THE PARADOX OF UNSCR 1325: ANALYSING TRENDS
IN UN PEACEKEEPING OPERATIONS SINCE 2000

By

Tushita Shekhar

Submitted to

Central European University
School of Public Policy

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Public Policy

Supervisor: Dr. Daniel Large
COPYRIGHT NOTICE

I, the undersigned ......................................................... hereby declare that I am the sole
author of this thesis. To the best of my knowledge this thesis contains no material previously
published by any other person except where due acknowledgement has been made. This thesis
contains no material which has been accepted as part of the requirements of any other academic
degree or non-degree program, in English or in any other language. This is a true copy of the
thesis, including final revisions.

Date: 14.06.2019

Name (printed letters): ________________________________

Signature: .................................................................
ABSTRACT

In 2000, the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 (UNSCR 1325) was passed (NGO Committee on Education 2000) which encompassed three main themes: protection, representation and gender perspective (NGO Committee on Education 2000). It officially recognized women as an integral part of the security sector, shifting their perceived role from a weak and helpless victim to productive actors of change. Despite almost 20 years since UNSCR 1325, the resolution has failed to achieve its goals with low levels of female representation and participation, while the UN peacekeepers are themselves committing sexual and gender based violence against their female counterparts and the host population. The failure is usually attributed to the culture of militarized masculinity in UN Department of Peace (DPO) and the masculine culture prevalent in the host country resulting in institutional barriers in implementing the resolution. The thesis provides an alternate explanation which not only argues that the problematic framing of the resolution itself is the root cause of its failure, but it also paradoxically perpetuates gender inequality.

The study begins by outlining the need of incorporating a gendered perspective in security sector which resulted in the passage of UNSCR 1325. Thereupon, the barriers and policy implications of the resolution are critically analyzed in terms of the problematic framing of the resolution itself, which reinforces and promotes the masculine culture by perpetuating gender stereotypes, as evidenced in the case study of UN Mission in Liberia (UNMIL). It concludes by recommending various policy options that the Troop contributing countries (TCCs), and the UN Department of Peace should adopt to ensure that gender equality is achieved in peacekeeping operations (PKOs) and domestic security institutions, while also highlighting the potential challenges to implementing some of these recommendations.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am extremely grateful to Dr. Daniel large for his guidance, understanding and patience. I would also like to thank Pratik Somani for being available at odd hours, pushing me to work and ensuring I survive. Furthermore, I am indebted to my family who have unconditionally supported me.

At last, I would thank the School of Public Policy for presenting me with an opportunity to be in CEU and have an amazing academic year.
# Table of contents

COPYRIGHT NOTICE .................................................................................................................. i

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................................. ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS........................................................................................................... iii

Table of contents ....................................................................................................................... iv

List of Abbreviations ............................................................................................................... vi

Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 1

Chapter 1 – Literature Review and Theoretical Framework ....................................................... 4

1. Literature Review .................................................................................................................. 4

1.1 Feminism in International Relations ................................................................................. 4

1.2 Negative vs Positive security: Evaluating UN operation’s effectiveness ...................... 6

1.3 UNSCR 1325 ...................................................................................................................... 8

1.4 Militarized Masculinity .................................................................................................... 10

2. Theoretical Framework ........................................................................................................ 13

3. Methodology ....................................................................................................................... 15

Chapter 2 – Analysis of UNSCR 1325 .................................................................................... 17

Chapter 3 – Case Study of Indian FFPU in Liberia ................................................................. 22

3.1 Liberian Civil War .............................................................................................................. 22

3.2 Impact of the Female Formed Police Unit ...................................................................... 23
Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................... 26
Bibliography ........................................................................................................................................ 31
List of Abbreviations

DPO – Department of Peace operations

FFPU – Female Formed Police Units

IR – International Relations

PKO – Peacekeeping Operations

SEA – Sexual Exploitation and Abuse

TCC – Troop Contributing Country

UN – United Nations

UNMIL – UN Mission to Liberia

UNSCR – UN Security Resolution

WPS – Women, Peace and Security
Introduction

We need to define security from a women’s perspective, and not as a man in uniform standing next to a tank armed with a gun.” - Orzala Ashraf Nemat

UN peacekeepers are deployed to various conflict-ridden countries around the world, where often, the primary responsibility of enforcing law and order falls on the UN peacekeepers due to the host state’s lack of capacity of the judicial and policing infrastructure. There are approximately 78,000 UN military officers and 25,000 UN civilian staff distributed across 14 countries, making it the second-largest military force deployed abroad, after the U.S. military (Autesserre 2019). Therefore, the advocates of the Women, Peace and Security (WPS) Agenda hailed it as a major milestone as UN peacekeeping operations as they have a global advantage in promoting values of gender equality, especially in post conflict states.

However, the asymmetrical gender relations are already deeply entrenched in the UN peacekeeping operations which results in the essentialist notions of gender stereotypes define women’s involvement such as – exclusion from combat or leadership roles, limiting the participation and functions of female peacekeepers to safe spaces; and harassment by UN peacekeepers.

The UN peacekeepers not only harass their fellow female officers but commit acts of SEA against the local population of the host state. All UN missions have been marred with allegations of SEA and predatory behaviour, especially targeting vulnerable sections of the population (UN Watch 2018). Blue helmets, supposedly the guardians of peace and stability,
acting as perpetrators of SEA not only violates human rights, but also undermines the credibility and reputation of UN. Sexual abuse and exploitation in peacekeeping missions is problematic not just because it is a gross violation of human rights, but also perpetuates gender inequality hindering the achievement of the UN mission mandates, and negatively impacting the security of the host country.

If gendered concerns are not addressed, it perpetuates a cycle of insecurity for women which is carried over from times of conflict into times of relative peace (H. Hudson 2009). For example, women can face insecurity in the form of gender-based violence at the hands of militia or even peacekeepers (H. Hudson 2009). Women also miss the opportunity to secure post-conflict power-holding positions due to their absence from the peace processes, as this is where many of these positions are allocated (Willett 2010). By excluding women in peace processes, it reinforces women’s invisibility as stakeholders in international security (Ellerby 2013) and promoting the negative stereotype of women as the passive victims (O’Rourke, 2010). Therefore, while UNSCR 1325 has been a vehicle for promoting gender equality by incorporating gender in all the mission mandates, the gendered societal structures tend to get reinforced in post conflict situations (Tickner 2004).

This puzzling contradiction forms the basis of the research question, “that while UNSCR 1325 is hailed as a major milestone, why is the UNSCR 1325 problematic not just in terms of failing its target of achieving gender equality, but also, paradoxically reinforcing inequality? It conducts an inductive study using qualitative research method such as content analysis, meta data analysis of the existing literature and media articles and using an explanatory single case study method of the Indian FFPU to test its findings. The theoretical framework relies on the feminist theory of international relations (IR) to engage in a critical approach to security by
including the gendered perspective for answering the question. The aim of the thesis is to highlight, problematize and supplement the insights found in existing literature on the origin and implications of UNSCR 1325.

The paper critically analyses the resolution and identifies its own language is hindering gender equality as the women’s experiences of (in)security were neglected while framing UNSCR 1325. The study emphasizes on narratives and experiences, as they widen the theoretical concepts of “peace and security” (Sylvester n.d.; Wibben 2011). Thus, this thesis will be part of the discourse that questions the interaction of UNSCR 1325 with the international and domestic security institution as part of the Women, Peace and Security agenda.

The thesis is structured in the following way. Chapter 1 begins with the literature review of the existing scholarship on the need for UNSCR 1325 and studies conducted to identify the barriers to fulfilling the resolution’s mandates. The purpose is to identify the research gap and provide a theoretical framework to answer the research question. In Chapter 2 the resolution and its policy implications are critically examined. In chapter 3, the analysis of the previous chapter is tested by taking the case study of the Indian all-Female Formed Police Units (FFPU) deployed as part of the UN mission to Liberia (UNMIL). Chapter 4 recommends policy changes and the potential challenges in incorporating those. The thesis concludes by suggesting scope for further research such as - validating the problematized framing of the resolution using a multi – case study method approach; and researching the scope of meaningful contribution by male actors in achieving gender equality.
Chapter 1 – Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

1. Literature Review

The UN “responsibility to protect” doctrine states that the international community is morally obligated to protect civilians from human rights violations, permitting the use of force, especially in the instances of ethnic cleansing, war crimes, genocides, crimes against humanity (Arbour 2008). Accordingly, UN missions also deploy experts in the field of development, politics, economics, human rights, and gender (United Nations Peacekeeping 2018). Its theoretical foundations can be attributed to the end of the cold war, which led to the emergence of critical approaches to security which focused on human security.

Women have traditionally experienced a long history of marginalization by their male counterparts due to the gendered nature of conflicts (Sjoberg 2009). While men play an active role as combatants or decision makers, women are treated as weak and passive actors. Gender-based violence, particularly sexual violence, are also increasingly being used as a weapon of war. Therefore, feminist IR theory and the gender analytical lens are used to analyze UNSCR 1325 and its failure and the dominant in achieving gender equality and ending sexual and gender-based violence (SGBV), while also taking into account the dominant explanations.

1.1 Feminism in International Relations

The role of feminism in IR has been to challenge dominant IR theories like realism, neo-realist which treat power, sovereignty and national interests and security as key concepts and these (Wohlfirth 2008) beliefs have been long been associated with masculinity (C. Enloe 2014).
Since the end of the Cold War, feminism has focused on finding a space for women in the security sector to end the uneven power relations between men and women.

Subsequently, feminist IR scholars came up with different approaches. For instance, liberal feminists believed that to empower women and eliminate female subordination, equality of opportunity is necessary (C. Enloe 2014; Elshtain 1995; Ann Tickner and True 2018). Marxist and social feminists argue that the capitalist’s exploitative tendencies to make profit has caused female oppression in the labour market through prejudice and exploitation (Willis 1984; Barrett 1986). Finally, post-colonial and post-structuralist feminists have argued that women have varied experiences based on their class, gender and race, therefore, it is impossible to have a universal gender experience and identity (Spivak 2010; Mohanty 1988). Despite the existence of the divergent approaches, the unanimous opinion amongst feminist scholars is that IR is dominated by men.

However, Romaniuk and Wasylciw contend that feminist scholarship has failed to recognize or examine the unique circumstances faced by men (Romaniuk, Scott Nicholas; Wasylciw 2010). As Gutmann argues, “masculinity is either ignored or considered so much the norm that a separate inventory is unnecessary” (Gutmann 1997, p.403). In order to effectively shift away from realist essentializations of gender and towards an understand of contemporary international affairs, IR discourse must change from examining the exclusion of women towards a gendered conception. (Romaniuk, Scott Nicholas; Wasylciw 2010). Carver book titled “gender is not a synonym for women” clearly highlights her argument, that approaches to gender equality should address both men and women (Carver 1996). Gender approaches that only include women are short sighted and inefficient. The goal is to enact policies that improve women participation and visibility to address their subordination and eventually
contributing to a gender equal environment. A gender equal environment requires a change in behaviour, mindset and discourse practices involving both men and women.

1.2 Negative vs Positive security: Evaluating UN operation’s effectiveness

Most of the existing literature that has evaluated the success and effectiveness of multidimensional peacekeeping and peace-building activities, have defined it in mostly gender-neutral terms. For example, Daniel Druckman and Paul F. Diehl considered numerous ways to evaluate the efficacy of peacekeeping operations, but they did not consider evaluating their success in terms of gender equality (Diehl and Druckman 2015). Furthermore, scholars such as Page Fortna have defined success as the absence or no recurrence of conflict (Fortna and Howard 2008); Michael Doyle and Nicholas Sambanis defined success as the absence of conflict, as well as the advancement towards democratizing of the state (M. W. Doyle and Sambanis 2005). However, these criteria ignore the varied experiences of people based on their race, class, gender etc.

Lise Howard and Roland Paris’s multi-case qualitative studies made progress on including mandate objectives, and reflecting on the quality of peace, if any attained, into their measurements of success (Howard 2008; Paris 2004). Meanwhile Kyle Beardsley’s study found that peacekeeping can diminish the potential for conflict to spread across the border (Beardsley 2012). Additionally, Amanda Murdie and David Davis discovered that peacekeeping missions with a mandate for mediation and humanitarian assistance improve human rights (Murdie and Davis 2010). However, such criteria or measures ignore other aspects of violence that are more prone to affect women (Hultman, Kathman, and Shannon
All the above-mentioned outcomes are important to assess, but it fails to address gender inequality in the missions and the host country even after UNSCR 1325.

Numerous studies on gender equality have demonstrated that gender equality contributes to sustainable peace, reduction or elimination of violence and human rights violations. It means that to ensure peace in the world, a crucial step is to promote gender equality which have been corroborated by various studies (Caprioli 2000; Caprioli and Douglass 2008; Caprioli and Boyer 2001; Melander 2005; V. M. Hudson and Den Boer 2002; V. M. Hudson 2012). Melander’s work with Erin Bjarnegård has also found that democratic societies are more peaceful only if they are making progress towards gender equality (Bjarnegård and Melander 2011).

The literature on quantitatively evaluating the effectiveness and success of peacekeeping operations have emerged in the past two decades only (Rudolf 2017). Doyle and Sambanis’s researched the impact of different types of missions and found that multi-dimensional missions are more effective than the observer and peace enforcement missions (Doyle and Sambanis 2016; Sambanis 2008). Lisa Hultman, Jacob Kathman, and Megan Shannon’s quantitative study found that larger peacekeeping forces tend to do better in reducing levels of one-sided violence and battlefield fatalities. With the introduction of civilian protection mandate, research focus shifted to exploring the relation between peacekeeping mission and civilian casualties. However, most studies would quantify effectiveness in terms of the absence of war or negative peace, which is measured by the number of conflict related deaths, as opposed to positive peace (Diehl and Druckman 2018). It ignores different categories of death like civilian death by government forces, UN peacekeepers, other combatants etc and not encompassing the entire
security spectrum (Kurtenbach 2015). It also fails to take into account human rights violations like SEA by UN peacekeepers.

SEA is a symptom of a larger structural causes like patriarchy; militarized masculinity, the gender unequal culture prevalent in the UN, troop contributing countries (Nordås and Rustad 2013; Karim and Beardsley 2016); the socialization experiences of the troops (Moncrief 2017) etc. which result in institutional failures to tackle the problem. Quantitative studies by Nordås & Rustad, Sabrina Karim and Stephen Moncrief are studied to analyse and narrow down the conditions under which SEA is more prevalent to identify the proximate and structural barriers. The prevalence of SEA is a better indicator for examining positive peace as it a more holistic approach towards human security and accounts for gender equality.

1.3 UNSCR 1325

Academic literature examining women’s participation in negotiating peace process has existed for a long period (Byrne, Marcus 1995; Steans 2013; Boals 1973), but most of these studies concentrate on the exclusion of women from political and peace processes or focus on the victimization of women due to war (LIsa 1994) edit and overlooked in post-conflict reconstruction processes (Luintel 2010). However, since the introduction of the UNSCR 1325, women’s participation in the peace process is studied with renewed focus (George and Shepherd 2016).

The Resolution emphasizes the importance of women’s “equal participation and full involvement in all efforts for the maintenance and promotion of peace and security, and the need to increase their role in decision-making with regard to conflict prevention and resolution”
(NGO Committee on Education 2000). The Resolution encompasses 3 main criteria: representation, gender perspective, and protection.

According to Karim and Beardsley (2016) the adoption of resolution 1325 has led to an increase in the number of female participants in peacekeeping operations. However, the thesis aims to examine whether their involvement is meaningful or mere tokenism.

In terms of participation, Karim and Beardsley observe that improvement is far from optimal with a long way to go in terms of achieving gender balance in peacekeeping operations. As per the UN Department of Peacekeeping on April 2009, only 874 of the 10,785 UN police officers were women, and of 90,181 military personnel only 2474 were women (Simić 2010). Moreover, most female military personnel are deployed to areas where there is the least risk in terms of conflict intensity (Smit and Tidblad-Lundholm 2018; Karim and Beardsley 2016).

The gaps in women’s participation remain significant, despite studies showing the representative inclusion of women in peace processes as negotiators, mediators, arbitrators etc. significantly increase the chances of attaining sustainable peace outcomes (Myrttinen, Khattab, and Naujoks 2017; Byrne, Marcus 1995; Gizelis 2009). However, these positive results hinge on the inclusion of women in a meaningful, otherwise it renders the contributions of female peacekeepers as a failure to improve the gender sensitivity, and also reinforces gender dichotomies (Myrttinen, Khattab, and Naujoks 2017).

In terms of representation, the progress is more dismal as between 1992 and 2011, only 4% of signatories to peace agreements and less than 10% of peace negotiators were women (UN Women 2012). Since the introduction of the UNSCR 1325, approx. 27% of peace agreements have made references to women, which is double the increase compared to peace agreements
negotiated between 1990 and 2000, revealing the extent to which women still remain marginalized from the peace process (Coomaraswamy 2015). Women continue to be heavily underrepresented in peace processes which results in overlooking the insecurities women and the absence of gendered provisions in formal peace agreements (Bell and O’Rourke 2010; Ellerby 2013).

UN peacekeeping operations are predominantly marred with allegations of sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA), especially targeting vulnerable women, children and refugees (UN Watch 2018). Therefore, a major aim of UNSCR 1325 was the protection of women, especially in addressing sexual violence against local women, and hence, the resolutions required states to deploy more women with the expectation that the female peacekeepers would not only act as deterrents, but also inspire the local women to exercise their rights (Simić 2010; Myrttinen, Khattab, and Naujoks 2017; Gizelis 2009; Olsson and Tryggestad 2001).

Despite the resolution, an investigation by the Associated Press revealed that between 2004 and 2016, the United Nations received almost 2,000 allegations of sexual exploitation and abuse against their peacekeepers (Sreenivasan, Wilson, and Woodruff 2017), and that must be a conservative number as many allegations of SEA are not recorded due to social and institutional barriers to reporting.

1.4 Militarized Masculinity

“Sexual abuse and exploitation of women in the context of security forces may be a major symptom of militarized masculinity as evidenced by sexual misconduct by security forces being common in areas with military bases or other large congregations of security sector officials (Robinson 2019). Scholars have theorized femininity and women’s experiences of
militarization by looking at civilian women living and working in and around military bases. So far the relation between military bases and the rise of prostitution and human trafficking has been the subject of discussion in critical feminist IR. Cynthia Enloe revealed the close relationship of military bases and the environments they are in, and with that shed light on the exploitative and oppressive practices that accompany military operations (C. H. Enloe 2000). However, thorough analysis of how women’s’ and girls’ lives are affected by peacekeepers is lacking.

These gaps led the scholars to conduct studies on the challenges or barriers of implementing UNSCR 1325 and identifying the root problem is the ‘hypermasculine’ culture prevailing in the PKOs and the countries they are deployed to. Laura Sjoberg observed that the notion an ideal warrior relies on privileging hegemonic masculinity and emphasizing on characteristics like – aggressiveness, courage, obedience, loyalty etc (Roost 2011). Moreover, Sarah Martin has suggested that a hypermasculine culture encourages tolerance for extreme sexual behaviours has evolved within peacekeeping missions (Martin 2005). Studies have discovered that men’s identity in missions are connected to their sexual activities.

With sexual relationships so central to the identities of the male peacekeepers, a hypermasculine culture encourages and even promotes SEA (Karim and Beardsley 2016). For instance, the UN Special Representative of the Secretary-General Yasushi dismissed concerns regarding the prevalence of SEA allegations against UN peacekeepers by saying “boys will be boys” (Defeis 2008).

While militarized masculinity and general opportunism in security institutions play an important role in the perpetration of SEA by peacekeeping personnel, patriarchal beliefs serve as a catalyst for individuals to commit exploitation and abuse. A connection exists between
patriarchy and the physical security of women, linking norms of gender equality and reduced levels of abuse against women (Hunnicutt 2015).

The importance of women’s inclusion during peacekeeping operations is justified by essentialist notions. By virtue of being mothers and social orientation, women are perceived to be less violent, emotionally attuned and natural caregivers – thus more suited for peacebuilding activities (Porter 2004; Moola 2010; Caprioli 2000; House 2019). Therefore, the calming presence of women would reduce aggressiveness and hypermasculinity in peacekeeping operations. Fukuyama argues that under women’s rule, the world would be less aggressive and violent which concurs with these essentialist notions of female peacekeeping (Luintel 2010). Yet the same belief is used exclude women from the peace processes (Karam 2000) as it consider them victims of conflict rather than as productive actors of change (Byrne, Marcus 1995).

However, since UNSCR 1325 emphasizes the role of women in peacekeeping, the literature has predominantly focused on the nature and extent of contribution of women in peacekeeping. Consequently, most research critically evaluates the implementation of 1325, without questioning the resolution and critically examining its implications. For instance, it emphasizes and promotes gender dichotomies of “men being aggressive and women being peaceful”, which in turn undermines the participation and deployment of women in PKOs.

These scholars have, however, only offered partial accounts of why peacekeeping missions are mostly less successful – and even harmful. Even more crucial, research to date has failed to place UN peacekeeping in the bigger picture of international peace and security. Furthermore, scholarship on PKO predominantly studies the operational effectiveness of PKOs, the
institutional reforms of failures of UN, or the host country’s infrastructure and capabilities, but often ignores the perspective of the female peacekeepers or the local people (Dorussen 2014).

2. Theoretical Framework

Realism and neo-realist, a prominent theory in international relations describes security essentially in terms of the security of the state. Security is defined by the ability of the state to protect its citizens and territories in the “anarchic” international system. Realism prescribes acquiring power and arms as means to ensure state security in an anarchic international system (Donnelly 2000).

After the end of Cold War, the realist state centric approach was challenged by the feminist discourse, and thus a new dimension materialized in understanding the theories of International Relations, which brought gender issues to the forefront. J. Ann Tickner explains that feminist approach “differs in that they adopt gender as a central category of analysis for understanding how unequal social structures, particularly gender hierarchies, negatively impact the security of individuals and groups” (Tickner 2010). International security is analysed with a gendered peace and security lens, which examine power dynamics within the field of peace and security (H. Hudson 2009). This gendered lens was developed primarily from Ellerby’s understanding of “(en)gendered security”, among other feminist scholars (Ellerby 2013). For instance, many scholars have posited a relationship between militarized masculinity and violence (Caprioli 2000; Freedman 2018; Bjarnegård and Melander 2011, Goldstein, 2001). The military culture and foreign policy of states are guided by hegemonic masculinities, i.e., an aggressive form of masculinity characterized by aggressiveness, obedience, courage, and patriotism (Sjoberg and Via 2010).
The traditional concept of security is based on the military aspect of conflict and turns a blind eye to the sufferings of all the people. Feminism distinguishes between negative and positive security. In case of negative security, security is considered to have been achieved with the surrendering of arms or signing of peace accords. It is referred to as negative security as it only focuses on the absence of violence. It fails to take into account that ending warfare does not directly end a culture of violence or establish a culture of peace (Hoogensen GjØrv 2012). Therefore, feminist security scholars brought about a different form of security, which was not considered by the previous scholars, giving a wider connotation to security which includes the individual and their environment.

Laura Sjoberg defines peace as the absence of violence and insecurity rather than just the absence of an open war (Sjoberg and Via 2014). The gendered lens encouraged the understanding that women can still face insecurity in the absence of armed conflict due to threats such as human trafficking, sweatshop labour or economic inequality (Sjoberg and Via 2014). Applying a gender lens to security processes is also necessary for the creation of responsible, comprehensive and sustainable peacebuilding policies and practices (H. Hudson 2009).

The gendered lens analytical approach identified the gendered aspect of warfare where women are portrayed as helpless victims and in need of protection (Willett 2010). Although women do experience conflict differently than men (Chenoy 2005), this approach undermines and undervalues women’s potential as productive agents of change in conflict resolution and peace-making (Willett 2010). Tickner argued that not only are women devalued, but peace in general becomes devalued (Tickner 2004). In examining the aforementioned challenges, the study relies on a feminist approach. This approach allowed for an examination of power, rights and
access structures between women and men (Tickner 2004), and sought to explore these unequal balances in traditional security and patriarchy (Chenoy 2005). The goal of these pursuits being “a gender balance as well as a feminization of security” (Chenoy 2005, p.176).

3. Methodology

This research employs qualitative research methods, and primarily relies on in depth literature review and content analysis of the already existing publications. The literature stems from the feminist IR theory which critically investigates existing research on peacekeeping missions, and its gendered impact leading to the passage of UNSCR 1325, which forms the basis for the theoretical framework. Based on the literature review, Chapter 2 will use content analysis of quantitative studies on the trends in female deployment and SEA in UN peacekeeping operations, journals articles, books, and news briefs or press releases by United Nations to scrutinize the implications of the resolution. It identified the problematic framing and paradoxical implications of SCR 1325 as the root cause of UN PKOs failing to achieve gender equality.

Chapter 3 employs single case study method to test the validity of the findings in Chapter 2. For this purpose, content analysis, meta data analysis and media analysis of the impact and portrayal of the Indian FFPU in Liberia as part of UNMIL from 2007 – 2016 is undertaken. It was an explanatory case study (Harder 2010) as it studied the facts, considered alternate explanations while testing the paper’s theory to explain the failure of UNSCR 1325. The Indian FFPU was selected as the case study as it was the first all FFPU deployed as per the mission mandates and there is extensive literature on their functions, impact and perception by the UN, media, and the locals for the entire duration of their deployment. While the Liberian case study
confirmed the previous findings, in future, a multiple case study approach of other UN peacekeeping operations should be conducted for comparative analysis and to test the external validity or transferability of the Liberian case study. It was an inductive study as the aim was to explore a new phenomenon or explanation by analyzing the previously research from a different perspective, and without using statistical methods (Strauss and Corbin 1990).
Chapter 2 – Analysis of UNSCR 1325

After the introduction of UNSCR 1325, the WPS agenda expanded to include the following UN resolutions: UNSCR 1820 (2008), UNSCR 1888 (2009), UNSCR 1889 (2009), UNSCR 1960 (2010), UNSCR 2106 (2013), UNSCR 2122 (2013), and UNSCR 2242 (2015), which also promote gender equality as an integral part of PKOs. While the WPS agenda has institutionalized gender equality through the various UNSC resolutions, compliance with these norms has been slow due to institutional failures and lack of accountability (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.) creating a culture of impunity.

It is difficult to of prosecuting peacekeepers for crimes perpetrated against the civilians in the host state. The host state may lack policing and judicial infrastructures, in addition to the social and political barriers to reporting the crime (Moncrief 2017). Hence the state fails to act as a deterrent of sexual violence.

Furthermore, neither the United Nations nor the host state has legal jurisdiction to prosecute military personnel contributed by member states, because peacekeepers enjoy immunity under Status of Forces Agreements (Freedman 2018). The host countries and even the UN cannot legally hold their behaviour accountable if the TCC country does not pursue charges. TCCs have little incentive to prosecute their soldiers and police officers to save national and international embarrassment and they rarely prosecute offenders (Allred 2006). Termination of employment and repatriation of the peacekeeper is the most severe administrative penalty that the UN is authorized to employ against the wrongdoer. The economics of SEA favours the UN peacekeepers given the low risk and high reward payoff of committing crimes. These factors contributed to a culture of impunity for SEA as the UN peacekeepers lack the incentive to alter
their behaviour. the culture of impunity has always existed, and it's unlikely to be reformed due to the political nature of the problem.

States have no incentive to alter their behaviour. What the resolution strived to do was to institute mandatory gender sensitization training to prevent sea and develop a gender sensitive mindset in the peacekeepers. However, the mandatory trainings show few PowerPoint presentations on gender and human rights and give handouts on international human rights instruments, which they are unlikely to read (Freedman 2018). Moreover, it doesn't account for the cultural complexity, like certain laws might be legal in their respective country, but illegal in the host nation or by UN standards (Freedman 2018). For example - a 2017 UN report of an audit of the Conduct and Discipline Unit of the UN mission in Central African Republican highlighted that 57 percent of the military personnel hadn't even attended the mandatory trainings and were unaware of the UN standards of conduct (Essa 2017)

Based on the current assessments, the failure of UNSCR 1325 is due to institutional failures and a lack of political will in implementation of the resolution. However, the thesis goes a step ahead to critically examine the resolution and its policy implications.

An assessment of the UNSCR 1325 reveals that it does not treat gender as a critical concept or undertook a critical approach to security. For instance, while gender is stated in almost every mandate of the PKOs, the mandates vary in their gender targets, such as some only prohibit the SEA by peacekeepers, while others mention specific objectives of promoting women's participation in politics or preventing sexual violence (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.).

It further reinforces gender stereotypes by promoting the gender essentialist notions which tend to, and (1) reduce the contribution of women to feminine stereotypes, (2) presume that gender
similarities will trump other cultural differences between locals and peacekeepers, (3) displace an undue share of the burden for reforms onto the female personnel, (4) overlooking the real barriers posed by gender stereotypes (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.).

Firstly, it reduces the contribution of women to feminine stereotypes. Francis Fukuyama has argued that biologically men are more closely associated with aggression, which makes them natural fighters (Fukuyama 1998). Helena Carreiras interprets the dichotomy as having some form of “explanatory power” regarding gendered patterns of behavior in security institutions, such as the gendered division of labor, organizational culture, and the interactions and identity formation of individuals in the organization (Carreiras n.d.). The UNSCR 1325 was framed based on these instrumentalist beliefs and expected that the pacifying presence of women would counter the hypermasculinity.

Unfortunately, expectations surrounding security institutions that men are natural warriors whereas women are natural peacemakers entrench exclusionary and discriminatory practices against women in peacekeeping missions, particularly in terms of limiting the number and agency of female peacekeepers, hindering the participation and representation aspect of UNSCR 1325.

It leads to the exclusion of women in particular areas of these institutions, particularly combat as women are not expected to be natural warriors. For example, only in 2015 did the United States lift the combat exclusion rule for women in the military, and many countries in the world continue to prevent women from engaging in combat (Kamarck 2016). The gender stereotypes result in women often being confined to roles that fit the stereotypes, such as administrative assistants, nurses, and other noncombat and subordinate roles.
Secondly, it presumes that gender similarities will trump other cultural differences between locals and peacekeepers. It denotes “women” as a homogenous group and assigns it universal gender identity and disregards the varied experiences of women based on social categories – such as, religion, class, nationality, ethnicity etc (Pratt and Richter-Devroe 2011). All women do not share common interests, and it is impractical to expect women from different nations advocating the same issues as there is no established set of “women’s interests” (Reingold and Harrell 2010; Reingold 2000). For instance, cultural sensitivity is unlikely to be overcome by gender similarities. For instance, in many countries, there are traditional and informal cultural practices for addressing issues of SGBV, of which peacekeepers potentially are not knowledgeable (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.). Jennings has also shown that female soldiers are not likely to report misconduct as patriotism trumps gender solidarity (Jennings 2011).

Thirdly, the expectation that the pacifying presence of the female personnel will counter the hypermasculine culture, places double burden on the women. It displaces the entire responsibility from male peacekeepers onto the female peacekeepers. Instead holding the men accountable for their ideas and actions, it is the obligation of women to be a deterrent and have a “civilizing” effect on their male colleagues. It creates double burden on women as they not only have to carry out their own tasks, but also monitor the behaviour of other male officials. Not only does it place double burden on women, but it is also unrealistic. Women are expected to act as a deterrent which could result in friction with the colleagues and superiors and disrupting their career advancement.

An analysis of contributing country’s motivations and deterrents for deploying women is assessed as the TCC have discretion over the contribution and composition of their contingent. According to the Stockholm International Peace Research Institute’s study on trends in
women’s participation in UN operations, the deployment of females was higher in operations with a relatively lower level of conflict intensity or in the post-conflict reconstruction phase, whereas the rate of SEA is higher during the high conflict intensity phase (Smit and Tidblad-Lundholm 2018).

Studies have shown that relatively strong records of gender equality not only tend to deploy higher proportions of female peacekeepers to both military and police peacekeeping components and experienced fewer counts of SEA allegations (Karim and Beardsley 2016).

It is not simply that by deploying women that gender barriers are overcome, but a gender mindset needs to be developed, beginning from domestic security institutions which would automatically lead to further recruitment and meaningful participation. The more gender equality is inculcated in domestic security institutions, the higher the probability that the country will send greater proportions of female peacekeepers to missions. The results corroborate that gender norms in society affect the participation rates of women in the security sector (Crawford, Lebovic, and Macdonald 2015; SEGAL 1995; Carreiras n.d.). Changing the structure and focus of recruitment for both domestic forces (recruitment into national militaries and police forces) and international peace operations may lead to changes in overall gender power structures that keep women from deploying to peacekeeping missions, especially to the missions where they could have maximum impact (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.).
Chapter 3 – Case Study of Indian FFPU in Liberia

In 2007, the first all-female Formed Police Unit from India and, with annual rotations, they continued to serve the Mission for 10 years, providing critical policing support as well as role models for Liberia. The analysis of UNSCR 1325 in the previous chapter can be tested by taking the case study of the Indian FFPU and evaluating their impact. Although the FFPU was deemed as a success in terms of a gender empowering agent, a deeper analysis presents a different story. The chapter begins with an overview of the Liberian civil war and the creation of UNMIL. Afterwards it analyses the impact and portrayal of the Indian FFPU by UN, media and other policymakers.

3.1 Liberian Civil War

In 1989, civil war broke out in Liberia, when the National Patriotic Front of Liberia (NPFL) led by Charles Taylor started a rebel movement against government Samuel Doe's government. That marked the beginning of a gruesome and violent period in Liberian history, during which an estimated 250,000 people died, and one million – one-third of the population – were displaced (Meharg 2012).

The Economic Community of West African States’ (ECOWAS) intervened in 1990, with the deployment of a 4000-strong military observer group. A UN Observer Mission (UNOMIL) followed in 1993, and succeeded by 1997 in demobilizing combatants and arranging elections, which saw Charles Taylor elected as Liberian President (Kember and Washington 2010). However, the country spiraled into chaos due to Taylor’s support for rebel groups in Sierra Leone. Afterwards, Taylor was charged with allegations of war crimes and he fled to Nigeria in July of 2003. In August, ECOWAS managed to negotiate a ceasefire between the rebel
groups and government and oversaw the Comprehensive Peace Agreement in Accra. A month later, the UN established UNMIL (UN Mission in Liberia), with 15,000 peacekeepers to act as a stabilizing force (UNITED NATIONS 2003). Based on the mandates of UNSCR 1325, the UN Department of Peacekeeping Operations created and deployed the FFPU to Liberia in 2007 from India (UN News 2007).

3.2 Impact of the Female Formed Police Unit

The all-female units are an innovative method in increasing female officer’s deployment as the orthodox gender norms of a country could prevent women from joining mixed-sex units. It also proved to be a recourse for women as they could avoid the harassment frequently reported in the mixed-sex units (Pruitt, n.d.).

The FFPU conducted joint patrols with the Liberia National Police and VIP protection and escort duties, and they assisted in developing the public order capacity of the Liberian National Police (LNP) (UNMIL 2018). At the institutional level, female peacekeepers were responsible for creating the Gender Unit and the Women and Children’s Protection Unit in the LNP, and pushing for the female quotas in the LNP (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.). By the time the FFPU departed, women made up 17 per cent of the country’s security sector, as compared to 6 per cent when they arrived (UNMIL 2018). They provided medical services and training to Liberian security agency personnel and UN staff including training new recruits for the LNP and Liberia Immigration Service on the provision of medical services and other outreach activities to local communities (UNMIL 2018).

At the community level, they reduced instances of Sexual and Gender Based Violence by providing sensitization mechanisms for educating the community, and ensuring that the LNP hear these cases (UNMIL - Office of the Gender Advisor 2003). They also engaged in
community oriented activities, such as teaching in local schools on the topics of cooking and dancing, and opening their medical clinic to all Liberians (Davies and True n.d.).

The FFPU’s main task was security provision and act as backup riot control, not tackling SEA or engaging in community projects (UNMIL 2018). While it is noteworthy that they broadened their security mandate to include human security, the comments from the UN, media, and other policymakers emphasized only on the human security aspect and not its role in security provision (Pruitt, n.d.). All contingents in the UNMIL have engaged in community projects as part of the civil – military relations activities (CIMIC), but only the FFPU’s contributions were acknowledged (Davies and True n.d.). The implication is that community-oriented projects are as natural fit for women, who are celebrated for doing “women’s work”, and men who do the same work would not be recognized (Davies and True n.d.). It reinforces gender stereotypes as it confines the women’s role to the “softer” form of security.

Since 2003, Liberia had conducted peaceful democratic elections and there had been no recurrence of a major conflict, making it a successful mission for UN (Diehl and Druckman 2015). So, it’s not a surprise that the first FFPU was deployed to Liberia.

Within UNMIL, there were discriminatory practices such as – women often took on roles of nurses, doctors or administrators or as advisers for traditionally gendered units such as women and children’s protection, and very few women serve in leadership roles. Despite the deployment of FFPU to a relatively safe mission, the female officers faced stricter rules and restrictions in terms of mobility and interactions with the local people (Davies and True n.d.). The restrictions included not being able to leave the base, not having a vehicle, and being required to travel with men which possibly prevented them from reaching their full potential (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.). Some women reported that they left the base once or twice during
their six-month or one-year deployment, and this was when the contingent participated in community outreach programs (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.).

While deployment to a relatively safe place can still be explained as it was the first FFPU mission but discriminating against the female officers by restricting their mobility and agency is unacceptable. Moreover, ignoring their contribution in the provision of hard security, and relegating their activities to the safe space of “women’s work” perpetuates the gender stereotypes. It raises the question, if the mobility and agency of women is restricted, their roles defined by gender stereotypes, and are simultaneously sexually harassed, what is the purpose of increasing women deployment to the PKOs?

The purpose is not to criticize gender balancing in UN operations or undermine the achievements of the Indian FFPU. Their contribution was vital and improvement in the participation of female peacekeepers can and should occur, but it should also be accompanied with broader changes to ensure all genders are equally valued.
Conclusion

After nearly two decades of the resolution, the participation and representation of women remain sub optimal in peacekeeping and peace building processes. While the existing literature attributes it to the prevalence of a hypermasculine culture in all security institutions, the thesis identifies the framing of the resolution as the root cause of the problem. UNSCR 1325 was based on essentialist notions of gender and did not critically engage with the concept of gender. For instance, it emphasizes on the increase in female participation, it fails to take into account that women’s participation should be meaningful as simply adding more women in stereotypical roles such as nurse or secretary would only reinforce the gender stereotypes.

By deploying more females, underlying barriers cannot be resolved as the militarized masculine culture is particularly hostile to feminized identities and bodies, and that men and women cannot be treated as equal (Peterson and Sisson Runyan 2011). Women must be placed in diverse roles, including driving vehicles and carrying firearms, in order to meaningfully chip away at the participation gap. By deploying the female combatants to safer missions, restricting their mobility and ignoring their role in provision of hard security hinder their capacity as a gender empowering agent. Therefore, the thesis recommends policy changes, both short term and long term, that will erode the rigid gender dichotomies in the security sector.

1. Redefining the warrior identity

An ideal warrior privileges the militarized masculine identity pushes the men to be aggressive and violent. However, by promoting an alternate and less aggressive masculine identity for the soldiers, the hyper masculine culture can be diluted. For instance, Claire Duncanson proposed a “peace-building masculinity” which believes in befriending the locals and opting for less
aggrieve and violent methods to ensure security (Duncanson 2015). It aims to frame gender
issues in security institutions in terms of operational effectiveness (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.).

Awards, or prizes can be given to peacekeepers who exemplify the peacebuilding masculine
identity by undertaking actions which promote gender equality or reduce SEA. Awards not
only incentivize the officer’s behaviour, but by becoming a coveted award, it could redefine
heroism and the ideal warrior identity.

2. Reframing masculinity
Promundo is an NGO which engages in research, workshops, and advocacy efforts to counter
toxic masculinity which equates manhood with violence and aggression, and instead promotes
healthy masculinity (Barker and Heilman 2018). These programs endeavour to change gender
norms and expectations, to promote gender equality as a way to mitigate violence against
women. The UN and national governments should implement such programmes in their
security institutions. While these programs require more time and financial investment, it has
long term benefits as it develops a gender equal mindset among its security officials.

3. Gender Balancing policies
While the thesis has criticised the UN’s efforts in female ratio balancing policies, it is the first
and necessary step towards promoting gender equality. Increasing women’s presence in
dominant masculine spaces is crucial in order to deconstruct what counts as feminine and
masculine and eventually dismantle the hierarchical gender dichotomies (Duncanson 2015).
It could also have a participation cascading effect, which has still not occurred in PKOs yet.
To improve women’s representation in national militaries and police institutions, recruitment
should start early in high school. Female officers should consider going to high schools to recruit women.

This policy is especially relevant at leadership positions as lower ranked officers follow the lead of their superiors. Therefore, if senior officers have a gendered perspective then the norm is likely to have trickle-down effects (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.). However, the process of selecting leadership may be highly politicized as selection for leadership positions is usually done by the UN Secretariat, which could prove to be a challenge.

4. Vetting and Recruitment

Studies by Karim and Beardsley have shown that the more gender equal the TCC country, and the higher the number of female peacekeepers, the lower will be the number of SEA allegations (Karim and Beardsley 2016). Stephen Moncrief expanded on this study and discovered that the socialization experience of the troops, or the proportion of troops belonging from a sexually violent mission or country has a positive linear relation with SEA allegations (Moncrief 2017).

Therefore, strict vetting measures should be adopted such as psychological evaluations of the officers or not deploying military or testing their gender sensitivity during the application process in written tests or interviews (Aastha 2018). Moreover, police personnel with a history or conviction of gross misconduct should not be deployed, changing the current practice of TCCs who send officials accused of SEA and torture (Aastha 2018).

5. Reforming the training curriculum
UNSCR 1325 requires trainees to undergo mandatory gender training during pre-deployment for trainees to learn how to use human rights information in a complex operational setting (Lackenbauer and Langlais 2013). They should recreate real-life dilemmas and various scenarios and, which test their understanding of cultural and gender perspectives (Williamson 2017). The trainees must be thoroughly familiar by the UN code of conduct by the end of training as there are often discrepancies between the laws and culture of the TCC and the host country. However, the overhaul of the training curriculum will not only be a costly and time consuming exercise, but it requires effective coordination between UN, TCCs and the host country. Gender training should also not be just one or two hours during pre-deployment or orientation but rather sustained training throughout the duration of the mission.

6. Tackling SEA

Currently the host country and UN have no power to prosecute SEA violations with the TCC having sole authority over prosecuting the wrongdoers. The UN can push the TCC to take these transgressions seriously by naming and shaming country the particular contingents and attaching financial penalties. The UN can also give incentives to contributing countries by rewarding those that prosecute offenders of SEA. However, UN relies on the TCC’s domestic forces for the PKOs and can’t afford to alienate those nations and this could present a political challenge

The UN should take responsibility and offer redress for actions committed in peacekeeping missions. UN missions should conduct outreach to local communities, including partnering with NGOs, to make the missions more accessible and SEAHV reporting easier for locals while outside watchdog groups should evaluate UN actions.
Implementing these policies would be a difficult task as there are various challenges such as - a lack of political will, financial constraints, politicization of appointments and placements, institutional inertia, a lack of information, cultural taboos etc (Karim and Beardsley, n.d.). Achieving transformation requires not just simple policy changes but rather the will to change such policies.

The thesis began by outlining the need of incorporating a gendered perspective in security sector which resulted in UNSCR 1325. Thereupon, the barriers and policy implications of the resolution are critically analysed in terms of the problematic framing of the resolution itself, which reinforces and promotes the masculine culture and perpetuates gender stereotypes, as evidenced in the case study of UNMIL in Liberia. The thesis’s analysis of the problematic framing should be further validated by conducting research on other peacekeeping operations as a multiple case study analysis will lead to an in-depth understanding of the subject.

Additionally, while the thesis did touch upon gender not being synonymous with female, it did not delve into how men could substantively contribute in bringing about gender equality. They are treated as passive actors in need of gender sensitization training to reduce SEA and not restrict women’s agency. Current research is sorely lacking ways to critically engage men as agents more than allies, as survivors of gender violence themselves, and as equal participants, in complex solidarity, towards equality (Kirby and Shepherd 2016).


Caprioli, Mary. 2000. “Gendered Conflict*.”


2019.

https://books.google.hu/books/about/Gender_is_Not_a_Synonym_for_Women.html?id=P1d2QgAACAAJ&redir_esc=y.


https://books.google.hu/books?id=1dp1DwAAQBAJ&pg=PA457&lpg=PA457&dq=UNMIL$ffpu&source=bl&ots=uc_4YGZs1g&sig=ACfU3U0ciwPcpPIdJZTyXmmFSXnJjyuw&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjV5bGkr9riAhWEaVAKHTAfAEIQ6AEwBnoECACQAQ#v=onepage&q=UNMIL ffpu&f=false.


Hudson, Heidi. 2009. “Peacebuilding through a Gender Lens and the Challenges of


37


https://books.google.hu/books?id=l8dv_m5xSOoC&printsec=frontcover#v=onepage&q&f=false.


Pruitt, Lesley J. n.d. *The Women in Blue Helmets: Gender, Policing, and the UN’s First All-Female Peacekeeping Unit.*


Tickner, J. Ann., and Inc. Recorded Books. 2010. *Gendering World Politics: Issues and Approaches in the Post-Cold War Era*. Columbia University Press. https://books.google.hu/books?id=SGv6RD7W0T8C&pg=PA48&lpg=PA48&dq=differ s+in+that+they+adopt+gender+as+a+central+category+of+analysis+for+understanding+how+unequal+social+structures,+particularly+gender+hierarchies,+negatively+impact+the+security+of+individuals+and+groups&source=bl&ots=81kSoXLBGF&sig=ACfU3U1imznEvtk81bWzA9dLaBljQYFRmQ&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjfl6WhOpiAhVB16QKHSYtCXkQ6AEwAHoECAYQAQ#v=onepage&q=differs in that they adopt gender as a central category of analysis for understanding how unequal social structures%2C particularly gender hierarchies%2C negatively impact the security of individuals and groups&f=false.


