stated reason: busy.
- 4. Male, stated reason: didn't speak English.
- 5. Male, reason: didn't speak English.

B. ELTE

- 6. Male, stated reason: only had 10 minutes.
- 7. Male, stated reason: only had 10 minutes.
- 8. Female, reason: didn't want to.

C. BMF

- 9. Class of students (approximately 15-17.) Stated reasons: didn't speak English, other reasons: didn't choose to stay for unknown reason.
- 10. Male, reason: didn't speak English.
- 11. Male, reason: didn't speak English.

Appendix III: Four Models of Prostitution in the EU, as defined by Transcrime, 2005.

1.” **Abolitionism.** A country falls under this model if outdoor and indoor prostitution are not prohibited. The State decides to tolerate prostitution and not to intervene in it. Prostitution by adults is not subject to punishment, but profiting from another person’s prostitution is, however, criminalised.”

2. “**New abolitionism.** This model is a development on the “abolitionism” model. A country falls under this model if outdoor and indoor prostitution are not prohibited, but with reference to the latter the State intervenes to explicitly prohibit the existence of brothels.”

3. “**Prohibitionism.** A country falls under this model if outdoor and indoor prostitution are prohibited. Parties involved in prostitution can be liable to penalties, including in some cases, the clients.”

4. “**Regulationism.** A country falls under this model if outdoor and indoor prostitution are regulated by the State and are therefore not prohibited when exercised according to this regulation. Prostitutes are often registered by local authorities and are in some cases obliged to undergo medical controls.”

Source: Transcrime. 2005. Study on National Legislation on Prostitution and the Trafficking in Women and Children. *Transcrime*. Brussels: European Parliament. viii.

Appendix III: Hungarian Law on Human Trafficking

TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS, SECTION 175/B OF HUNGARIAN CRIMINAL CODE

- (1) Any person who sells, purchases, conveys, or receives another person or exchanges a person for another person, or appropriates one for such purpose for another party, commits a felony offense and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to three years.
- (2) The punishment shall be imprisonment between one to five years if the criminal act is committed
- a) against a person deprived of personal freedom,
 - b) against a person under the age of eighteen,
 - c) for the purpose of forced labor,
 - d) for the purpose of sodomy or sexual intercourse, or to involuntarily engage in such with another person.
 - e) for an illegal use of the human body;
 - f) as an organized criminal act, or
 - g) in return for a payment.
- (3) The punishment shall be imprisonment between two to eight years if the criminal act
- a) involves two of the cases described in Subsection (2), or if the criminal act is committed
 - b) as part of a criminal organization,
 - c) against a person against a person under the tutelage, guardianship, supervision or medical treatment of the perpetrator.
- (4) The punishment shall be imprisonment between five to ten years if the criminal act
- a) involves three of the cases described in Subsection (2), or if the criminal act is committed
 - b) against a person under the tutelage, guardianship, supervision or medical treatment of the perpetrator, and deprived of personal freedom.
- (5) The punishment shall be imprisonment between ten to fifteen years or life imprisonment if the criminal act is committed for the purpose of forced labor and sodomy or sexual intercourse, or to involuntarily engage in such with another person
- a) against a person deprived of personal freedom, as part of a criminal organization,
 - b) against a person under the tutelage, guardianship, supervision or medical treatment of the perpetrator, and deprived of personal freedom.
- (6) Any person making preparations to engage in trafficking of human beings commits a misdemeanour offence and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to 2 years.

Sources:

Interpol, National Laws, “Legislation of Interpol member states on sexual offences against children: Hungary - Hongrie – Hungría,” Budapest, Spring 2006,
<http://www.interpol.int/Public/Children/SexualAbuse/NationalLaws/csaHungary.pdf>

Choudhury and others, *Challenges Facing Law Enforcement Officers in Combatting Sex Trafficking in Hungary: How Laws, Structure, and Culture Prevent Effective Intervention*, (Princeton University, 2005) http://www.princeton.edu/research/special_reports/trafficking.pdf

Appendix V: Hungarian Law on Prostitution And Related Offenses

Promotion of Prostitution, Section 205 (of the Hungarian Criminal Code)

- (1) The person who makes available a building or another place for prostitution to another person, commits a felony and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to three years.
- (2) The person who maintains, heads a brothel, or makes available financial means to the functioning thereof, commits a felony and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to five years.
- (3) The punishment shall be imprisonment from two years to eight years if
 - a) any person who has not yet completed his eighteenth year engages in prostitution in a brothel
 - b) prostitution is promoted as part of a criminal organization.
- (4) The person who persuades another person to engage in prostitution, shall be punishable in accordance with subsection (1).

Living on Earnings of Prostitution, Section 206

The person who lives wholly or in part on the earnings of a person engaging in prostitution, commits a felony, and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to three years. Banishment may also take place as a supplementary punishment.

Pandering, Section 207

- (1) The person who solicits another person for sexual intercourse or fornication for somebody else in order to make profit, commits a felony, and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to three years.
- (2) The punishment shall be imprisonment from one year to five years, if the pandering is business-like.
- (3) The punishment shall be imprisonment from two years to eight years, if the pandering is committed
 - a) to the injury of a relative of the perpetrator or of a person under his education, supervision or care or who has not yet completed his eighteenth year of age,
 - b) with deceit, violence or direct menace against life or limbs,
 - c) As part of a criminal organization
- (4) The person who agrees on the perpetration of pandering defined in subsection (2) commits a felony and shall be punishable with imprisonment of up to three years.

Section 210/A

- a) Prostitution is pursued by the person who has sexual intercourse or fornicates striving to make regular profit.

b) For the purposes of this Title, fornication is: any gravely indecent act with the exception of sexual intercourse, which serves the stimulation or satisfaction of sexual desire.

Sources:

Choudhury and others, *Challenges Facing Law Enforcement Officers in Combatting Sex Trafficking in Hungary: How Laws, Structure, and Culture Prevent Effective Intervention*, (Princeton University, 2005) http://www.princeton.edu/research/special_reports/trafficking.pdf

OHCHR, Republic Of Hungary, Responses to the list of issues submitted by the Committee Against Torture (CAT/C/HUN/Q/4) to be considered during the examination of the fourth periodic report of Hungary (CAT/C/55/Add.10) on 15-16 November 2006, <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cat/docs/AdvanceVersions/CAT.C.HUN.Q.4.Add.1.pdf>