

SOCIAL INTEGRATION OF THE ROMA AND THE AFTERSCHOOL MOVEMENT IN
HUNGARY

By
Sára Horlai

Submitted to
Central European University
Nationalism Studies Program

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts

Advisor: Professor Júlia Szalai

Budapest, Hungary

2016

ABSTRACT

The thesis investigates the role of the extracurricular afterschool movement in the social integration of the Roma minority in Hungary. The main argument is that there is a great potential for these programs to transcend their original role and engage in practices of community development that ultimately strengthens the educative aim as well. This thesis aims to dig deeper in the process taking the case of the “Tabán Model for Integration” in Monor, Hungary. My research questions are: how embedded is the project, how it is perceived by various local actors/institutions and to what extent it engages in practices of community development?

To inquire about these questions, I made 14 interviews, with various local groups, the Tanoda employees, the local stakeholders and the target group of the Tanoda. Based on the results of the analysis of the interviews, the Tanoda program can be regarded as very much embedded and is perceived to be a successful program by all parties. Even though, the community development capacity of the program was not assessed due to small number of interviews with the members of the target group, based on the observations and the interviews that were made so far, it seems to be less efficient than its interest negotiation capacity.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank to my supervisor Júlia Szalai for her guidance and valuable comments, to Barnabás Szabó for proofreading this thesis and to the whole Nationalism Studies Department for providing the possibility for me to study here. Moreover, I am very grateful to Boglárka Bakó and to the students and volunteers in the Csobánkai Csepp Tanoda, for all the experience I gained in the past three years about afterschool programs. I would like to thank to everyone in Monor who was willing to talk to me, and to the Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta for receiving me. Last but not the least, I would like to thank to my family and friends for all the great discussions and emotional support they offered during the time I was writing this thesis.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
2	Definitions	3
3	Literature review	5
3.1	Discrimination of the Roma in the post-socialist context	5
3.1.1	The Roma in post-socialist Hungary.....	5
3.1.2	Institutional discrimination, prejudices and poverty	8
3.2	Education	11
3.2.1	Segregation in education.....	11
3.2.2	Tackling school segregation.....	13
3.2.3	Community development and extracurricular education	14
3.3	Tanoda movement in Hungary.....	17
3.3.1	History and description	17
3.3.2	Measuring effectivity	20
3.4	Context.....	22
3.4.1	The Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta.....	22
3.4.2	The integration program in Monor.....	23
4	Description of research	26
4.1	Main questions to be addressed and hypotheses	26
4.2	Research design	27
4.3	The interviews.....	29
5	Framework of analysis	31
5.1	Structure of the analysis.....	31
5.2	General impressions.....	31
5.2.1	Observations	31
5.2.2	Description of the interviews	34
6	Discussion of results	42
6.1	Network structure and quality of relations.....	42
6.1.1	Target group.....	42
6.1.2	Stakeholders	43
6.2	Interest negotiation.....	48
6.2.1	Employees of the afterschool	48
6.2.2	Target group.....	50
6.2.3	Stakeholders	52
7	Conclusion and discussions	56

8	Bibliography	58
9	Appendix.....	62
9.1	Interview outline type A: Employees of the program.....	62
9.2	Interview outline type B: Stakeholders	64
9.3	Interview outline type C: Parents/relatives	66
9.4	Interview outline type D: Students.....	68

1 Introduction

Since 1994 there is an over increasing trend to establish extracurricular afterschools in Hungary. Extracurricular afterschools - Tanoda in Hungarian - are informal educational units, the main goal of which is to support disadvantaged, predominantly Roma students throughout their studies. The Roma population, constituting 7-8% of the Hungarian society, face severe discrimination and prejudices within the country. One of the main consequences is the segregation of Roma students in the educational system. School segregation contributes to a great extent to the perpetuation of their marginal position in society. Segregated education is usually accompanied by poor school infrastructure, low standards of teaching, reduced expectations and low self-esteem of the pupils. It also encloses disadvantaged students to their own social group, as they do not have the possibility to develop connections with students in more favorable social positions. Approximately one of every three Roma students in Hungary are participating in segregated education.

Tanoda programs aim to remedy the improperly functioning educational system by offering personalized education and various extracurricular activities in a playful, homely atmosphere. There are around 200 Tanoda projects in the country, maintained by NGOs, religious organizations or the municipality, most of them funded by state. Besides directly assisting students with their school related studies, the program aims to develop their cognitive and social competences and strengthen their identity, that could also support their school performance in a more indirect way. However, the effectivity of these institutions are mostly unknown. Due to unstable funding their volatility rates are high, besides there are no generally accepted methods to evaluate its effectivity. In recent years there is an intense debate amongst experts on how to measure the achievement of Tanoda programs. Grades are usually considered to be the most obvious measure but it is argued by many experts that it tells little about the

actual effect of the Tanoda. While an inner system of evaluation that measures the development of both cognitive and non-cognitive skills would be indispensable, there are other considerations on how to approach this question as well.

This thesis aims to shed light on other important aspects of the Tanoda program, namely the relation between local embeddedness, interest negotiation and community development capacity of these initiatives. In order to introduce the reader to the most essential questions concerning educational disadvantages of minorities, especially the Roma minority in Hungary, and the possible solutions to combat these disadvantages, the relevant literature will be reviewed in the next section.

2 Definitions

Disadvantaged: Liskó refer to disadvantaged people that are unemployed, have low levels of education, or they are from a Roma ethnic background.¹ Most types of disadvantages induce others; family, financial and learning disadvantages usually go side by side. When more than one of these features are present in a person's life, we talk about multiple disadvantages.²

School segregation: refers to the separation of disadvantaged children in the educational system, which is the cause and simultaneously, the consequence of social polarization. This separation could be deliberate, such as separating Roma students within class, in between classes or in between schools. It could also be the consequence of geographical segregation.³

Integration in school: Fejes argues that even when minority and majority students are educated together, we can still talk about segregated schooling, if their socio-economic background is similar or the class environment does not promote the development of interethnic relations. Another important feature of integrated education is the application of progressive pedagogic methods, such as cooperative learning.⁴

Desegregation: refers to the process by which previously segregated institutions are either demolished and students are enrolled in other schools or to the process of reverse integration, by which students that are not disadvantaged are enrolled in the original institution. Desegregation in itself does not result in integrated education.⁵

Community development: Molnár, Peták and Vercseg published an extensive review of practices of community development with people living in extreme poverty in Hungary. They

¹ Liskó, "Szakképzés és lemorzsolódás," 95-120.

² Liskó, "Disadvantaged children in vocational training schools." 155-205.

³ Havas, "Esélyegyenlőség, deszegregáció." 121-138.

⁴ Fejes "Miért van szükség deszegregációra?" 15-36.

⁵ Szűcs, "A Hódmezővásárhelyi deszegregációs intézkedés." 58-71.

define community development as a practice that contributes to community formation within neighborhoods, where people are living in deep poverty and to their empowerment, for example the training of community leaders. Besides, building up social connections with their surroundings, the mainstream society, has a very important role in achieving the long term goal, integration into society. Therefore, they emphasize that community development projects should be implemented in cooperation with local institutions and stakeholders.⁶

Social embeddedness: Mark Granovetter used the concept of 'embeddedness' to refer to the way individuals take actions influenced by the social relations within which they function. He argues that ties that bridges various social groups could be the main source of information, capital and agency.⁷ The extent of social embeddedness could be measured by the existence or the lack of certain ties, and the strength (quality) of these relations.

⁶ Molnár, Peták and Vercseg, "Közösségi lehetőségek a mélyszegénység elleni küzdelemben."

⁷ Granovetter, "The strength of weak ties." 1360-1380.

3 Literature review

In order to provide a theoretical background to the research focus of this thesis I will review relevant literature and theories. Primarily I will consider the main findings of studies considering the prejudice and discrimination prevalent towards the Roma in the post-communist context, with special attention to Hungary, and ethnic self-understanding and experiences of those belonging to the Roma minority. The second part of this literature review is concerned with education. I will review the main trends of school segregation, then move onto the discussion of the possible remedies: theories and models of school integration and initiatives that offer aid from outside of the school environment, such as extracurricular teaching programs and community development interventions. In the third part the Tanoda⁸ movement, its history and achievements, will be considered. Finally, I will describe the specific context of my research, by introducing the Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta and their Tabán Integration Project.

3.1 Discrimination of the Roma in the post-socialist context

3.1.1 The Roma in post-socialist Hungary

Roma in European societies have long been subjected to widespread discrimination and many of them live in great poverty. Even though there is historical evidence of economic cooperation and cohabitation of Roma and non-Roma populations, the past centuries are largely characterized by hostile relations, persecution and the genocide of the Roma during the second world war. The socialist era in East-Central Europe brought about the forceful assimilation of the Roma. They were not acknowledged as distinct ethnic or national groups. A vast majority of them became employed in factories as unskilled workers. As the factories were usually

⁸ afterschool in Hungarian

located in newly built industrial cities, many of them left their communities. Even though illiteracy was decreasing amongst them as schooling became more and more general, they rarely acquired higher qualifications. After the dissolution of the Soviet bloc, in 1989-1990, most of the factories were closed due to the economic transition in post-socialist countries and Roma were overrepresented amongst the unskilled masses of workers who lost their job. Legislation of these new democracies explicitly promote equality and penalize discrimination, however in effect, discriminatory mechanisms remained prevalent in the institutions and everyday interactions of these societies. It has a considerable effect on the ethnic self-understanding and experiences of those belonging to the Roma minority.⁹

Roma in Hungary are overrepresented amongst the population living in deep poverty. They live scattered around the country, but there is a larger concentration in underdeveloped regions such as North-Eastern Hungary. There are around 700.000 Roma living in Hungary, which accounts for 7% of the Hungarian population. Based on official census data this number is much lower. Doyle and Kao refers to this phenomenon as ‘racial concordances’ when there is a relative gap between the size of minority population defined by the majority and the minority. They assert that generally, fewer people identify with ethnic minorities than being assigned to these groups by the majority. The size of this gap can depend on factors such as the extent of residential segregation of the minority or the volume of racial prejudice they perceive. At higher levels of segregation, the correspondence between the ethnic classification of the majority and the self-classification of the minority, is also higher.¹⁰ Also, the more prejudice the members of the minority group perceive, the more likely that they will hide their ethnic

⁹ Ladányi and Szelényi, “A roma etnicitás társadalmi konstrukciója Bulgáriában, Magyarországon és Romániában a piaci átmenet korszakában,” 85-95.

¹⁰ Doyle and Kao, “Are racial identities of multiracials stable? Changing self-identification among single and multiple race individuals,” 405-423.

identity. The results of the national census of 2011 shows that in the last ten years the self-reported Roma ethnicity of Hungarian people has emerged from 205 thousand to 315 thousand.¹¹ This rise in self--reported ethnic identities could be the consequence of the very active campaign of national organizations to encourage individuals to indicate their ethnic identities in the questionnaire.

Traditionally there are three main subgroups of Roma in Hungary. The Romungro (or „Hungarian”) Gypsies, constitutes the largest subgroup. Most of them do not speak Romanes anymore. The Vlach (or „Wallachian” or „Olah”) Gypsies are regarded to be a more traditional group. Many of them speak Romanes and keep the traditions. The Boyash (or „Beás”) Gypsies speak a Romanian dialect and traditionally many of them were potters. Young generations of Roma in Hungary often has little knowledge about these subgroups, the significance of subgroups in their lives is considerably low, therefore does not form a central aspect of their ethnic identification.¹²

Identity issues of the Roma are very complicated because they are living in diaspora with no claimed homeland. Csepeli and Simon state that „the history of the Roma in Central and Eastern Europe is one of non--identification”.¹³ The formation of double identities, both Hungarian and Roma, were not supported by the socialist regime, fast assimilation was required to the Hungarian society. Today Roma people can practice more agency in formulating their ethnic identities, but there is still no political and societal consensus about who can be

¹¹ Kemény and Janky, “A cigány nemzetiségi adatokról.” Accessed May, 15, 2016.
http://www.hhrf.org/kisebbssegkutatas/kk_2003_02/cikk.php?id=747

¹² Csaba and Závecz, “Milyen tényezők hatnak a magyarországi cigány népesség nemzetiségi önbesorolására?” 17-44.

¹³ Csepeli and Simon “Construction of Roma identity in Eastern and Central Europe: Perception and self-identification.” 131.

considered as a Roma or what does being a Roma mean.¹⁴ Considering the current situation in Hungary, Belénesi argues that for many Roma in the country, Roma identity means a stigmatization, racial prejudice and stereotypic categorization, which leads to a sense of negative identity and hiding or denying this identity.¹⁵ Summarizing research results from the past decades concerning anti-Roma prejudice in the Hungarian society, Váradi concludes that more than 70% of the Hungarian population holds prejudiced views towards the Roma. In her research with adolescents, she finds that the attachment to Hungarian national identity and socio-economic status are being the main explanatory factors behind the intensity of prejudiced attitudes.¹⁶

3.1.2 Institutional discrimination, prejudices and poverty

Emigh, Fodor and Szelényi are arguing that the economic transition in post-socialist countries, predominantly deindustrialization, intensified the competition over scarce resources. Masses of unemployed people without qualifications entered the arena of a discursive classificatory struggle, that resulted in the labeling of certain groups as undeserving and others as the deserving poor. Roma living in poverty are usually perceived to belong to the latter group, blamed for their situation. The authors also refer to this group as the ‘underclass’. „Thus we define the underclass in terms of the objective life chances of its members. These individuals are separated from the rest of society by a caste like cleavage [...] underclass is likely to form in conjunction with the presence of certain social characteristics, and in particular, ethnicity or gender.”¹⁷ Members of the underclass are living in deep poverty, spatially segregated from

¹⁴ Szabó and Örkény, “A 14-15 évesek interkulturális világgépe,” 413-470.

¹⁵ Blénes, “Processes of formation of Roma identity in east central Europe.”

¹⁶ Váradi, “A society trapped in prejudice: the case of Hungary,” 61-83.

¹⁷ Emigh, Fodor and Szelényi “The Racialization and Feminisation of Poverty?” 4.

the mainstream society, and transmit their situation to the next generations. Taking the example of the Roma, the authors argue, that when there is a minority overrepresented amongst the poor, social differences are becoming labeled as biological or cultural, that signifies the process of the ethnicization of poverty.

Turning to the case of the Roma in Hungary, based on the findings of Kertesi and Kézdi, Roma in Hungary are excluded from the labor market to a large extent, which is signified by their low formal employment rates. They further argue that there is a great employment gap, the difference between the percentage of employed Roma and non-Roma persons, which is partly explained by the low levels of education of the Roma. The authors argue, that it has a negative effect on the development of children, this way it contributes to the reproduction of social disadvantages.¹⁸ Szalai (2013) states, that besides the effects of the economic transition, social institutions in the post-socialist Hungarian society have been developed in a way to serve majority interests, consequently the Roma became deprived from social/citizenship rights. Welfare distributions are unequal and political institutions for effective minority representation are absent.

In 1993 the Roma policy was integrated into a broader Minorities Policy by the Minorities Law, which established the minority self-government system. The main goal of these institutions was to provide the means of preserving minority culture and identity. However, this decision did not emerge from grassroots organization, but was decided on the national level: „to demonstrate progressive minority policies as part of an effort to gain accession to the European Union, and (...) to set a legislative precedent for neighboring countries that would ultimately benefit Hungarian minorities living outside Hungary’s borders.”¹⁹ One of the most

¹⁸ Kertesi and Kézdi, “Roma Employment in Hungary after the Post-Communist Transition.” 563–610.

¹⁹ Molnár and Schafft, “Social exclusion, ethnic political mobilization, and Roma minority self governance in Hungary,” 54.

controversial aspects of Roma Minority Self-Governments (RMSG) is connected to the tension between their official and actual role. The Minorities Law did not differentiate between various minority needs, therefore they assign the role to promote minority culture, traditions and identity to all of them. However, the Roma minority - being the largest of all national minorities, facing the gravest social disadvantages - often regard the institution as the primary agent to articulate the community's needs towards local and national authorities. Szalai argues that even though the discourse of the politics of recognition has shifted from the emphasis of cultural distinctiveness and poverty to minority rights, the institutional structures of Roma representation in Hungary remained largely unaffected by this shift, suffering from a weakening legitimacy. Local authorities also frequently shift the responsibility to deal with local social problems to RMSGs. Therefore, RMSGs often take up roles they were not designed to occupy, which can lead to discontent within Roma communities when RMSGs fail to add up to their expectations.

Another problematic aspect of the system is prevailing on the national level. As Kovats argues „the electoral system employed does not allow for the proportional representation of the various electoral groups which runs a risk that the National Roma Minority Self-Government (NRMSG) becomes a tool for promotion of one fraction in Roma politics rather than acting as the representative body of the Roma population as a whole”.²⁰ He claims that it creates a very competitive atmosphere in Roma politics. To preserve their position, NRMSG leaders have reorganized the government structure in a way that they gain more and more power over the allocation of money targeted at Roma programs, to enhance their political status in the eyes of Roma populations. This makes them very dependent on the Hungarian government, leading to

²⁰ Kovats, “The Political Significance of the first National Gypsy Minority Self-Government (Országos Cigány Kisebbségi Önkormányzat),” 9.

the formation of unequal, paternalistic relations. They are not accountable to the Hungarian parliament neither to any government body. Kovats concludes that the questionable level of democracy within the NRMSG, the exclusion of other political strands and significant Roma activists from their operation, brings forward legitimacy issues of the institution.

3.2 Education

3.2.1 Segregation in education

The educational system is one of the main spheres of institutional discrimination. Educational segregation and its effects has become the central focus of educational research for the past decades. Segregation in education is based on ethnicity and class, characterized by spatial features, such as residential segregation, segregation between and within schools or classrooms and most of the time it is accompanied by low quality of education or offer qualifications that are unworthy on the labor market. When students belonging to a socially advantaged group are attaining private education or minority students are participating in educational programs designed to serve their specific interests, it is not regarded as segregation but as separation.

The UNDP/World Bank/EC Regional Roma Survey, 2011, measuring educational indicators in twelve Central and Southeast European countries, concludes that Roma students are considerably disadvantaged in the sphere of education, compared to their non-Roma counterparts. Amongst many, the author identifies problems such as, low pre-school attendance, late initial school entry and high dropout rates, attending ethnically segregated schools or classes and the overrepresentation of Roma students in special schools.²¹ Based on a cross-country comparative survey, Szalai, Messing and Neményi were seeking answers to

²¹ Brüggemann, "Segregation in Education" 63-71.

the question of how ethnic and social differences in schools contribute to the career paths in education, social relations and identity development of adolescents coming from an immigrant or Roma background. They found that students belonging to “visible” minorities, such as the Roma, are facing discrimination in the school environment either in the form of institutionalized selection or hostile attitudes from majority peers. The incapability of schools to reduce inequalities in knowledge at the primary stage of education, leads to the ever widening gap between students coming from different social backgrounds, which determines their potentials for future life to a large extent.²²

The above mentioned tendencies resonates well with the observed mechanisms in the Hungarian educational system. In their study, Kertesi and Kézdi are arguing, that the number of segregated elementary schools are continuously growing since the 90s. Elementary schools where Roma students make up the majority, are usually smaller in size, which helps to reduce the slightest possibility of contact with non-Roma students.²³ Segregation becomes even more prevalent at the secondary level. The study of Liskó reveals that most Roma students are enrolled by vocational schools, where they study outmoded vocations and cannot attain a state level test that is indispensable for further education. She further states, that one third of the students drop out from vocational schools in the first two years.²⁴

In a recent study, Kertesi and Kézdi were inquiring about the test score gap of Roma and non-Roma students on the countrywide competence measurement. They found that both reading skills and mathematic competences of the Roma students are generally worse and the effect of education and poverty are the main explanatory factors for the observed difference. Even

²² Szalai, Messing and Neményi, “Ethnic and Social Differences in Education in a Comparative Perspective. EDUMIGROM Comparative Papers.”

²³ Kertesi and Kézdi, “Általános iskolai szegregáció Magyarországon az ezredforduló után,” 959-1000.

²⁴ Liskó, “Szakképzés és lemorzsolódás,” 95-120.

though Roma student on average are staying longer in school and getting a higher certificate than their parents did, their odds of finding a job did not improve.²⁵ Neményi concludes that the Hungarian school system does not ensure equal chances of identity development for minority and majority students. While the school structure has infinitesimal effects on the ethnic identity formation of majority students, the formation of positive ethnic identities for minority students is largely dependent on it. These results shed light to the interconnected nature of Roma ethnicity, poor schooling, low educational achievement and poverty.²⁶

3.2.2 Tackling school segregation

One of the widely discussed practices that can reverse segregation is affirmative action - also referred to as preferential treatment or positive discrimination. Its aim is to put disadvantaged students on an equal footing, in the form of applying quotas or offering scholarships. Based on the UNDP/World Bank/EC Regional Roma Survey (Brüggeman, 2012) affirmative action, in the form of educational support for disadvantaged groups, is generally accepted by the wider public. The acceptance of preferential treatment is higher among Roma than among non-Roma students and acceptance of these methods are decreasing on the secondary and university level.

Desegregating already segregated units is another method to reverse segregation. In Hungary, Surányi and Kézdi compared schools that participated in a state initiated school integration project with schools in the same area which did not. They found that non-Roma students had better opinion about their Roma classmates in base schools than in the control schools. The social closure was smaller and their opinion formation about their Roma classmates was less

²⁵ Kertesi and Kézdi, "The Roma/non-Roma Test Score Gap in Hungary."

²⁶ Neményi, "Az interetnikus kapcsolatok hatása az identitásra." 27-53.

stereotyped. In the base school, both Roma and non-Roma students were less likely to support views about social hierarchy. The cooperation between the pupils and working in groups helped a lot to Roma and other disadvantaged children to perform better in school, and it was independent from their socioeconomic background. When they controlled for class composition they found that in lot of cases it did not has an effect on the better results of base schools, while in some cases for instance the chances to enter higher education was greater where the amount of Roma students did not exceed the 30% in a class. In conclusion the base schools have better results on most of the examined dimensions, therefore the authors argue that integrated education could help reducing unequal opportunities between Roma and non-Roma students.²⁷

Moody examined integration in terms of the friendship formation pattern of students in racially mixed classrooms. His theoretical assumption that a setting could be regarded as integrated if the number of cross race friendships is equal to the distribution of the races in the setting. Using the methods of social network analysis, he found that if racially heterogeneous students are taking part in extracurricular activates, such as playing in the soccer team of the school or singing in the choir, it can facilitate the formation of common aims and cooperation among them that leads to interracial friendliness.²⁸

3.2.3 Community development and extracurricular education

However, it is not always possible and not necessarily enough, to induce change from within the school. In those cases, remedies that come from outside of the school system can support school education and decrease disadvantages. Community development being at the heart of

²⁷ Kézdi and Surány, “Egy sikeres integrációs program tapasztalatai: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatási integrációs programjának hatásvizsgálata 2005-2007.”

²⁸ Moody, “Race, School Integration, and Friendship Segregation in America.” 679-716.

these initiatives is a method applied in various contexts in the past centuries. Community development initiatives aims to organize and emancipate socially disadvantaged, isolated groups of people. In their research, Schafft and Brown were analyzing the relation between community development and self-representation capacity of RMSGs in Hungary. The focus of their research was the role of the various forms of social capital of RMSGs. They assumed that ties within the minority group, between the minority and the majority group and linkages to other local or national institutions, such as the local government or the NRMSG, can account for the municipal-level differences of RMSGs. They found that RMSGs operating in settlements where the Roma and non-Roma has good relations, could influence local decision making that would result in a productive relationship with the local government. They also found that local Roma minorities forming a somewhat cohesive group - which means that the density of ties are high, and these networks are characterized by values of trust and solidarity - have a greater chance to establish effective self-representation. Based on their results, connection with the NRMSG also has a strong effect on the capacity of local community development, however ties with other local or external actors, such as Non Governmental Organizations (NGO) has no significant effect. A possible explanation for that, provided by the authors, is that due to scarce resources there are few NGOs to turn to. They conclude by stating that the follow mentioned three forms of social capitals are the most effective if all of them are present. However, a promising result of their research is that neither the prevalence of either form of social capital, neither the capacity of local self-governments are dependent on the socio-economic or regional context to a large extent.²⁹

A very recent research project by Júlia Szalai also confirmed the above mentioned results of Kaai and Schafft. According to Szalai strong ethnic identification and community formation in

²⁹ Schafft and Brown, "Social Capital and Grassroots Development. The Case of Roma Self-Governance in Hungary." 201-209.

the given locality could be the basis of effective political representation and participation. The aim of the research was to elaborate and test a set of quantitative and qualitative indicators with the participation of Roma people, to help them express their interests and enhance social integration by regular monitoring. The increasing share of supplementary organizations such as NGOs and churches in the representation of Roma interests further contributes to the weakening legitimacy of RMSGs and often these institutions reinforce dependency and patron client relations with the Roma communities. The novelty of this approach is that tools are given to local Roma communities to monitor policy implementation, therefore the very subjects of these programs can evaluate its effectivity.³⁰

In the Romanian context, Ryder and his colleagues were examining whether unequal social order could be challenged through inclusive and intercultural educational initiatives such as Inclusive Community Development (ICD). They define ICD as a process, often initiated by some kind of catalyst (an NGO most of the time), whereby disadvantaged communities are empowered to participate in decision making. This is an assets based method, which means that community development is based on the social and cultural values of the community. The authors take the example of a school desegregation initiative in a Roma community, which was carried out with the participation of the Roma parents, the school staff and a Roma NGO. They state that grass-roots, civil organizations can be catalysts for local social change.³¹

Extracurricular afterschool programs, primarily targeting students, could also contribute to community development. The aim of these programs can be manifold, depending on the specific needs of their target group. They offer, mentoring, learning support and various

³⁰ Szalai. "Fragmented Social Rights in Hungary's Postcommunist Welfare State," 283-305.

³¹ Ryder, Rostas and Taba, "'Nothing about us without us': the role of inclusive community development in school desegregation for Roma communities," 518-539.

afternoon activities for disadvantaged students. The Harlem Children Zone program in the US is a great example. The goal of the program is to help disadvantaged students to get to college. They provide extra-curricular and mentoring programs for the students, support local schools to improve their curricula/ teaching methods and offer health education to the families of their students. The author points out the important role of personal connection of the students, their parents and their schools with the mentors. Almost all of the students attending the afterschool program graduated from high school, applied to, and enrolled in college, which is a good indicator for the relative success of the program.³²

There are a variety of similar programs in Hungary as well. Extracurricular educational programs, Tanoda in Hungarian are aiming to offer educational support to disadvantaged, predominantly Roma students throughout their studies. Some of them originated from housing intervention initiatives, such as the Tabán Integration Project in Monor, others became a catalyst of community development, such as the project in Told of the Igazgyöngy Foundation. In the next section the history of the Tanoda movement, the various types of afterschool programs and the debates surrounding measuring their effectivity will be discussed.

3.3 Tanoda movement in Hungary

3.3.1 History and description

After the change of the regime, in 1989, alternative educational centers were developed besides of the public education system. While some of these institutions were targeting the upper middle class families by offering elite education, requiring its participants to pay tuition, others were established to support disadvantaged students, either within or outside of the school

³² Rogers, "Helping Students in Under-Performing Public Schools. Building the Pipeline: Effective Practice Briefs."

system. Tanoda programs belong to the latter group. The first tanoda programs appeared in the 90s, established by NGOs. The student body was heterogeneous in these institutions. After the turn of the century afterschools could apply for funds to a fixed period of time to the state, therefore more and more of them were established.³³ In this period, besides NGOs, Roma minority self-governments appeared as project owners. The first state funds for afterschool education were offered in 2004, with the aim to support the already efficiently functioning Tanoda programs and to spread this model in the most disadvantaged regions of the country. 92 afterschool applied to the state fund at that time, and 23 of them received funding in the end. In the next year the criteria to acquire state funds were considerably modified. Instead defining the target group as disadvantaged it shifted to those students facing multiple disadvantages. Administration of the program was standardized, aiming to serve the interest of effective monitoring. A larger emphasis was put on the importance of maintaining relations with the public schools. The initiation of new projects was supported as well, however funding was not continuous, the next application period for funds was only publicized in 2008. Some of the afterschools had to resume functioning while others closed for good. Since then there were two more rounds of funding. Even though the number of afterschool programs funded by the state are continuously growing, state funding is unstable and unpredictable that makes these projects less durable. Tanoda programs established after 2006, are most often maintained by Roma civil organizations and program participants are predominantly Roma students.³⁴

How to define what is a Tanoda? What types exists and what are its aims? „It is in itself a paradox, as the main aim of the institution is to create an environment that no longer needs its support (Katalizátor, 2014)”. Afterschools are alternative educational units founded mostly by civil organizations, where disadvantaged, predominantly Roma students receive support in

³³ Szőke and Trencsényi “A Józsefvárosi tanoda.”

³⁴ Németh, “A tanoda-típusú intézmények működésének, tevékenységének elemzése. Kutatási beszámoló.”

learning and developing various necessary competences. The aim of these institutions can be manifold. Németh (2008) identified 3 main goals in a countrywide representative Tanoda survey: 1. support students to improve their scholastic achievement, 2. decrease the difficulties the students face because of their disadvantaged social position, 3. strengthening the identity of the students. The official definition of the Tanoda by the Ministry of Human Resources is as follows: „The Tanoda, being the umbrella term for extracurricular pedagogical activities, is designed and maintained based on the notion of inclusive nurturing, contributing to the educational success and social mobility of students from various social and cultural groups and with various individual competences, enrolled in primary and secondary education.”³⁵

Based on the research results of Németh Szilvia, Tanoda programs can be grouped into three distinct categories based on their pedagogic program and aims. She labels the first group as the ones offering support with the school related studies of the students. The main aim of these institutions is to support students who have low scholastic performance and are from multiply disadvantaged backgrounds. The main emphasis in these programs is on the development of scholastic achievement by directly focusing on school curricula. On the other end, there are those programs that deals with ‘talented’ students. These institutions offer elite training to disadvantaged students that are outstanding because of their competences or ambitions. The main goal of these afterschools is to support students to attain a high school degree. The last type includes Tanoda programs that basically combines the features of the other two types. They are sensitive to the specific needs of the individual students and offer a wide range of activities to their participants. Their target group is heterogeneous. Their program elements include talent management, individual coaching and preparatory training for the final exam in

³⁵ Emberi Erőforrások Minisztériuma, “Tanoda sztenderd.” 1. Accessed March 15, 2014. <http://palyazat.gov.hu/doc/1363>

high school.³⁶ In two thirds of all afterschools, colleagues emphasized that their main aim is to improve the scholastic achievement of their students, in order to facilitate their integration to the labor market later on.

Besides supporting the students in learning the school curricula, some of the afterschools apply methods that support studying in a more indirect way. During these sessions students can improve their text writing and comprehending skills, can acquire methods that facilitates learning and familiarize with cooperative working techniques. Several afterschools organize sport programs, art education, excursions and summer camps. Therefore, afterschool activities are mainly centered around learning support and leisure, both contributing to the mental and psychological development of the students, aiming to compensate for their social disadvantages. Besides afterschools provide a community for the students, where they feel accepted and supported by their mentors and peers.³⁷

3.3.2 Measuring effectivity

The question of how to measure the effectivity of the Tanoda programs has become a main concern for experts and social workers in the past years. Vámos provides an extensive review on theories concerning the effect of extracurricular afterschool programs on adolescent development. Results show that it contributes to the formation of a positive attitude towards education and to the development of important social competences that influence school and work related success in an indirect way. These effects are the strongest amongst disadvantaged students. The author emphasizes the positive effect of relations with the mentors, who usually belongs to a higher status group in society and a formation of a community amongst the peers

³⁶ Németh, “A tanoda-típusú intézmények működésének, tevékenységének elemzése. Kutatási beszámoló.” 16.

³⁷ Kerényi, “Tanoda könyv. Javaslatok tanodák szervezéséhez.”

with a strong self-help attitude.³⁸ In his article, Fejes discusses the various ways to measure the effectivity of Tanoda projects and make recommendations for the development of adequate tools for monitoring afterschool programs. His main argument is that neither school grades, nor measurement, based on school curriculum or related cognitive competences, can account for the real contribution of the Tanoda on the student's lives. He recommends the introduction of non-cognitive measurements, such as those based on motivation and social competences of the students. Besides, Fejes states that control groups should be involved in the assessment as well. In his conclusions, he argues that amongst many other factors, it would be important to gain information on the evaluation of these programs by the local communities, and the societal embeddedness of the Tanoda.³⁹

There has been one study by Németh that also aimed to discover the attitude of the target group and the larger environment of the afterschools towards the program. The author concludes that students emphasize the importance of the playful and caring atmosphere in the Tanoda, while parents state that the self-esteem of their children has improved a lot since they participate in the activities organized by the institution. In many settlements, Tanoda programs took upon the role of a local social-community center, functioning as a settlement house, supporting the families in need and organizing programs for the parents as well. Local actors with whom the Tanoda cooperates for longer or shorter periods are also listed in the study. Németh states that a very important social capital is centered around the Tanoda in these settlements.⁴⁰ Accordingly, many experts and program participants are critical concerning the official definition, as it mainly defines the Tanoda as an institution that offers educational support.

³⁸ Vámos, "Elméleti keret a tanodák eredményességének vizsgálatához," Accessed February 22, 2016. http://www.tani-tani.info/elmeleti_keret_a_tanodak_eredmenyessegenek_vizsgalatahoz

³⁹ Fejes, "Mire jó a tanoda?" 29–56.

⁴⁰ Németh, "Tanoda-kutatás és fejlesztés 2012/2013. Zárótanulmány. Vitaanyag."

Many of them argue, that there is a need for redefinition and renaming these programs. The word 'tanoda', understood in a conventional sense, refers to an educational institution, while in effect there are several other functions these institutions are fulfilling. To repeat some of these, they also engage in developing the individual competences and strengthening the identity of their pupils, besides they provide them with various opportunities for leisure, offering social support to their families as well as the program contributes to community development.⁴¹

3.4 Context

3.4.1 The Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta

The Association of the Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta was founded in 1989, under the leadership of Father Imre Kozma. As its first main program, the organization had an important role in sheltering German refugees in 1989 before the collapse of the Berlin wall. Since then, they engage in a variety of social care services, such as health care services, disabled care, child and family care, homeless care and elderly care. The Maltese Charity Service has 7 regional organization, their nearly 8000 volunteers and employees work in 150 local groups.,,Over the course of this grandiose rescue action, the Charity Service became partners with government agencies as well as social organizations. The public opinion sensing the concrete manifestation of social solidarity turned to the Maltese Charity Service with trust, and in Hungary – implicitly - it has entrusted the charity service with the management of and dealing with social and social-psychic tensions that the administrative, social and healthcare

⁴¹ Katalizátor hálózat, "A tanodák jelene és jövője: hatékonyság és hálózatosodás." Accessed March 1, 2014. <http://katalizatorhalozat.hu/esemenyek>

institutional network of society was unable to solve.”⁴² The Maltese Charity Service funds their activities from donations, tenders and government funds. They work in close cooperation with central and local governments. Their involvement in government projects is subject to criticism by civil society actors and organizations.

They developed the 'Presence' method, which builds on the notion, that the charity service should be constantly approachable to its beneficiaries, in order to bring about complex community rehabilitation, therefore they establish their offices in the given settlements. Depending on the specific needs of their target group, they offer assistance with various difficulties, such as securing the housing conditions, for instance equip the houses with special prepayment meters in cooperation with the energy suppliers or establish extracurricular program for the children, nursery group to young mothers and centers for addicts. Many of their programs target Roma communities. The organization is devoted to the enforcement of equal opportunities of the Roma minority in Hungary.

3.4.2 The integration program in Monor

The program at Monor was launched in 2004. Residents addressed a letter to the Maltese Charity Service seeking help for their very poor living conditions in the settlement, called 'Tabán', located in the outskirts of Monor city. Monor has around 20.000 inhabitants and it is well connected to the capital city, it is only 40 kilometers away from Budapest. However, after the change of the regime a ghetto like settlement was formed in the Tabán area. Impoverished Roma families moved to the areas already inhabited by Roma. The mayor provided some vans, formerly used in circus, to the families. There was no running water in

⁴² “History of the Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta.” Accessed May 25, 2016. <http://www.maltai.hu/?action=subpage&subpageid=11>

the houses, most of the residents were unemployed and their housing conditions were very insecure. For instance, as they could not provide for the electricity bills, they connected wires to the poles on the streets to acquire electricity. It is not only illegal, but a very harmful practice, causing serious injuries to the residents. „Before the appearance of the Charity Service in 2004 the kids living in the settlement failed already in the first classes, they dropped behind their peers, were moved to special schools and finally totally dropped out from the educational system. They became parents during their teenage and became grandparents by the age of thirty. They did not learn any professions, did not have a job and they live without perspectives.”⁴³

A mobile office and a settlement house was put in the middle of the settlement. An employee representing the Maltese Charity Service was working in the office, to whom the residents could turn to with their problems. In the beginning, the aim was to secure the housing conditions - reconstructing some of the houses, building new ones or buying houses outside of Tabán. They equipped the settlement house with showers and washing machines, which is used by most families on a daily basis ever since. Running the settlement house, provided work opportunity to some of the residents. After a while a community center was also erected, hosting the help center for addicted people as well as the learning program run by local nuns who were helping the children from the settlement with their studies. The Charity Service applied to the governmental afterschool fund in 2013, since then they have a Tanoda program as well, being a continuation of the more informal learning support in the community center. The Charity Service bought a house on the edge of the settlement and both the Tanoda program and the social office moved there. To support community formation and provide the children with several opportunities to develop their competences, they established a soccer team and

⁴³ “Monor, Tabán.” Accessed May 25, 2016. <http://jelenlet.maltai.hu/helyszinek/monor-taban/>

initiated a music learning group, called the 'Symphony program'. To support the early development of the children and inform young parents about health related issues, the Charity Service also launched the Sure Start Children House, located next to the Tanoda. Approximately 500 people live in the Tabán area, most of them identify themselves as Roma and half of the residents are under 18. The Maltese Charity Service employs 5 people, several volunteers and within the framework of the workfare program, 7 residents of the Tabán settlement as well.⁴⁴

⁴⁴ Kiss, "Cigánytelep nyolctól négyig. Dávid naplója."

4 Description of research

4.1 Main questions to be addressed and hypotheses

According to the results of recent studies, there has been little research on how local communities and institutions evaluate the Tanoda. Literature on community interventions emphasize the importance of developing projects in cooperation with various local actors and adjusting program aims to the specific needs of the community. Therefore, the gap this research aims to fill is the qualitative evaluation of the local integration of a specific Tanoda project. I would like to learn what expectations are raised towards the Tanoda and how the Tanoda positions itself within this web of competing interests. I would also explore, how the process of local integration contributes to community development. to what extent these programs are socially embedded and how these institutions cooperate with schools and other relevant organizations.

I argue that by effectively negotiating local interests, adjusting the program to the needs of their target group and to the local specificities as well as maintaining good relations with all the relevant local groups, Tanoda projects become locally embedded. Embedded projects are more durable and stable, that are indispensable factors for achieving both short term (pedagogic) and long-term (social) goals of the Tanoda. I also argue that embedded projects transcend their original educative role and become engaged in social work within the locality, therefore community development becomes a byproduct of this process. This complexity is what ultimately strengthens the original, educative role of the program.

Therefore, the main questions to which this research seeks to find an answer are the following:

To what extent the Tanoda program could be regarded as embedded?

How is the interest negotiation capacity of the program?

What is the relation of community development and the Tanoda program in the given context?

4.2 Research design

Research methods encompass observations on the field as well as semi-structured individual interviews and group interviews. The framework of the research has been developing in the past three years, based on my experience as a volunteer in a Tanoda program, at Csobánka, and my previous thesis research, titled 'Aim at studying! Analysis and experiences of the initiation of an afterschool program'. My past thesis research was based on 8 month of observations as a participant and informal discussions in the afterschool. The main question was: what are the necessary premises for the endurance and successful functioning of a recently initiated afterschool program? To answer the question, I reviewed conflicts that erupted in between the volunteers of the program, as well as in between the volunteers and the foundation, the students, the parents and the surrounding institutions such as the schools and the local government, as well as the solutions to these conflicts. However, it remained clear, that some questions must be directly addressed if I would like to attain a more precise picture of the mechanisms of interest negotiation. Even though I was considering to make the recent thesis research within the same context, my long-term involvement in the afterschool might made my position as a researcher less creditable in several ways. I was also considering a comparative analysis of two afterschools, however at the end, due to the constraints of time, I decided to carry out this case study in only one afterschool, the one in Monor.

It is important to note here, that I am a firm believer of action research, which refers to research projects that are aiming to find pragmatic solutions to a particular problem, and this way contribute to the more efficient functioning of the subject of the research. For this reason, I offered to my interviewees to hold a presentation at the Tanoda, summarizing the main findings of this study. Furthermore, during the time spent at Monor I was helping to the Charity Service

in studying with the students, organize activities for them and play with them as well as helping in gardening and packing in the kitchen.

Based on my previous experiences, I identified the most prominent local actors and institutions that can affect the functioning of an afterschool. From March to April (2016) I went to the field, on a weekly basis. By spending the whole day there each time I went, I could observe most of the programs organized by the Charity Service, could visit the settlement and talk to the people. Based on my observations, I adjusted the previously defined list of influential actors to the local specificities of the given context. The final list therefore has become the following:

- I. Employees of the program: the program coordinator of the Monor integration project, the head of the afterschool, a teacher, a volunteer and a local assistant of the afterschool.
- II. Local actors: the head of the school, the head of the kindergarten, the employee responsible for the Tabán settlement from the family care office, the head of the Roma Self-Government and the Mayor.
- III. Beneficiaries of the program: the students and the parents/other relatives of the students.

When I was ready with the list of interviewees, I outlined a questionnaire containing the main topics I wanted to address, and made a pilot interview with one of the volunteers from the afterschool in Csobánka. This interview contributed a lot to the final format of my questionnaires, the questions become more specific, more comprehensive and the wording has become easier to comprehend. Even though it might have been useful, to make pilot interviews with students, parents and local actors, such as the head of the Roma Self-Government, my previous research experience and familiarity with this context allowed me to formulate all questions in a way that it successfully covered all the topics I was eager to learn more about. Ultimately I ended up with four questionnaires, a separate one for the program employees, another addressed to the local stakeholders and two more, an outline containing my questions

towards the parents and other relatives of the students, and the last one to the students themselves.

4.3 The interviews

The interviews were carried out in April and May 2016 in Monor. Overall I have talked to 14 people. I have made interviews with 6 people working for the Charity Service, the program coordinator of the integration program, the head of the Tanoda, a teacher, a volunteer and two assistants in the Tanoda. Unfortunately, one of the recordings was lost, therefore I did not include the interview with one of the assistants. I made 5 stakeholders interviews, with: the head of the Roma Minority Self-Government; the women responsible for the Tabán settlement from the family care service; a kindergarten teacher who was formerly working in the Tanoda program; and the two vice-headmasters from the elementary school. There are more than one kindergartens and elementary schools in Monor, however for this research I only considered the ones that are officially appointed to the Tabán settlement. For the interviews, I selected those representatives of the institutions who are in charge of contacting the Tanoda program. Due to the limited time available for my research, I decided not to interview the Mayor. It would be interesting to learn more about his attitude towards the program, however based on the interviews I made with the employees of the Charity Service, he does not play an influential role in the everyday functioning of the program. In order to explore the community development capacity of the program, I was aiming to interview approximately 6 students from the afterschool and their relative. Due to the limited time available for my research, finally I only talked to a parent, whose kids attend the afterschool and a young mother who is a regular in the Sure Start Children House, and whose sister attends the Tanoda and two students from the afterschool.

Most of the interviews were individual interviews and there were three group discussions, with the vice-headmasters of the elementary school, the parents/relatives and the students. Most of my interviewees were middle aged women and half of the interviews were made with Roma people from the Tabán settlement. The length of the discussions lasted on average 45 minutes, the interview with the assistant in the Tanoda program being the shortest, 23 minutes, and the one made with the program coordinator, the lengthiest, 1 hour and 21 minutes. I have not asked my interviewees about their ethnicity, therefore I only have information about it, in those cases where they mentioned it by themselves.

5 Framework of analysis

5.1 Structure of the analysis

The discussion of the results will be grouped into two topics, the social embeddedness and the interest negotiation capacity of the program. As I have previously indicated, I was not being able to make as many interviews as planned, with the beneficiaries of the program, therefore there will be no separate section for assessing the community development capacity of the program. In the first section, I will describe the social network of the Tanoda, focusing on the existence and quality of relations with the surrounding institutions, stakeholders and the beneficiaries of the program. In the second section I will consider the interest negotiation capacity of the program, by comparing the notions of the employees, the stakeholders and the target group about the aim and functioning, the target group and the evaluation of the program. In order to substantiate the validity of my findings and to introduce the reader to the context of the interviews, I will start by outlining my general impressions based on my observations on the field. I will also provide a short description of each interview situation, however the names of my interviewees are covered.

5.2 General impressions

5.2.1 Observations

The Roma settlement called the Tabán is basically contains two crossing streets without pavement. Houses are in quite bad conditions, made of cheap materials scattered in a completely unorganized fashion. There is no running water in most houses and ownership is often not clear. The Tanoda, the social office and the Childrens House are situated at the edge of the Tabán, while the community center, the hangar is in the middle of the Tabán next to the settlement house where locals could wash their clothes and use the shower. The Charity Service

provides jobs for many local Roma, mostly in the framework of the workfare program. People from the settlement can seek support with their problems in the social office. Besides, individual problem management, the program coordinators in the office are also responsible for carrying out rehabilitation projects in the settlement. Recently they provided each and every family with a dustbin, as the collection of waste material was not properly managed in the settlement. Even though the office has fixed opening hours, when someone from the settlement arrives at a different day/time, they usually let them in and consider their claimants.

The Tanoda is open every afternoon. On average 10 students attend the afterschool program. There are two teachers and two assistants, helping them with their homework or to prepare for a school exam. There are also two volunteers, coming once a week. One of them helps out with studying and the other one with psychological counselling. An older woman from the settlement cooks lunch for the employees and makes sandwiches in the afternoon for the kids. Most of the kids are going to the same school, however not all of them are from the Tabán settlement, but from the surrounding area, and approximately half of them are non-Roma. The atmosphere is very family like, however the relation of the staff and the students are very much hierarchical, it is very similar to that of the school.

The Sure Start Childrens House operate every weekday. There were around 10 mothers and 12 children. It is only for those aged in between 0-3, however there were older children as well. Even though the aim of the program is to develop the kid's competences for entering kindergarten, the kids prefer to stay in the Children House even after starting kindergarten. Not only mothers, but pregnant women and grandmothers also often attend. The activities are often defined by the pedagogic coordinator, but it has a rather informal and open character. Mothers are playing together with their kids and discuss health related issues with the medical volunteers of the program. It was a very friendly atmosphere, they seemed to be feeling at home here.

The classes of the symphony project mostly take place in the Childrens House, receiving participants from both the Children House and the Tanoda. Due to a decrease in founding, now there is only one teacher coming from Budapest. She teaches violin and cello to the kids. Some of the instruments were bought by the Charity Service, the rest were donated to the program. The kids seemed to be very excited about playing the instruments, there were very small ones playing children's songs and older ones playing more difficult pieces. Even though the program is not as popular now as it has been in the past years, it is still attended by some students and they seem to enjoy it a lot.

The Charity Service and the public service sector seem to work very closely. Someone from the children care service just dropped by, when I was there to discuss some issues. The employees of the Tanoda and the Social office work in close proximity to each other, have lunch together and discuss most issues together. The Children House is a separate unit. They are not involved in these discussions. There is some tension or rivalry, in between the Children House and the Tanoda. When I was there, their order from the supermarket has arrived. The employees had some conflict over which products belongs to whom. Afterwards the Tanoda staff had some discussion about the summer camp over lunch. They were implicitly favoring not to go to the summer camp together with the Children House and tried to convince the head of the Children House with financial arguments.

I also attended a pre-Easter event during one of the weekends. They had separate activities in the Children House and in the Tanoda for the kids and there were Jesuit monks coming to plant vegetables in the garden of the Tanoda. It was organized within the framework of a community engagement project. Some mothers, the Tanoda staff and one of the students also helped out in the planting, however it was mainly carry out by the monks. I asked one of the teachers from the Tanoda whether there were similar events in the past, and whether the attendance of the people from the Tabán was higher those times. She said that it has never been higher, also the

residents of the settlement are not familiar with the methods of planting and most of them does not have a garden where they could plant. Even though the Maltese Charity Service is a catholic organization, religion does not seem to play an important role in the functioning of the Tabán Integration project. Employees mentioned that all of them are religious as well as the majority of the target population, however religion is mainly considered as a personal issue, their activities rarely takes on a religious character.

5.2.2 Description of the interviews

All the people working in the Tanoda were very kind and welcoming. They enjoyed talking about what they are doing. It was the same, with the students. They were happy to share their stories from the Tanoda and from the school. As for the stakeholder interviews, all of them seemed to regard this topic as something that is important to discuss, and it was very easy to schedule the interviews, however as we held our discussion in their workplaces it was a bit more rushed, than in the Tanoda. Lastly, the relatives of the students were a bit suspicious about the interview, and they did not feel comfortable to share too much with me. They did not let me to record our conversation, therefore I was making notes throughout the discussion.

Interviews: type A – Employees of the Maltese Charity Service

Interviewee A/1 – The program coordinator

She is 26 years old and has a degree in social work. Previously she has worked for the family care service in Monor, however she felt that her agency was quite restricted there and when she was offered the job of program coordinator at the Tabán Integration program 2 years ago, she gladly accepted it. She was very helpful throughout the whole research process and helped me to arrange the interviews with many of my interviewees. She seems very enthusiastic but realistic at the same time. When I asked her about her future plans, she indicated that she would like to work here in the future as well, but she would rather be a mentor to be able to spend

more time with the students. She was very talkative during the interview, explained a lot about the Integration program and the institutional framework of the Tanoda program.

Interviewee A/2 – The head of the Tanoda

She is middle aged and has a degree in pedagogy, with biology and chemics specialization. She has been working as a teacher for most of her life, then for some years she has worked at the police headquarters in a nearby town. In her words, it was not fulfilling for her, she was looking for a new challenge and she saw the advertisement of a teacher position in the Tanoda in the local newspaper. She was not familiar with the work of the Charity Service in Monor, therefore it was a completely new field for her. She seemed to be very proud of the whole program and to her achievements within the Tanoda. She is rather strict, in her teaching habits as well as a person. She also plans long-term with the Tanoda, she said that she has been drawn into this. She is quite critical about both her colleagues, the target group and the residents of Monor.

Interviewee A/3 – A teacher in the Tanoda

She is middle aged and have a degree in pedagogy, she is a Russian language teacher and a mental hygiene expert. She was working in an elementary school for 6 years, then she went to work to a Family Care Service. She moved to Monor in 2013, seeking a job and until then she applied to the Charity Service as a volunteer. Now she is employed by the organization and works as one of the teachers in the Tanoda. She is rather silent and very caring. Throughout the interview she emphasized the importance of their good relation with the school. As a former teacher she enjoys discuss the issues concerning the students of the Tanoda, with the school teachers. She would like to stay in her position in the Tanoda as long as it is possible.

Interviewee A/4 – A volunteer of the Tanoda

She is 26 years old, has a BA in international relations and an MA in intercultural pedagogy and psychology. After finishing her BA, she was looking for an opportunity to volunteer with disadvantaged kids. She applied to several organizations and finally the Charity Service

received her three years ago. She works at a journal as an editor full time, and volunteers in the Children House and the Tanoda, once a week. She is very well informed about the theory and practice of Tanoda programs, a real expert in this issue. Her attitude towards the program 'participants' (the employees, the stakeholders and the beneficiaries as well) is very reflective and also a bit sarcastic. She is very strict with the children but also admired by them. To my question concerning her future plans, she said that she would love to stay here in Monor until the end of her life, however there is another afterschool of the Charity Service in a much more underdeveloped settlement, and she was offered a full time job there, therefore she will most likely start working there from the next year.

Interviewee A/5 – An assistant of the Tanoda

He is 21 years old and finished a vocational school with the qualification of shop assistant. Before coming to work to the program he was enrolled in a gardening training for adults. His sister was working here as an assistant in the framework of the workfare program, and recommended this job to him, therefore when there was an opportunity he applied. He is now working there for half a year and he likes his job, even though he mentioned that he would be happier with a higher salary. He is from the Tabán settlement, but he did not attend the afterschool, or any other of the programs of the Charity Service before. He was quite critical about the residents of the settlement and emphasized the important role of the Tanoda in introducing an everyday schedule to the student's life. He would like to keep working in the Tanoda in the future as well, and he is planning to continue his studies.

Interviews: type B – Stakeholders in Monor

Interviewee B/1 – The head of the Roma Minority Self-Government

He is middle aged, and finished elementary school. He was working from the age of 15. He has worked in several factories, at the public transportation company in Budapest and at the airport

as a caterer. He was the representative and later the head of the Roma Minority Self-Government in Monor since 1993. In 2006 he was ill, at that term he did not participate in the works of the RMSG, and he was reelected as president in 2014. Besides he is a pensioner, and have a very serious heart disease, that makes him less mobile. He lives on the edge of the Tabán settlement. He talked about the Charity Service as a very beneficial organization for the settlement, however he feels a bit left out of the decision making process of the NGO, he mentioned several times that he would preferred to be asked about who should get housing support from the Charity Service. As an RMSG, he is also the leader of the settlement house and the public workers who are responsible for the maintenance of the place, therefore he decides on who gets public employment. This makes him an influential figure within the settlement, and he seems to enjoy this position. He said that is mostly satisfied with the work of the Charity Service and would be happy if they would have more money to continue with the rehabilitation of the settlement.

Interviewee B/2 – A representative of the Family Care Service

She is middle aged, has a degree in kindergarten pedagogy, developmental pedagogy and she is a mental hygiene expert. She has worked for most of her life in a kindergarten, then she was employed for 5 years at a boarding school for handicapped children and in the past three years she has been working in the Family Care Service. She is the one responsible for the Tabán settlement within the service. As many of the children from the settlement were enrolled in the boarding school, she was already familiar with some of the families and the program of the Charity Service. She evaluated her relation with the NGO to be very sufficient and she is also satisfied with the workings of the Family Care Service. Her attitude towards the residents of the Tabán settlement is a bit patronizing and mostly she sees her role as an official authority. She is satisfied with the Tanoda program and she would support the enlargement of the program to make it more accessible to the residents outside of the Tabán area as well.

Interviewee B/3 – The kindergarten teacher

She is in her forties, she has three university degrees, one in kindergarten pedagogy, one in integrative pedagogic methods and one in pedagogy of students with special needs and handicaps. She has been working as a kindergarten teacher in a segregated village, and then decided to move from there when her oldest kid was starting school. She started working at the boarding school for handicapped students and after a while she applied to the kindergarten in Monor, which belongs to the same administrative district as the Tabán settlement, therefore most of the kids from the settlement are enrolled in that kindergarten. From the beginning she was in contact with the Charity Service and they soon offered her a part-time job in the Children House. She works there for 4 years now, she largely contributed to the development of the program there. She was asked to be the head of the Tanoda from 2013, therefore she was working in three jobs for three years. Since the Tanoda founding was over, she volunteers in the Tanoda. She is very supportive of the interconnected nature of the programs run by the Charity Service and public institutions. She has become an expert in the maintenance of the afterschool and has many innovative ideas to develop the system. She enjoyed her work in the afterschool a lot, however for now she would like to have more time for her family, and get more involved in the Tanoda program some years on, when her children will be older.

Interviewee B/4 – The vice-headmaster of the lower grades at the elementary school

She is in her forties and has a degree in music pedagogy and completed a training in institutional management. She was working as an elementary school teacher in various schools in Monor, employed by the recent school for 5 years and she is the vice-headmaster of the lower grades for two years now. She is very supportive of the Tanoda program and emphasized its efficiency that has visible results in their school as well. She seemed to be very enthusiastic about the program, well informed about its specific activities and was eager to further develop the school's relationship with the Tanoda. Her attitude towards the students and their family

members contains some prejudiced views, however she firmly believes that with the help of the Charity Service, their living conditions and life chances can improve a lot.

Interviewee B/5 – The vice-headmaster of the upper grades at the elementary school

He is in his forties, has a degree in pedagogy with a specialization in physics. He has been working in three different schools as a teacher, then in private companies for 6 years, and for 5 years now, he works in this school. He was appointed vice-headmaster of the higher grades two years ago as well. He goes to the Tanoda as a volunteer sometimes to help the students before physics exam. He says that the attitude of the students towards studying has changed significantly since the program was launched. However, he shares the same prejudiced views of the residents of the Tabán settlement as his colleague. He is very supportive of the Tanoda program and has little knowledge of the other activities of the Charity Service in Monor.

Interviews: type C and D – Students of the Tanoda program and their parents/relatives

Interviewee C/1 – Parent

She is in her late sixties. For reasons not discussed with me, she was raising her grandchildren instead of her daughter, her grandchildren regard her to be their mother and she considers them as her children, therefore I will refer to her from now on as a parent. She has completed the first 4 grades of elementary school, has worked in the farmers' co-operative, in a chemical factory in Pest and in several shops as sales assistant. She is now a pensioner and lives in the Tabán settlement. One of her children is an assistant in the afterschool, another son of hers attends the Tanoda program, whose younger brother is involved in the soccer team. She was very shy and a bit frightened of my presence. Her answers to my questions were short, but generally she showed a supportive attitude to the afterschool. She emphasized the role of the Charity Service in offering financial and administrative support to her family and supporting the students of the afterschool with school books and providing them food during the afternoon.

Interviewee C/2 – Sister

She is 20 years old and completed elementary school as well as 2 years of secondary education. She has not worked yet as she has a little son, therefore she is still at home with him. She has no plans on where to work in the future. They live in the Tabán settlement. Her little sister attends the afterschool and she attends regularly the Children House with her son. She was more talkative during the interview. She also seemed to be more knowledgeable of the specific activities organized at the Tanoda. She said that it is a good program, as they do not make difference between the students based on their social conditions.

Interviewee D/1 – Student

He is 9 years old, a third grader in the Kossuth elementary school in Monor, where most of the students from the Tanoda are enrolled. He lives in the Tabán settlement with his family. He attends the afterschool program for 1,5 years now on a daily basis. He applied to the afterschool because one of his friends was also enrolled and advised him to do so. He also plays in the soccer team. In his opinion the program helps him, and the other participants as well, to improve their educational achievement and their 'behavior'. He compared the program to the elementary school and emphasized how much more he likes to be in the afterschool.

Interviewee D/2 – Student

He is 11 years old, a fifth grader in the Kossuth elementary school in Monor. He lives near the Tabán settlement with his family. He only attends the afterschool for half a year on a daily basis. He was also brought there by a friend, from school. He does not participate in the other activities organized by the Charity Service (such as the soccer or the symphony program) but he is very active in the afterschool. He is the one who arrives first and leaves last, and he helps around in the kitchen or the garden, whenever it is possible. He is also very satisfied with the Tanoda, he mentioned that he behaves better in school and his grades are better this year as well. He emphasized that here everyone is being very nice to him.

6 Discussion of results

6.1 Network structure and quality of relations

6.1.1 Target group

With regards to the target population, employees of the Tanoda mentioned that they have a very close relation with the students of the program. They described themselves, together with the students as a big family. Most of the students are visiting the afterschool on a daily basis, for them it is like going home, as one of the employees stated. There has been a decrease in the attendance rate of the students, since the end of the afterschool fund. There were several theories amongst the employees to explain it. Some mentioned that there are less excursions, which was a very big source of attraction before. Others claimed that there may be too many activities, the Tanoda, the soccer program and the symphony program, to choose from, therefore the students just got overwhelmed. Furthermore, some of the employees argued that whenever the families in the Tabán settlement are upset with the Charity Service, for instance not receiving financial support, they prohibit their kids to attend the Tanoda. Based on the group discussion with the students, they enjoy a lot going to the Tanoda. They mentioned that the employees pay attention on them and care for them as well as that they get help in learning, they can play there and go on excursions occasionally. They seemed to be very satisfied with the program, they juxtaposed it to the school which they were much less satisfied.

As for the parents, most employees mentioned that their relation is rather unbalanced. One of the teachers said that somehow they still do not confine in them as much their kids do. There are no parents club, or scheduled parent's meetings, which some employees regarded as a deficiency in their program. The parents and relative I interviewed expressed their satisfaction with the Tanoda and they said that they get on well with the employees.

6.1.2 Stakeholders

All of the employees mentioned the school as one of the most important partner of the program. The relationship was described by both the vice-headmasters and the Tanoda employees as mutually beneficial. They support each other, for instance some of the teachers occasionally go to the Tanoda to teach the kids, while on the other side, the sheer existence of the Tanoda reduced dramatically the rates of dropping out and school failure of disadvantaged students. Both parties mentioned that the school recommends students to apply to the Tanoda. Their cooperation is formal, in terms that they have signed a contract about supporting each other, but communication mechanisms are mostly takes an informal form. They call each other whenever they need to discuss something or seek advice, this applies to all of the Tanoda employees and the teachers as well as headmasters in the school. Tanoda employees are invited to the conference of the teachers in the school and they both participate in the 'case discussion meetings' organized by the Family Care Service. The students participating in the symphony program held several concerts in the school. One of the vice-headmasters mentioned, that they could also organize events together that takes place in the Tanoda.

„Make it [i.e. the cooperation] tighter. For example, organizing more joint activities, so not only they can come here, to the school, but the school could be “taken out” to them. This is what hasn’t been done yet, to show the kids the environment there [in the Tanoda]; they have already encountered it here, in the school, as it has already come here, the results of their work have been visible here, but this could be turned the other way round, which has not happened yet. This would be a positive thing.”⁴⁵

One of the employees of the Tanoda mentioned that the school relies on the Tanoda as a contact point and mediator to the parents and she also thinks that the school need to take a more active role in paying attention to the specific problems of the students and pass on the information to the relevant bodies.

⁴⁵ Interviewee B/4. The vice-headmaster of the lower grades at the elementary school. June 3, 2016.

Most of the employees of the Tanoda mentioned the Family Care Service as an important partner, even though this relation is a bit more complicated than the one with the school, as it is intertwined with the other programs of the Charity Service as well. Based on the interviews with the Tanoda staff, the Tanoda gets in touch with the Family Care Service when there is a problem with a student, for instance they rarely attend school, that could result in the revoking of the social allowance from their family. They also cooperate in examining and sending students with learning difficulties to schools for children with special needs. The program coordinator is the one who contacts the representative of the Family Care Service most often and participates in the 'case discussion meetings' organized by the Family Care Service. She has mentioned that this relation is not without conflicts and not always fluent, however it developed a lot in the past years and they have built up a well-functioning cooperation.

„I would call both relations functional. There might be some troublesome points that don't let us go beyond formalities, which is I think due to how the system works, so not to personal issues or intentions and the like, but things that are attributable to the functioning of the system. For example, at the Family Care Service, there is this family that is quite big, they live in bad conditions, and the disabled child was in a very good place, with foster parents, his abilities were being developed nicely, the kid was becoming all right, when they decided to put him back home after a revision, because there is this principle in the system that the kids should be given back to the parents, as there's no more place at foster parents' or in foster homes. Now it is decided that under the age of 12 they can only be given to foster parents, the older ones can only go to foster homes, but there's no place so they send everyone they can back to the parents. And I understand that, there is a pressure to do this, but it was not good for the child. It is not their fault, the fault is in the system, but I imagine it happens at every institution that we blame some kind of a Fata Morgana.”⁴⁶

The representative of the Family Care Service also mentioned that it is not precisely the Tanoda, but the whole integration program they are in touch with. They have a contract as well and the NGO often contacts the families or arranges issues instead of the Family Care Service. She said that it is a very intense cooperation, they talk on phone 5-6 times a day and in her opinion it is a very good and beneficial relation.

⁴⁶ Interviewee A/1. The program coordinator. April 13, 2016.

Only two of the employees mentioned the importance of the relation with the kindergarten. They said that they always get very positive feedback from there. As one of the kindergarten teacher was working in the afterschool and is still works in the Children House, she is an important figure in connecting these institutions. One of the employees mentioned, that this woman mediates a lot in between the kindergarten teachers and the families from the Tabán, and she also facilitates that kindergarten teachers visit the settlement from time to time. The kinder garden teacher also explained briefly the importance of promoting this involvement.

„I just remembered that there was one yesterday, the Order of Malta Charity organized a full-day program, a “Health Day”, a thematic day about health-related issues, for which they made a bus with lung diagnostics equipment come. First of all, for the benefit of the target group, to help these Roma people who have a very negative approach towards the health care system, but we always need reversed integration, to tear down the walls. When some four years ago this happened for the first time, I was trying to motivate my colleagues, as we also need this kind of lung examination as part of the employment-related medical examination, so I told them to come, it is free of charge and you don’t have to sacrifice a whole workday for it. At the time, only two came, I could only bring two colleagues, but last year it was twelve of us, and we underwent the examination together with the target group, the moms and grandmas. So we have this kind of joint programs, we know about each other’s issues, and there is a formal element to it, the Cooperation and Assistance Agreement.”⁴⁷

She was also very supportive of all programs organized by the Charity Service. Even though the kindergarten has a stronger tie with the Children House, as many of the kids enrolled in the kindergarten was previously enrolled in the Children House. However, from kindergarten, the kids will enroll in the Tanoda program, therefore she finds both relations very beneficial. Based on the experiences of her previous involvement, she emphasized the importance of the formation of a strong network in between public institutions and the programs maintained by the Charity Service.

The relation with the Roma Minority Self-Government was described by one of the employees of the program as unstable. In her opinion it is basically because of the power relations, when the Charity Service does not favor the standpoint of the RMSG president on certain issues,

⁴⁷ Interviewee B/3. The kindergarten teacher. June 3, 2016.

mostly on who receives support, the RMSG tries to undermine the initiative of the NGO. For one of the presidential periods, the Charity Service supported the election of a young Roma intellectual originating from the settlement. The previous president turned against the NGO and sabotaged its programs. In the last elections, he was re-elected as president and since then their relation is more balanced. The president of the RMSG did not mention that there were periods when they were on bad terms with the organization. In his opinion, all the programs organized by the NGO are very beneficial for the community, he added that they sometimes organize programs together, such as the Roma Day celebrations. His only concern was that the housing interventions are less frequent and whenever the Charity Service decides to help someone, to buy a new house or to refurbish the former one, his opinion is not considered enough. He described his relationship with the program coordinator as follows:

“We don’t have secrets of that kind, we are not courting each other, we are more like a married couple, we fight and then we reconcile.”⁴⁸

There were other local institutions mentioned by some of the employees of the Tanoda. Two of them mentioned the relation with the catholic priest, who comes to the Tanoda at religious celebrations and is very supportive of the families as well as of the NGO. Besides, police officers organize events for drug and crime prevention in the Tanoda from time to time. Besides, one of the employees mentioned that within the framework of their career orientation program, they are in relation with some of the secondary schools and future employees, such as the local bakery. Their relation with the city and its residents was also mentioned by most of them. Some of them said that they have a very good relation with the recent municipal government, they organize the Children’s Day in the city together. One of the employees said that the residents of Monor are very prejudiced towards the Roma. The assistant of the Tanoda also added, that even though they organize events in the Tanoda, such as the ‘open day’, when

⁴⁸ Interviewee B/1. The head of the Roma Minority Self-Government. May 27, 2016.

those interested outside of the Tabán, can visit the institution „they just did not come, they do not have a good opinion of it”⁴⁹. There is one private company at Monor who support the institution, they organized a big charity concert for them, where the students from the symphony program could play.

Only one local institution was mentioned with whom it would be important to have a good relation, but somehow the institution is reluctant to get involved, which is the health care service. The program coordinator mentioned that they seem to be afraid to go to the settlement, therefore often when parents call them because someone is ill, they do not go there to examine them. They also do not call the NGO to discuss issues concerning the students, which is very problematic, for instance when they give out countless medical certificates so that the students can verify their missing from school.

Actors outside of the locality was also mentioned, such as donors who support the Tanoda with clothes and school equipment; educational institutions from Budapest from which volunteers come to the program and the plenary discussions with other Tanoda programs from the region.

⁴⁹ Interviewee A/5. An assistant of the Tanoda. April 13, 2016.

6.2 Interest negotiation

6.2.1 Employees of the afterschool

The Tanoda staff outlined a wide variety of aims of their institution. With regards to educational achievement they mentioned the importance to decrease the rate of students dropping out of school, increase the amount of students who finish elementary school, facilitate education related success, such as pursuing further studies, change the attitude of the children towards studying, support them in formulating their goals and in the long run, help students to enroll in universities, who could later be an important role model for the rest of the students in the afterschool. With regards to other competences, they would like to develop the cooperative skills of the students as well as facilitating their community formation and pass on useful pragmatic knowledge, such as domestic practices and hygiene. They also mentioned that the afterschool has an important role in connecting the parents and the school and mediate in between them; advocate the interest of the students and facilitate their integration in the city, by implementing a successful program. Concerning the long term aims of the institution some of them said it should provide a possibility for the children to break out of their disadvantaged social position and decrease its negative effects. Others emphasized the importance to provide the children with facilities that parents belonging to the middle class could provide for their kids.

In order to achieve these aims they also outlined the various practices they apply and the activities they organize for the students. They are mainly helping the students to write their homework and prepare for their exams in school. However, they also mentioned that they try to be as sensitive of the specific needs of the students as possible. It is not frequent, but when they have the time for it they also focus on the development of other competences of the children such as their logical skills. They also engage in practices of talent development, therefore provide the students with the possibility to participate in activities, such as the

symphony program or the soccer trainings. If a student fails a class at the end of the year, they help them to prepare for the re-take exam. Even though there is no schedule in the Tanoda, there are certain rules of which students should oblige to. They could only enter with their textbooks, playing and lunch is only approved after studying, they should reserve their environment in good conditions and pay attention to each other. If they behave well they get a stamp and after collecting a certain amount, they can get a little present, such as a chocolate bar.

I was also inquiring about, how the Tanoda staff describe their target group. Most of them said that Roma, elementary students from the Tabán settlement. Some of them also mentioned students enrolled in secondary education, the family of the students and disadvantaged students from other parts of the city. When I was asking them about the difficulties their target group is facing, they mentioned that they are multiply disadvantaged because they are living in poverty, even though some argued that most of them do not live in deep poverty. Their housing conditions are generally bad, they live in small and dark houses, often without proper furniture. There is no running water in the houses, and they have difficulties with heating and paying electricity bills during the winter. Parents have low levels of education, often struggling with providing for their family from day to day because their main source of income is social allowance. Very few of them have a job, and those parents who works are mostly does public work. In some of the families, crime and addiction also appears, therefore there are kids whose parents are often in jail. They are subject to prejudices and discrimination. For instance, they have difficulty to access health care services and some of the students have to face the prejudices of their peers and teachers in school. Some of the employees also mentioned that some of the students belonging to their target group are emotionally deprived and have difficulties to conform to school because of the different norms in school and in their home environment. One of the employees seemed to be a bit prejudiced. She said, that:

„Their norms and values are completely different from out norms, the norms of normal people...Their bad financial condition mostly originates from that they spare their money.”⁵⁰

All of the employees in the Tanoda evaluated the project to be a success in general. When I asked them to specify this success, they emphasized the good working environment in the Tanoda, their relative success with preparing their students during the summer to the re-take exams, their strengthening relationship with the school, the reintegration of non-Roma students to the Tanoda and the attitude of the children towards the afterschool. When I asked them about the problematic parts of the project, all of them mentioned different things. With regards to the students it was mentioned, that they refuse any kind of schedules, their attendance is decreasing and that they are not motivated enough to „develop their full capacity.” With regards to the Tanoda staff some of them mentioned that it is very hard to recruit suitable candidates, while others were claiming that the division of labor amongst the employees is not balanced. About the parents, they found it problematic, that there is still some kind of a distance in between them, and that they still cannot access, the most disadvantaged families. All of them mentioned that a more stable funding would be important on the long run. When I asked them about their future plans concerning the program, many of them mentioned that a psychologist should be involved full time, in their work. Some of them were arguing that they should involve more those students who study in secondary education. They also mentioned that it would be great if they could focus more on the development of the creativity of the students.

6.2.2 Target group

When I asked the beneficiaries about the main aim of the Tanoda program they were mostly focusing on the educative role of the institution. The parents mentioned that the main aim of the program is to support children in finishing elementary school, to prevent them from

⁵⁰ Interviewee A/2. The head of the Tanoda. April 13, 2016.

wandering around aimlessly on the streets and to provide them a place where they can just feel good. About the functioning of the institution, parents said that the students have to write their homework, prepare for their exams and afterwards they can play and talk to the teachers. They also mentioned that the Tanoda brings the children to the theater, the movies, the circus, to concerts and they also take them to excursions and summer camps. To my question, how they would describe the target group of the Tanoda, they replied that it cannot be generalized, some are living in better conditions, some in worse and some living a normal life and then there are others who does not care enough about their children. About the difficulties of the target group, they explained that most of them live from social allowances and has many children. They said that during the winter it is very difficult to provide for heating and electricity. They also mentioned that it is very hard for them to find work.

In their opinion, the afterschool is very successful and they brought up the example of a boy who got into a high school in Szolnok by the support of the afterschool. Specifically, they mentioned the importance of the knowledge of the teachers, that they can help their kids in studying and that they receive school equipment from the Tanoda. They also emphasized that the kids really enjoy attending the afterschool, because they love the employees very much and that „the employees do not make differentiations amongst the children based on their looks or anything alike”⁵¹. In their opinion there is no problem with the functioning of the afterschool and they hope that in the future it will remain the same.

Similarly, to the parents, the students also mentioned that the main aim of the institution is to make them happy, but they also added that another aim is to develop their grades and behavior in school. Regarding the activities in the Tanoda, they said that first they study, write their homework, then they play. Even though they both had a favorite teacher, they were open to

⁵¹ Interviewee C/2. Sister. May 27, 2016.

study with the rest of the teachers as well. It was interesting to see that they did not mention poverty, when I asked them about the difficulties of the students enrolled in the Tanoda. Their answer was that there are both girls and boys, usually students in the afterschool have mediocre grades and they need help in studying. In their opinion the program is very good, it helps them to improve their grades and to understand school material. There is nothing, that they regard as problematic in the functioning of the Tanoda. They would not change a single thing in the afterschool, however they would like to have better grades.

6.2.3 Stakeholders

The Family Care Service representative defined the aims of the institution as follows: to change the student's attitudes towards studying, nurturing their talents and helping them to achieve their aims. In her opinion the long term goals are to help the pupils to break out from their disadvantaged social position and facilitate their social integration. She also added that in her opinion the Tanoda should only provide assistance for families and children who are willing to cooperate. Regarding the activities in the afterschool she mentioned that the students get support in writing their homework, besides, there are many interesting program they could participate in and during the summer vacation they can attain help with preparing for the re-take exams. Her answer to my question regarding the target population was that students enrolled in the program were usually attending the Children House as well, and they are talented. About their difficulties she mentioned that they often fail in school because they miss many classed. They live in poverty and their families lack the knowledge and tools to support them. She said that she has learnt a lot from these families, however, similarly to one of the afterschool teachers, she has some prejudiced views about the Roma as well:

„They face prejudices, however there is some truth to it. Their culture is totally different from ours. Because of their traditions, girls will become mother at a very early age. They spend a lot of time with their kids, however the quality of the time spent is questionable.”⁵²

It is a very well-functioning initiative in her opinion. Less students fails the re-take exams and parents become more cooperative. She mentioned that the only problematic aspect could be that the employees does not keep their distance with the students who might take advantage of this. She hopes that the attitude these students acquire in the afterschool, will be passed on to the next generations and it will become a very successful initiative to achieve the full integration of the Roma in the Hungarian society. In the future it would be important to get more funding, so that they could expand their target group.

The head of the RMSG argued that the main aim of the institution is to support the students in their studies, teach them rules and integrate them to the majority society. He said that students regardless of their age and cognitive capacities are educated together in the afterschool. The circumstances of the children are very bad in his opinion. Their nutrition is not sufficient. They have housing difficulties, their families cannot pay their bills and there are drug addicts amongst their parents as well. He also added that his main problem with the young Roma generation is that they do not like to work.

He thinks that it is generally a successful program. He mentioned that there are very enthusiastic teachers, the grades of the students are improving and he also talked about the boy who is now studying in a high school in Szolnok. He found three aspects of the functioning of the afterschool to be problematic: 1. that students are not diligent enough, 2. that students from different age groups with different cognitive competences are not educated in a separated way, 3. that secondary school students are not involved enough. In his opinion, in the future it would

⁵² Interviewee B/2. A representative of the Family Care Service. May 27, 2016.

be important to have a fixed teaching staff, to involve more the RMSG in decision making and to provide scholarship to talented students.

According to the kindergarten teacher, the goals of the Tanoda covers: the strengthening of the identity of the students, compensating for their social disadvantages, providing them the opportunity to participate in extracurricular activities, widen their knowledge about the world and make them familiar with various opportunities. About the everyday functioning of the institution she said that during the period they received the state fund they had to do a lot of administration and their schedule was stricter. These days students can come whenever they feel like, they talk a bit, have lunch and write their homework. She shared her dilemma with me concerning the activities organized for the children:

„It is very important to provide art education, music education and such things, but studying is the most important element, because only that can provide the possibility to break out. It is awful, we know very well that writing the homework will not contribute to the development of most competences, but at the same time, if it is not ready, the student will fail. Even though it would be much better to concentrate on the development of logical and reading competences, homework should be done first.”⁵³

She described the target population, as multiply disadvantaged elementary school students, who are living in very bad housing conditions, in a segregated settlement. In her words, their disadvantages are 'socio-cultural'. Their parents are often unemployed and if not, they do public work.

Her evaluation of the program was very positive. She mentioned that in the past three years, they developed a large social network. Besides, both the grades and the various competences of the kids developed a lot. Similarly, to one of the teachers, she mentioned that those kids that would need the help of the program the most, are the most difficult to access, because their parents does not cooperate. She finds it problematic that „to continue nurturing the parents in the afterschool in the same way they did it in the Children House is much more difficult, as

⁵³ Interviewee B/3. The kindergarten teacher. June 3, 2016.

they are much less involved”. In her opinion, the efficacy of the program, depends on the solution to its stable funding. She believes that on the long run, the afterschool will be founded by the Maltese Charity Service.

Finally, the aims of the Tanoda outlined by the vice-headmasters from the school, is to support the students in their educational advancement, which is the only way out from their socially disadvantaged position. They also added that the institutional socialization provided by the Tanoda, supports them to integrate to the majority society without losing their ‘culture’. Regarding the activities, they mentioned that the kids receive individual or grouped tutoring and they get something to eat there as well. When I asked them about the beneficiaries of the program, they said that all students are disadvantaged and most of them are recruited from the Tabán settlement. Their basic needs are often not gratified and in some families the parents are incarcerated. Their notions about the target group also contained some prejudices:

„Low levels of education, unemployment and their relation to work. It is in their socialization, their brain has to be modified a bit, because their relation to work is still, let’s say, inconsistent. I would like to get some money, but I do not want to work.”⁵⁴

When I asked them to evaluate the program, they listed many positive aspects. They said that there is a very good atmosphere in the afterschool and that teachers are very enthusiastic. They also added that it brings a certain structure to the lives of the students that has a positive effect on their school performance. They emphasized that the employees in the Tanoda know very well the way to address the parents, which facilitates the cooperation of the families with the program. The only problematic aspect they mentioned was that students are not grateful enough for the support they get there.

In their opinion, it will function for a long time, even if there is no funding, however they mentioned that funding should be stable as well as that the staff at the Tanoda should be allowed to make more decisions on their own, referring to the strict restrictions of the Tanoda tender.

⁵⁴ Interviewee B/4. The vice-headmaster of the lower grades at the elementary school. June 3, 2016.

7 Conclusion and discussions

To conclude, the Tanoda has a very wide social network and most of these relations are very strong. With the school, the family care service and the kindergarten they are in a mutually beneficial cooperation. Regarding their target group, their success is less obvious. They were relatively successful in involving the students to the program, however their relation to the parents based on the interviews is rather ambiguous.

Their capacity for interest negotiation is definitely efficient if we consider the results of the interviews with the stakeholders. They are very well informed about the program and on most questions they seem to agree with each other. Furthermore, they were all mostly satisfied with the functioning of the program. The target group has also had considerable information of the aims and the functioning of the program, however the fact that they did not mention any problematic aspects of it, could imply, that in effect they know little about the afterschool.

This close cooperation of the Charity Service with local public institutions often results in the mechanism, in which these institutions shift their responsibilities to the NGO. Even though, it is a well-known negative effect, that often accompanies the appearance of NGOs, based on the interviews, the enthusiasm of the employees of the Tanoda, has a positive effect on the work-related attitudes of the representatives of the public institutions as well as on their opinion formation concerning the Roma in Monor. The fact that these institutions do not compete with the NGO, instead they are constantly sharing their experiences and informations with each other can promote the interests of the target group of the Charity Service to a large extent.

To the research question considering community development, I can only give a limited answer. Based on the interviews and my observations, the local embeddedness of the Charity Service facilitated the embeddedness of the Tanoda program as well. However, the relation of the Charity Service and the residents of the Tabán settlement is quite paternalistic and the

residents are very much dependent on the NGO. Even though the Tanoda program has a very clear capacity within the given context to facilitate community formation, the residents do not perceive it separately from the Charity Service, therefore the functioning of the Charity Service influences the community formation capacity of the afterschool to a large extent.

To elaborate more the community development capacity of the Tanoda in Monor, it would be important make more interviews with the beneficiaries of the program, both with the students and their parents, relatives. The advocacy activity of the Tanoda and its initiatives aimed at empowering the community should be examined more carefully.

In order to attain, more reliable conclusions concerning the community development capacity of afterschool programs, it would be useful to make a comparative analysis, involving more afterschools in the research.

8 Bibliography

Blénes, Éva. "Processes of formation of Roma identity in east central Europe." In *Ethnic Identities in Dynamic Perspective, Proceedings of the 2002 Annual Meeting of the Gypsy Lore Society*, edited by Sheila Salo, and Csaba Prónai, Budapest: Gondolat kiadó, 2002.

Brüggemann, Christian. "Segregation in Education" In *Roma Education in Comparative Perspective*. 63-71.

Csaba, Zoltán L. and Závecz, Gergő. "Milyen tényezők hatnak a magyarországi cigány népesség nemzetiségi önbesorolására?" In *Roma Kutatások. Élethelyzetek a Társadalom Peremén*, edited by Erika Kurucz, 17-44. Budapest: Nemzeti Család- és Szociálpolitikai Intézet, 2011.

Csepeli, György and Simon, Dávid. "Construction of Roma identity in Eastern and Central Europe: Perception and self-identification." In *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 30/1 (2003): 129-150.

Doyle, Jamie M. and Kao, Grace. "Are racial identities of multiracials stable? Changing self-identification among single and multiple race individuals." In *Social Psychology Quarterly* 70 (2007): 405-423.

Emberi Erőforrások Minisztériuma. "Tanoda sztenderd." 2008. Accessed March 15, 2014. <http://palyazat.gov.hu/doc/1363>

Emigh, Rebecca J., Fodor, Éva, and Szelényi, Iván. "The Racialization and Feminisation of Poverty?" In *Poverty, Ethnicity and Gender in Eastern Europe during the Market Transition*, edited by Rebecca J. Emigh, and Iván Szelényi, 1-32; Westport, CT: Praeger, 2006.

Fejes, József B. "Miért van szükség deszegregációra?" In *A Szegedi és Hódmezővásárhelyi Deszegregációt Támogató Hallgató Mentorprogram: Öt Év Tapasztalatai*, edited by Norbert Szűcs and József Fejes, 15-36; Szeged: Belvedere, 2013.

Fejes, József B. "Mire jó a tanoda?" *Esély* 26/4 (2014): 29–56.

Granovetter, Mark. "The strength of weak ties." *American Journal of Sociology*, 78/6 (1973): 1360-1380.

Havas, Gábor. "Esélyegyenlőség, deszegregáció." In *Zöld könyv. A Magyar közoktatás megújításáért*, edited by Fazekas Károly, Köllő János és Varga Júlia, 121-138. Budapest: Ecostat Kormányzati Gazdaság- és társadalomstratégiai Kutató Intézet, 2008.

Jelenlét. "Monor, Tabán." Accessed May 25, 2016. <http://jelenlet.maltai.hu/helyszinek/monor-taban/>

Katalizátor hálózat. "A tanodák jelene és jövője: hatékonyság és hálózatosodás." 2014. Accessed March 1, 2014. <http://katalizatorhalozat.hu/esemenyek>

Kemény, István and Janky, Béla. "A cigány nemzetiségi adatokról." In *Kisebbség Kutatás*, 2 (2003). Accessed May, 15, 2016.

http://www.hhrf.org/kisebbségkutatas/kk_2003_02/cikk.php?id=747

Kerényi, György. "Tanoda könyv. Javaslatok tanodák szervezéséhez." Budapest: SuliNova Közoktatás-fejlesztési és Pedagógus-továbbképzési Kht, 2005.

Kertesi, Gábor and Kézdi, Gábor. "The Roma/non-Roma Test Score Gap in Hungary." Budapest Working Papers on the Labour Market 1401, Institute of Economics, Centre for Economic and Regional Studies, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, 2014.

Kertesi, Gábor, and Kézdi, Gábor. "Általános iskolai szegregáció Magyarországon az ezredforduló után." *Közgazdasági Szemle*, 56/11 (2009): 959-1000.

Kertesi, Gábor, and Kézdi, Gábor. "Roma Employment in Hungary after the Post-Communist Transition." *Economics of Transition*, 19/3 (2011): 563–610.

Kézdi, Gábor and Surányi, Éva. "Egy sikeres integrációs program tapasztalatai: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatási integrációs programjának hatásvizsgálata 2005-2007." Budapest: Educatio Társadalmi Szolgáltató Közhasznú Társaság, 2008.

Kiss, Dávid. "Cigánytelep nyolctól négyig. Dávid naplója." Budapest: Magyar Máltai Szeretetszolgálat, 2011.

Kovats, Martin. "The Political Significance of the first National Gypsy Minority Self-Government (Országos Cigány Kisebbségi Önkormányzat)." *Journal on Ethnopolitics and Minority Issues in Europe*, Autumn (2001): 1-24.

Ladányi, János and Szelényi, Iván. "A roma etnicitás társadalmi konstrukciója Bulgáriában, Magyarországon és Romániában a piaci átmenet korszakában." In *Szociológiai Szemle*, 4 (2001): 85-95.

Liskó, Ilona. "Disadvantaged children in vocational training schools." In *Vocational training of disadvantaged students: Research paper 1997*, edited by Papp Ágnes, 155-205. Budapest: Munkaügyi Minisztérium, 1997.

Liskó, Ilona. "Szakképzés és lemorzsolódás" In *Zöld könyv. A Magyar közoktatás megújításáért*. Edited by Fazekas, K.; Köllő, J. and Varga, J., 95-120. Budapest: Ecostat Kormányzati Gazdaság- és társadalomstratégiai Kutató Intézet, 2008.

Molnár, Aranka; Peták, Péter, and Vercseg, Ilona. "Közösségi lehetőségek a mélyszegénység elleni küzdelemben." Budapest: Autonómia Alapítvány, 2014.

Molnár, Emilia and Schafft, Kaai, A. "Social exclusion, ethnic political mobilization, and Roma minority self governance in Hungary." *East Central Europe/L'Europe Du Centre Est*, 30/1 (2003): 53-74.

Moody, James. "Race, School Integration, and Friendship Segregation in America." *American Journal of Sociology*, 107 (2001): 679-716.

Neményi, Mária. "Az interetnikus kapcsolatok hatása az identitásra." In *Szociológiai Szemle* 22 (2012): 27-53.

Németh, Szilvia. "A tanoda-típusú intézmények működésének, tevékenységének elemzése. Kutatási beszámoló". Budapest: Roma Education Fund, 2008. Accessed May 05, 2016.

Németh, Szilvia. "Tanoda-kutatás és fejlesztés 2012/2013. Zárótanulmány. Vitaanyag." Budapest: T-Tudok, 2013.

Rogers, Cheryl. "Helping Students in Under-Performing Public Schools. Building the Pipeline: Effective Practice Briefs." Promise Neighborhoods Institute at PolicyLink. 2009.

Ryder, Andrew R.; Rostas, Iulius, and Taba, Marius. "'Nothing about us without us': the role of inclusive community development in school desegregation for Roma communities," *Race, Ethnicity and Education*, 17/4 (2014): 518-539.

Schafft, Kaai, A. and Brown, D. L. "Social Capital and Grassroots Development. The Case of Roma Self-Governance in Hungary." *Social Problems*, 47/2 (2000): 201-209.

Szabó, Iлона and Örkény, Antal. "A 14-15 évesek interkulturális világképe." In *Periférián. Roma Szociológiai Tanulmányok*, edited by Varga, I., 413-470. Nyíregyháza: Ariadne Kulturális Alapítvány, 1997.

Szalai, Julia. "Fragmented Social Rights in Hungary's Postcommunist Welfare State." In *Social Policy and Citizenship: The Changing Landscape*, edited by Adalbert Evers and Anne-Marie Guillemard. 283-305; New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.

Szalai, Julia; Messing, Vera, and Neményi, Mária. "Ethnic and Social Differences in Education in a Comparative Perspective. EDUMIGROM Comparative Papers." Budapest: Central European University, Center for Policy Studies, 2010.

Szőke, Judit and Trencsényi, Borbála. "A Józsefvárosi tanoda." Budapest: Soros Alapítvány, 1998.

Szűcs, Norbert. "A Hódmezővásárhelyi deszegregációs intézkedés." In *A Szegedi és Hódmezővásárhelyi Deszegregációt Támogató Hallgató Mentorprogram: Öt Év Tapasztalatai*, edited by Norbert Szűcs and József Fejes, 58-71. Szeged: Belvedere, 2013.

The Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta. "History of the Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta." Accessed May 25, 2016. <http://www.maltai.hu/?action=subpage&subpageid=11>

Vámos, Krisztina. "Elméleti keret a tanodák eredményességének vizsgálatához." *Tani-tani Online*, 5 (2015). Accessed February 22, 2016. http://www.tani-tani.info/elmeleti_keret_a_tanodak_eredmenyessegenek_vizsgalatahoz

Váradi, Luca “A society trapped in prejudice: the case of Hungary.” In *Youth Trapped in Prejudice: Hungarian Adolescent’s Attitudes towards the Roma*, Luca Váradi, 61-83; Springer VS, 2014.

9 Appendix

9.1 Interview outline type A: Employees of the program

I. Bio

Education

Previous jobs

Involvement with Malta - the story of how did you ended up here?

II. About the program

How would you define the main aims of the program?

What is the world 'presence' means in your understanding?

To what extent does the program and its implementation have a religious character in your opinion?

Could you define the specific afterschool activities you organize?

How would you define the main aim of the Tanoda program?

Could you elaborate a bit on the implementation of the program?

(the number of teachers, student; schedule; policy; teaching methods)

What do you think, to what extent the actual implementation fits with project aims?

What do you consider to be the main success and the most problematic aspect of the program so far?

III. Target group

How would you define the target group of the program?

What is the main difficulty they face in your opinion?

How this program can support them in overcoming their difficulties?

What motivates the students to come to the afterschool in your opinion?

What do they expect from the afterschool?

How cooperative/involved they are?

IV. Network

Who would you define as the most prominent local characters, that have an impact on the program?

How often do you/the Tanoda get in contact with them?

Is there anyone from the afterschool who also works or have worked in one of the mentioned institutions?

How would you define the quality of these relations?

(good-bad, formal-informal; who reaches out to the other; supporter or expert; involvement in each other's work)

How do they perceive the work of the afterschool, what do they expect from you?

Are there any institutions/actors with whom you do not have a good relation, or with whom you should have, but have no contact?

V. Local involvement

Were there any instances when the Tanoda played the role of a mediator in between its target group and another local institution/actor?

Were there any instances when the Tanoda helped to reach a compromise in a problematic situation in between its target group and another local institution/actor?

Does the after-school participate in local activities that are open to the larger public (such as village day)

Did the afterschool organize such an activity?

VI. Future

How do you see the future of the afterschool project?

What would you change about it, how would you develop it if you would have the possibility?

For how long are you planning to stay in this position/in this project?

Is there anything else that you would like to add/talk about?

9.2 Interview outline type B: Stakeholders

I. Bio

Education

Previous jobs

II. About the program

Have you heard of the Tabán integration program?,

Could you describe the specific activities they engage in?

In your opinion what are the main aims of the Tanoda program?

Could you elaborate a bit on the implementation of the program?

(the number of teachers, student; teaching methods)

What do you think, to what extent the actual implementation fits with the project aims?

What do you consider to be the main success and the most problematic aspect of the program so far?

III. Target group

How would you define the target group of the program?

What is the main difficulty they face in your opinion?

How this program can support them in overcoming their difficulties?

What motivates the students to go to the afterschool in your opinion?

What do they expect from the afterschool?

IV. Network

How often do you/your institution get in contact with the Tanoda?

Is there anyone from your institution who also works or have worked in the afterschool?

How would you define the quality of this relation?

(good-bad, formal-informal; who reaches out to the other; supporter or expert; involvement in each other's work)

V. Local involvement

Were there any instances when the Tanoda played the role of a mediator in between its target group and another local institution/actor?

Were there any instances when the Tanoda helped to reach a compromise in a problematic situation in between its target group and another local institution/actor?

Does the after-school participate in local activities that are open to the larger public (such as village day)

Did the afterschool organize such an activity?

VI. Future

How do you see the future of the afterschool project?

Would you alter something if you would be responsible?

Would you alter your relation with the program?

Is there anything else that you would like to add/talk about?

9.3 Interview outline type C: Parents/relatives

I. Bio

Education

Previous jobs

II. About the program

Do you have kids who attend the extracurricular activities of the program?

(Tanoda, soccer, music program)

If yes/no why?

In your opinion what are the main aims of this program?

Could you describe the specific activities they engage in?

What do you think, to what extent the actual implementation fits with project aims?

What do you consider to be the main success and the most problematic aspect of the program so far?

III. Target group

How would you define the target group of the program?

What is the main difficulty they face in your opinion?

How this program can support them in overcoming their difficulties?

What motivates the students to come to the afterschool in your opinion?

What do they expect from the afterschool?

How cooperative/involved they are?

IV. Network

How often do you get in contact with the Tanoda?

How would you define the quality of this relation?

Do you participate in any of the programs organized by the Charity Service of the order of Malta?

V. Local involvement

Were there any instances when the Tanoda played the role of a mediator in between its target group and another local institution/actor?

Were there any instances when the Tanoda helped to reach a compromise in a problematic situation in between its target group and another local institution/actor?

Does the after-school participate in local activities that are open to the larger public (such as village day)

Did the afterschool organize such an activity?

VI. Future

How do you see the future of the afterschool project?

Would you alter something if you would be responsible?

Would you alter your relation with the program?

Is there anything else that you would like to add/talk about?

9.4 Interview outline type D: Students

I. Bio

Education

II. About the program

Do you attend the extracurricular activities of the program?

If yes/no, why?

How often do you go to the Tanoda?

In your opinion what are the main aims of this program?

Could you describe the specific activities you engage in the Tanoda?

How do you see this program?

What do you like most and least in this program?

III. Target group

Who are the students that attend the program, how would you define them?

(age, ethnicity, educational achievement)?

What is the main difficulty they face in your opinion, why do they need the support of the Tanoda?

How this program can support them in overcoming their difficulties?

How cooperative/involved they are/are you in your opinion?

Those who not attend it anymore, why do you think they left?

IV. Local involvement

Were there any instances when the Tanoda helped your family in any ways?

Did you participate in any local activities in Monor, with the afterschool?

Did you participated in any local activities in Monor organized by the afterschool?

V. Future

Would you alter something in the program if you would be responsible?

Would you alter your attitudes towards the program?

Is there anything else that you would like to add/talk about?