The "Island of the Damned": Gender Violence in Haiti and the Politics of Development Aid

By

Meredith Evans

Submitted to Central European University Department of Gender Studies

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts in Gender Studies

Supervisor: Hadley Renkin

Budapest, Hungary

2011

Abstract

In wake of the 2010 earthquake that devastated the country, Haiti instantly became the subject of an international conversation. Governments and individuals from around the globe were quick to offer assistance to the crippled state. Led by Western nations, the international response to the disaster framed Haiti as a particular kind of tragic place: an earthquake-ravaged state that lost all control over its citizens and subsequently witnessed highly-sexualized and aggressive men victimize defenseless women and girls. This thesis considers sexual politics at the centre of international motivations surrounding the restructuring of Haiti. Analyzing media representations from the United States, the United Kingdom, and Canada, as well as information from state governments, the United Nations and international non-governmental organizations, this thesis problematizes normative depictions of Haiti implicit within international discourses on development aid and gender violence post-earthquake. Haiti, as a "Third World" state, is framed as in need of development aid from Western nations and this framing constructs particular representations of gender violence, citizens and places. Drawing on the works of Michel Foucault, Edward Said, Michel-Rolph Trouillot, and Gayatri Spivak among others, this thesis argues that contemporary representations of Haiti are framed in accordance with a post-colonial "Othering." Binarized with developed and safe Western countries inhabited by rational and respectful citizens, Haiti is represented as an underdeveloped and dangerous place that can only be purged through a reconstruction of a safe "private" space and a properly control "public," a reconstruction that only international development aid is positioned to provide.

Table of Contents

Abbreviations

CEDAW	United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women
CHREPROF	Centre Haïtien des Recherches et d'Actions pour la Promotion Féminine
NCHR	National Coalition for Haitian Rights
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
HRW	Human Rights Watch
IACHR	Inter-American Council on Human Rights
IHRC	Interim Haiti Reconstruction Commission
IDP	Internally Displaced Persons
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organization
MINUSTAH	United Nations Stabilizing Mission in Haiti
UN	United Nations
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UN Women	United Nations Women

Introduction

> For tourists on cruise ships plying the Caribbean, Haiti appears a beguiling, mysterious place... But it is no paradise for the country's nine million people. Indeed, the devastating earthquake now bringing death and heartbreak is the latest in a long line of tragedies to befall a place dubbed the Island of the Damned.
> – Andrew Malone, "Haiti: Rape, murder and voodoo on the Island of the Damned," *The Daily Mail*, January 14, 2010.

On January 12th, 2010, the Caribbean state Haiti was devastated by an earthquake of 7.0 magnitude that left thousands dead, injured, and homeless. The catastrophe thrust Haiti into the international spotlight, exemplified by the above quote from *The Daily Mail'*s article "Haiti: Rape, murder and voodoo on the Island of the Damned," published two days after the disaster.[1] Similar stories that frame Haiti as innately tragic resonate throughout the international news in the wake of the 2010 earthquake. International narratives mark Haiti as a particular kind of tragic place, where "rape crimes aren't investigated or prosecuted [and gender-based] violence is implicitly condoned."[2] International discourses typically reiterate one solution for Haiti's ill-fated state: development aid.

These narratives suggest that the international community has a responsibility to help Haiti after the earthquake – to both rebuild the state's infrastructure and reorder its society. Foreign aid poured into Haiti following the disastrous earthquake, with a total of 11 billion USD pledged to the country by the beginning of 2011.[3] A significant portion of this funding was dispersed to international non-governmental organizations (INGOs), of which many

---

[1] Andrew Malone, "Haiti: Rape, murder and voodoo on the Island of the Damned," *The Daily Mail,* January 14, 2010, http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1243016/ANDREW-MALONE-Rape-murder-voodoo-island-damned.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

[2] Stephen Lendman, "Gender-Based Violence in Haiti," *The Baltimore Chronicle,* August 17, 2010, http://baltimorechronicle.com/2010/081710Lendman.shtml (accessed 1 May 2011).

[3] Lisa Evans, "Haiti earthquake aid pledged by country," *The Guardian,* January 12, 2011, http://www.guardian.co.uk/news/datablog/2010/jan/14/haiti-quake-aid-pledges-country-donations (accessed 1 May 2011).

estimates suggest that Haiti, a nation of less than ten million inhabitants, has the most per capita in the world.[4]

Due to the international community's role in leading Haiti's post-disaster reconstruction efforts, it is important to explore how the problem that is Haiti is approached internationally post-earthquake and the consequences that arise. There has been substantial attention given to the politics of international development aid in Haiti and whether it is, in fact, aiding the country; however, previous research fails to adequately contemplate how gender violence in Haiti relates to these debates.

Gender violence – sexual violence and rape, to be precise – is prevalent throughout the international representations of post-earthquake Haiti that play an integral role in constructing the state as "damned." According to Michel Foucault, the regulation, order, and control of deviant sexualities is especially important because of the symbolic power that sexuality is given in modern societies.[5] As the most deviant sexual act of all, rape poses the greatest threat to social order. It is through depictions of Haiti as a place of rape and gender violence that life in Haiti can be imagined by the West to be, like rape, a "fate worse than death."

In this thesis I consider how the international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence in Haiti fits into broader narratives surrounding international development aid and gender violence in Haiti, and what implications these narratives hold for Haitian people. I explore this through post-colonial theory, a critical framework that recognizes the continuing impact of European imperialism on the world in discourse today, and through the lens of gender analysis, a feminist approach that is attentive to the important role of gender in

---

[4] Peter Hallward, *Damming the Flood: Haiti, Aristide, and the Politics of Containment* (London: Verso, 2007), 77.
[5] Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality: Vol. I, An Introduction* (New York: Pantheon, 1978), 17-35.

discourse.[6] I question how Haiti, as a Third World state, is framed as in need of development aid from the West and how this framing is constructed through particular representations of gender violence, people, and places. Using the terms "Third World" and "West" in order to signify the continuing impact of colonialism, I argue that representations of Haiti contribute to a post-colonial "Othering" of the country as an "underdeveloped" Third World state in need of development aid as well as a site of gender violence in opposition to the "developed" and ordered Western "Self." Ultimately, I argue that the post-earthquake international discourse on gender violence in Haiti acts as a depoliticized medium for the exclusions of gender and race that justify a reification of a "public/private" organizational system in Haiti by means of development aid.

Research Design and Methods

To make this argument I researched international (Western) discourses that address development aid and gender violence in Haiti. With a Foucaultian perspective, I analyzed these discourses with the recognition that power works through knowledge production and discursive configurations. Foucault understands discursive formations to be structures that produce knowledge and generate meaning. Foucault describes a discursive formation as "whenever, between objects, types of statement, concepts, or thematic choices, one can define a regularity (an order, correlations, positions and functionings, transformations)."[7] My sources, concerning either international development aid or gender violence in Haiti, are discursive formations that construct and regulate a specific Western-based understanding of reality.

In my research I compiled and analyzed newspaper and magazine reports, articles, and videos from the United States (U.S.), the United Kingdom (UK), and Canada, as well as

---

[6] Following Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, eds. *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader* (New York: Routledge, 2003), 187, I use the term "post-colonial" with a hyphen in lieu of "postcolonial" in order to "distinguish post-colonial studies *as a field* from colonial discourse theory" [original emphasis].
[7] Michel Foucault, *Archaeology of Knowledge* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972), 38.

press releases, videos, and reports from state governments, the United Nations (UN), and INGOs. I focus primarily on news articles because they garner the widest audiences. I organized my sources according to the issues of international development and gender violence in Haiti, subdividing the latter into discourses on gender violence in Haiti pre- and post-earthquake. I draw on sources from the U.S., the UK, and Canada. My focus on these countries comes primarily from the acknowledgement that they are part of an English-language group that dominate the knowledge production of news targeted to an international community, namely the West. I examine the need for international development aid to Haiti as it is constructed through particular representations of gender violence, people, and places. In order to do so I analyze and interpret my sources from the international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti, problematizing the texts as producing certain kinds of representations and meanings.

Overview

Chapter I: "Othering Haiti: A Post-colonial Feminist Perspective" explores post-colonial theories that provide an analytical framework for examining the discourses on international development aid and gender violence in Haiti. I discuss post-colonial theories that account for the dominance of the West in knowledge production and its place as "Subject" in international (Western) discourse. These perspectives recognize contemporary power imbalances are rooted in historical colonial practices and manifested within international relations today as neo-colonialism. I consider how representations of Haitian people and places fit into broader post-colonial narratives that are racialized and gendered.

To contextualize my study of Haiti, in Chapter II: "Foreign Interests in Haiti" I examine how contemporary global inequalities that disadvantage Haiti have roots in colonial and post-colonial history. In this chapter I consider how the international discourse on development aid in Haiti fits into broader debates on the politics of development aid, paying

4

particular attention to how the Haitian context relates to post-colonial critiques of aid that see it problematically as a vehicle for international (Western) influence and a neo-colonial domination of the so-called Third World.

Chapter III: "Gender Violence in Haiti" explores how gender violence, as a certain kind of "problem," has been an important part of broader international narratives of Haiti. In this chapter I argue that reoccurring representations of Haiti as a unique location of gender violence through culture-blaming, post-colonial representations of people, human rights rhetoric, and representations of the "failed" Haitian state contribute to an Othering of Haiti as a place in need of international development aid.

In Chapter IV: "Gender Violence in Haiti Post-Earthquake, the Shattering of the 'Private' Sphere and the Policing of the 'Public'" I use feminist perspectives on the "public/private" dichotomy of the modern state and argue that after the earthquake there has been a perceived breakdown of the "private" sphere and an inability to regulate the "public" sphere in Haiti that the discourses on gender violence exemplify. Because of this breakdown, I suggest that the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti post-earthquake demonstrates the country's current situation as even more of a "failed" and Othered state now more than ever. I argue that the international discourse on gender violence in post-earthquake Haiti ultimately makes use of depoliticized exclusions that are gendered and raced, justifying a reinstatement of the "public/private" organizational system through the mechanics of development aid.

Chapter I
A Post-colonial Feminist Perspective and the Othering of Haiti

1.1 Post-colonial Theory and Othering

Post-colonial theory acknowledges and examines how the so-called West continues to maintain its domination over former colonies such as Haiti. The hegemonic power of the West, particularly through discursive knowledge production, is explored by Edward Said in his seminal text *Orientalism.*[8] Said explores how, through colonial discourse, the West constructed itself as Subject, capable of knowledge production, in opposition to the Orient, or the Muslim world, that is constructed as Other.[9] According to Said, this Othering colonialist discourse of the Orient was both produced and used by the West to define itself and therefore Orientalism "has less to do with the Orient than it does with 'our' world."[10]

Post-colonial scholars expand on Said's pioneering work beyond the Orient, applying it to all that is dominated and Othered by the West. Michel-Rolph Trouillot argues that multiple Others exist in opposition to the West and are grouped into a "Savage slot," "a space for the inherently Other."[11] The "savage," "uncivilized," and "out-of-control" representations of European colonies were used to justify colonialism by the "civilized" and "controlled" West. As Trouillot suggests, the idea of the Othered "savage" is precisely necessary in order for the West to construct itself as the "civilized" Self.[12] These discursive constructions have material consequences. Notably, Homi Bhabha argues that the Western colonialist discourse constructs the colonized "as a population of degenerate types on the basis of racial origin, in order to justify conquest and to establish systems of administration and instruction."[13]

---

[8] Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (1978; repr., New York: Vintage Books, 1979).
[9] Ibid.
[10] Ibid, 12.
[11] Michel-Rolph Trouillot, "Anthropology and the Savage Slot," in *Global Transformations: Anthropology and the Modern World* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003), 1, 27.
[12] Ibid, 7-28.
[13] Homi K. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (Abingdon, UK: Routledge, 1994), 101.

Colonialism, therefore, was not only justified but "necessary" for the civilization of these Othered places, including Haiti.

For the study of Haiti, a former French colony, a post-colonial theoretical framework is imperative, as the legacy of colonialism and imperial dominance still resonates today. As Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin suggest, "all post-colonial societies are still subject in one way or another to overt or subtle forms of neo-colonial domination, and independence has not solved this problem."[14] This statement resonates especially with Haiti because, as I will discuss further in Chapter II, neo-colonial domination has plagued the country despite its early independence through, for example, imposed debt, economic sanctions, and military occupations. Since Haiti's remarkable slave revolution that resulted in its independence in 1804, Trouillot argues that Haiti has posed a symbolic challenge to the "ontological order of the West and the global order of colonialism."[15] His analysis suggests that perhaps a response to this challenge is included in the West's neo-colonial domination of Haiti, since its very existence poses a symbolic threat to the Western world.

1.2 International Development Discourse and Othering

Importantly, post-colonial scholars explore how Western representations of former colonies in the so-called Third World post-World War II create post-colonial discourses that take the place of former colonial narratives. International development aid typically refers to Western projects that promote planned political, economic, and social growth; however, Mark Hobart argues that development projects routinely contribute to a deterioration rather than an amelioration of the situation in the Third World or global South.[16] Hobart and others suggest that the post-colonial development discourse perpetuates an Othering of non-Western

CEU eTD Collection

---

[14] Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, Introduction to *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader,* ed. Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin (New York: Routledge, 2003), 2.
[15] Trouillot, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston, MA: Beacon, 1997), 89
[16] Mark Hobart, "Introduction: the growth of ignorance?," in *An Anthropological Critique of Development,* ed. Mark Hobart (London: Routledge, 1993), 1.

places and has roots in colonial relations.[17] Arturo Escobar argues that the development

discourse, from its beginnings post-World War II, reflects previous colonial understandings

of the world through constructions of the global South or Third World as "underdeveloped"

and the global North or the West as necessary providers of aid.[18] Hobart suggests that

"whatever the rationale, non-western societies have been widely represented as static, passive

and incapable of the progress based on rational government and economic activity which the

West alone could provide."[19] Since World War II, that rationale has been primarily

development aid.

The rationale of development aid has been warranted through Western constructions

of the Third World as in need of "development," effectively replacing past Western

arguments that colonies were in need of "civilization." Like colonialism, development is

influenced by ethnocentrism, since the "proper" (white) values of European culture are

expected to be adopted by indigenous populations through "modernization."[20] James

Ferguson argues that, following in the footsteps of colonialism,

> "development" is the name not only for a value, but also for a dominant problematic
> or interpretive grid through which the impoverished regions of the world are known to
> us... Poor countries are by definition "less developed," and the poverty and
> powerlessness of the people who live in such countries are only the external signs of
> this underlying condition.[21]

Such an understanding of development is, according to Escobar, problematically tangible

only from a certain Western perspective.[22] Moreover, he suggests that, like Said's

understanding of colonial discourse on the Orient, development discourse signifies not the

---

[17] Hobart, ed. *An Anthropological Critique of Development;* See also Arturo Escobar, *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1995); James Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine: "Development," Depoliticization, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho* (1990; repr., Minneapolis, MN: Unniversity of Minnesota Press, 1994).
[18] Escobar, *Encountering Development,* 4.
[19] Hobart, "Introduction: the growth of ignorance?," in *An Anthropological Critique of Development,* 2.
[20] Escobar, *Encountering Development,* 43.
[21] Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine,* xiii.
[22] Escobar, *Encountering Development,* 8-9.

truth about the Third World but instead the West's power over it.[23] Likewise, Hobart argues that

> in order for [the Third World] to be able to progress, these peoples have first to be constituted as 'underdeveloped' and ignorant. Conversely, without such underdevelopment and ignorance, the West could not represent itself as developed and possessing knowledge.[24]

Constructing the post-colonial Third World as "underdeveloped" is reflective of earlier constructions of colonies as "uncivilized." Despite its frequent usage in the twenty-first century, the term "underdeveloped" has problematic connotations.

Marking a country as in need of development signifies particular meanings and representations. In Western development discourse, Hobart argues that a lack of development indicates "stupidity, failure, and sloth."[25] Similarly, according to Escobar, contemporary development discourse maintains "the premise of the Third World as different and inferior, as having a limited humanity in relation to the accomplished European."[26] Additionally, Escobar argues that through representation development discourse creates an image of the Third World as a place with

> [an] under-developed subjectivity endowed with features such as powerlessness, passivity, poverty, and ignorance, usually dark and lacking in historical agency, as if waiting for the (white) Western hand to help subjects along and not infrequently hungry, illiterate, needy, and oppressed by its own stubbornness, lack of initiative, and traditions.[27]

Such representations in development discourse justify and perpetuate the hegemonic power and control of the West in post-colonial "developing" societies like Haiti through the mechanics of development aid and, thus, legitimate and sustain global inequalities between the global North (West) and South (Third World). Contemporary international narratives on particular issues such as gender violence in post-colonial states like Haiti correspond with

---

[23] Escobar, *Encountering Development,* 8-9.
[24] Hobart, "Introduction: the growth of ignorance?," in *An Anthropological Critique of Development,* 2.
[25] Ibid, 1.
[26] Escobar, *Encountering Development,* 54.
[27] Ibid, 8.

development discourse since, like narratives on issues such as poverty and human rights, they provide reason for development aid in the first place.

1.3 Gendered and Racialized Representations of People

Western post-colonial discourses, including international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti, use racialized and gendered representations of both post-colonial people and places that reflect earlier colonial portrayals. Through colonial discourse and constructions of racialized subjects, Anne McClintock suggests that "poverty and social distress were figured as biological flaws, an organic pathology in the body politic that posed a chronic threat to the riches, health and power of the 'imperial race.'"[28] The gendered aspect of colonial discourse is also crucial; Ann Laura Stoler importantly argues that "imperial authority and racial distinctions were fundamentally structured in gendered terms."[29] Specifically, she suggests that gendered representations function through intersections with race and class, so that "key symbols of the colonial state were secured by the ways in which gender was regulated, sexuality was patrolled, and race was policed."[30] Furthermore, she suggests that gender-specific sexual sanctions and prohibitions during colonial regimes were "squarely at the heart of imperial agendas" that created racialized subjects and practices.[31]

According to McClintock, these racialized and gendered representations of people "fostered a sense of the legitimacy and urgency of state intervention, not only in public life but also in the most intimate domestic arrangements of metropolis and colony."[32] As I argue throughout this thesis, contemporary racialized and gendered representations of post-colonial subjects through the international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti

---

[28] Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender, and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York: Routledge, 1995)*,* 48.
[29] Ann Laura Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002)*,* 42.
[30] Ibid, 210.
[31] Ibid, 15-16.
[32] McClintock, *Imperial Leather,* 48.

10

remain integral for justifying contemporary Western intervention not through colonization but through development aid.

Characteristic representations of post-colonial or Third World women in international discourses on development today typically construct them as a uniform group of "helpless" victims of male oppression. In her influential text "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses," Chandra Mohanty examines how Western knowledge production, particularly by Western feminists, discursively constructs the Third World woman as a homogenous "singular monolithic subject," ignoring specific socio-historical contexts.[33] According to Mohanty, these Western post-colonial discourses understand the universal category of Third World women as a "'powerless' group often located as implicit *victims* of particular cultural and socio-economic systems" [original emphasis].[34] She argues that the representations of Third World women in victimized positions are constructed in opposition to representations of empowered Western women and therefore relegate Third World women to an "*object status,*" one she suggests is extremely problematic as it denies their "historical and political *agency*" [original emphases].[35]

Post-colonial scholars have considered how this discursive victimization of Third World women legitimizes contemporary Western intervention through narratives that suggest that Third World women need to be "saved" from dangers that include Third World men, Third World culture, and Third World religion. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak importantly examines how the discourse surrounding the British abolition of the widow-burning *sati* ritual was "generally understood as a case of 'White men saving brown women from brown men.'"[36] A similar "saving" rhetoric is argued by Lila Abu-Lughod to occur in the post-9/11

---

[33] Chandra Mohanty, "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses," *Feminist Review* 30 (Autumn, 1988), 61.
[34] Ibid, 66.
[35] Ibid, 66-67.
[36] Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?," in *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader,* ed. Laura Chrisman and Patrick Williams (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), 93.

discourse on Muslim Afghan women. Abu-Lughod problematizes the "saving" discourse and suggests that "projects of saving other women depend on and reinforce a sense of superiority by Westerners, a form of arrogance that deserves to be challenged."[37] Following 9/11, representations of victimized Muslim women have contributed to a justification of U.S. intervention in the Middle East. I ague a similar phenomenon is taking place through discourses on gender violence Haiti, particularly in the country's post-earthquake state in which women are constructed as particularly "helpless." For example, Haitian women are represented as "helpless" by Amnesty International in a post-earthquake press release that describes them to be "vulnerable and are afraid of attacks."[38] As I will elaborate on in Chapter III, representations such as these construct Haitian women as "helpless" and in need of "saving" by the West, thus justifying Western intervention through aid in Haiti.

While Western discursive representations construct Third World women as "helpless" victims, representations of post-colonial men in international discourses on development typically present them as "dangerous." This discursive construction of "dangerous" Third World men is rooted in racialized colonial fears of black men challenging white male power and Western colonial order. Stoler argues that "cultural racism" was produced in colonial discourse as an "inherent product of the colonial encounter, fundamental to an otherwise illegitimate access to property and power."[39] She suggests that colonial racism not only "fixed and naturalized the differences between We [Europeans] and They [colonized subjects]" but also functioned to police such differences.[40] Fears of black men transgressing racial hierarchical boundaries and challenging Western order and control intersect with fears of black male sexuality. McClintock highlights how the association of black people with

---

[37] Lilia Abu-Lughod, "Do Muslim Women Really Need Saving?," *American Anthropologist* 104/3 (2002), 789.
[38] Amnesty International, "Haiti's Emergency Response Must Include Protection from Sexual Violence," *Amnesty International*, March 25, 2010, http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/haitis-emergency-response-must-include-protection-sexual-violence-2010-03-25 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[39] Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power,* 17-18.
[40] Ibid, 25.

12

uncontrolled sexuality can be traced back to the Middle Ages.[41] She suggests that during times of colonialism and slavery the association between blackness and "an unbridled, lascivious sexuality" became even more prominent, particularly due to the constructed danger it posed to white colonial women.[42]

Similarly, Stoler remarks that "the demasculinization of colonized men and the hypermasculinity of European males are understood as key elements in the assertion of white supremacy."[43] A racialized colonial discourse, according to Stoler, emphasizes the dangers of colonized men and assigned them a "heightened sexuality" where colonizers saw them as "potentially threatening as sexual and political aggressors."[44] Therefore, representations of hypersexualized black men are linked to colonial constructions of black men as "savage," "primal" and in need of "civilized" white male control.[45] This resonates with Trouillot's discussion of the "savage slot," in which black men are discursively located through such representations.[46] Similar to Trouillot's argument, Stoler suggests that these constructions lead to material consequences. She argues that the constructed danger that black colonized men would commit acts of sexual violence to white women resulted in

> new prescriptions for securing white control. These included increased surveillance of native men, new laws stipulating corporal punishment for the transgression of sexual and social boundaries, and the demarcation of new spaces that were made racially off-limits.[47]

The colonial construction of Third World men as a threat to women, a political threat, and a general threat to Western order and security continues to be in effect today in post-colonial discourses. For instance, Robyn Wiegman and Patricia Hill Collins both examine how ideas of a deviant black male sexuality and representations of black men as rapists of white women

---

[41] McClintock, *Imperial Leather,* 113.
[42] Ibid.
[43] Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power,* 46.
[44] Ibid, 58-59.
[45] Suzanne Harper, "Subordinating Masculinities/Racializing Masculinities: Writing White Supremacist Discourse on Men's Bodies," *Masculinities* 2/4 (1994), 1-20.
[46] Trouillot, "Anthropology and the Savage Slot" in *Global Transformations,* 7-28.
[47] Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power,* 59-60.

who deserved to be lynched has played an important role in shaping contemporary racist perceptions in the U.S.[48] In Chapter III I explore further how racist representations of "out-of-control" Haitian men are part of the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti.

1.4 Gendered and Racialized Representations of Places

Discourses on gender violence in the Haiti make use of post-colonial representations of places that construct the Haitian state as Othered, feminized, and in need of masculinized Western state control. Representations of Haiti as dependent, weak, and feminized are part of contemporary gendered narratives of dependent "developing" nations of the Third World that are rooted in racialized colonial discourses that feminized colonized people and places. Said understands Orientalism and Western hegemony as a "male power fantasy" in which the Orient was dominated, feminized and "penetrated, silenced, and possessed" by the West.[49] In a similar vein, McClintock argues that, through a racialized colonial discourse, "the white race was figured as the male of the species and the black race as the female."[50] These arguments are important to discourses on development, in which the Third World is typically feminized and Othered in representations against the masculinized Subject of the West.

The gendered geographies of the feminized Third World and the masculinized West are constructions that intersect with representations of individual states themselves. Feminist scholars argue that the state itself is gendered masculine. In her influential text *The Sexual Contract,* Carole Pateman argues the "public" or political sphere of the liberal state is masculinized as opposed to the feminized "private" or domestic sphere.[51] Wendy Brown explores the masculinization of the state further, arguing that "the masculinism of state prerogative power inheres in both its violent and its transcendent (above- 'life') features, as

---

[48] Patricia Hill Collins, *Black Sexual Politics: African Americans, Gender, and the New Racism* (New York: Routledge, 2005)*, 63-64; Robyn Wiegman, "The Anatomy of Lynching," *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 3/2 (January 1993), 445-467.
[49] Said, *Orientalism,* 54.
[50] McClintock, *Imperial Leather,* 55.
[51] Carole Pateman, *The Sexual Contract* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1988).

well as in their relation: women are the 'other' of both theses moments of prerogative power as well as the conduit between them."[52] This masculinist power is exercised by the state's control over its female and male subjects – exemplified through its oppressive control over women's bodies and reproductive abilities as well as its attempts to control the sexuality of predatory, violence men in order to protect women.[53] These paradoxical functions of the masculine state demonstrate what Brown describes as a "multiple and contradictory composition" of masculine state power.[54]

Though all states are gendered masculine, some are constructed as more so than others. Since the Third World is feminized and Othered, its states are de-masculinized in opposition to the strong masculinities of Western states. The strong, self-defined masculinities of Western states are closest to meeting the standards of what can be understood as "hegemonic masculinity." Introduced and developed by R. W. Connell in the early 1980s, hegemonic masculinity reflects "empirical evidence of multiple hierarchies - in gender as well as in class terms - interwoven with active projects of gender construction."[55] Hegemonic masculinity is distinguishable from other forms of masculinities and femininities as the privileged notion of ideal maleness in cultural consciousness. Hegemonic masculinity is "not assumed to be normal in the statistical sense" as only a minority of men actually embody it; for the most part, representations of hegemonic masculinity exist only in the symbolic – a constructed notion of masculine performance that is always evolving and largely unattainable.[56] Despite the unreachable nature of hegemonic masculinity, all individuals (regardless of gender identity or performance) position themselves in relation to it. At a local, national or international level, there is "a circulation of models of admired

---

[52] Wendy Brown, "Finding the Man in the State," *Feminist Studies* 18/1 (Spring 1992), 26.
[53] Ibid, 7-34.
[54] Ibid, 31.
[55] R. W. Connell, *Masculinities* (Sydney: Allen & Unwin, 1995); Connell and James W. Messerschmidt, "Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept," *Gender and Society* 19/6 (December 2005), 830.
[56] Connell and Messerschmidt, 832.

masculine conduct" that both refer to and distort the realities of social practice.[57] Thus, although hegemonic masculinities may not accurately correspond to the lives of individual men, exemplars represent desired cultural ideals.

This ideal conception of masculinity is a Western construction that positions hegemonic masculinity as both white and powerful – requirements only Western states are positioned to meet. Hegemonic masculinity denotes agency and other "subordinate" masculinities are constructed in relation to it with respect to class, race, ethnicity, age, sexuality, and nationality, for example. Therefore, masculinities of states in the Third World are definitionally subordinate to Western masculinities. The subordinate masculinities of Third World states are constructed as such through representations that are feminized, marginalized, and infantilizing. Ambiguously, subordinate masculinities of Third World states are also constructed as a threat to hegemonic white masculinity through hypersexualization, like early colonial discourses outlined above by Stoler. Therefore, through representations that construct them as weak and dependent while simultaneously dangerous and out-of-control, the subordinate masculinities of Third World states are positioned as inferior in post-colonial discourses, whereas Western states remain closest to the hegemonic masculine "ideal" through representations that construct them as powerful, independent, and strong.

The subordinate masculinities of Third World states are constructed as inferior to the masculinities of Western states in post-colonial discourses because of their inability to fulfill one of their important masculinized roles as outlined above by Brown - controlling "their" men in order to protect "their" women from male violence.[58] Consequently, the chivalrous Western states must step in. The West is justified to intervene by these narratives and, as Bhabha suggests, this justification is grounded in racism.[59] Such representations are prevalent in discourses on gender violence in Haiti, in which the Haitian state is constructed as failing

---

[57] Connell and Messerschmidt, 838.
[58] Brown, "Finding the Man in the State," 7-34.
[59] Bhabha, *The Location of Culture,* 101.

to perform its masculine duty of control and protection. For instance, a 2011 *New York Times* article on post-earthquake rape in Haiti's IDP camps explicitly states that "The Haitian government, beset by political and other crises, has failed to do its job. But others, including the United Nations, the United States and other international donors and aid agencies, can and must do more."[60] This statement implies that Western states must not only help the Haitian state but must step in and take control, since Haitians are inherently incapable to do so. In Chapters III and IV I will expand on how narratives that gender Haiti as a subordinate masculinity are used in the international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti to contribute to a justification of Western state domination and control of Haiti through the mechanics of aid.

---

[60] Editorial, "An Epidemic of Rape for Haiti's Displaced," *New York Times*, April 3, 2011, http://www.nytimes.com/2011/04/04/opinion/04mon2.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

Chapter II
Foreign Interests in Haiti

2.1 Foreign Interests in Haiti from the Colonial Period to Today

Haiti has experienced many transformations over the years from its colonial period as Saint-Domingue, France's richest colony in the eighteenth century, to the world's first Black republic, and, finally, to its dismal state today as the poorest nation in the Western hemisphere. Efforts from the West to control what is Haiti today, the western portion of the Caribbean island of Hispaniola that is shared with the Dominican Republic to the east (see figure 1), began with Spanish colonization in 1492.[61] Spain maintained control over the entire island from the 15th to the 17th century, when in 1697 the western part of the island formally fell under French colonial control.[62] For the entirety of the eighteenth century as Saint-Domingue, Haiti's production of sugar and coffee through imported African slave labour made it one of France's richest colonies.[63] The colonial rule was disrupted with the first successful slave rebellion from 1791-1804, which culminated in the independence of Haiti as the first Black republic, despite violent attempts at repression by Europe and the U.S.[64]

Figure 1. Map of Haiti.[65]

---

[61] Paul Farmer, *The Uses of Haiti* (Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press, 1994), 60.
[62] Ibid, 61.
[63] Laurent Dubois, *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005), 21.
[64] Ibid, 1.
[65] BBC, "UN admits Haiti needs more work," image, *BBC News,* April 16, 2005, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/4452829.stm (accessed 1 May 2011).

The consequences of the Revolution of Saint-Domingue/Haiti and its disruption of the global power structures still resonate today, since, as Peter Hallward suggests, Haitian independence "dealt the myth of white supremacy a mortal and thus unforgivable blow."[66] Hallward continues to suggest that

> there is no single event in the whole of modern history whose implications were more threatening to the dominant global order of things. The mere existence of an independent Haiti was a reproach to the slave-trading nations of Europe, a dangerous example to the slave-owning U.S., and an inspiration for successive African and Latin American liberation movements.[67]

The threat of the Haitian example led to what Trouillot argues was an effective silencing of the "unthinkable" revolution by the international community in Western discourse.[68] According to Trouillot, the Haitian Revolution "challenged the very framework within which proponents and opponents had examined race, colonialism, and slavery in the Americas," since it, unlike the revolutions in France and the U.S., promoted a political philosophy of universal equality that was not accepted globally until after World War II.[69] Global resentment toward Haiti's successful revolution and challenge to colonial order had a significant impact on the state's international relations. Haiti was marked by the West as a violent and insecure place. For instance, during the nineteenth century Paul Farmer argues that Haiti took on a symbolic role in "a monolithically racist world" as "the nightmare republic."[70] He argues that racist narratives throughout the nineteenth century confirmed the European and American assumption "that blacks were incapable of self-rule."[71] Through these racist representations, Farmer argues "Haiti became a cautionary tale of great relevance to all colonial powers with holdings in the New World."[72] Trouillot explores how the discursive "ostracism" of Haiti through representations that erased the Western memory of

---

[66] Hallward, *Damming the Flood*, 11.
[67] Ibid.
[68] Trouillot, *Silencing the Past,* 27.
[69] Ibid, 82-83, 88.
[70] Farmer, *The Uses of Haiti,* 226.
[71] Ibid.
[72] Ibid, 228.

19

Haiti's Revolution propelled the subsequent deterioration of Haiti both economically and politically during the nineteenth century.[73] This economic and political decline was, according to Trouillot, "only one symptom of an underlying denial" of the Haitian Revolution.[74]

Following the successful revolution, France led an embargo, supported by Britain and the U.S., which crippled the state's economy.[75] Only in 1825 did France finally agree to recognize Haiti's independence and lift the embargo, yet this agreement had a significant price. France demanded that Haiti agree to compensate its former colonizers for their loss of land and slaves. In order to pay this debt of 150 million francs (21 billion USD today) to France, later reduced to 90 million francs in 1838, the Haitian government had to resort to taking out high interest loans.[76] By the early twentieth century, 80% of the government's budget was still put toward this debt.[77] Finally, in 1947 the debt, including incurred interest, was paid off; however, it had both perpetuated the state's need for further loans from multilateral institutions and had effectively destroyed the Haitian economy.[78] Indeed, the political and economic ostracism of Haiti was a consequence of Haiti's symbolic ostracism through representations that erased Haiti's Revolutionary past. The consequences of these representations continue to shape the country and its dismal situation today.

Following the aftermath of its independence, Haiti has since been what Noam Chomsky describes as a "plaything for international power politics."[79] This has proven particularly true for the U.S., which played an enormous role in the affairs of Haiti throughout history, particularly in matters pertaining to U.S. interests that include what

---

[73] Trouillot, *Silencing the Past*, 98.
[74] Ibid, 95.
[75] Slavoj Žižek, *Living in the End Times* (London: Verso, 2011), 159.
[76] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 12.
[77] Ibid.
[78] Ibid.
[79] Noam Chomsky, Introduction to *The Uses of Haiti,* by Paul Farmer (Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press, 1994), 17.

Hallward outlines as "the promotion of a secure investment climate, the nurturing of links with local business elites, the preservation of a docile and low-wage labor force, and so on."[80] Like France, the U.S. refused to recognize Haiti's independence until 1862, when it began to address slavery on its own soil during the American Civil War.[81] In the late nineteenth century the U.S. invaded Haiti numerous times in response to its political disorder in order "to protect American lives and property."[82] These invasions culminated in a violent U.S. military occupation of the Haitian state from 1915 to 1934.[83] Chomsky argues that this occupation secured not only the U.S.'s interest in Haiti but also Haiti's dependency on the U.S.[84] Through the suppression of local rebellion and centralization of government in Port-au-Prince, Mary A. Renda argues, the nineteen-year U.S. occupation of Haiti "eliminated the very safeguards against entrenched despotism that Haiti, for all its problems, had always successfully maintained."[85] The occupation laid the groundwork for the two brutal dictatorships of the Duvaliers and oppressive military regimes that presided over Haiti for much of the twentieth century.[86]

During the second half of the twentieth century the U.S. continued to prioritize its own interests over Haitians by influencing Haitian politics. The U.S. supported the brutal dictatorships of Francois Duvalier, known as "Papa Doc," from 1957 to 1971 and Jean-Claude Duvalier, known as "Baby Doc," from 1971 to 1986, partly because of their strong anti-Communist stance.[87] U.S. support was also given to the Duvaliers in exchange for their compliance with U.S. economic interests.[88] For instance, Nina Glick Schiller and Georges Fouron describe how the repressive Duvalier regimes enabled "low wages and no labor

[80] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 178.
[81] Chomsky, Introduction to *The Uses of Haiti,* 16.
[82] Renda, *Taking Haiti,* 30.
[83] Chomsky, Introduction to *The Uses of Haiti*, 17.
[84] Ibid, 19.
[85] Mary A. Renda, *Taking Haiti: Military Occupation and the culture of U.S. Imperialism 1915-1940* (University of North Carolina Press, 2001)*,* 36.
[86] Ibid.
[87] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 15.
[88] Ibid.

organizing" for U.S. industry.[89] A popular uprising finally overthrew Baby Doc in 1986; however, the military regime that took over was similarly oppressive and was, once again, backed by the U.S.[90]

The U.S. continued to shape Haiti's political landscape throughout the 1990s. Jean-Bertrand Aristide, leader of the left-leaning party Lavalas, was elected to the Presidency in Haiti's first democratic elections in 1990 over his U.S.-backed centrist opponent.[91] Since both the U.S. and the U.S.-trained Haitian military were unhappy with Aristide, particularly with his economic and military reforms and policies, the military staged a coup in 1991, backed by the U.S., that overthrew the democratically-elected regime.[92] The military regime that took power and ruled from 1991 to 1994 was brutally violent and systematically targeted those who opposed the regime.[93] This oppressive regime was continually supported by the U.S., since in Haiti, as Farmer suggests, "state terrorism has long had the support of the U.S. government."[94] Though Aristide was restored to the Presidency in 1994, another military coup ousted him again in 2004, again backed by the U.S. and other Western states and, since 2004, Hallward suggests Haiti has been effectively governed by the international community.[95] The continual U.S. intervention in Haitian political affairs demonstrates that international powers have enormous influence on the Haitian state and that they care more about their own interests then those of the Haitian people.

In addition to supporting brutal political regimes, the U.S. influence in Haiti led to the implementation of neoliberal structural adjustment policies in the country. The U.S. strategy for Haiti in the 1980s encouraged it to abandon its local agricultural industry, welcome

---

[89] Nina Glick Schiller and Georges Fouron, "Killing me Softly: Violence, Globalization, and the Apparent State," in *Globalization, the State, and Violence,* ed. Jonathan Friedman (Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press, 2003), 209.
[90] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 16, 27-28.
[91] Ibid, 30-31.
[92] Ibid, 33, 37.
[93] Ibid.
[94] Farmer, *The Uses of Haiti,* 357.
[95] Peter Hallward, "Our role in Haiti's plight," *The Guardian,* January 13, 2010,
http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2010/jan/13/our-role-in-haitis-plight (accessed 1 May 2011).

private U.S. enterprises such as export-focused industry, and import its food from the U.S.[96] Following the elections of U.S. President Ronald Reagan and UK Prime Minister Margaret Thatcher in 1979, similar neoliberal policies were implemented not just in Haiti but throughout the world. In Haiti, these neoliberal policies destroyed the local economy and led to a relocation of the rural community into urban centers, primarily Port-au-Prince, where textile factory employment was located.[97] Lisa McGowan suggests that these neoliberal policies have locked the Haitian economy in a pattern that exploits the Haitian people and benefits "a few creditors, some foreign investors and consumers, and a small class of Haitian elites."[98]

Neoliberal policies that favor a strengthening of the private sector, despite having had negative consequences in the past, continue to be promoted by the U.S. as a solution for Haiti, particularly as part of the country's post-earthquake reconstruction. In his work *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*, David Harvey argues that "construction of consent" is a prevalent technique used to implement neoliberal policies world-wide.[99] Based exclusively on Western cultural and social traditions that constitute a specific notion of "common sense," institutional power is legitimized, despite being "profoundly misleading, obfuscating or disguising [of] real problems."[100] Further, Harvey argues that the moral values that coincide with the neoliberal shift of the 1980s centre on Western (and white) notions of "cultural nationalism, moral righteousness, Christianity (of a certain evangelical sort), and family values."[101] These neoliberal policies were implemented in Haiti on the basis of representations of the country as

CEU eTD Collection

---

[96] Farmer, *The Uses of Haiti,* 209.
[97] Schiller and Fouron, "Killing me Softly: Violence, Globalization, and the Apparent State," 209.
[98] Lisa McGowan, *Democracy Undermined, Economic Justice Denied: Structural Adjustment and the Aid Juggernaut in Haiti* (Washington: Development Group for Alternative Policies, January 1997, quoted in Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 8.
[99] David Harvey, *A Brief History of Neoliberalism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).
[100] Ibid, 39.
[101] Ibid, 84.

23

a certain kind of place – "uncivilized" in the nineteenth century and "underdeveloped" in the twentieth and twenty-first.

Similar to the neoliberal policies that cemented Haiti's economic dependency on the U.S., many Haitians depend economically on relatives who have migrated abroad. Over the years there has been massive migration from Haiti, primarily to the U.S. but also to other countries including Canada and France. Migration increased particularly during the Duvalier regimes of the 1960s and 1970s, and the Haitian diaspora is estimated to be somewhere between two and four million people today.[102] Known as Haiti's "boat people," the Haitian diaspora community has played an important role in the Haitian economy through the provision of remittances. In 2006, more than one billion USD was sent to Haiti from its diaspora communities, 71% of it from the U.S., which was equivalent to approximately double the Haitian government's budget of the time.[103] Though extremely important in bolstering Haiti's economy, remittances have also played a role in further establishing Haiti's economic dependency on the U.S.

Foreign interests, whether political, economic, or symbolic, take primacy in Haiti over efforts to improve the state of the country. Hallward aptly remarks that "too many powerful interests - international leaders and entrepreneurs, US agribusiness, charitable NGOs, the employers who exploit thousands of desperate Haitian migrants.... have a stake in Haitian poverty to allow it to change anytime soon."[104] These various "interests" tie together and are important in perpetuating not only Haiti's material needs for aid but also the representations that depict Haiti symbolically as a backward, out-of-control place that needs Western intervention and control. As I will discuss in Chapters III and IV, narratives that emphasize

---

[102] Clarens Renois, "Haiti diaspora allowed to vote," *Associated Foreign Press,* May 10, 2011, http://www.google.com/hostednews/afp/article/ALeqM5gQDU2mDHXNq9JfaxOk7vG_L8qM7w?docId=CNG.7666cf41808dc7d84a13a2cd4ccc112e.10f1 (accessed 20 May 2011).
[103] Joseph Guyler Delva, "Haitian Diaspora bolsters homeland's economy in record numbers," *The Haitian Times,* March 7, 2007, http://www.indypressny.org/nycma/voices/262/briefs/briefs_1/ (accessed 1 May 2011).
[104] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 8-9.

gender violence in Haiti represent the country symbolically as out-of-control legitimize international intervention and disguise the above mentioned foreign interests. The interests of the international community are embedded in the mechanics and industry of international aid.

2.2 The Politics of Development Aid

International development aid in Haiti, similarly to other countries of the Third World, has been provided by, among others, the U.S., Canada, and European countries in response to the above-mentioned dismal economic and political conditions of the state, conditions ironically caused by the same system that now provides aid. To analyze the international discourse on development aid in Haiti, wider debates around the politics and mechanics of development aid and NGOs must be considered to situate Haiti's case. Anthropologists, including Escobar, Ferguson, and William Fisher, have divided the academic discourse on post-WWII development aid into two streams of thought.[105] The first normative perspective represents international development aid as inherently good and includes perspectives that argue aid needs reform but is nevertheless good. The second post-colonial perspective alternatively understands development aid as inherently flawed.

2.2.1 Development Aid is Good

Many scholars understand development aid to be inherently good and necessary, despite its flaws. Normative Western understandings support the continuing increase in international aid as a development solution. Scholars such as John Clark, David Lewis, and Tina Wallace understand aid to be not only benevolent, but also necessary for economic development, poverty reduction, and democratic development.[106] NGOs in particular are

CEU eTD Collection

---

[105] Escobar, *Encountering Development;* Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine;* William Fisher, "Doing Good? The Politics and Antipolitics of NGO Practices," *Annual Reviews in Anthropology* 26 (1997), 439–464.
[106] John Clark, *Democratizing Development: The Role of Voluntary Organizations* (West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press, 1991); David Lewis and Tina Wallace, eds., *New Roles and Relevance: Development NGOs and the Challenge of Change* (Bloomfield: Kumarian Press, 2000), xii.

understood as playing a positive role in development. For instance, scholars such as Michael Bratton and Julie Fisher argue that NGOs work to strengthen both states and civil society.[107]

Normative critiques of foreign aid maintain the basic premise that aid is inherently good. Scholars such as Alan Fowler and Terje Tvedt argue that diverting funding away from states and instead to NGOs undermines states' abilities to provide social services; however, their critique is centered on what bodies receive the foreign aid and they do not question aid's benefits.[108] Jenny Pearce critiques NGOs for being under the illusion they are addressing issues as advocates and providing services for communities they are trying to help when, in fact, their efforts empower international NGO personnel and leaders and not the communities they are trying to enable.[109] Pearce's critique of NGOs maintains an assumption of their inherent good intentions. She suggests they should have a shift in priorities and work toward helping those communities develop their own capacity for advocacy.[110] These arguments demonstrate how normative critiques of development aid refrain from questioning aid's inherent good intentions. Ferguson argues that "pointing out errors and suggesting improvements is an integral part of the process of justifying and legitimating 'development' interventions. Such an activity may indeed have some beneficial or mitigating effects, but it does not change the fundamental character of those interventions."[111]

NGOs themselves similarly fail to question the character of their interventions, and thus, as Ilana Feldman suggests, remain "convinced that doing something is better than doing

---

[107] Michael Bratton, "The politics of government-NGO relations in Africa" *World Development* 17 (1989), 69-587, and Julie Fisher, *Nongovernments: NGOs and the political development of the Third World* (Hartford: Humarian Press, 1998).

[108] Alan Fowler, "The role of NGOs in changing state–society relations: perspectives from Eastern and Southern Africa," *Development Policy Review* 9 (1991), 53–84; Terje Tvedt, *Angels of mercy or development diplomats? NGOs and foreign aid* (Oxford: James Currey, 1998).

[109] Jenny Pearce, "Between Co-option and Irrelevance? Latin American NGOs in the 1990s," in *NGOs, States and Donors: Too Close for Comfort?* ed. David Hulme and Michael Edwards (MacMillan Press: London, 1997), 257-274.

[110] Ibid.

[111] Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine,* 285.

26

nothing, that the ethical failings of their projects do not outweigh the good they do."[112] This sentiment is reflected by NGOs in Haiti. For instance, in response to a critique of NGO efforts in Haiti, the INGO InterAction, an umbrella group comprised of U.S.-based NGOs, published a statement titled "NGOs Are Part Of Solution, Not Problem In Haiti" that states "simply put, NGOs have done a job the Haitian government was not equipped to do."[113] The perspective that understands aid as both inherently "good," and, like InterAction suggests, the only solution, is the normative Western perspective of the international discourse on development aid in Haiti.

2.2.2 Development Aid is Bad

The second perspective that Escobar, Ferguson, and William Fisher outline rejects the notion that aid is inherently good and instead sees its implementation as "fundamentally flawed."[114] Ferguson criticizes normative critiques of aid, arguing that "pointing out errors and suggesting improvements is an integral part of the process of justifying and legitimating "development" interventions. Such an activity may indeed have some beneficial or mitigating effects, but it does not change the fundamental character of those interventions."[115] This understanding that aid is "fundamentally flawed" includes post-colonial critiques that consider contemporary international relations and the mechanics of development aid to be fraught with unequal power relations based in colonial relations between the global North and South.

---

[112] Ilana Feldman, "The Quaker way: Ethical labor and humanitarian relief," *American Ethnologist* 34/4 (2007), 689-705.
[113] InterAction, "Interaction Viewpoint: NGOs Are Part Of Solution, Not Problem in Haiti," *InterAction,* March 17, 2010, http://www.interaction.org/document/interaction-viewpoint-ngos-are-part-solultion-not-problem-haiti (accessed 1 May 2011).
[114] Escobar, *Encountering Development;* Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine;* William Fisher, "Doing Good? The Politics and Antipolitics of NGO Practices," *Annual Reviews in Anthropology* 26 (1997), 439–464.
[115] Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine,* 285.

In her critique of international aid in Africa, Dambisa Moyo argues that Western aid weakens the path to sustainable development by instilling dependency.[116] She agues against the rhetoric that deems aid essentially good and instead advocates for ending aid to all African countries. Haiti's reliance on development aid demonstrates dependency. This dependency is apparent through, for instance, Haitian Prime Minister Jean-Max Bellerive's statement that Haiti needs "at least five to ten years" of aid following the 2010 earthquake.[117] A dependency on aid is beneficial to the West. Hobart argues that, despite perceived altruism

> development is big business... very profitable not just to the western industries involved, but to those parts of governments which receive aid, let alone to development agencies. And the giving of development aid and the extension of markets for manufactured products is more than balanced by the processes of counter-development, by which the countries to be developed make up the major source of cheap raw materials and labour.[118]

This is the paradox of aid: development aid is premised on the goal of ending poverty, yet requires a continuation of poverty for its existence as an industry. Development aid is indeed "big business" in Haiti. For example, instead of investing foreign aid into the country itself, much of it is returned back into the hands from which it came. Out of 1583 aid projects following the earthquake supported by U.S. government funds of 267 million, most were contracted to internationally-owned countries with only twenty given to companies owned by Haitians.[119] As such, 98.40 USD out of every 100 USD of post-earthquake aid has been effectively returned to the U.S. by funding projects contracted to American companies.[120]

---

[116] Dambisa Moyo, *Dead Aid: Why aid is not working and how there is a better way for Africa* (New York: Allen Lane, 2009).

[117] Randall Palmer and Arshad Mohammed, "Haiti seeks years of aid; donors to meet in March," January 25, 2010, http://www.reuters.com/article/2010/01/25/us-quake-haiti-donors-sb-idUSTRE60O29D20100125 (accessed 1 May 2011).

[118] Hobart, "Introduction: the growth of ignorance?," in *An Anthropological Critique of Development,* 2.

[119] William Booth, "NGOs in Haiti face new questions about effectiveness," *The Washington Post,* February 1, 2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2011/02/01/AR2011020102030.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

[120] Isabeau Doucet, "The Nation: NGOs have failed Haiti," *NPR,* January 13, 2011, http://www.npr.org/2011/01/13/132884795/the-nation-how-ngos-have-failed-haiti (accessed 1 May 2011).

This advancement of foreign interest through development aid is suggested by some post-colonial scholars to be part of a neo-colonial project.[121] Specifically, Escobar argues that since its beginnings following World War II, development aid "has created an extremely efficient apparatus for producing knowledge about, and the exercise of power over, the Third World" and, furthermore, "has successfully deployed a regime of government over the Third World, a 'space for "subject peoples"' that ensures certain control over it."[122] Additionally, he explains that development itself, "although couched in terms of humanitarian goals and the preservation of freedom, the new strategy [of development] sought to provide a new hold on countries and their resources."[123] Roxanne Lynne Doty similarly understands foreign aid to be reproducing the global North's power over the global South as it "put in place permanent mechanisms by which the 'third world' could be monitored, classified, and placed under continual surveillance."[124] Victoria Lawson argues that the modern development discourse effectively recreates the subaltern.[125] Developed in post-colonial theory by Spivak, the subaltern refers to groups outside of hegemonic power structures.[126]

Lawson's argument that the subaltern is recreated through development aid is supported by the current situation in Haiti. For example, the recent letter sent from the Haitian members of the Interim Haiti Reconstruction Commission (IHRC) to co-chair Bill Clinton suggests that the Haitians on the committee have been ignored, disconnected, and silenced. The letter states that "the twelve Haitian members present here feel completely disconnected from the activities of the IHRC... the way Haitians who are not members of the Executive Committee are being treated is very revealing of the desire to minimize their part

---

[121] Alex De Waal, Foreword in *Capitalizing on Catastrophe: Neoliberal Strategies in Disaster Reconstruction,* ed. Nandini Gunewardena and Mark Schuller (Plymouth: AltaMira Press, 2008), ix-xiv; Victoria A. Lawson, *Making Development Geography*.
[122] Escobar, *Encountering Development,* 9.
[123] Ibid, 26.
[124] Roxanne Lynn Doty, *Imperial Encounters: The Politics of Representation in North-South Relations* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1996), 128.
[125] Lawson, *Making Development Geography* (London: Hodder Arnold, 2007).
[126] Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?"

in council."[127] The silencing of Haitian voices in the post-earthquake reconstruction efforts, as Lawson argues, recreates the Haitian subaltern.

These various post-colonial perspectives on the effects of development aid are important for the study of Haiti in order to consider the broader consequences of the current situation. As Ferguson argues, "the outcomes of planned social interventions can end up coming together into powerful constellations of control that were never intended and in some cases never even recognized, but are all the more effective for being 'subjectless.'"[128] He deems this the "anti-politics machine" of "development" depoliticizes aid and constructs certain ideas and representations about "underdeveloped" countries that have important effects.[129] Representations of Haiti as a particular kind of place in international discourse on development are conducive to an Othering of the country and perpetuates unequal power relations between Haiti and Western providers of aid.

2.3 International Development Aid in Haiti

In 1998, the World Bank estimated that there were between 10,000 and 20,000 INGOs and NGOs working in the country, and that number has only increased following the 2010 earthquake.[130] The bulk of foreign aid is funneled through INGOs due to international distrust of the perceived weak and historically threatening Haitian state. Following the earthquake, the U.S. has pledged over 10 billion USD to the country and it is expected that 70% of the money will be funneled through INGOs.[131] Haiti was aptly referred to as a "Republic of NGOs" by the U.S. Institute for Peace in 2008.[132] In 2007 it was estimated that

---

[127] "Protest Letter of Haitian Members of Interim Haiti Reconstruction Commission," *Canada Haiti Action Network,* December 14, 2010, http://canadahaitiaction.ca/content/protest-letter-haitian-members-interim-haiti-reconstruction-commission (accessed 1 May 2011).

[128] Ferguson, *The Anti-Politics Machine,* 19.

[129] Ibid.

[130] Thomas Wiens and Carlos Sobrado, *Haiti: The Challenges of Poverty Reduction* (World Bank, 1998).

[131] José de Córdoba, "Aid Spawns Backlash in Haiti," *Wall Street Journal.* November 12, 2010, http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052702304023804575566743115456322.html# (accessed 1 May 2011).

[132] Madeline Kristoff and Liz Panarelli, "Haiti: A Republic of NGOs?," *U.S. Institute for Peace* (April 2010); William Booth, "NGOs in Haiti face new questions about effectiveness," *The Washington Post,* February 1,

30

CEU eTD Collection

80% of basic public services were being provided by NGOs and that 70% of the Haitian government's operating budget was funded through foreign aid.[133]

The influence of INGOs in Haiti has been recently addressed as potentially problematic. For example, Haitian state officials have described the presence of aid as "an invasion" of NGOs that bypass the state.[134] Similarly, Alex Dupuy critiques the aid situation in Haiti. He argues that the presence of international NGOs reinforces the nation's dependency on aid and weakens the Haitian state in bypassing it, hampering the state's democratic development.[135] Therefore, he argues that aid in Haiti is not helping the country and is instead advancing a Western agenda.[136] The undermining of the Haitian state by the international community is problematic because, as the critiques of international development above suggest, international interests will continually be prioritized over domestic concerns.

2.4 Foreign Interest through Development Aid in Haiti

The establishment of post-World War II humanitarian aid in developing countries such as Haiti has played an important role in perpetuating global power imbalances. This "dramatic" power imbalance between Haiti and the U.S.-led international community is explored by Dupuy, who suggests that the latter "monopolizes economic and political power and calls all the shots" through foreign aid.[137] The international aid industry's existence enables countries of the West to exert their external influence and control within Haiti's borders since, as Hallward suggests, "the conditional disbursement of aid funding to the

---

2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2011/02/01/AR2011020102030.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

[133] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 177-178.

[134] William Booth, "NGOs in Haiti face new questions about effectiveness," *The Washington Post,* February 1, 2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2011/02/01/AR2011020102030.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

[135] Alex Dupuy, *The prophet and power: Jean-Bertrand Aristide, the international community, and Haiti* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2007).

[136] Ibid.

[137] Alex Dupuy, "Foreign Aid Keeps Country from Shaping its own Future," *The Washington Post,* January 9, 2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2011/01/07/AR2011010706511.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

country gives Haiti's international donors enormous if not irresistible leverage."[138] Farmer links this leverage to Haiti's desperate situation, suggesting that "Haiti's tragedy... is about the right of investors to determine the living conditions of the poor."[139] Reasons such as this establish that, according to Farmer, "Haiti and Haitians exist to serve the powerful."[140] Completely dependent on international aid assistance, Robert Fatton states that "Haiti's material well-being is utterly dependent on the whims of the world economy and the demands of foreign financial organizations."[141] As such, Farmer remarks that "In few places in the world have the actions of the powerful had such direct, if unanticipated, effects among the poor."[142] So long as foreign aid is not invested into long-term development of the Haitian local economy, international states will continue to benefit and Haiti will continue to suffer.

To be sure, aid may temporary alleviate particular problems in Haiti. Without international aid, Farmer acknowledges "misery will just increase, and thousands will die of AIDS, malaria and other diseases without any hope of treatment. Those who say the aid is not worth what Haiti has to do to get it do not live daily with the reality of poverty and suffering."[143] However, foreign nations import aid to Haiti under a guise of benevolence and good intentions, a facade that hides the international community's interest and role in both creating and maintaining Haiti's fragile state and its consequential dependency on aid.

2.5 International Discourse on Development Aid in Haiti

Development aid has increased substantially to Haiti following the devastating 2010 earthquake and has been posited as the solution to reconstruction efforts. International media articles following the earthquake called on increases in aid to help Haiti. For instance, an April 2010 *New York Times* article states that

---

[138] Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 7.
[139] Farmer, *The Uses of Haiti,* 231.
[140] Ibid, 51.
[141] Robert Fatton, *Haiti's Predatory Republic: The Unending Transition to Democracy* (Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2002), 39, quoted in Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 9.
[142] Farmer, *The Uses of Haiti,* 46.
[143] Farmer, quoted in Hallward, *Damming the Flood,* 9.

> the United Nations and nongovernmental organizations are pressing ahead... The government of President René Préval and Prime Minister Jean-Max Bellerive has a long way to go to prove its competence and reliability. But the Haitian people should not have to suffer for their government's failings any more than they already have. For these relief efforts to continue – and improve – Haiti needs more emergency aid...[144]

This quote suggests that, since the government of Haiti is incompetent, international aid is the only post-earthquake solution. This narrative dominates international media accounts. Another article in the *New York Post* titled "To really help Haiti, fight corruption" states that the Haitian government is to blame for the failure of past efforts at development and suggests that "it's still possible for Haiti to develop an accountable government... the international community should see this tragedy as an opportunity to break from the past and to empower Haitians to help themselves."[145] This article suggests that only with help of the international community can the Haitian government and Haiti's situation be improved. In addition to suggesting that Haiti is "underdeveloped" politically and, hence, in need of aid, an emphasis on poor socioeconomic post-earthquake conditions frame Haiti's "underdeveloped" existence.

Similarly, representations of the post-earthquake socioeconomic situation of Haiti today emphasize Haiti's dismal state, stressing that the earthquake caused a tumultuous situation. For example, an *ABC News* article titled "Emergency aid 'should be new Haiti focus'" describes the chaotic process of delivering aid:

> United Nations peace-keeping troops have fired warning shots and sprayed tear gas on a crowd of Haitian earthquake survivors as scuffles at a food delivery point spiraled out of control. Fighting broke out in the crowd as the troops distributed food, water and rations to hundreds of people at a former military airfield. In other areas some aid groups have reported attacks on their relief convoys.[146]

---

[144] Editorial, "What Haiti Needs Right Now," *The New York Times,* April 16, 2010, http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/17/opinion/17sat1.html (accessed 1 May 2011).
[145] Michael Magan, "To really help Haiti, fight corruption," *The New York Post,* March 27, 2010, http://www.nypost.com/p/news/opinion/opedcolumnists/to_really_help_haiti_fight_corruption_4aegByfRhTKF JvgHZBgY1J (accessed 1 May 2011).
[146] ABC/BBC, "Emergency aid 'should be new Haiti focus,'" January 24, 2010, http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2010/01/24/2800041.htm (accessed 1 May 2011).

Descriptions of Haiti's post-earthquake turmoil like this construct Haiti as disorderly and Other as opposed to the orderly Western providers of aid. In these representations, hordes of Haitians are binarized with rational UN troops attempting better the victims' lives. Many accounts of the post-earthquake situation focus on Haiti's IDP camps and the poor living conditions in them. For instance, a *BBC News* report states that "the conditions are ghastly – one child we saw drank dirty water from the same bucket he urinated in."[147] Stories such as these present Haiti as an appalling and grotesque place and again Other it against the West.

Othering narratives such as these present Haiti as "underdeveloped" in international discourses and consequently frame development aid as the only solution for Haiti, justifying Western intervention. Representations like these are, importantly, the focuses of narratives in the international discourse on gender violence and, as I will explore in Chapters III and IV, have a similarly Othering effect through those discourses.

---

[147] Sima Kotecha, "Rape at 'crisis' level in Haiti earthquake camps," *BBC News*, January 13, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/newsbeat/12171443 (accessed 5 May 2011).

Chapter III
Gender Violence in Haiti

3.1 International Discourse, Development Aid, and Gender Violence

Gender violence is a reoccurring theme in international discourses on development, and is a critical part of the international discourses on Haiti both before and after the 2010 earthquake. Feminist development scholars have explored how gender violence is an important element of development discourse used to Other Third World places as "backwards," "underdeveloped," and in need of aid. Shirin Rai argues that gender takes a central role in this Othering through development discourse by presenting Third World women as "victims of barbaric cultures as well as their markers."[148] She suggests that development discourse suggests that "the social relations that enmeshed [Third World women] were barbaric and therefore threatening to the civilized world."[149] Additionally, Uma Narayan argues that Western discourse habitually engages in culture-blaming when discussing fatal forms of violence against women in Third World countries by giving "cultural explanations" for gender violence.[150] Comparatively, gender violence in the West against white women of European descent is rarely, if ever, linked to explanations of "culture."

Perspectives such as these demonstrate how gender violence, as a problem for Third World women caused by "their" culture, is used to Other Third World countries in international discourse on development. In this chapter I explore the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti and argue that, by making use of culture-blaming, post-colonial stereotypes of people, human rights rhetoric, and post-colonial notions of gendered states, the

---

[148] Rai, *Gender and the Political Economy of Development,* 56.

[149] Ibid, 56.

[150] Uma Narayan, "Death by culture," in *Dislocating Cultures: Identities, Traditions, and Third World Feminism* (New York: Routledge, 1997), 81-117. I use the phrase "culture-blaming" interchangeably with what Narayan defines to be "cultural explanations" in which "culture" is blamed for or used to explain the oppression of women in non-Western (Third World) places.

international discourse on gender violence contributes to an Othering of Haiti as a "failed" place in need of international development aid and help of the West.

3.2 Gender Violence in Haiti

Gender violence is a very real problem for Haiti and has been an important part of the international discourse on the country over the years. Gender violence in Haiti began to enter the international discourse in the 1990s after reports surfaced that rape was used as a repressive political tool during the military regime that ruled after ousting President Jean-Bertrand Aristide in 1991. In 1994, the well-known INGO Human Rights Watch (HRW) with the National Coalition for Haitian Rights (NCHR) published *Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror,* which focused on how the military regime used rape to systematically violate human rights.[151] In 1999, the UN Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women also emphasized the problem of the political rapes between 1991-1994 that followed the military coup d'état as well as in earlier years under the Duvalier regime.[152] Anne Fuller argues that the public discussion of political rape during the military regime of 1991-1994 paved the way for further discussion on gender violence, "*legitimizing* public discussion of what had been a forbidden topic" [original emphasis].[153]

As Fuller suggests, political rape in Haiti did indeed make international headlines. For example, an article in *The Washington Post* titled "Political Repression by Rape Increasing in Haiti" from 1994 discusses the HRW report and states that "Haiti's police, military and paramilitary forces are using rape as a terror tactic, frequently against women activists accused of supporting exiled president Jean-Bertrand Aristide."[154] Another article from 1994

---

[151] Human Rights Watch/National Coalition for Haitian Refugees, *Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror*, HRW/NCHR (New York, 1994), 4.
[152] UN Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC), *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women, Its causes and consequences: Report on the Mission to Haiti,* UN Doc. E/CN.4/2000/68/Add.3 (27 January 2000).
[153] Anne Fuller, "Challenging Violence: Haitian Women Unite Women's Rights and Human Rights," *The Association of Concerned Africa Scholars. Special Bulletin on Women and War* (Spring/Summer 1999).
[154] Janet Reitman, "Political Repression by Rape Increasing in Haiti," *The Washington Post,* July 22, 1994.

in *The Washington Times* describes a U.S. report that states that "the military and the de facto government promote repression and terror, sanctioning widespread assassination, killing, torture, beating, mutilation and rape."[155] Following the example of the UN and HRW, the international discourse on gender violence stressed the issue of political rape.

The focus on political gender violence in Haiti was again emphasized by international discourse after the second military coup of 2004 that again ousted Aristide when rape was, yet again, used by gangs of men as a repressive political weapon. In 2008 Amnesty International, an important U.S.-based human rights INGO, released *Don't Turn Your Back on Girls: Sexual Violence Against Girls in Haiti.* This report states that

> during the armed rebellion that ousted President Jean-Bertrand Aristide for a second time in February 2004, and in its aftermath, rape was used as a weapon by numerous gangs throughout the country to terrorize the population... the prevailing state of lawlessness and lack of public security that accompanied the transitional government of Haiti between March 2004 and May 2006 were contributing factors to such high incidence of sexual abuse.[156]

International narratives on gender violence in Haiti also paid particular attention to gang rape, a phenomenon understood as ensuing the use of rape as a tool of political repression. For example, a 2007 article in *The Guardian* stresses gang rape, stating that "the phenomenon of gang rape is common."[157] Similarly, a *BBC News* article focuses on gang rape in the 2008 article "Rape looms large over Haiti slums," stating that "the street gangs in the slums use rape as a powerful weapon of war."[158]

The emphasis on gang rapes is also stressed in Amnesty's 2008 report *Don't Turn Your Back on Girls.* The report stated that "while widespread reports of groups of armed men raping women started under the military regime (1991-1994), it has now become a common

---

[155] Ben Barber, "U.S. rips Haiti on human rights: Report cites rise in rape, murder, intimidation by junta," *The Washington Times,* September 14, 1994.
[156] Amnesty International, *Don't turn your back on girls: Sexual violence against girls in Haiti,* AMR 36/004/2008 (November 2008), 5.
[157] Alex Renton, "The rape epidemic," *The Guardian,* December 2, 2007, http://www.guardian.co.uk/lifeandstyle/2007/dec/02/women.features3 (accessed 1 May 2011).
[158] BBC, "Rape looms large over Haiti slums," *BBC News,* November 27, 2008, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/7750568.stm (accessed 1 May 2011).

practice among criminal gangs."[159] The focus on "criminal" gang rape is reflected in a 2009 news video from *The Guardian* titled "Haiti's Lost Girls."[160] Its caption states that "inside Haiti's foetid slums, where criminal gangs use rape as a weapon to control the millions struggling to survive extreme poverty."[161] The video focuses on victims who are attacked by gangs of "armed men who moves in packs."[162] Like the Amnesty report, the *Guardian* video suggests that the gang rape was influenced by the practice of political rape. The video's narrator states that the military "used rape to subdue the population" and that the police "also used rape to terrify [Haitians]" and that, because of this history, "it became almost inevitable that the men from the slums would feel free to use the same power."[163]

Over the years domestic violence was also given attention by international narratives, albeit rather marginal compared to other more "public" forms of gender violence like gang rape. For instance, a 2007 World Bank study reported that 46% of Haitian girls had been sexually abused within the home.[164] Additionally, Amnesty's 2008 report addressed "sexual violence in the community and family" as a small sub-topic.[165] Though the international discourse on gender violence does not highlight domestic violence, select national studies confirm it was also an issue in addition to political and gang rape. In Haiti, a study was conducted by the Centre Haïtien des Recherches et d'Actions pour la Promotion Féminine (CHREPROF) in 1996 that addressed the problem of domestic violence and stated that seven out of ten women participants of the study were victims of gender violence and, out of those victims, half reported the perpetrators to be husbands or boyfriends.[166] A study on domestic

---

[159] Amnesty International, *Don't turn your back on girls*, 5.
[160] GuardianFilms, "Haiti's Lost Girls," *The Guardian,* March 8, 2009,
http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/video/2009/mar/08/haiti-slums-rape (accessed 1 May 2011).
[161] Ibid.
[162] Ibid.
[163] Ibid.
[164] Michael Justesen and Dorte Verner, *Factors Impacting Youth Development in Haiti,* 4 (World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series, Paper No. WPS411 0 2007).
[165] Amnesty International, *Don't turn your back on girls*, 23.
[166] Anastasia J. Gage, "Women's experience of intimate partner violence in Haiti," *Social Science & Medicine* 61 (2005), 346.

and sexual violence in Haiti conducted by the Ministry of Women's Affairs and Women's Rights published in 2006 also addressed gender violence within the family as a problem. It states that

> the general perception of women victims of violence, service providers and members of the community is that the levels of violence in Haiti are very high and this is reflected within the family. They all see a link between social and sexual violence and violence within the family... the most common manifestations of violence being physical violence within the family and sexual violence (rape) outside the family.[167]

In the years leading up to the earthquake, international narratives discussed gender violence with a focus on the issues of political rape and gang rape. However, as explored above, Haitian studies demonstrate that domestic violence was also an issue during those time periods. Following the earthquake, the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti focuses on rape in the IDP camps with little to no mention of domestic violence. The focus on "public" forms of gender violence in stories both before and after the earthquake is of interest and I will elaborate on its effects in Chapter IV.

In this chapter I continue by examining the re-occurring themes of culture-blaming, post-colonial stereotypes of people, human rights rhetoric, and post-colonial notions of gendered states in the discourses on gender violence in both "private" and "public" forms before and after the earthquake. In the course of this analysis, however, by no means do I attempt to dismiss the reality and severity of the problem of gender violence in Haiti and the importance of raising awareness on the issue within the country and the broader international community. In this analysis I am concerned with and seek to uncover how these discourses contribute to a post-colonial Othering of Haiti as a particular place of gender violence and what their broader effects are.

---

[167] Ministère à la Condition Féminine et aux Droits des Femmes, "Une réponse à la violence faite aux femmes en Haïti. Étude sur la violence domestique et sexuelle en Haïti" (2007), 5.

3.3 Haiti's "Culture" of Gender Violence

International narratives on gender violence in Haiti engage in a particular form of culture-blaming. In her 2008 article on "The Double Weakness of Girls: Discrimination and Sexual Violence in Haiti," legal scholar Benedetta Faedi Duramy argues that stigmatization is linked to the fact that eligibility for marriage demands chastity and a virtuous reputation.[168] Therefore, she argues that incidents of gender violence are generally understood "as unfortunate events of life, rather than crimes."[169] The idea that gender violence is so normalized by Haitian "culture" that it is not even a crime is repeated throughout the discussions on gender violence in Haiti. For instance, the history of gender violence in Haiti is discussed in the post-earthquake international discourse on gender violence as if gender violence is ingrained in the "culture."

A 2011 *Los Angeles Times* article states that "Rape wasn't even considered a serious criminal offense in Haiti until five years ago... Before 2005, rape was considered an offense against honor, or 'crime of passion,' meaning it was a minor infraction in which the perpetrator would go free if he agreed to marry his victim."[170] By stressing the incredibility that rape is not taken seriously, this article Others Haiti as a place with a culture accepting of gender violence as opposed to the West, a place vehemently against such horrors. Through presenting Haiti as "backwards" in its apparent acceptance of "out-of-control" sexuality and violence in its handling of gender violence, Haiti fits the primitive "savage slot," against which the West's "civilization" and order are reified. The same *Los Angeles Times* article also states that

> rape has long been a scourge in Haiti. It was used as a form of political repression in 1994 and in 2004, periods of upheaval when military dictators and their brutish gangs of enforcers seized power. Men who opposed the regime were abducted and killed,

---

[168] Benedetta Faedi Duramy, "The Double Weakness of Girls: Discrimination and Sexual Violence in Haiti," *Stanford Journal of International Law* 44/147 (2008), 167.
[169] Ibid.
[170] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

3.3 Haiti's "Culture" of Gender Violence

International narratives on gender violence in Haiti engage in a particular form of culture-blaming. In her 2008 article on "The Double Weakness of Girls: Discrimination and Sexual Violence in Haiti," legal scholar Benedetta Faedi Duramy argues that stigmatization is linked to the fact that eligibility for marriage demands chastity and a virtuous reputation.[168] Therefore, she argues that incidents of gender violence are generally understood "as unfortunate events of life, rather than crimes."[169] The idea that gender violence is so normalized by Haitian "culture" that it is not even a crime is repeated throughout the discussions on gender violence in Haiti. For instance, the history of gender violence in Haiti is discussed in the post-earthquake international discourse on gender violence as if gender violence is ingrained in the "culture."

A 2011 *Los Angeles Times* article states that "Rape wasn't even considered a serious criminal offense in Haiti until five years ago... Before 2005, rape was considered an offense against honor, or 'crime of passion,' meaning it was a minor infraction in which the perpetrator would go free if he agreed to marry his victim."[170] By stressing the incredibility that rape is not taken seriously, this article Others Haiti as a place with a culture accepting of gender violence as opposed to the West, a place vehemently against such horrors. Through presenting Haiti as "backwards" in its apparent acceptance of "out-of-control" sexuality and violence in its handling of gender violence, Haiti fits the primitive "savage slot," against which the West's "civilization" and order are reified. The same *Los Angeles Times* article also states that

> rape has long been a scourge in Haiti. It was used as a form of political repression in 1994 and in 2004, periods of upheaval when military dictators and their brutish gangs of enforcers seized power. Men who opposed the regime were abducted and killed,

---

[168] Benedetta Faedi Duramy, "The Double Weakness of Girls: Discrimination and Sexual Violence in Haiti," *Stanford Journal of International Law* 44/147 (2008), 167.
[169] Ibid.
[170] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

women raped. *An entire generation of Haitians is filled with children of rape* [emphasis added].[171]

By suggesting that "an entire generation of Haitians is filled with children of rape," this article implies that gender violence (rape) is inherent in the Haitian culture. Similarly, a 2011 Los Angeles Times article begins with the following story:

> Halya Lagunesse thought she knew despair. Nearly seven years ago, the soldiers who had killed her husband gang-raped the Haitian woman and her daughter Joann, who was 17 at the time. But that pain pales in comparison to the torment of learning last March that her 5-year-old granddaughter had been raped... Hers is a tragedy of rape compounded: Her granddaughter, now 6, was conceived in the gang rape of her daughter.[172]

This chilling quote emphasizes the notion that rape is so embedded in "their" way of life that generations of Haitians are born of it. Likewise, a 2006 article published by the nonprofit Center for Public Integrity states that "violence against women is endemic in Haitian culture," also suggesting that violence is engrained in Haiti's culture.[173]

The post-earthquake article in *The Daily Mail* discussed previously in the introduction especially exoticizes Haiti as a place where rape is inherent in the "culture."[174] Published only two days after the earthquake, this article explains Haiti to a Western audience, of which many had likely heard little of Haiti before the 2010 earthquake hit international headlines. Giving an extremely exoticized version of Haitian history, the article states additionally that

> those with the misfortune to be born in Haiti... have long endured a living hell. With one in ten under-40s infected with HIV, and millions living in squalor and destitution, thousands try to flee each year to the U.S. by hanging on to anything that will float. While hurricanes, floods and earthquakes have all devastated the landscape over the years, the biggest threat has come from humans. Successive dictators have raped,

---

[171] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[172] Ibid.
[173] Sarah Fort, "Violence: an Ever-Present Threat," *The Centre for Public Integrity,* November 11, 2006, http://projects.publicintegrity.org/aids/report.aspx?aid=814 (accessed 1 May 2011).
[174] Andrew Malone, "Haiti: Rape, murder and voodoo on the Island of the Damned," *The Daily Mail,* January 14, 2010, http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1243016/ANDREW-MALONE-Rape-murder-voodoo-island-damned.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

murdered and even reputedly eaten their enemies. [Haiti is] described by one commentator as an 'international crime scene' rather than a country...[175]

Rape, according to this article, is just one of the many atrocities in Haiti's history that is part of their "exotic" and horrific culture. This article Others Haiti by representing it as a place full of "deviants" – rapists, criminals, savages (cannibals), and diseased that inhabit the "Island of the Damned." Descriptions such as this construct Haiti as a dystopia, fitting what Trouillot deems the "savage slot," the "space for the inherently Other," that is pitted against and separated from an ideal utopia.[176] Constructing Haiti as a dystopia because of its culture, one that encourages gender violence, reinstates notions that gender violence is a problem "there" (Haiti) and not "here" (the West).

Culture-blaming has also been used to explain the under-reporting of gender violence in Haiti. The international discourse on gender violence in Haiti refers to a "stigmatization" of gender violence victims as a problem linked to Haiti's culture. Amnesty's 2008 report *Don't Turn Your Back on Girls* states that,

> as with other forms of violence against women and girls, victims of rape in Haiti are often unwilling to report the crime, largely due to shame, fear and social attitudes that tolerate and legitimize male violence.... social attitudes towards victims of sexual violence which blame the victim rather than the rapist deter girls from reporting and ensuring that those responsible are held to account.[177]

This statement is an example of how Haitian social attitudes or culture is blamed for the under-reporting of rape, suggesting that "they" (Haitians) do not understand rape "properly," like "we" (in the West) do. The same report also suggests that the under-reporting of domestic violence is also a fault of the Haitian society and culture in addition to the under-reporting of more "public" forms of rape. It states that "violence in the family often remains

---

[175] Andrew Malone, "Haiti: Rape, murder and voodoo on the Island of the Damned," *The Daily Mail,* January 14, 2010, http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1243016/ANDREW-MALONE-Rape-murder-voodoo-island-damned.html (accessed 5 May 2011).
[176] Trouillot, Introduction and "Anthropology and the Savage Slot" in *Global Transformations,* 1, 17.
[177] Amnesty International, *Don't turn your back on girls*, 13.

hidden... the result of this failure to acknowledge and address the problem is a social climate in which violence in the family is seen as normal, unimportant, or inevitable."[178]

In a similar manner, many international news articles on gender violence following the earthquake stress the stigmatization of raped women as a "cultural" problem that encourages gender violence. A 2010 article in *The Independent* states that "Rape... remains shrouded in shame. Victims are often forced out of school and ostracised by their communities..."[179] A post-earthquake *MSNBC News* article sub-heading states "Victim: 'I am so ashamed. We're scared people will find out and shun us.'"[180] A 2010 *CBS News* article states that "sexual assaults are daily occurrences in the biggest camps, aid workers say - and most attacks go unreported because of the shame, social stigma and fear of reprisals from attackers."[181] Similarly, a 2011 *Los Angeles Times* article repeats that, despite the fact that rape is now (finally) recognized as a crime in Haiti, "still, victims are stigmatized..."[182] The focus on "stigma" in the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti constructs the country as a place where gender violence is not only widespread but stigmatized by culture as opposed to the Western world where gender violence is "under control" and taken seriously.

Discussions of gender violence in Haiti frequently stress how the authorities are not taking gender violence seriously. The 2008 Amnesty report *Don't Turn Your Back on Girls* states that, in addition to social attitudes, another reason for the under-reporting of gender violence in Haiti is the "lack of confidence that girls and women will experience a positive

---

[178] Amnesty International, *Don't turn your back on girls*, 16.
[179] Nina Lakhani, **"**Rape on the rise in Haiti's camps," *The Independent*, February 7, 2010, http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/rape-on-the-rise-in-haitis-camps-1891514.html (accessed 5 May 2011).
[180] Associated Press, "Haiti quake victims now face rape trauma," *MSNBC,* March 16, 2010, http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/35899757/ns/world_news-haiti/t/haiti-quake-victims-now-face-rape-trauma/ (accessed 5 May 2011).
[181] CBS/Associated Press, "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps," *CBS News,* March 17, 2010, http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).
[182] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

and supportive response from law enforcement officials."[183] A post-earthquake *Fox News* article states that "over in Haiti, police don't always take the victim's side, so abuse isn't reported as much as it is here in the United States."[184] This statement is an explicit comparison between the West's "proper" handling of gender violence in comparison with Haiti, a culture that is so "backwards" women can not even report the crime. It also implies that Haitian police and thus the state of Haiti are corrupt, can not function properly, and are "failed." A 2011 *Los Angeles Times* article states that

> abusers [are] rarely caught and prosecuted to the full extent of the law... Malya Villard-Appolon, a founding member of [local women's organization] Kofaviv, recalled how police leered at her 14-year-old daughter when the two went to a police station to report the girl's rape. One officer said girls and young women get raped because they're "in heat.""[185]

In this article the lack of attention given to gender violence by the authorities is explicitly linked to the "backwards" Haitian culture where police do not understand rape as a crime. Haiti is Othered as a place where gender violence is acceptable compared to the orderly West that understands gender violence as a problem and, moreover, takes measures to address it. Again, Haiti is represented as a place where gender violence is both widespread – both embedded in and not taken seriously by its culture.

3.4 "Helpless" Haitian women

As Rai suggests, women are not only victims of "culture" in the development discourse but are also their "markers."[186] This is particularly prevalent in development discourse on gender violence where representations of Third World women are central. Mohanty's work on discursively victimized Third World women and Spivak's critique of

---

[183] Amnesty International, *Don't turn your back on girls*, 13.

[184] Tyisha Fernandes, "A local pastor talks about domestic violence in Haitian culture," *Fox News,* 2011, http://www.fox4now.com/story/11172416/a-local-pastor-talks-about-domestic-violence-in-haitian-culture?redirected=true (accessed 30 May 2011).

[185] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

[186] Shirin M. Rai, *Gender and the Political Economy of Development* (Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell, 2002)*,* 56.

44

colonial discourse's narrative on "saving" women are both built upon and applied in a development context with respect to gender violence. As I explored in Chapter I, Mohanty argues that representations of "helpless" Third World women in Western discourse deny women in the Third World or global South agency in comparison to Western women.[187] Similarly, in her work on development, Geeta Chowdhry uses the idea of Third World women to suggest that development discourse constructs women as "objects that need help, not subjects who could be active participants in the development process."[188] Representations of Third World women as "helpless," contrary to empowered (white) Western women, signify the danger they face by their Othered "culture."

In the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti, representations that present Haitian women as "helpless" victims are important and reoccur frequently in news stories. For example, a 2010 Amnesty press release on sexual violence in the camps paints a descriptive picture of the victimized women:

> The sadness of these girls, their low voices, their pains and their fears speak clearer and louder than any data or number. One of them is pregnant, another is afraid of being pregnant, some are terrified of being killed by their attackers. They look resigned and submissive. When we asked them what they want most in life, all of them assertively said they wanted to continue to go to school. One of them gave us a message to pass to the authorities: "You need to protect the girls, because I don't want anybody to suffer what I have been going through."[189]

A feeling of helplessness is emphasized again by Amnesty in a second 2010 press release that states "Women and girls living in makeshift shelters feel vulnerable and are afraid of attacks."[190] *BBC News* repeats that women are "especially vulnerable."[191] A 2010 article in

---

[187] Mohanty, "Under Western Eyes," 61-88.
[188] Geeta Chowdry, "Engendering Development? Women in Development (WID) in International Development Regimes," in *Feminism/Postmodernism/Development,* ed. Marianne Marchand and Jane L. Parpart, (London: Routledge, 1995), 33.
[189] Chiara Liguori, "Sexual violence in Haitian camps of the displaced, beyond the numbers," *Amnesty International*, March 22, 2010, http://livewire.amnesty.org/2010/03/22/sexual-violence-in-haitian-camps-of-the-displaced-beyond-the-numbers/ (accessed 5 May 2011).
[190] Amnesty International, "Haiti's Emergency Response Must Include Protection from Sexual Violence," *Amnesty International*, March 25, 2010, http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/haitis-emergency-response-must-include-protection-sexual-violence-2010-03-25 (accessed 5 May 2011).

The New York Times similarly highlights women's vulnerability to gender violence post-earthquake, asserting that "sleeping in camps, on the street and in yards, many feel themselves at the mercy not only of the elements but of those who prey on others' misery."[192] In addition to framing Haitian women as vulnerable, helpless victims, a 2011 *Los Angeles Times* article on post-earthquake rape emphasizes a "Third World" vulnerability status by giving the description that "Haitian women are the poorest and most disenfranchised in this poorest of nations in the hemisphere."[193] Emphasizing Haitian women's socioeconomic status contributes to a emphasis of a Third World victimization.

To represent the Third World women victim in international discourses on gender violence, many news and NGO reports focus on narratives that depict stereotypical victims of gender violence and particularly victims of rape. Catherine MacKinnon argues that women are judged on their ability to consent to sex on the basis of their morality, suggesting that "virtuous women, like young girls, are unconsenting, virginal, rapable. Unvirtuous women, like wives and prostitutes, are consenting, whores, unrapable."[194] International discourses on gender violence in Haiti use examples of young girls to fit Western understandings of the "proper" rape victim. A 2008 *BBC News* article sub-heading emphasizes youth, stating that "Amnesty says 55% of the 105 rapes reported so far this year were girls aged under 18." The article depicts an interview with a rape victim, describing her to be "a shy and skinny 16-year-old." The emphasis on youth persists in many news articles. A 2010 *CBS News* article on rape in the post-earthquake IDP camps describes youth victims:

> In the hilltop suburb of Petionville, where plush mansions look out over slums on hillsides and in ravines, a 7-year-old rape victim was being treated Monday in the

[191] BBC, "Haiti: Rape warning from human rights group," *BBC News,* January 6, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-latin-america-12125810 (accessed 1 May 2011).

[192] Deborah Sontag, "Sexual Assaults add to miseries of Haiti's ruins," *New York Times*, June 23, 2010, http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/24/world/americas/24haiti.html (accessed 6 April 2011).

[193] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

[194] Catherine A. MacKinnon, *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989), 175.

hospital of a tent camp set up on a golf course. Another child, a 2-year-old, had been raped in the same camp two weeks earlier.[195]

Similarly, a 2011 *BBC News* article includes a bolded sub-heading emphasizing "Child victims" and writes about an interview with Josie Philistin, the rape shelter co-ordinator for the women's group Kofaviv who said that "after the earthquake we received lots of victims but maybe 80% are adolescent. We have also lots younger, maybe 5 years old, who have been raped."[196] Youth is again underscored by a 2010 article on post-earthquake rape in *The Independent* that states "so widespread are the reports – and they include the rape of a girl of 12 by her rescuer after she was pulled out from the rubble – that emergency measures are now being taken."[197]

Representations of youth are particularly shocking for a Western audience as they are linked to an understanding that rape and sexual assault is worse when the victim is sexually inexperienced and "virtuous." A 2010 article on post-earthquake rape in *CBS News* reflects this explicitly by blatantly drawing attention to a victim's sexual history. The article states that "Pierre [a human rights advocate who lives in a camp] has documented three other gang rapes in the camp, including of a 17-year-old who says she was a virgin before six men attacked her and raped her repeatedly."[198] By stressing stories with young, virginal victims that fit Western stereotypes of the "proper" rape victim, these representations are depicting a clear image of Haitian women as "helpless" Third World women victims to a Western audience.

As these examples demonstrate, the discourse on gender violence in Haiti emphasizes women's victimization. Such representations could be a result of efforts to entice readership

---

[195] CBS/Associated Press, "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps," *CBS News,* March 17, 2010, http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).
[196] Sima Kotecha, "Rape at 'crisis' level in Haiti earthquake camps," *BBC News*, January 13, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/newsbeat/12171443 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[197] Nina Lakhani, **"**Rape on the rise in Haiti's camps," *The Independent*, February 7, 2010, http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/rape-on-the-rise-in-haitis-camps-1891514.html (accessed 5 May 2011).
[198] CBS/Associated Press, "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps," *CBS News,* March 17, 2010, http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).

or provoke foreign donations to Haiti. However, representations of victimized Third World women are problematic, despite the reality of these stories and the severity of the impact of violence on Haitian women. Constructing Haitian women as Third World Women victimize them as "objects" in need of "saving" from Haitian culture and men plays an important role in the Othering of Haiti as a dangerous and "backwards" place. Similar to representations of post-colonial Third World Women explored by Mohanty, Spivak, and Abu-Lughod, this victimization and narrative of "saving" through representations of post-colonial Third World Haitian women reinforces a "sense of superiority" in the West that enables a positioning of international development aid as the solution.

3.5 "Dangerous" Haitian men

The "helpless" Third World women in international discourse on gender violence are not only the victims of Third World "culture" but also the victims of the "dangerous" Third World men. As discussed previously in Chapter I, racialized notions of the "dangerous" black men are crucial to post-colonial discourse. In international narratives on gender violence, the threat of the Third World men justifies the West's intervention and the "saving" of women in "underdeveloped" places. The discourse on gender violence in Haiti constructs an image of "dangerous" Haitian men by stressing the uncontrolled nature of Haitian male sexuality. In a 2007 *Guardian* article, journalist Alex Renton describes his personal reaction:

> At this point, I find myself wondering if Haiti's epidemic of sexual violence can really be explained as simply as it is... Poverty and boredom equals rape? As a man, I have to confess I don't understand rape... I can't picture myself doing that... Patrick [Haitian interviewee] said he thought that Haitian men were sex addicts. Rape and 'sodomy' were their favourite activities... One [man working in an NGO], an Italian, said he found Haitian male sexuality bizarre to the point of disturbing.[199]

---

[199] Alex Renton, "The rape epidemic," *The Guardian,* December 2, 2007, http://www.guardian.co.uk/lifeandstyle/2007/dec/02/women.features3 (accessed 1 May 2011).

This quote represents the white British male journalist as "civilized" and incapable of rape who is compared against the "savage," "dangerous," hypersexualized black Haitian men, all of whom are potential rapists.

The emphasis on the number of Haitian men who are armed, in gangs, and who are criminals is stressed in the international discourse on gender violence. A 2008 *BBC News* article quotes then-Head of the Haitian Ministry of Women, Myrian Merlet, who states that gangs of men "have the power to terrorise the population as they wish."[200] It is not only the dangerous nature of the gangs that creates a representation of "dangerous" Haitian men but the widespread nature of the gangs, as if all Haitian men are members. A 2007 article on Haiti's "rape epidemic" in *The Guardian* answers the question "why is there so much rape?" with the following:

> [a] lack of education and most important, lack of jobs. Ninety-five per cent of the young people in Cité Soleil are unemployed. 'And the young men who are unemployed are often in gangs.'...the slums of Port-au-Prince and other Haitian cities are indeed dominated by gangs.[201]

The presence of gangs is also stressed by Amnesty International in their 2011 *Aftershocks* report, which states "most of the rape victims interviewed by Amnesty International were raped by armed men and youth gangs roaming the camps after dark." [202] A 2011 *BBC News* article includes a bold sub-title that, in reference to perpetrators, states that "they often come armed with knives and pistols. In darkness, they slit open [post-earthquake IDP camp] tents and rape the women inside."[203] A 2011 *Los Angeles Times* article describes the young men who join the armed gangs as "uneducated, unemployed men who populate the camps, often

---

[200] BBC, "Rape looms large over Haiti slums," *BBC News,* November 27, 2008, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/7750568.stm (accessed 1 May 2011).
[201] Alex Renton, "The rape epidemic," *The Guardian,* December 2, 2007, http://www.guardian.co.uk/lifeandstyle/2007/dec/02/women.features3 (accessed 1 May 2011).
[202] Amnesty International, *Aftershocks: Women Speak Out Against Sexual Violence in Haiti's Camps,* AMR 36/001/2011 (January 2011), 6.
[203] Sima Kotecha, "Rape at 'crisis' level in Haiti earthquake camps," *BBC News*, January 13, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/newsbeat/12171443 (accessed 5 May 2011).

stoned and with time on their hands. They see women and girls as fair game."[204] Similar to the association of armed mass violence with notions of revolution, armed "gangs" are particularly threatening to both state and society. Representations that depict the presence of armed gangs of men contribute to an idea of Haitian men as particularly "dangerous" and threatening to both Haitian women and the West itself.

In addition to highlighting perpetrators who are in armed gangs, the international discourse also stresses that many of the perpetrators are previous criminals. A 2010 *CBS News* report states that "[Haitian] Police Chief Mario Andresol blamed the attacks on the more than 7,000 prisoners who escaped. 'Bandits are taking advantage to harass and rape women and young girls under the tents,' he told reporters two weeks after the quake."[205] A 2010 *Times* article similarly stresses criminals as known perpetrators with its title "Criminals in Haiti 'raping quake survivors and trafficking children.'"[206] The article elaborates, stating that "Criminals in Haiti are preying on vulnerable earthquake survivors, even raping women, in makeshift camps set up in Port-au-Prince after the disaster. [Police Chief Mario Andresol states that] 'It took us five years to apprehend them. Today they are running wild.'"[207] An emphasis on the danger of the perpetrators reflects real concerns. Nevertheless, these are the primary representations of Haitian men in the international discourse on gender violence and thus perpetuate the stereotypical representation of Third World black men as "dangerous," "wild," and "savage."

The representations of "dangerous" Haitian men in international discourse on gender violence are strengthened by descriptions and images of women who have visible injuries. A 2011 *BBC News* article on post-earthquake rape in the camps quotes a victim who said that

---

[204] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[205] CBS/Associated Press, "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps," *CBS News,* March 17, 2010, http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).
[206] Times (UK), "Criminals in Haiti 'raping quake and trafficking children,'" *The Times* (UK), January 29, 2010, http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/us_and_americas/article7007400.ece (accessed 1 May 2011).
[207] Ibid.

"after they finished [raping me], they beat me. They beat me so much that you can see scars on my skin and my knee."[208] Another 2011 *BBC News* article quotes an additional victim who described her attack, stating that "in the night it was raining. I was in my tent and one man came in, kicked me in the belly. He then raped me. I screamed but nobody could hear me because of the rain. I bled non-stop for three months afterwards."[209] The awareness-raising 2010 UN Women (formerly UNIFEM) video also draws attention to visible injuries. The video begins with close ups of a young victim's beaten eye and head, and later states that "the trauma of the day before is evident... her damaged eye, her bandaged head..."[210] Representations of victims who have visible injuries reinforce notions that Haitian men are "violent," "barbaric," and "savage," emblematic of the racialized, hyper-sexualized, and "dangerous" Third World men.

3.6 Human Rights, Gender Violence, and Haiti

Within international discourses on Haiti, gender violence is not only represented as a problem embedded in Haitian culture, carried out by racialized stereotypes of the "dangerous" Third World men against the "helpless" Third World women, but is also represented as an example of Haiti's lack of human rights. Universal notions of human rights are understood as necessary to "correct" the "backwards" cultures of the Third World. Furthermore, a liberal discourse on human rights is used in international discourse on development as a mechanism for justifying international aid. Whereas the Third World is constructed as lacking in human rights, Doty suggests that the West has been constructed through development discourse as "inherently humane and democratic," just like they were

---

[208] BBC, "Haiti: Rape warning from human rights group," *BBC News*, January 6, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-latin-america-12125810 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[209] Sima Kotecha, "Rape at 'crisis' level in Haiti earthquake camps," *BBC News*, January 13, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/newsbeat/12171443 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[210] UNIFEM, "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within," *Youtube,* October 1, 2010, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).

"inherently civilized in earlier encounters."[211] Doty suggests that, through development and foreign aid, "once again the West must breathe life into a base and lifeless (though always potentially volatile) element of humanity, giving it an identity and beginning its history."[212]

Critiques of the liberal human rights discourse criticize it for its compliance with capital interests, the masking of global inequalities, and ties to an Enlightenment discourse where a universalist discourse on rights was silent about colonial practices.[213] Though the West is constructed as the bearer of human rights, Chandra Muzaffar notes that "Western colonialism in Asia, Australasia, Africa, and Latin America represents the most massive, systematic violation of human rights ever known in history."[214] Feminist scholars have explored how narratives of gender are a part of the liberal human rights discourse. Geeta Chowdry explores how the international discourses on child labor in India are strongly influenced by the rhetoric of universal human rights.[215] Building on previous post-colonial literature that suggests international human rights, including women's rights, are "universal only in pretension, not in practice, since it is a charter of an idealist European philosophy," she argues that "current claims to universal human rights are mired in the political antagonisms of the colonial encounter."[216]

Similarly, in her article on human rights in Burma, Sheila Nair argues that "the emergence of a dominant liberal human rights discourse on a global scale has been central to

---

[211] Doty, *Imperial Encounters,* 139.

[212] Ibid, 134.

[213] Sheila Nair, "Human Rights and Postcoloniality: Representing Burma," in *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class,* ed. Geeta Chowdry and Sheila Nair (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), 258.

[214] Chandra Muzaffar, "From human rights to human dignity," in P. Van Ness, ed. *Debating Human Rights* (London: Routledge, 1999), 26, quoted in Nair, "Human Rights and Postcoloniality," 259.

[215] Geeta Chowdry, "Postcolonial interrogations of child labor: Human rights, carpet trade, and Rugmark in India," in *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class,* ed. Geeta Chowdry and Sheila Nair (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), 225-253.

[216] Richard A. Wilson, ed. *Human Rights, Culture and Context: Anthropological Perspectives* (London: Pluto Press, 1997), 4, quoted in Chowdry, "Postcolonial interrogations of child labor," 231; Chowdry, "Postcolonial interrogations of child labor," 231.

how the West imagines Burma as a space where human rights violations recur."[217] Nair considers how the reproduction of the category of Third World woman is crucial to liberal human rights discourse, as she is "oppressively appropriated and repositioned in liberal discourses on human rights... [discourses] that can be disconcertingly universalizing, simplifying, and patronizing in reference to Third World women's struggles."[218] The Third World woman, therefore, signifies a lack of human rights. Both Chowdry and Nair's articles examine how the West is constructed as a moral authority on human rights, including women's rights, for the Third World and how this is problematic since "the liberal discourse on rights is mostly silent on the subject of colonialism and imperialism and therefore cannot account for the relationship between colonial rule and human rights practices in the postcolonial state."[219] Since Third World women signify a lack of women's rights and thus human rights, international discourses on gender violence in Haiti are part of the Othering discourse that constructs the entirety of the Third World to be lacking in human rights, thereby justifying notions that the North should intervene and maintain its global dominance.

Through the markers of Third World women, international discourse on gender violence in Haiti constructs the country as a place with gender violence and without human rights. Gender violence in Haiti is framed within international discourse as a human rights issue. Amnesty International has been extremely vocal on the topic and has published two recent reports on gender violence in Haiti, one in 2008 and one in 2011. The 2008 Amnesty report *Don't Turn Your Back on Girls* frames the problem of sexual violence against girls in human rights terms, articulating that "states are required to make sure that the rights recognized under international human rights law are made a reality in practice."[220] In their

---

[217] Nair, "Human Rights and Postcoloniality: Representing Burma," 255.
[218] Chowdry, "Postcolonial interrogations of child labor," 274.
[219] Nair, "Human Rights and Postcoloniality: Representing Burma," 261.
[220] Amnesty International, *Aftershocks,* 20.

53

2011 post-earthquake report *Aftershocks: Women Speak Out Against Sexual Violence in Haiti's Camps,* Amnesty states that

> sexual and gender-based violence is a violation of human rights. Primary responsibility for ensuring the human rights of displaced women and girls in Haiti lies with the Haitian government. Even though Haiti has ratified international and regional human rights instruments, such as the UN Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), it is failing to protect the rights of women and girls.[221]

These two statements from Amnesty demonstrate how gender violence is framed in universalistic human rights rhetoric. Recently, the issue of gender violence in Haiti was brought to the Inter-American Council on Human Rights (IACHR) by the international U.S.-based women's organization MADRE and others.[222] Hearings were held in March of 2011 on the issue of rape in Haiti's post-earthquake IDP camps that aimed to "highlight the need for the international community to support the capacity of the Haitian government to meet *its human rights obligations*" [added emphasis].[223] The discourse on gender violence in Haiti as exemplary of its lack of human rights perpetuates representations of the West as the bearer of rights and the Third World as lacking them entirely. Furthermore, these examples demonstrate how gender equality, through discourses on gender violence, comes to signify not only whether countries possess human rights but also whether they should be allowed to participate in the so-called international community, and, ultimately, whether they are positioned to meet the Western-defined requirements of a successful and "civilized" state.

3.7 Gender Violence and the "Failed" Haitian State

The international discourse on gender violence in Haiti represents the issue of gender violence as a human rights problem that the Haitian state has failed to address. The burden of

---

[221] Amnesty International, *Aftershocks,* 13.
[222] MADRE News, "International Human Rights Hearing on Rape Epidemic in Haiti," *MADRE,* March 23, 2011, http://www.madre.org/index/press-room-4/news/international-human-rights-hearing-on-rape-epidemic-in-haiti-600.html (accessed 1 May 2011).
[223] Ibid.

responsibility to address gender violence in the camps is placed almost entirely on the Haitian state. Amnesty's 2011 *Aftershocks* report emphasizes that

> the Haitian state and its agents are responsible under international human rights law for ensuring security and protection in the camps... Primary responsibility for ensuring the human rights of displaced women and girls in Haiti lies with the Haitian government. Even though Haiti has ratified international and regional human rights instruments, such as the UN Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), it is failing to protect the rights of women and girls. Human rights violations, including sexual and gender-based violence, are rampant in the camps.[224]

Amnesty cites an interview with a UN representative that elaborates on the Haitian state's failed efforts:

> At the heart of the problem, according to the Representative of the UN Secretary-General on the Human Rights of Internally Displaced Persons, Walter Kälin, is that "underlying the lack of progress towards safer shelter is a larger failure on the part of the Government of Haiti to formulate and communicate to the public a plan on how to deal with the camps. This also affects the work of the IHRC [Interim Haiti Recovery Commission] on the subject."[225]

This quote ties the Haitian government's failure to address gender violence to a broader failure of the state in responding to the 2010 earthquake. Articulating that the Haitian state has not met its responsibilities in solving both the problems of disaster reconstruction and gender violence constructs Haiti as a failed state with a failed society made up of failed citizens, with failed attempts to join the "universe" of human rights and thus "humanity."

As explored in Chapter I, narratives of "failed" Third World states such as Haiti are part of a post-colonial discourse that feminizes the Third World as the "underdeveloped," "savage," and "out-of-control" Other to the hegemonic, "developed," "civilized," "strong," and masculinized West. Haiti, as a weakened state, is feminized and constructed as inferior to the West because of its failure to address gender violence. These representations depoliticize the role Western states have played in creating Haiti's "underdeveloped" and dismal socioeconomic conditions, as discussed in Chapter II. Since the burden of responsibility for

---

[224] Amnesty International, *Aftershocks*, 2.
[225] Ibid, 3.

addressing gender violence in Haiti is placed on the state and distanced from the international community, the resulting implication is that the international community, the "strong" masculinized West, is constructed as existing on the sidelines, free of blame, and prepared to swoop in to save the day. Therefore, through the international discourse on gender violence, Haiti is perpetually Othered as a "place" that can and must be helped by the kind-hearted West and its generous providing of development aid.

Chapter IV
Gender Violence in Haiti Post-Earthquake, the Shattering of the "Private" Sphere and the Policing of the "Public"

Thus far, I have established how international narratives on development aid and gender violence in Haiti are instrumental in a post-colonial Othering of Haiti. In this chapter I narrow my analysis to the international discourse on gender violence in post-earthquake Haiti. I consider how the 2010 earthquake's destruction of "private" residential infrastructure in Haiti, what I refer to as the symbolic "private" sphere, and ensuing chaos within the "public" sphere has shifted the narratives on gender violence to focus on the need to reinstate a distinction between "public" and "private" life, a distinction quintessential to Western liberal democracies, that was shaken by the earthquake.

I use feminist critiques to explore how imaginary notions of what is "public" and what is "private" affect the discourse on gender violence following the 2010 earthquake. I argue that through the international discourse on gender violence in post-earthquake Haiti there is a perceived shattering of the "private" sphere and a lack of regulation of what is perceived to be the "public" sphere, demarcating Haiti a "failed" modern state and an "out-of-control" place that cannot maintain these distinctions. In this chapter I consider how the solutions to post-earthquake gender violence in Haiti, framed as a rebuilding of residential infrastructure in the "private" and an increased policing of the "public" that only the mechanics of development aid can provide, are justified through the post-colonial international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence. I apply feminist perspectives that recognize the "public/private" dichotomy as fundamentally exclusionary on the grounds of gender and race. I argue that these exclusions are identifiable in the discourse on post-earthquake gender violence, despite the framing of the development aid solution as simply altruistic and apolitical. Furthermore, I argue that these exclusions are precisely what enable a justification

57

and perpetuation of the Western "public/private" system as the model to be imitated by the Other that is Haiti through the mechanics of development aid.

4.1 Feminist critiques of the "Public/Private" Divide and Gender Violence

Grounded in Western liberal political thought, modern states are manifested upon the premise that there should be a distinct separation of a "public" and a "private" sphere. This philosophy suggests that the political realm of the "public" should be regulated by the state and that what is in the domain of the family or the "private" should be free from state interference. Feminist scholars have criticized this distinction, arguing that the "personal is political": what is imagined as "private" is in fact political and should be considered as such. In her seminal text *The Sexual Contract,* Pateman criticizes Rousseau's social contract theory and general liberal philosophy's imagining that there is a "public" domain, populated by citizens and governed by the state, distinct from the "private" sphere, comprised of the family.[226] Pateman criticizes this division and argues that

> the dichotomy between the private and the public is central to almost two centuries of feminist writing and political struggle; it is, ultimately, what the feminist movement is about... feminist criticism is primarily directed at the separation and opposition between the public and private spheres in liberal theory and practice.[227]

Pateman suggests that since the "private" sphere is understood as outside the "public" realm, it has been often overlooked in political theory. She elaborates that a feminist perspectives find problems with the idea that "the public sphere, and the principles that govern it, are seen as separate from, or independent of, the relationships in the private sphere" and that many feminists argue both realms to be "interrelated."[228] Furthermore, she argues that this distinction is fundamentally gendered. She states that

> women and men are differentially located within private life and the public world... underlying [this] complicated reality is the belief that women's natures are such that

---

[226] Pateman, *The Sexual Contract.*
[227] Pateman, "Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Dichotomy," in *Public and Private in Social Life,* ed. Stanley I. Benn and Gerald F. Gaus (London: Croom Helm, 1983), 118.
[228] Ibid, 119, 132.

they are properly subject to men and their proper place is in the private, domestic sphere. Men properly inhabit, and rule within, both spheres.[229]

Like Pateman, other feminist scholars (Susan Moller Okin, among others) criticize the social construct of the "public/private" divide for its gendered and race-based exclusions.[230] Though white women are excluded from the "public" political sphere, black men and women are excluded from both the "public" political sphere and the "private" sphere of the family. Additionally, Okin affirms that "'the personal is political' is the central message of feminist critiques of the public/domestic dichotomy."[231] Similarly, in her text *Public Man, Private Woman: Women in Social and Political Thought,* Jean Bethke Elshtain criticizes Western political philosophy for denying the reality of the "private" sphere for women and the relations between family, self, and society.[232] Though these feminists critiques demonstrate that what Western political philosophy typically relegates to the "private" sphere is, in fact, gendered and profoundly political, the issue of race is overlooked.

In her text "Women as Wives, Servants and Slaves: Rethinking the Public/Private Divide," feminist scholar Barbara Arneil criticizes Pateman's *The Sexual Contract* for overlooking the exclusions of race central to the "public/private" binary.[233] Though on the one had white women are excluded from the "public" political sphere black men and women, through the history that is shaped by the experience of slavery, are excluded from both the "public" political sphere and the "private" sphere of the family. In her text "It's All in the Family: Intersections of Gender, Race, and Nation," Patricia Hill Collins similarly argues that the family is a social institution that has been denied to black men and women throughout

---

[229] Pateman, "Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Dichotomy," 120.

[230] Susan Moller Okin, *Women in Western Political Thought* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1979).

[231] Okin, *Justice, Gender, and the Family* (New York: Basic Books, 1989), 124.

[232] Jean Bethke Elshtain, *Public Man, Private Woman: Women in Social and Political Thought* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993).

[233] Barbara Arneil, "Women as Wives, Servants and Slaves: Rethinking the Public/Private Divide," *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 34 (March 2001), 29-54.

history.[234] Therefore, an intersectional approach to the "public/private" divide that understands it to be exclusionary on the basis of not only gender but also race and class is crucial in order to analyze its political implications.

The consequences of the imagined "public/private" distinction are important for contemporary politics. Nancy Fraser argues that modern systems of "liberal democracy," with understandings of a "public" sphere as a realm typically referring to "the state, the official-economy of paid employment, and arenas of public discourse," are understood as the "right" governing methods for new democracies.[235] She argues that the gendered and raced exclusions of this imagined dichotomy lead to material and "practical political consequences."[236] In my analysis of the international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence in Haiti I pay particular attention to the exclusions of gender and race and resulting implications.

4.2 International Discourse on Gender Violence in Post-Earthquake Haiti: The Shattering of the "Private" Sphere

Following the 2010 earthquake, there has been a perceived breakdown of the "private" sphere as can be seen in the international discourse on gender violence. The focus of rape in the post-earthquake IDP camps stress narratives that emphasize the destruction of private infrastructure and homes as a consequence of the earthquake and the resulting lack of security and privacy in the IDP camps, where over one million Haitians without homes are currently living. These narratives construct an image of Haiti as a chaotic place lacking privacy and a "private" sphere. As a result of its lack of a "private" sphere, narratives suggest that women are not safe in the camps and that a rebuilding of Haiti would solve the problem of gender violence, problematically assuming that women would be free of gender violence if

[234] Patricia Hill Collins, "It's All in the Family: Intersections of Gender, Race, and Nation," *Hypatia* 13/3 (Summer 1998), 62-82.
[235] Nancy Fraser, "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy," *Social Text* 25/26 (1990), 56-57.
[236] Ibid, 57.

they were behind closed doors. Furthermore, this solution assumes that Haitian men would be under control since they would be off the streets and less inclined to form dangerous gangs.

The international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence in Haiti emphasizes one dominant story line: the earthquake's damage forced survivors into IDP camps where the levels of rape are extreme. An Amnesty International press release similarly states that "One year after the earthquake which killed 230,000 people and injured 300,000, more than one million people still live in appalling conditions in tent cities in the capital Port-au-Prince and in the south of Haiti, where women are at serious risk of sexual attacks."[237] *The Toronto Sun* posits the camps as a reason for gender violence, stating that

> a year after what little they had was shattered and torn, the women of Haiti are struggling against a new crisis - rapes in the camps. Last January's earthquake not only left behind death and debris fields, it also, say experts, created a rich hunting ground for sexual predators.[238]

A *Los Angeles Times* article articulates the link between the earthquake and rape in the camps, stating that "the earthquake generated new shockwaves of sexual violence. Hundreds, maybe thousands – there is no comprehensive count – have been raped."[239] An article from *The Independent* also draws attention to rape as a consequence of the disaster by suggesting that "women and young girls are suffering a rising number of rapes and sexual assaults."[240] The severity of the problem of rape in Haiti's IDP camps is emphasized, for example, in titles such as that of a *New York Times* article "An *Epidemic* of Rape for Haiti's Displaced," a *Los Angeles Times* article "Rape *flourishes* in rubble of Haitian earthquake," and a *New York Daily News* article "Rape *runs rampant* in wake of Haiti's 2010 earthquake"

---

[237] Amnesty International, "Haiti: Sexual Violence Against Women Increasing," *Amnesty International*, January 6, 2011, http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/report/haiti-sexual-violence-against-women-increasing-2011-01-06 (accessed 6 April 2011).

[238] Thane Burnett, "Rape crisis for Haitian women: Report," *The Toronto Sun,* January 6, 2011, http://www.torontosun.com/news/world/2011/01/06/16789106.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

[239] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

[240] Nina Lakhani, **"**Rape on the rise in Haiti's camps," *The Independent*, February 7, 2010, http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/rape-on-the-rise-in-haitis-camps-1891514.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

[emphases added].[241] As these articles suggest, the prevalence of rape in post-earthquake Haiti has become one of the primary foci of international discourse.

International NGO narratives suggest that gender violence has increased because the earthquake shattered homes and the previous infrastructure, or what can be understood as the imaginary "private" sphere. Since women are living in tents within the IDP camps, they are perceived to be without privacy; therefore, the distinction between what is "public" and what is "private" is blurred and women are at higher risk of attack as a result. In the first paragraph of their report on the post-earthquake rape in the IDP camps titled *Our Bodies Are Still Trembling: Haitian Women's Fight Against Rape*, MADRE emphasizes how the earthquake "created a severe crisis of safety and security – especially for those living in the Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) camps – exacerbating the already grave problem of sexual violence."[242] MADRE suggests that the main problems include "lack of lighting; lack of private bathing facilities; lack of tents; and even for those with tents, utter lack of security (at least one survivor stated that her attacker had used a blade to cut the side of her tent to gain access)..."[243] These issues all relate to an understanding that privacy does not exist in the camps and that if there was in fact privacy there would not be gender violence. Similarly, a *Los Angeles Times* article on rape post-earthquake states that

> only a few of an estimated 1,300 tent encampments that are spread through this shattered capital have nighttime lighting or significant police presence. Tents do not have doors or locks. People are jammed together in dehumanizing density *without privacy* [added emphasis].[244]

---

[241] Editorial, "An Epidemic of Rape for Haiti's Displaced," *New York Times*, April 3, 2011, http://www.nytimes.com/2011/04/04/opinion/04mon2.html (accessed 5 May 2011); Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011); Jared McCallister, "Rape runs rampant in wake of Haiti's 2010 earthquake that devastated country," January 23, 2011, http://articles.nydailynews.com/2011-01-23/local/29442499_1_kofaviv-sexual-violence-jean-bertrand-aristide (accessed 1 May 2011).
[242] MADRE, *Our Bodies Are Still Trembling: Haitian Women's Fight Against Rape* (July 2010), 4.
[243] Ibid, 4.
[244] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

This article suggests that rape in IDP camps is occurring because of the lack of privacy that the tents provide. Furthermore, describing the cramped conditions as "dehumanizing" suggests that "humanity" equates space and privacy.

Amnesty's post-earthquake *Aftershocks* report suggests that "the lack of security in and around the camps is one of the main factors contributing to sexual and other forms of gender-based violence."[245]Amnesty released an online awareness-raising video in January 2011 to correspond with the release of their *Aftershocks* report. The video, like the report, emphasizes the problem of insecurity in the IDP camps.[246] The video's narrator states that "without homes and security, so many girls and women who survived the disaster are now even more at risk of violence... living in these camps, in these conditions, is leaving women open to rape and other violence."[247] Amnesty links the lack of homes and, therefore, lack of "privacy" in the IDP camps to the existence of gender violence. In March of 2010, months before the release of the *Aftershocks* report, Amnesty released a statement titled "Haiti's Emergency Response Must Include Protection from Sexual Violence."[248] The statement stressed that "insecurity, overcrowding and inadequate sanitary facilities are putting women and girls at great risk of abuse because they are *exposed* and without protection" [added emphasis].[249] Again, women are "exposed" because they lack "privacy," homes, and a "private" sphere. In October 2010 UN Women released an online awareness-raising video entitled "Violence Against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within" that focuses on the issue of security within camps.[250] The video states that

---

[245] Amnesty International, *Aftershocks*, 3.
[246] Amnesty International, "Haiti: Sexual Violence Against Women Increasing," *Youtube,* 6 January 2011, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y8xb94sfIEQ (accessed 6 April 2011).
[247] Ibid.
[248] Amnesty International, "Haiti's Emergency Response Must Include Protection from Sexual Violence," *Amnesty International*, 25 March 2010, http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/haitis-emergency-response-must-include-protection-sexual-violence-2010-03-25 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[249] Ibid.
[250] UNIFEM, "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within," *Youtube,* 1 October 2010, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).

an estimated 1.5 million people left homeless by the quake are living on the streets mostly in flimsy, makeshift shelters. There is no protection from the elements or from intruders. Without homes and security, so many girls and women who survived the disaster are now even more at risk of violence.[251]

UN Women stresses the lack of security and privacy of the shelters as the reason for increases in gender violence. A *CBS News* article also states that

the quake that killed an estimated 200,000 people has made women and girls ever more vulnerable. They have lost their homes and are forced to sleep in flimsy tents or tarp-covered lean-tos... With no lighting and no security, [the tent cities] are menacing places after sunset.[252]

Again, the insecurity and lack of "privacy" of the tents is stressed as a pressing issue and the main reason for increases in gender violence.

Narratives of tents being insecure and ripped open by attackers are repeated in the international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence in Haiti. In an Amnesty press release a gang rape is described as follows:

One woman, Suzie, recounted how she was living in a makeshift shelter with her two sons and a friend when they were attacked around 1am on 8 May. Suzie and her friend were both blindfolded and raped in front of their children by a gang of men who forced their way into their shelter.[253]

A similarly shocking story is described in a *Los Angeles Times* article:

The young men were watching Fania Simone. They had picked her. Picked her for rape. They went to her tent and seemed to know she would be alone. Her mother had left for the countryside in search of food. Three of them. They wore masks. They threw her to the dirt floor. They kicked her in the ribs and slapped her face. "If you tell anyone," one of her attackers threatened, "we will kill your brother or your sister"... [Simone] still lives in the plastic-tarp tent, and her attackers lurk, murmuring their threats, watching her.[254]

The women of the stories are constructed as vulnerable because of the insecurity of their "makeshift shelter" and "plastic-tarp tent." A *CBC News* article follows suite and states that

---

[251] UNIFEM, "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within," *Youtube,* October 1, 2010, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).
[252] CBS/Associated Press, "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps," *CBS News,* March 17, 2010, http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).
[253] Chiara Liguori, "Sexual violence in Haitian camps of the displaced, beyond the numbers," *Amnesty International*, March 22, 2010, http://livewire.amnesty.org/2010/03/22/sexual-violence-in-haitian-camps-of-the-displaced-beyond-the-numbers/ (accessed 5 May 2011).
[254] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).

"[sexual violence] is mainly due to the horrendous conditions in the camps, where tents are made of plastic and easily ripped open by attackers in the dead of night."[255] Similarly, a UN Women awareness-raising video on rape in the IDP camps states that "the scale of the Haitian disaster is so huge and so much still needs to be rebuilt that many Haitian women fear that it will be a long time before it is a safe place for them and their daughters."[256] This quote assumes that women and girls would in fact be safe if not for a lack of "privacy" that infrastructure and homes provide. Therefore, a rebuilding of homes, a rebuilding of the imaginary "private" sphere, is framed as the solution. International narratives such as these suggest that if women had homes and infrastructure that were not made of plastic and that could not be ripped open, then they would then be safe from attacks.

In addition to emphasizing the lack of privacy and the insecurity of the IDP camp tents, international narratives also highlight additional conditions of the camps that blur the lines between what is "public" and what is "private," resulting in increased gender violence. Many narratives emphasize the lack of privacy and insecurity of women's toilets and showers, particularly powerful symbols of the "private" in Western society. In a press release on its *Aftershocks* report, Amnesty International states that "thousands of displaced people are sleeping in public spaces in just one square meter or even less; women are obliged to bath almost naked under the eyes of the other residents and passers-by..."[257] Similarly, the UN Women awareness-raising video on rape in the IDP camps states that addressing the problem of gender violence "would include ensuring that women's bathing facilities enable them to have privacy and dignity..."[258] Again, the conditions are implied to be "dehumanizing"

---

[255] CBS/Associated Press, "Sex violence against Haiti's women on rise," *CBC News,* January 6, 2011, http://www.cbc.ca/news/world/story/2011/01/06/haiti-rape-report006.html (accessed 5 May 2011).
[256] UNIFEM, "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within," *Youtube,* October 1, 2010, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).
[257] Chiara Liguori, "Sexual violence in Haitian camps of the displaced, beyond the numbers," *Amnesty International*, March 22, 2010, http://livewire.amnesty.org/2010/03/22/sexual-violence-in-haitian-camps-of-the-displaced-beyond-the-numbers/ (accessed 5 May 2011).
[258] UNIFEM, "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within," *Youtube,* October 1, 2010, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).

through their lack of "privacy" and "dignity," values central to notions of "humanity,"

"human rights," and "civilization."

The lack of privacy of toilets and showers is also emphasized by international news reports. In a *New York Times* article entitled "Sexual Assaults Add to Miseries of Haiti's Camps," the article stresses that "poor or nonexistent lighting, unlockable latrines, adjacent men's and women's showers and inadequate police protection have all been problems" that have led to the increase in gender violence within IDP camps.[259] Similarly, a CBS News report on post-earthquake rape in IDP camps states that

> at the camp on Monday where the young mother was gang-raped, a woman in shorts tried to bathe discreetly. Stripped to her waist, she faced her blue tarp tent, her back to the rows of other shelters. Nearby, a teenage girl squatted behind a pile of garbage, trying to avoid the stench and clouds of flies around tarp-covered latrines that provide the only privacy, but also are places where women are attacked.[260]

Yet again, the article's description of women bathing in public and emphasis that the lack of privacy in the camps is linked to the problem of rape.

Linking public bathing and a lack of privacy to a reason for rape suggests that having "privacy" would prevent rape, thus reaffirming that violence in the IDP camps is "public." Therefore, the link between the camp's lack of privacy and rape excludes forms of gender violence that continue to exist regardless - "private" forms of violence, meaning violence committed by a perpetrator known to the victim. An understanding of rape as caused by the poor camp conditions and lack of infrastructure and, therefore, a lack of privacy, the international discourse assume that infrastructure, homes, and "privacy" would solve the problem of gender violence.

These narratives assume that women would be safe in a "private" sphere. Feminist scholars argue that that the neglect of "private" forms of gender violence such as domestic or

---

[259] Deborah Sontag, "Sexual Assaults add to miseries of Haiti's ruins," *New York Times*, June 23, 2010, http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/24/world/americas/24haiti.html (accessed 6 April 2011).

[260] CBS/Associate Press, "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps," *CBS News,* March 17, 2010, http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).

family violence, committed by perpetrators known to the victim, is a result of the imagined "public/private" distinction where the "private" sphere of the family is understood as a realm that should have minimal interference.[261] Therefore, "public" forms of gender violence, committed by perpetrators unknown to the victim, are prioritized in the international discourse. Jayne Mooney suggests that the paradox of "private" forms of gender violence is that because it is out of the public eye it is assumed to be infrequent, but it is because the "private" realm is free of interference that domestic violence is extremely high.[262] MacKinnon argues that a liberal state's privacy law is problematic since

> the law of privacy treats the private sphere as a sphere of personal freedom. For men, it is. For women, the private is the distinctive sphere of intimate violation and abuse, neither free nor particularly personal. Men's realm of private freedom is women's realm of collective subordination.[263]

Thus, privacy law assumes both women and men in private have the same degree of "privacy," an assumption MacKinnon challenges and suggests to be untrue. As explored in Chapter III, like "public" forms of gender violence, domestic violence was an issue in Haiti long preceding the earthquake. By suggesting that a rebuilding of homes and the "private" sphere is a solution for gender violence in Haiti, international narratives on gender violence ignore feminists' politicization of familial relations and the realities of domestic violence.

The solution of rebuilding a "private" sphere that is suggested by the international discourse on gender violence in post-earthquake Haiti is problematic because it assumes a necessity of an imaginary "public/private" distinction and that women will be safe if there is a rebuilding of the "private" realm and if the "public" realm is adequately policed. This understanding neglects to acknowledge that for women the "private" is often a site lacking

---

[261] Jan M. Pahl, *Private Violence and Public Policy: The needs of battered women and the response of public services* (New York: Routledge, 1985); Jalna Hanmer and Mary Maynard, *Women, Violence, and Social Control* (Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities Press International, 1987); Susan M. Edwards, *Policing "domestic" violence: Women, the law, and the state* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 1989); Gill Hague and Ellen Malos, *Domestic Violence: Action for change* (London: New Clarion Press, 2005).
[262] Jayne Mooney, *Gender, violence and the social order* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2000), 30.
[263] MacKinnon, *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State,* 168.

privacy and freedom. As discussed in Chapter III, domestic violence was a problem for Haiti pre-earthquake. Discussion of private forms of gender violence, such as family or domestic violence, are missing from the international discourse on gender violence following the earthquake.

The focus on one type of "public" gender violence is problematic since it excludes certain perpetrators: husbands, boyfriends, family members, friends, and acquaintances are ignored. Benedetta Faedi Duramy suggests that women's reporting of gender violence in Haiti is especially low for cases of domestic violence.[264] In their post-earthquake *Aftershocks* report on gender violence, Amnesty states that the small number of rapes that *are* reported tend to be ones committed by "armed men and youth gangs roaming the camps after dark."[265] Since the focus of gender violence today is on rapes committed by strangers in the IDP camps, gender violence that is committed by perpetrators known to the victim may be overshadowed by the solutions framed in the international discourse.

4.3 International Discourse on Gender Violence in Post-Earthquake Haiti: The Policing of the "Public" Sphere

In addition to the earthquake's destruction of infrastructure and resulting breakdown of what can be understood as a "private" sphere, I argue that the international discourse on gender violence in post-earthquake Haiti suggests that Haiti has failed to regulate its "public" sphere. The international discourse stresses that Haitian police are failing to patrol the camps and what can be understood as "public" spaces, since the camps lack privacy. This is framed as a security problem that leads to gender violence (rape). The solution to gender violence in the IDP camps is, therefore, not only a rebuilding of the "private" sphere but an increased regulation of the "public" sphere.

---

[264] Duramy, "The Double Weakness of Girls," 167.
[265] Amnesty International, *Aftershocks*, 6.

The breakdown of Haiti's law and order system is systematically stressed by international news sources. A *BBC News* article suggests that, following the earthquake, "attackers were even more likely to get away with their crimes because the Haitian justice system broke down after the disaster and the police lacks manpower [*sic*]."[266] A *Los Angeles Times* article similarly suggests that "The institutions of law and order, to the extent they ever had influence, have crumbled."[267]

A *CBC News* article implies the failure of the Haitian state through its description of the failed state police, whose response "to survivors of rape is described as inadequate, with police turning a blind eye and often just driving on by. Many survivors of rape said when they sought police help they were told officers could do nothing."[268] MADRE notes that in the camps there is a "lack of a police presence (many survivors stated that police only patrolled the perimeter of the camps and were unwilling to enter the interior, particularly at night).[269] In "'Our Bodies Are Shaking Now' - Rape Follows Earthquake in Haiti" from *The Huffington Post,* Beverly Bell highlights the prevalence of rape in IDP camps, stresses the lack of security in the camps and states that "the greatest urgency remains prevention, which in turn requires security and a functioning justice system."[270] An article in *The Times* on rape post-earthquake similarly states that

> security was tenuous in Haiti before the 7.0-magnitude quake and [Haiti's police chief] Mr Andresol said that the police force itself had been crippled by the disaster. He added that the Haitian police force had only 8,000 members before the quake and that many of them were now dead or missing. A large number of the remaining officers were demoralized or traumatized. 'We lost 70 police officers, nearly 500 are

[266] BBC, "Haiti: Rape warning from human rights group," *BBC News*, January 6, 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-latin-america-12125810 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[267] Tracey Wilkinson, "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake," *Los Angeles Times,* February 4, 2011, http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).
[268] CBC, "Sex violence against Haiti's women on rise," *CBC News,* January 6, 2011, http://www.cbc.ca/news/world/story/2011/01/06/haiti-rape-report006.html (accessed 5 May 2011).
[269] MADRE, *Our Bodies Are Still Trembling*, 4.
[270] Beverley Bell, "'Our bodies are shaking now' - Rape follows Earthquake in Haiti," *Huffington Post,* March 24, 2011, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/beverly-bell/our-bodies-are-shaking-no_b_511397.html (accessed 5 April 2011).

still missing and 400 were wounded,' Mr Andresol said at a temporary office standing in for the capital's police headquarters, which collapsed in the quake.[271]

The lack of policing and patrols in the camps are constructed as part of the reason for insecurity and rape. An article in *The Toronto Sun* on post-earthquake rape suggests that "a greater police and international presence after dark would be an important step.... Officials argue a lingering breakdown of security and order means, unless a response is developed, the rapes will continue amid the shadows."[272] Since it is suggested that instances of rape will continue if "security and order" are not addressed, this quote implies that rapes will stop if, in fact, they are addressed.

InterAction also criticizes the relief response to gender violence in terms of security, stating that "the security presence both in and outside camps remains minimal, leaving women and girls especially vulnerable to gender-based violence and trafficking."[273] The UN Women awareness-raising video on post-earthquake gender violence interviews the Haitian Secretary of Public Security, who tells UN Women that "protecting [Haitian women] is a near impossible task for the Haitian national police force."[274] The need for aid to prop up Haiti's weak efforts with respect to gender violence is made clear by Amnesty's awareness-raising video on rape in the IDP camps that states "the risk of rape or attacks on women have increased dramatically" and suggests that "the new Haitian government must make security a priority and the international community must help."[275]

The international response of Western aid to the earthquake's disaster of regulating the "public" sphere took shape immediately after the earthquake, with the US prioritizing the

---

[271] Times (UK), "Criminals in Haiti 'raping quake and trafficking children,'" *The Times*, 29 January 2010, http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/us_and_americas/article7007400.ece (accessed 5 May 2011).
[272] Thane Burnett, "Rape crisis for Haitian women: Report," *The Toronto Sun,* 6 January 2011, http://www.torontosun.com/news/world/2011/01/06/16789106.html (accessed 5 May 2011).
[273] InterAction, "Prioritizing protection in Haiti: Lessons and Recommendations," *InterAction,* November 2, 2010, http://tinyurl.com/26q323p (accessed 5 April 2011).
[274] UNIFEM, "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within," *Youtube,* 1 October 2010, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).
[275] Amnesty International, "Haiti: Sexual Violence Against Women Increasing," *Youtube,* 6 January 2011, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y8xb94sfIEQ (accessed 6 April 2011).

landing of military flights over humanitarian aid and, as Hallward puts it, made "fears of popular unrest and insecurity their number one concern."[276] This militarized response is aligned with post-colonial trends that were normalized during the 1990s.[277] The militarized peace-keeping operation of the UN Stabilizing Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH) was already present in the country before the earthquake and its peace-keeping troops and police were increased dramatically as an immediate response to the disaster.[278] The UN Security Council's Resolution 1944 explicitly directs the UN peace-keeping mission in Haiti to prioritize gender violence, stating the Security Council

> *Encourages* MINUSTAH to continue assisting the Government of Haiti in providing adequate protection to the civilian population, with particular attention to the needs of internally displaced persons and other vulnerable groups, especially women and children, including through joint community policing in the camps, along with strengthened mechanisms to address sexual and gender-based violence [original emphasis].[279]

This initial response demonstrates how the reaction of Western nations fits the narratives that encourage an increased policing and regulation of the "public" sphere by the West.

The emphasis on the need of policing of the camps reflected in the international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence and the corresponding response of the international community suggests that, in addition to a reconstruction of the "private" sphere through the rebuilding of homes, the "public" sphere must be regulated to put an end to gender violence in Haiti. These dominant narratives of the international discourse on gender violence in post-earthquake Haiti frame the solution to the current problem to be a reinstatement and a regulation of the "public/private" divide, an organizational structure

---

[276] Peter Hallward, "Securing Disaster in Haiti," *Monthly Review,* January 24, 2010, http://mrzine.monthlyreview.org/2010/hallward240110.html (accessed 1 May 2011).
[277] Nicholas J. Wheeler, "The Humanitarian Responsibilities of Sovereignty: Explaining the Development of a New Norm of Military Intervention for Humanitarian Purposes in International Society," in *Humanitarian Intervention and International Relations,* Jennifer M. Welsh, ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 29-52.
[278] See UN Security Council, "Resolution 1908 (2010)," UN Doc. S/RES/1908 (2010), UN Security Council, "Resolution 1927 (2010)," UN Doc. S/RES/1927 (2010) and UN Security Council, "Renewing Haiti Mission Mandate in Resolution 1944 (2010), Looks to Review of Situation After Pending Elections, New Government," UN Doc. SC/10054 (Oct. 14, 2010) that brought MINUSTAH troop levels to 8940 and police forces to 4391.
[279] UN Security Council, "Resolution 1944 (2010)," UN Doc. S/RES/1944 (2010).

central to Western political philosophy. By constructing this solution, the international discourse on gender violence in Haiti suggests that the Western divisions of "public/private" are the necessary ones for reinstating order and control in Haiti.

4.4 Reinstating the "Public/Private" Divide through Development Aid

The international discourse on post-earthquake gender violence Others Haiti as disordered and incapable of properly imitating the Western realms of the "public/private". Thus, a re-organization of Haiti as a "proper" state according to a Western vision of the organization of the "public/private" spheres is framed as solvable only through international development aid, since the "failed" and Othered state of Haiti is represented as incapable of addressing the problem itself.

Representations of the solution to post-earthquake gender violence as development aid is depoliticized, since it is required by the idea of "humanity" that aid itself justifies. The depoliticization of this discourse masks the exclusions of gender and race that are precisely the symbolic justifications that reinstate notions that the Western notion of the "public/private" divide is the "proper" structure for solving Haiti's problems. Through the discourse on post-earthquake gender violence, the internal gendered exclusions of Haitian women from the "private" and the external racialized exclusions of Haitian men from the "public" result in the bestowment of political power and access to the ruling elites who conform with and support the "proper" "public/private" system. As history demonstrates, those who threaten to challenge this Western order – be it nineteenth-century Haitian revolutionaries or modern politicians like Aristide – will be punished.

Conclusion

In this thesis I argue that the international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti contributes to its framing as a Third World country in need of development aid from the West. I apply post-colonial theories in order to analyze representations of gender violence, people, and places in Haiti as Othered. I explore how the contemporary problems facing Haiti can be traced throughout its oppressive colonial and post-colonial history. I situate the international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti within broader debates on the politics of development aid, understanding Haiti's condition through post-colonial perspectives that see aid as a neo-colonial subjugation of the Third World. I analyze international discourses of gender violence in Haiti and argue that gender violence, as a symbolically powerful problem, is a key element to broader post-colonial narratives that Other Haiti through culture-blaming, representations of people, human rights rhetoric, and representations of the state itself as "failed," all of which represent Haiti as a place in need of development aid. Finally, I draw upon feminist perspectives on the liberal "public/private" organizational feature of modern societies to argue that the post-earthquake international discourse on gender violence in Haiti acts as a depoliticized medium for the exclusions of gender and race that justify a reinstatement of the "public/private" organizational system in Haiti by means of development aid, thus reifying Western order.

In my analysis of how the international discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti justify a reinstatement of the West, its interests, and its organizational structures, I am not suggesting that gender violence does not occur in Haiti or other parts of the so-called Third World. To be sure, gender violence exists in Haiti and that reality is distressing. However, in this thesis I am concerned with how, through these discourses, the West is positioned as a superior moral authority "helping" the situation of post-earthquake gender violence in Haiti through development aid. Specifically, I attempt to reveal how this

position is compromised when its exclusionary interests of gender and race, those that are depoliticized through altruistic international discourses of development aid and gender violence, are at work.

My examination of international discourses, however, considers the narratives on development aid and gender violence in Haiti from one direction only; namely, from the perspective of the West. Though an analysis of this Western perspective of Haiti is integral to exploring how Haiti is Othered by the West, a consideration of Haitian narratives and whether their discursive representations in fact resist the dominant representations of the West requires further research and critical analysis.

These post-colonial discourses on development aid and gender violence in Haiti reflect the idea that, as Trouillot suggests, the creation and control of "savage" Others is necessary for the West to constitute itself as Subject.[280] However, the depoliticization of these discourses through representations of Western benevolence – a selfless "helping" of the Third World in its path toward "civilization" or "development" – is precisely what disguises the interests of the West and facilitates the vindication and perpetuation of global power imbalances. This creation of Others is indeed the project of the West throughout both colonial and post-colonial discourses, a project that ultimately perpetuates the unequal relationships that are arguably those that, in fact, create the initial need for and dependency on international development aid.

---

[280] Trouillot, "Anthropology and the Savage Slot" in *Global Transformations,* 7-28.

Bibliography

Abu-Lughod, Lilia. "Do Muslim Women Really Need Saving?" *American Anthropologist* 104/3 (2002), 783-790.

Arneil, Barbara. "Women as Wives, Servants and Slaves: Rethinking the Public/Private Divide." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 34 (March 2001), 29-54.

Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, ed. *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader*. New York: Routledge, 2003.

Bhabha, Homi K. *The Location of Culture.* Abingdon, UK: Routledge, 1994.

Bratton, Michael. "The politics of government-NGO relations in Africa." *World Development* 17 (1989), 69-587.

Brown, Wendy. "Finding the Man in the State." *Feminist Studies* 18/1 (Spring 1992), 7-34.

Cerwonka, Allaine. "Slippery Paths: On the Difficulties and Possibilities of Thinking Sexuality and Borders Together." Working Paper.

Charles, Carolle. "Gender and Politics in Contemporary Haiti: The Duvalierist State, Trans-nationalism, and the Emergence of a New Feminism (1980–1990)." Feminist Studies 21/1 (1995), 135–64.

Charles, Carolle. "Sexual politics and the mediation of class, gender and race in former slave plantation societies: the case of Haiti." In *Social Construction of the Past: Representation as Power,* edited by George C. Bond and Angela Gilliam, 44-58. London: Routledge, 1994.

Chomsky, Noam. Introduction to *The Uses of Haiti,* by Paul Farmer. Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press, 1994.

Chowdry, Geeta. "Engendering Development? Women in Development (WID) in International Development Regimes." In *Feminism/Postmodernism/Development,* edited by Marianne Marchand and Jane L. Parpart, 26-41. London: Routledge, 1995.

Chowdhry, Geeta. "Postcolonial interrogations of child labor: Human rights, carpet trade, and Rugmark in India." In *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class,* edited by Geeta Chowdry and Sheila Nair, 225-253. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

Chowdry, Geeta and Sheila Nair, eds. *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class.* London: Routledge, 2002.

Chrisman, Laura and Patrick Williams, eds. *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

Clark, John. *Democratizing Development: The Role of Voluntary Organizations.* West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press, 1991.

Connell, R. W. *Masculinities.* Sydney: Allen & Unwin, 1995.

Connell, R. W. and James W. Messerschmidt. "Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept." *Gender and Society* 19/6 (December 2005), 829-859.

DeMars, William E. *NGOs and Transnational Networks: Wild Cards in World Politics.* Pluto Press: London, 2005.

De Waal, Alex. Forward to *Capitalizing on Catastrophe: Neoliberal Strategies in Disaster Reconstruction,* edited by Nandini Gunewardena and Mark Schuller. Plymouth: AltaMira Press, 2008.

Doty, Roxanne Lynn. *Imperial Encounters: The Politics of Representation in North-South Relations.* Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1996.

Dubois, Laurent. *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution,* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005.

Dupuy, Alex. *The prophet and power: Jean-Bertrand Aristide, the international community, and Haiti.* Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2007.

Duramy, Benedetta Faedi. "The Double Weakness of Girls: Discrimination and Sexual Violence in Haiti." *Stanford Journal of International Law* 44/147 (2008), 147-204.

Edwards, Susan M. *Policing "domestic" violence: Women, the law, and the state.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 1989.

Elshtain, Jean Bethke. *Public Man, Private Woman: Women in Social and Political Thought.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993.

Engle, Sally Merry. Gender Violence: A Cultural Perspective. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-lackwell.   2008.

Escobar, Arturo. *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1995.

Farmer, Paul. *The Uses of Haiti.* Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press, 1994.

Fatton, Robert. *Haiti's Predatory Republic: The Unending Transition to Democracy* (Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2002), 39. Quoted in Peter Hallward, *Damming the Flood: Haiti, Aristide, and the Politics of Containment.* London: Verso, 2007.

Feldman, Ilana. "The Quaker way: Ethical labor and humanitarian relief." *American Ethnologist* 34/4 (2007), 689-705.

Ferguson, James. *The Anti-Politics Machine: "Development," Depoliticization, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho.* 1990. Reprint, Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1994.

Fisher, Julie. *Non governments: NGOs and the political development of the Third World.* West Hartford: Kumarian Press, 1998.

Fisher, William. "Doing Good? The Politics and Antipolitics of NGO Practices." *Annual Reviews in Anthropology* 26 (1997), 439–464.

Foucault, Michel. *Archaeology of Knowledge.* New York: Pantheon Books, 1972.

Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sexuality: Vol. I, An Introduction.* New York: Pantheon, 1978.

Fowler, Alan. "The role of NGOs in changing state-society relations: perspectives from Eastern and Southern Africa." *Development Policy Review* 9 (1991), 53-84.

Fraser, Nancy. "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy." *Social Text* 25/26 (1990), 56-80.

Fuller, Anne. "Challenging Violence: Haitian Women Unite Women's Rights and Human Rights." *The Association of Concerned Africa Scholars. Special Bulletin on Women and War* (Spring/Summer 1999).

Gage, Anastasia J. "Women's experience of intimate partner violence in Haiti." *Social cience & Medicine* 61 (2005), 343-364.

Hague, Gill and Ellen Malos. *Domestic Violence: Action for change.* London: New Clarion Press, 2005.

Hallward, Peter. *Damming the Flood: Haiti, Aristide, and the Politics of Containment.* London: Verso, 2007.

Hanmer, Jalna and Mary Maynard. *Women, Violence, and Social Control.* Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities Press International, 1987.

Harper, Suzanne. "Subordinating Masculinities/Racializing Masculinities: Writing White Supremacist Discourse on Men's Bodies." *Masculinities* 2/4 (1994), 1-20.

Harvey, David. *A Brief History of Neoliberalism.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.

Hill Collins, Patricia. *Black Sexual Politics: African Americans, Gender, and the New Racism.* New York: Routledge, 2005.

Hill Collins, Patricia. "It's All in the Family: Intersections of Gender, Race, and Nation." *Hypatia* 13/3 (Summer 1998), 62-82.

Hobart, Mark. "Introduction: the growth of ignorance?" In *An Anthropological Critique of Development: The Growth of Ignorance,* edited by Mark Hobart, 1-30. London: Routledge, 1993.

Hudock, Ann C. *NGOs and Civil Society: Democracy by Proxy?* Cambridge: Polity Press, 1999.

Lawson, Victoria A. *Making Development Geography.* London: Hodder Arnold, 2007.

Lewis, David and Tina Wallace, eds. *New Roles and Relevance: Development NGOs and the Challenge of Change.* Bloomfield: Kumarian Press, 2000.

Lewis, Linden, ed. *The Culture of Gender and Sexuality in the Caribbean.* Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2003.

MacKinnon, Catharine A. *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989.

McClintock, Anne. *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender, and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest.* New York: Routledge, 1995.

McGowan, Lisa. *Democracy Undermined, Economic Justice Denied: Structural Adjustment and the Aid Juggernaut in Haiti.* Washington: Development Group for Alternative Policies, January 1997. Quoted in Peter Hallward, *Damming the Flood: Haiti, Aristide, and the Politics of Containment.* London: Verso, 2007.

Mintz, Sidney W. *Caribbean Transformations.* Chicago: Aldine, 1974.

Monhanty, Chandra Talpade. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." *Feminist Review* 30 (Autumn, 1988), 61-88.

Mooney, Jayne. *Gender, violence and the social order.* Palgrave Macmillan, 2000.

Moyo, Dambisa. *Dead Aid: Why Aid is not working and how there is a better way for Africa.* New York: Farrar, Staus and Giroux, 2009.

Muzaffar, Chandra. "From human rights to human dignity." In Peter Van Ness, ed. *Debating Human Rights* (London: Routledge, 1999), 25-31. Quoted in Shelia Nair, "Human Rights and Postcoloniality: Representing Burma." In *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class,* edited by Geeta Chowdry and Sheila Nair, 254-284. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

Nair, Sheila. "Human Rights and Postcoloniality: Representing Burma." In *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class,* edited by Geeta Chowdry and Sheila Nair, 254-284. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

Narayan, Uma. "Death by culture." In *Dislocating Cultures: Identities, Traditions, and Third World Feminism,* 81-117. New York: Routledge, 1997.

Okin, Susan Moller. *Justice, Gender, and the Family.* New York: Basic Books, 1989.

Okin, Susan Moller. *Women in Western Political Thought.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1979.

Pahl, Jan M. *Private Violence and Public Policy: The needs of battered women and the response of public services.* New York: Routledge, 1985.

Pateman, Carole. "Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Dichotomy." In *Public and Private in Social Life,* edited by Stanley I. Benn and Gerald F. Gaus, 118-140. London: Croom Helm, 1983.

Pateman, Carole. *The Sexual Contract.* Cambridge: Polity Press, 1988.

Paton, Diana and Pamela Scully, eds. *Gender and Slave Emancipation in the Atlantic World.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2005.

Pearce, Jenny. "Between Co-option and Irrelevance? Latin American NGOs in the 1990s." In *NGOs, States and Donors: Too Close for Comfort?* edited by David Hulme and Michael Edwards, 257-274. London: MacMillan Press, 1997.

Rai, Shirin M. *Gender and the Political Economy of Development.* Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell, 2002.

Reddock, Rhoda. *Interrogating Caribbean Masculinities: theoretical and empirical analysis.* Mona, Jamaica: University of the West Indies Press, 2004.

Renda, Mary A. *Taking Haiti: Military Occupation and the culture of U.S. Imperialism, 1915-1940.* Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2001.

Said, Edward W. *Orientalism.* 1978. Reprint, New York: Vintage Books, 1979.

Schiller, Nina Glick and Georges Fouron. "Killing Me Softly: Violence, Globalization, and the Apparent State." In *Globalization, the State, and Violence,* edited by Jonathan Friedman, 203-249. Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press, 2003.

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" In *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader*, edited by Laura Chrisman and Patrick Williams, 66-111. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

Stoler, Ann Laura. *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002.

Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. "Anthropology and the Savage Slot: The Poetics and Politics of Otherness." In *Global Transformations: Anthropology and the Modern World,* 7-28. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003.

Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. *Global Transformations: Anthropology and the Modern World.* New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003.

Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History.* Boston, MA: Beacon, 1997.

Tvedt, Terje. *Angels of mercy or development diplomats? NGOs and foreign aid.* Oxford: James Currey, 1998.

Wheeler, Nicholas J. "The Humanitarian Responsibilities of Sovereignty: Explaining the Development of a New Norm of Military Intervention for Humanitarian Purposes in International Society." In *Humanitarian Intervention and International Relations,* edited by Jennifer M. Welsh, 29-52. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.

Wiegman, Robyn. "The Anatomy of Lynching." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 3/2 (January 1993), 445-467.

Wilson, Richard A., ed. *Human Rights, Culture and Context: Anthropological Perspectives* (London: Pluto Press, 1997), 4. Quoted in Chowdry, "Postcolonial interrogations of child labor: Human rights, carpet trade, and Rugmark in India." In *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading Race, Gender and Class,* edited by Geeta Chowdry and Sheila Nair, 225-253. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

Wood, Geof. "States without Citizens: The Problem of the Franchise State." In *NGOs, States and Donors: Too Close for Comfort?,* edited by David Hulme and Michael Edwards, 79-92. London: MacMillan Press, 1997.

Žižek, Slavoj. *Living in the End Times.* London: Verso, 2011.

Appendix

ABC/BBC. "Emergency aid 'should be new Haiti focus.'" January 24, 2010. http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2010/01/24/2800041.htm (accessed 1 May 2011).

Amnesty International. *Aftershocks: Women Speak Out Against Sexual Violence in Haiti's Camps.* AMR 36/001/2011 (January 2011).

Amnesty International. *Don't turn your back on girls: Sexual violence against girls in Haiti.* AMR 36/004/2008 (November 2008).

Amnesty International. "Haiti's Emergency Response Must Include Protection from Sexual Violence." *Amnesty International*. March 25, 2010. http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/haitis-emergency-response-must-include-protection-sexual-violence-2010-03-25 (accessed 5 May 2011).

Associated Press. "Haiti quake victims now face rape trauma." *MSNBC.* March 16, 2010. http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/35899757/ns/world_news-haiti/t/haiti-quake-victims-now-face-rape-trauma/ (accessed 5 May 2011).

Amnesty International. "Haiti: Sexual Violence Against Women Increasing." *Amnesty International*. January 6, 2011. http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/report/haiti-sexual-violence-against-women-increasing-2011-01-06 (accessed 6 April 2011).

Amnesty International. "Haiti: Sexual Violence Against Women Increasing." *Youtube.* 6 January 2011. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y8xb94sfIEQ (accessed 6 April 2011).

Barber, Ben. "U.S. rips Haiti on human rights: Report cites rise in rape, murder, intimidation by junta." *The Washington Times.* September 14, 1994.

BBC. "Haiti: Rape warning from human rights group." *BBC News.* January 6, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-latin-america-12125810 (accessed 1 May 2011).

BBC. "Rape looms large over Haiti slums." *BBC News.* November 27, 2008. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/7750568.stm (accessed 1 May 2011).

BBC. "UN admits Haiti needs more work." *BBC News.* April 16, 2005. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/4452829.stm (accessed 1 May 2011).

Bell, Beverley. "'Our bodies are shaking now' - Rape follows Earthquake in Haiti." *Huffington Post.* March 24, 2011. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/beverly-bell/our-bodies-are-shaking-no_b_511397.html (accessed 5 April 2011).

Booth, William. "NGOs in Haiti face new questions about effectiveness," *The Washington Post,* February 1, 2011, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2011/02/01/AR2011020102030.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

Burnett, Thane. "Rape crisis for Haitian women: Report." *The Toronto Sun.* January 6, 2011. http://www.torontosun.com/news/world/2011/01/06/16789106.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

CBC. "Sex violence against Haiti's women on rise." *CBC News.* January 6, 2011. http://www.cbc.ca/news/world/story/2011/01/06/haiti-rape-report006.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

CBS/Associated Press. "Rape Rampant in Haiti's Earthquake Camps." *CBS News.* March 17, 2010. http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2010/03/17/world/main6306562.shtml (accessed 5 May 2011).

CBS/Associated Press. "Sex violence against Haiti's women on rise." *CBC News.* January 6, 2011. http://www.cbc.ca/news/world/story/2011/01/06/haiti-rape-report006.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

De Córdoba, José. "Aid Spawns Backlash in Haiti." *Wall Street Journal.* November 12, 2010, http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052702304023804575566743115456 322.html# (accessed 1 May 2011).

Delva, Joseph Guyler. "Haitian Diaspora bolsters homeland's economy in record numbers." *The Haitian Times.* March 7, 2007. http://www.indypressny.org/nycma/voices/262/ briefs/briefs_1/ (accessed 1 May 2011).

Doucet, Isabeau. "The Nation: NGOs have failed Haiti." *NPR.* January 13, 2011. http://www.npr.org/2011/01/13/132884795/the-nation-how-ngos-have-failed-haiti (accessed 1 May 2011).

Dupuy, Alex. "Foreign Aid Keeps Country from Shaping its own Future." *The Washington Post.* January 9, 2011. http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/ 2011/01/07/AR2011010706511.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

Editorial. "An Epidemic of Rape for Haiti's Displaced." *New York Times*. April 3, 2011. http://www.nytimes.com/2011/04/04/opinion/04mon2.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

Editorial. "What Haiti Needs Right Now." *The New York Times.* April 16, 2010. http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/17/opinion/17sat1.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

Evans, Lisa. "Haiti earthquake aid pledged by country." *The Guardian.* January 12, 2011. http://www.guardian.co.uk/news/datablog/2010/jan/14/haiti-quake-aid-pledges-country-donations (accessed 1 May 2011).

Fernandes, Tyisha. "A local pastor talks about domestic violence in Haitian culture." *Fox News.* 2011. http://www.fox4now.com/story/11172416/a-local-pastor-talks-about-domestic-violence-in-haitian-culture?redirected=true (accessed 30 May 2011).

Fort, Sarah. "Violence: an Ever-Present Threat," *The Centre for Public Integrity,* November 11, 2006, http://projects.publicintegrity.org/aids/report.aspx?aid=814 (accessed 1 May 2011).

GuardianFilms. "Haiti's Lost Girls." *The Guardian.* March 8, 2009. http://
www.guardian.co.uk/world/video/2009/mar/08/haiti-slums-rape (accessed 1 May
2011).

Hallward, Peter. "Our role in Haiti's plight." *The Guardian.* January 13, 2010. http://
www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2010/jan/13/our-role-in-haitis-plight (accessed 1
May 2011).

Hallward, Peter. "Securing Disaster in Haiti." *Monthly Review.* January 24, 2010. http://
mrzine.monthlyreview.org/2010/hallward240110.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

Human Rights Watch/National Coalition for Haitian Refugees. *Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of
Terror.* HRW/NCHR (New York, 1994).

InterAction. "Interaction Viewpoint: NGOs Are Part Of Solution, Not Problem in Haiti."
InterAction. March 17, 2010. http://www.interaction.org/document/interaction-
viewpoint-ngos-are-part-solultion-not-problem-haiti (accessed 1 May 2011).

InterAction. "Prioritizing protection in Haiti: Lessons and Recommendations." *InterAction.*
November 2, 2010. http://tinyurl.com/26q323p (accessed 5 April 2011).

Justesen, Michael and Dorte Verner. *Factors Impacting Youth Development in Haiti.* 4
(World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series, Paper No. WPS411 0 2007).

Kotecha, Sima. "Rape at 'crisis' level in Haiti earthquake camps." *BBC News.* January 13,
2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/newsbeat/12171443 (accessed 5 May 2011).

Kristoff, Madeline and Liz Panarelli. "Haiti: A Republic of NGOs?" *U.S. Institute for Peace*
(April 2010).

Lakhani, Nina. **"**Rape on the rise in Haiti's camps." *The Independent*. February 7, 2010.
http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/rape-on-the-rise-in-haitis-camps-
1891514.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

Lendman, Stephen. "Gender-Based Violence in Haiti." *The Baltimore Chronicle.* August 17,
2010. http://baltimorechronicle.com/2010/081710Lendman.shtml (accessed 1 May
2011).

Liguori, Chiara. "Sexual violence in Haitian camps of the displaced, beyond the numbers."
Amnesty International. March 22, 2010. http://livewire.amnesty.org/2010/03/22/
sexual-violence-in-haitian-camps-of-the-displaced-beyond-the-numbers/ (accessed 5
May 2011).

MADRE News. "International Human Rights Hearing on Rape Epidemic in Haiti." *MADRE.*
March 23, 2011. http://www.madre.org/index/press-room-4/news/international-
human-rights-hearing-on-rape-epidemic-in-haiti-600.html (accessed 1 May 2011).

MADRE. *Our Bodies Are Still Trembling: Haitian Women's Fight Against Rape* (July 2010).

Magan, Michael. "To really help Haiti, fight corruption." *The New York Post.* March 27, 2010.http://www.nypost.com/p/news/opinion/opedcolumnists/to_really_help_haiti_fight_corruption_4aegByfRhTKFJvgHZBgY1J (accessed 1 May 2011).

Malone, Andrew. "Haiti: Rape, murder and voodoo on the Island of the Damned," *The Daily Mail,* January 14, 2010, http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1243016/ANDREW-MALONE-Rape-murder-voodoo-island-damned.html (accessed 5 May 2011).

McCallister, Jared. "Rape runs rampant in wake of Haiti's 2010 earthquake that devastated country." January 23, 2011. http://articles.nydailynews.com/2011-01-23/local/29442499_1_kofaviv-sexual-violence-jean-bertrand-aristide (accessed 1 May 2011).

Ministère à la Condition Féminine et aux Droits des Femmes. "Une réponse à la violence faite aux femmes en Haïti. Étude sur la violence domestique et sexuelle en Haïti" (2007).

Palmer, Randall and Arshad Mohammed. "Haiti seeks years of aid; donors to meet in March." January 25, 2010. http://www.reuters.com/article/2010/01/25/us-quake-haiti-donors-sb-idUSTRE60O29D20100125 (accessed 1 May 2011).

"Protest Letter of Haitian Members of Interim Haiti Reconstruction Commission." *Canada Haiti Action Network.* December 14, 2010. http://canadahaitiaction.ca/content/protest-letter-haitian-members-interim-haiti-reconstruction-commission (accessed 1 May 2011).

Reitman, Janet. "Political Repression by Rape Increasing in Haiti." *The Washington Post.* July 22, 1994.

Renois, Clarens. "Haiti diaspora allowed to vote." *Associated Foreign Press.* May 10, 2011. http://www.google.com/hostednews/afp/article/ALeqM5gQDU2mDHXNq9JfaxOk7vG_L8qM7w?docId=CNG.7666cf41808dc7d84a13a2cd4ccc112e.10f1 (accessed 20 May 2011).

Renton, Alex. "The rape epidemic." *The Guardian.* December 2, 2007. http://www.guardian.co.uk/lifeandstyle/2007/dec/02/women.features3 (accessed 1 May 2011).

Sontag, Deborah. "Sexual Assaults add to miseries of Haiti's ruins." *New York Times*. June 23, 2010. http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/24/world/americas/24haiti.html (accessed 6 April 2011).

Times (UK). "Criminals in Haiti 'raping quake and trafficking children.'" *The Times* (UK). January 29, 2010. http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/us_and_americas/article7007400.ece (accessed 1 May 2011).

UN Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women, Its causes and consequences: Report on the Mission to Haiti.* UN Doc. E/CN.4/2000/68/Add.3 (27 January 2000).

UNIFEM. "Violence against Women and Girls in Haiti: The Enemy Within." *Youtube.* October 1, 2010. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G4cEVdLXy8Q (accessed 6 April 2011).

UN Security Council. "Renewing Haiti Mission Mandate in Resolution 1944 (2010), Looks to Review of Situation After Pending Elections, New Government." UN Doc. SC/10054 (Oct. 14, 2010).

UN Security Council. "Resolution 1908 (2010)." UN Doc. S/RES/1908 (2010).

UN Security Council. "Resolution 1927 (2010)." UN Doc. S/RES/1927 (2010).

Wilkinson, Tracey. "Rape flourishes in rubble of Haitian earthquake." *Los Angeles Times.* February 4, 2011. http://articles.latimes.com/2011/feb/04/world/la-fg-haiti-women-20110204 (accessed 5 May 2011).