

Are We at Home?

Roma Migratory Concepts of Home in Canada and in Hungary

By

Melinda Vajda

Submitted to

Central European University

Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology

Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Prem Kumar Rajaram

Second Reader: Assoc. Prof. Ayse Caglar

Budapest, Hungary

2019

Contents

Acknowledgements	2
Abstract	3
Introduction: Roma return migrants from Canada, an understudied phenomenon.....	4
Methodology	6
Chapter 1: Migration and the Liminality of Home.....	8
1.1. Theories: Spatiality, Temporality and Politics	10
1.2. Background of the study: The social situation of Roma in Hungary and in Canada	15
Chapter 2: Ambivalences of Home: Roma migrants in Canada and in Hungary	20
2.1. Home and Spatiality: ‘I don’t relate my home to a house’	22
2.2. Temporality and the Senses of Home	25
2.3. The Politics of Home	30
Conclusion	36
Bibliography:.....	39

Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to express my gratitude to my informants for sharing their experiences and narratives about home. I am very thankful to my fiancé, mother and cousin for encouraging me during the thesis writing process.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. Prem Kumar Rajaram, to my second reader Prof. Ayse Caglar and to Prof. André Thiemann for the continuous support of my thesis, for the patience, motivation, and immense knowledge.

I am also very thankful to my external readers, Márton Rövid, Zsuzsa Árendás and Roland Ferkovics for their useful suggestions.

Abstract

How home is made, unmade and remade? This question lies at the heart of my research on home making practices of Roma from Szabolcs-Szatmár-Bereg county, many of whom have migrated repeatedly: from rural to urban areas in Hungary, from Hungary to Canada and back again. Home-making as the focus of the thesis contains many important dimensions- identity, belonging, integration, politics, spatiality and temporality. Interrogating these dimensions, I argue, we can better understand the impacts of migration on home-making and vice versa. The Roma return migrants' situation in Hungary is an understudied phenomenon, hence my thesis aims to fill this gap. Roma are the biggest minority in Europe facing discrimination in housing, education, health and employment related issues. Therefore, my thesis answers the following questions: How do Roma people as a community living on the margins imagine home? Have Roma persons ever felt themselves at home in Hungary? How do they create a new home in Canada and then in Hungary? How do space, time and politics impact on their sense of home? To find the answers I have used qualitative methods: participant observation both in Canada and in Hungary and semi-structured interviews. According to my main findings living on the margins affects significantly the Roma people's sense of home, because many of the informants were claiming that they do not feel themselves at home neither in Hungary, nor in Canada. Their concept of home is liminal from spatial, temporal and political point of view. Due to the political contexts, they are floating between the two countries, between past and present. Their search for home is a coping strategy but until now they have not found it. Their sense of home is related to the future, so their search is continuing.

Introduction:

Roma return migrants from Canada, an understudied phenomenon

I was working on my BA thesis in 2015 when I experienced the return migration of several Roma families who started to come back from Canada to Hungary. I interpreted the phenomenon as a next step of the mobile Roma families because it was significant part of their migration. My previous thesis dealt with the Roma people who moved from the countryside to Budapest in the 1980s and 1990s mainly because of economic reasons. Since their social, economic, housing situation changed a lot, I was interested in how their ethnic identity shaped in Budapest.

When I was making the interviews and the participant observation among the families for my BA thesis, it turned out that their migration is a longer process in which the migration inside Hungary was the first step. After leaving their villages in the 1980s and 1990s the Roma people tried to find job and live in Budapest. For some families it was difficult, because of the lack of higher education and the existence of antigypsyism. Hence, they decided to commute between their village and the capital city. After 20 years the hostile attitude increased which culminated in 2008 and 2009. I do believe that the Roma killings in which 6 people died were strong reasons to leave the country and migrate to Canada. Besides, the economic motivation, the different social welfare system and the multicultural society in Canada also encouraged the Roma families to leave their *home*. In 2011 Canada restricted its migration policy and concerning the Roma people only those had the chance to stay there who were able to prove their experiences of discrimination back in Hungary. After 2012 several families had to return to Hungary and according to my experiences most of them tried to live (again) in Budapest. Most of the families could not make a living in the capital city, therefore they did not have other chance but to move back to their village from which he/she or his/her parents started the migration in the 1980s, 1990s.

In my current research, I will study the Roma return migrants who came back from Canada to Hungary after 2012. Although several experts have written about the mentioned migration process, they were mostly dealing with the Roma migrants' present situation in Canada or the causing factors of leaving Hungary. Hence, I feel that there is a lack of studies regarding the role of the returnees in the Hungarian society.

My focus will be on the return migrants' concept of home. More precisely: How do Roma people imagine home as a community living on the margins? Have Roma persons ever felt themselves at home in Hungary? How do they create a new home in Canada? According to Sara Ahmed (2003) there are several narratives related to home, because it can mean the birthplace or the place where one grew up. Also, home can mean belonging or the place where one feels comfortable.

I believe that home is a complex concept because it contains identity, belonging, migration, space, time and integration strategies. Based on my participant observation both in Canada and in Hungary and according to my interviewees' narratives, there are three main dimensions which influenced the migrants' sense of home: temporality, spatiality and political context. In my theoretical part I will write about the theories through which we can understand the Roma migrants' concept of home. Most of the theories and case studies overlap the Roma migration but in my main chapters I will illuminate the gaps which caused by the inferior status of the Roma community. To understand better the social, economic and political situation of the Roma people in the *Background of the case study* chapter, I will provide an overview on the mentioned topics.

Methodology

Focusing on the methodological part of the research I would refer to Oakley's idea which suggests that "research participants should be fully included in the research process" (Oakley: 2000: 18). During my fieldwork I used semi-structured interviews and put emphasis on the interpretation of the participants because I believe that their narratives are the most important. Concerning my position in the research I try to use the benefits of the halfie role (Abu-Lughod 1991)-who can see a community from inside and outside simultaneously.

As anthropologists, they write for other anthropologists, mostly western. Identified also with communities outside the West, or subcultures within it, they are called to account by educated members of those communities. More importantly, not just because they position themselves with reference to two communities but because when they present the Other they are presenting themselves, they speak with a complex awareness of and investment in reception. Both halfie and feminist anthropologists are forced to confront squarely the politics and ethics of their representations. There are no easy solutions to their dilemmas. (Lughod 1991, 142).

I consider myself a halfie, because I am familiar with and practicing the Roma traditions and the Romani language. This belonging to the Roma community helped me a lot in different stages of my research. Finding informants through my network and creating a comfortable interview situation was not so difficult. But it was very interesting that -mainly in Canada-some of the Roma migrants withdraw their participation in my research. As they formulated, although they have been living in Canada for more than 5 or even 10 years, speaking about Hungary and about home, could be a shocking experience for them. As the example shows the advantages of my positionality was not enough to initiate a discussion about the topic.

My participant observation took place in the northern eastern part of Hungary in Szabolcs-Szatmar-Bereg county, in Hodász. It is the village where my mother was born and where I have spent my summer and winter holidays. Because of that I have personal relationships with some of the return migrant families which resulted a deeper connection during the discussion and the participant observation. I had a chance to spend 3 weeks in Canada, Montreal and continue my participant observation and conduct interviews. In Montreal I have made 6 interviews (4 women and 2 men) from the age 22 to 52. In Budapest and in Hodász I had 6 informants (3 women and

3 men) from the age 18 to 45. Regarding my participant observation I visited the families in their houses and I tried to map their social places as churches, concerts and cafes. There is a significant difference regarding the time I spent on my fieldwork. While in Hungary I have been conducting my participant observation from 2018, in Canada have spent only 3 weeks. Therefore, my findings will focus more on the return migrants' concept of home.

Chapter 1: Migration and the Liminality of Home

‘After we got the permission, we returned to Hungary to see our relatives and at the end of our visit I said that we will go home... This was the first time when I called Canada home. But you know, there is a difference between the two homes, because I go home to Canada because it is a must... but when I come to Hungary, I come with all my heart (...) Here I can be who I really am’. (Eta, 51)

Eta’s narrative on migration encouraged me to see the Roma people’s migration to Canada and then back to Hungary through the lens of home. All my interviewees highlighted the importance of home and related their identity, memories and future related plans to the topic. Besides, they were comparing integration to the Canadian society and reintegration to the Hungarian and Roma society by emphasizing their sense of home. As the quotation presents the Roma migrants are in an ambivalent status regarding their sense of home. According to my main findings their sense of home is liminal (Turner 1967) in terms of spatiality, temporality and politics.

In my thesis I would like to follow Boccagni’s approach (2017) regarding the migrants’ concept of home, because his main angles-temporality, spatiality, politics- overlap with my informants’ discourses. Paolo Boccagni is an assistant professor at the Department of Sociology at the University of Trento. His main research fields are transnational studies, international migration and social studies. In my thesis I will refer to his study *Migration and the Search for Home* (2017). Besides, as my interviewees highlighted, I will also point how sounds, vision and smell contribute to create or recreate home in between Canada and Hungary.

The literature about home has changed over time because the experts have different opinions how spatiality and temporality affect the concept of home. In the following part of my thesis I will introduce the above-mentioned shifts in the literature and then I will elaborate more on Boccagni’s article (2017).

According to Rolshoven (2017, 28) home can be either here or there further he links home to a settled lifestyle which means that an individual's identity is connected to one place.

Rather than view home as fixed, bounded and confining location, geographies of home transverse scales from the domestic to the global in both material and symbolic ways. The everyday practices, material cultures and social relations that shape home on a domestic scale resonate far beyond the household. (Blunt and Varley 2004, 3).

As the quotation illuminates, nowadays several authors state the concept of home as a fixed place is in doubt. Moreover, Blunt and Dowling (2006, 2) write that “international movements are also processes of establishing home, as senses of belonging and identity move over space and are created in new places”. Georgiou (2006, 10) highlights that because of migration and new communication technologies, spatiality plays a huge role in the building of transnational identities. Globalization and migration can be seen as new opportunities for establishing new identity and belonging. (Escher 2006, 62). The mentioned authors believe, globalization has a very strong impact on local happenings and on home which means that home is something that individuals can take along during their migration.

Al-Ali and Koser (2002) argue that home is not a place but rather a space where a person's belonging is impacted by globalization and migration. They say that home has a hybrid characteristic because it is neither here nor there but both here and there. These persons can adapt to distinct societies and cultures at the same time. “It is not a problem of belonging to the country or not. I feel at home anywhere in the world” (Arnold 2016, 170). This quotation was shared by a man who was born in Senegal. Thomas is working as a flight attendant and lives in New York because as he stated he cannot live in a place where there are not people with different ethnic background. Regarding the liminal characteristic of home, the Roma migrants' sense of home is quite similar, about which I will write more in my main findings. Comparing Thomas' case with the Roma migrants' situation there is a very important difference. Roma are living Hungary as a minority group, facing with discrimination because of their ethnicity. Despite Thomas in his country of origin, Roma are not “native inhabitants” in Hungary (although they have been living here for more than 600 years). In the chapter of *Politics and Home* I will write more how the inferior status and the different political contexts can shape an individual's concept of home.

In the following part of my thesis I will introduce Boccagni (2017) theories which shed light on the migration-home nexus from the angle of spatiality, temporality and politics.

1.1. Theories: Spatiality, Temporality and Politics

Home and Spatiality

In the Romani language home as a noun cannot be expressed. However, we can use it as an adverb and saying *to go home*, or *I am at home*. In these cases, we use the word *khere* which comes from the noun *kher* (house). If we ask: Do you have a home? We can just describe as: Do you have a house to live? *Hi tut kher kaj beshes/trajis/zhuves?* If we consider the home concept etymologically there is a clear connection between home and house. 2 out of 6 families are using the language on an everyday basis and it was very interesting to see how the term *kher* appeared in their concept of home.

“If the privileged place (i.e. the home) was destroyed by war or a natural catastrophe, or if necessity or curiosity compelled a group to abandon it for good, the spirit of the ancient home was normally carried on the back of the community” (Heller 1995, 2-3).

As the quotation illuminates, home is not necessarily linked to a physical place because it can be spatially extended, displaced and reproduce over space. To understand the connection between home, migration and space the literature introduces three notion. Portability and reproducibility of home as a social relationship with place and the factors that account for this (Boccagni 2018, 49).

Portability means the possibility to preserve the sense of home without having the physical circumstances. Besides it refers to the potential of separating the sense of home from a fixed place. Reproducibility sheds light on the attitudes of migrants to reproduce their past home experience in a new environment. For reproducing the sense of home, it is not enough to have access to a physical place because as I argued in the previous chapter the angle of time is inevitable as the cultural and emotional retention of the past through everyday practices helps migrants in this process. Also, the usage of the native language, keeping the traditions, the way of eating and dressing contribute people to have a sense of home. The access to public spheres has also significant impact on the sense of home. (Boccagni, 2018). Regarding this point of view, I will write more in the *Politics of Home* part. The interviewees highlighted two public spaces- the church and the concert halls- which they prefer to visit. Later, I will present how do they use these places to create a feeling of home in Canada and in Hungary.

Furthermore, the creation of the dwelling place such as the decoration, several objects can relate home to the memories and home in the past. In other words, it is called the materialization of the past. (Boccagni 2017) By introducing one family in Canada and one in Hungary, my thesis will show how the creation of a dwelling place influence their home concept. I will shed light on the topic both from a temporal and spatial dimension.

Roma migrants in Canada and the returnees in Hungary delink home from a fixed place. In my main chapter I aim to shed light on the importance of owning a house. There are different interpretations of owning a house in Canada and in Hungary according to my interviewees. While in Hungary it is one of the most important achievements to have a house, in Canada renting a house and moving from one place to another, is an acceptable practice and it is not necessarily linked to their home concept. Through my informants' narratives I will highlight the connection between spatiality, ownership of a house, the usage of public spheres and the concept of home.

Home and Temporality

As Boccagni (2017,65) writes the angle of time plays a very important role in the connection of migration and home. "Home is a kind of origin, we go "back" home even when our arrival is in the future. The home environment is one thoroughly imbued with the familiarity of past experience. It is the environment we inhabit day after day until it becomes taken for granted as is unselfconscious" (Dovey 1985, 37). Rykwert (1951) also connects home to the past and sees it as the starting point, as a center. Also, home is linked with the origin, roots of a person which usually started in the childhood. Home can give meaning to externality since it provides the inside which is "secure and familiar base from which people explore their world ... and in which they return for rest, regeneration, and sense of self-identity, opposed to the outer, less familiar, secure and controllable world" (Saile 1985 92). Most of the informants' narratives will support the idea of connecting home with past experiences. During my fieldwork they were sharing stories from their childhood. In my main findings my aim is to show how the past experiences impact the migrants' concept of home with the help of different senses as sounds, visions and smells.

The length of residence affects the individuals' concept of home. (Saile 1985) The more time a person has been living in a new environment, the more likely is to identify it as his/her home. In my main findings I will disagree with the statement both in Hungary and in Canada. The Roma people minority status don't allow them to feel themselves at home even in Hungary,

where their ancestors were born. Regarding their migration though they have spent 20 years in Canada they don't feel a fully belonging.

“Even in the best circumstances, every new dwelling place requires some time to be reconstructed as living, participating and richly experienced home place, where many other people may have lived already”. (Saile 1985, 87) According to Lawrence (1985) the everyday physical routines such as sleeping, tidying up, cooking or eating at the same place contributing to make the dwelling place “familiar, secure and controllable” and over time it can create a sense of home. Concerning this topic, I will present how a migrant woman in Canada connects her everyday routine to the sound of the church bell and how it affects her concept of home.

Finally, the angle of time is very important because it fills the gap between the ideal and the experienced home. In my findings I will illuminate the link between temporality and the political contexts. As my main finding says Roma migrants have three different concepts of home. For all groups the search for home is still an ongoing process and most of them connect their home to the future.

The Politics of Home

The concept of home mostly studied as a domestic question and understood as private issue, although it has very important public and political relevance. Home contains the “material and legal boundaries between insiders and outsiders”. (Boccagni, 2018, 87) The sense of home is affected not only by someone's emotions and memories but by broader political and economic factors. Migration impacts the political dimension of home as the migrants have a need for home which interacts with the native residents' home concept. Migrants' potential to feel themselves at home is influenced by the majority-migrants relationship. (Boccagni 2018)

Following Heller's approach, it is inevitable to go beyond the individualized angle of the migration-home nexus because the issue is more complex and need more focus on the structural conditions. If someone can feel at home is not only caused by personal emotions but has crucial societal consequences. “The issue is not whether someone can feel at home in X democracy, but whether the democratic institutions themselves should be considered as basic, or almost sufficient, homemakers. (Heller, 1995 11)

Continuing to argue why home making is not only a personal issue Kumar and Markova (2008) point out how the “domestication” of the public space relates with the sense of home. Feeling at home in a public space is shaped by both a subjective experience and by the native residents’ attitude. The political dimension of home, in the public sphere, has also to do with a sense of external recognition: the outer environment formulate whether an outsider belongs to the public space or not (Olwig 1999; Ralph and Staeheli 2011).

In my findings I will show how the public sphere and the external recognition contributed to the return migrants’ sense of home. Regarding this topic I will emphasize broadly the Roma migrants’ situation back in Hungary and their connection to the church. In terms of the migrants in Canada I will mention very briefly the importance of public sphere due to my short fieldwork in Montreal.

“Even long-settled ethnic minorities (...) can be questioned in their loyalty and accused of not really belonging to a supposedly cohesive and homogenous majority.” (Boccagni 99) This statement is true for the Roma community’s situation in Hungary. Although they have been living in Hungary for more than 600 years, their legitimate membership and belonging are still questionable. Several authors illuminate that the nativist and conservative stances are shaping mostly the discourse of home. To whom homeland is home? Who belongs there and why? Populist politicians, nationalist inhabitants, authorities and paramilitary organizations gain power by using these questions. A well-known theoretical framework, the Domopolitics summarizes how these actors identify the sense of home with state, public security and immigration. Those who belong to the *domus*¹ have right to equal treatment but they are obligated to protect the home from external danger caused by large-scale immigration (Boccagni 2018).

Demopolitics implies a reconfiguring of the relation between citizenship, state and territory. At its heart is a fateful conjunction of home, land and security. (...) The home is our place, where we belong naturally, and where by definition, others do not; international order as a space of homes-every people should have (at least) one; home as a place we must protect. We must invite guests into our home, but they come at our invitation; they don’t stay indefinitely. Other are, by definition, uninvited. Illegal migrants and bogus refugees should return to “their homes”. Home is a place to be secured

¹ Domus means both home and house in Latin

because its contents (our property) are valuable and envied by others. (...) Hence demopolitics embodies... a game which configures things as “Us vs Them”. (Walters, 2004 241)

I believe that Walters highlighted several points which I consider the key reasons of the Roma migration. According to my informants’ narratives they did not feel a belonging to the majority because of their ethnicity. “During my childhood I have faced discrimination at the school. (...) Somehow, I felt that I don’t belong here” (Maya, 32) In other words, Roma people don’t belong to the *domus* in Hungary and are not entitled to equal treatment. They are considered as others who are ‘not invited to the majority’s home’, therefore they “should return to their homes”. Roma people’s search or need for home-which is a source of protection, recognition, improvement” (Boccagni 103) did not start when they left Hungary. The core of the issue is coming from their minority status and the prejudices they are facing. As the largest minority in Europe, facing with discrimination both in personal and political level, home does not represent the “legitimate membership and belonging” (Boccagni 88) for them. Therefore, I consider the home making as a coping strategy of Roma migrants in Canada and back in Hungary. According to Boccagni the political angle regarding home making are based on inclusion, recognition and participation. Searching for home in both places the Roma migrants’ situation was very difficult because their sense of home was highly influenced by the majority’s opinion, further they had limited access to public spheres. Based on this understanding of the political side of the migration-home nexus, I will use this angle to represent my finding in the main chapters.

In my next part of the theses I will write about the social and political situation of Roma people in Hungary and in Canada. Since I have spent more time with participant observation in Hungary, I will put more emphasis on Hungary.

1.2. Background of the study: The social situation of Roma in Hungary and in Canada

Providing a social and political background of Roma people will support the understanding of their migration from Hungary to Canada. Hence, I would introduce studies and media discourses which are focusing on poverty, social problems and migration.

Szelenyi (2001) writes about the connection between poverty, markets and ethnicity -in the period of transition- which was very accurate in the Roma people's life. His research was about to find how poverty is changing in the transition of the socialist redistribution to capitalist markets. As Hungary shifted to free markets the question was how it affects poverty, in other words can economic growth and capitalism reduce poverty and social inequalities. For answering this question, the author introduces the concept of underclass which goes beyond the link between poverty, market and ethnicity.

The people who belong the underclass according to Myrdal (1963, 1964), are 'long-term poor who were not benefiting from the postwar economic boom. These individuals were locked into long-term structural unemployment because they did not have and could not acquire the education and skills demanded in a diversified economy' (Szelenyi 2001:3). According to Myrdal (1963:14-16) the formation of the underclass happened mainly during the economic transformation.

Concerning Roma people this theory was true in many cases and which is proven by older person's narrative in my community as well. They say that before capitalism the traditional Roma jobs –basketry, bell making, blacksmithing etc.-were widespread in the county and the families could satisfy their needs. They were proud of their handmade products furthermore if somebody was very talented he/she possessed a prestigious role among the community in which the people expressed their respect towards the craftsman. Those who did not possess any traditional Roma jobs, were working at mines or factories. After the transition the traditional jobs have lost their values, the factories and mines were slowly disappeared so most of the Roma people became unemployed. 'With the collapse of the mining, steel and construction industries, Roma were the first to lose their jobs and had no hope for finding new employment'; (Gheorge 1991).

Szelenyi also points out two important concepts: firstly, the underclass formation is connected to racialization which means that a social phenomenon-poverty- is determined biologically and

not socially and secondly that ‘poverty is the outcome of classificatory struggle’. Hence Roma are defined and connected with poverty instead of culture, language or history.

As Tarkowska argues (2001) to create an underclass, the actors ‘need’ to be isolated socially, economically and geographically as well. On the one hand it is true because besides the unpleasant socially and economically situation the Roma were also discriminated in terms of their place of living. In most of the cases they were living in Roma settlements both in the villages and in the cities. “During the past decades, there was a dramatic ecological change in rural social spaces. The ethnic majority population began to escape small, isolated villages into centers of rural growth of cities” (Szelenyi:2001:9).

After the transition, Roma lost their social ties with the majority-used to be seasonal workers, musicians- and lived in ghettos. On the other hand, I find very punctual how Tarkowska formulates her opinion because she writes about the isolation as a passive process from the Roma people’s angle. I think that it is important to clarify that in the creation of an underclass, the majority are active players and the Roma are passive since they have lost their jobs because of deindustrialization. Furthermore, they did not have money to move in the cities and search for new jobs which resulted that they became socially isolated. As a response to their social, economic situation and the presence of everyday discrimination, they have started to migrate from Hungary to Canada. The first wave of the migration started in 1997 (Hajnal, 2002) and the second in 2008 (Durst, 2014).²

Unfortunately, the formation of the underclass is continuing nowadays as well but it had a new angle in 2015 when the Hungarian prime minister compared Roma to refugees. ‘Hungary cannot take any economic refugees since we already have 800 thousand Roma to catch up/integrate’ (Kocze, Rövid: 2017:689). With this statement Orban expressed the de-Europeanisation of Roma people who are clearly not belonging to neither Hungary nor Europe- as the refugees. This narrative reinforces the underclass situation of the Roma persons who are detached from the Hungarian citizenship because they were not able to fully integrate to the major society. On the one hand, the prime minister has used these statements in order to create fear among the society regarding the coming refugees and on the other hand he clearly expressed that the Roma people cannot call home Hungary because they don’t belong here.

² In my opinion there was a 0. wave of the Roma migration when the people were moving from the countryside to Budapest in the 1980. I have dealt with the topic in my BA thesis.

In my research I tried to find answers how Roma migrants-both in Canada and returned ones in Hungary- felt themselves when they have heard these sentences in the media and whether their concept of home has changed. Personally, I felt disappointment and anger because no matter how me and my family are trying to be part of the society-for 600 years- someone who has power can call us ‘not-belonging aliens and threats’. My own concept of home is complex because I would link it with family, Hungary, Budapest, the countryside but beyond all these feeling there is the sentence that I don’t belong here.

The following quotation is just another evidence that it is very difficult to call or imagine home in a country where Roma are linked with radicalization and aggression. ‘Roma could be a target for radicalization. (...) There is a risk Roma could end up in Syria as foreign fighters alongside jihadist or other radical groups’ (Kocze, Rövid:2017:690)-said the Hungarian Minister of Justice in 2015. As the authors point out this statement remained unquestioned because neither the international media nor the EU bodies asked the minister for further explanations, so the narrative of Gypsy-threat became acknowledged.

Political contextualization in Hungary and in Canada

The discourses in media have a crucial role by representing the Roma minority as they have the power to either show the detailed context of an issue or to strengthen the stereotypes. In Hungary people watch television 4.5 hours daily which is a significant number, and which have a strong impact on forming people’s opinion (Kocze, Rovid:2017). In 2017 there was a media research conducted in Finland, the UK and Hungary which analyzed the press discourses on Roma people. The common result was that in all three countries the political ‘left’ and ‘right’ newspapers racialized Roma and formulated them as the ‘others’. Moreover, the homogenization of the minority was also similar, although in Hungary and in the UK the Roma are belonging to more than one cultural and linguistic group- on the press these differences disappeared. In Finland and the UK there is a distinction made between local and migrant Roma in which the first group is the good, accepted and the second is the bad, problematic (Varju:2017). For instance, in Finland the immigrant Roma appear in media as the ‘problematic others’ while the local Roma’s issues are formulated sensitively. Concerning Hungary, the article has no statements about the distinction between local and migrant Roma. When the Roma started to migrate to Canada and later came back to Hungary the press did not make any difference, they were considered *others* as before the migration.

In Hungary there are two main newspapers which are writing about the present political situation in the country. Népszabadság (NSZ) is a left-wing paper which tries to find a solution for Roma related issues, while Magyar Nemzet (MN), a right-wing paper, emphasize that only Roma are responsible for the prejudices and their low social and economic situation. By the end of the 2000s the radical right wing became stronger and stronger and the media representation of the Roma were more connected to racism and criminalization. 'There are two types of society in Hungary today. People in the first know the rules of living together... The second society skipped the socialization, persons in it live on their instincts...most of the members of the second society are Roma (MN, February 2, 2009)'. The quotation represents the Hungarian political context of Roma people during the time of their migration.

Representing the political context in Canada I will introduce different voices regarding the situation of Hungarian Roma migrants. In Canada, 2012 the media discourses on Roma migrants increased significantly, because the Canadian parliament accepted the Bill C-31 which said that 27 countries-including Hungary- are safe. Therefore, the migrants coming from there had little chance to stay in Canada. Seeing Hungarian Roma as bogus refugees who are taking advantage on the Canadian society by 'living on the welfare system' was the viewpoint of the Canadian conservative party. Kenney's parliamentary secretary, Rick Dystra say the following: "It's clear there is an opportunity for people to take advantage here."

Siekierski (2013) formulates the circumstances of initiating C-31: "Minister Jason Kenney went on a fact-finding mission in Hungary last October (2012) to see why so many of the country's Roma were claiming asylum in Canada, nothing he saw made him change his mind about the need to crack down on a slew of "bogus claimants" coming from the country."

(...)

Only days after Kenney left, thousands of anti-Roma Jobbik supporters took to the streets of Miskolc. According to a Reuters article that appeared in the National Post, as they marched, they chanted: Gypsy crime! Gypsy criminals!"

Below the Canadian article the comments are showing hostile attitudes toward Roma migrants.

"Roma are not refugees: they are undesirable in most countries because of their chosen lifestyle which is largely criminal ... They boo-hoo that they are persecuted when in fact they are parasites living off others and defend it by calling it their 'culture'."

"Deport them all. Keep thieves, baggers and criminals out of Canada, there are enough people on welfare as it is."

"Why on earth would we provide refugee status to pickpockets, scammers and thieves. They're not considered honorable professions in Canada either." (Skierski, 2013)

Tamás Király, Hungary's deputy head of mission in Ottawa clarified in an interview that he believes the Roma are bogus refugees. His statement suggest that Roma people did not faced with discrimination in Hungary, they migrated to Canada to have better economic situation. "We sincerely hope that Hungary will be a designated 'safe' country of origin. This would largely reduce the incentives for economic migrants to come to Canada as asylum seekers." (Farber 2012)

In Canada there was another voice which refers to the political situation in terms of Roma refugees. The *The Star* political magazine has published several articles which introduce the prejudices towards Roma people in Canada. The authors' aim is point out the majority's lack of knowledge on Roma people and emphasize the political manipulation of the conservative party. In 2013 an article was published with a very strong title: Our message to the Roma: Your message or your life. In this article a Hungarian social worker shares a story about a Roma woman with risky pregnancy. At a Toronto hospital the doctors refused to treat her because they were not sure as a refugee claimant, the woman was covered.

I also know a pregnant woman who needed an ultrasound. She was told she had to pay because she was a claimant. She was past her due date. She needed a C-section. She was in pain, she was worried, she wanted some medication. They said to her, okay, as long as you sign a paper saying that you'll pay. And they gave her a sheet of paper to sign, with no letterhead on it, nothing. (Fiorito, 2012)

In the interview the Hungarian storyteller explained her reasons of migrating from Hungary to Canada and expresses that the Roma people can not feel themselves at home neither in Hungary nor in Canada. "I came for a new life. I think the Roma feel the same way; they were not welcome in Hungary. Nor, it seems, are they welcome here." (Fiorito, 2012)

Both the Hungarian and Canadian state see the Roma community as a homogenous group which is connected mostly with otherness, social and economic issues and criminality. In my main chapter I will show how my informants are reflecting on these political views and how their feel at home is shaped by the political contexts.

Chapter 2: Ambivalences of Home: Roma migrants in Canada and in Hungary

To represent my main findings, I will shed light on the similarities and differences between the theoretical part and my informants' narratives on home making. For seeing these connections, I will analyze the Roma migrants' concept of home through the dimensions of spatiality, temporality and politics. Firstly, I would like to introduce a Roma song on which most of my interviewees were referring when I was asking how they imagine home. By analyzing the song briefly my aim is to give a hint about how the Roma returnees are thinking about home.

„I am walking around the world, but I do not find my place. Meanwhile I am thinking about my family with a broken heart. I do not find my home, although I have been searching it for a long time. Oh, God, give rest to my soul. Oh, God what have you done, you have not created country for Roma people. Roma are thrown out from everywhere in the world but what should s/he do. Rather s/he is going away and thinking that no one needs trouble”.³

For me it was a very interesting experience that most of the participants were mentioning this song because I could consider it a romanticized song. In the following quotation a return migrant mentions the song when I was asking her whether she connects home with a fixed place.

“You know it is interesting. I don't feel myself at home neither here, nor there. You know that song which says that there is no home for Roma people... I feel the same. The two countries should be one (...) somebody should unite them.” (Maya, 32)

But the authors of the song are Hungarian Roma and most of the interviewees could identify themselves with the lyrics therefore I see this song as a self-representation. The content itself provides us several information concerning home because it links emotions and home by saying one can find rest at home if s/he finds it. Searching for home is a 'man task' as the song puts it which can refer to the financial responsibility of creating a home. We can also find in the lyrics the sense of being alone, being an outsider who is facing with prejudice which were also formed by my interviewees. Besides the song connects home-making with transcendentalism which topic- religion and connection with God- also appeared in the narratives when they were

³ Váradi Roma Cafe: Járok, kelek a világbán
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vfKr8PgD-1E>

speaking about how it helps them to reintegrate into the community. In more details I will write about later when I will discuss the importance of churches as public space which helps migrants in creating home.

2.1. Home and Spatiality: ‘I don’t relate my home to a house’

In the theoretical part of the thesis I expressed that several authors argue that home is not always linked to one physical place. By analyzing the migrants’ concept of home both in Canada and in Hungary, I found that their level of portability (Boccagni 2018) is very significant, because all my informants delinked their concept of home from one fixed place. Although they migrated to a new country, they were able to expand their sense of home. Instead of linking home to their previous country or house, they point out the mobile characteristic of home and the importance of family.

Zsuzsa migrated to Canada in 2010 with her mother, Eta. After 3 years they got the permission to stay in Canada. She got married in Canada and they have a 1-year old daughter. Zsuzsa doesn’t connect her sense of home to one place. As she was saying in her narrative, she considers herself a mobile person, because she was moving a lot both in Hungary and in Canada. When she was talking about home she emphasized the importance of her family.

“I don’t think that a flat or a house is the most important when I am thinking about home. This is our third house in Canada. (..) Home is where my husband and our daughter are”. (Zsuzsa, 24)

“You know I feel myself at home everywhere... It can be Canada, Hungary, England or Germany. Actually... I don’t care about the country. What matters is the house. The house and my family...nothing else”. (Gyula 40)

Gyula and his family migrated to Canada, Toronto in 2010. After the Bill C-31, in 2014 they were forced to return to Hungary. For a while, they were living in Budapest but after 3 months they moved back to Hodász, from where they migrated to Canada. As Zsuzsa, he also delinks home and a fixed place.

Melani, my other informant from Canada emphasized the mobile characteristic of home and highlighted another important issue which the ownership of a house is. Melanie and her husband, Attila migrated from Budapest to Canada in 2001. After 2 years, they got the permission and settled in Montreal. They have two sons, who were born there. They will return to Hungary this summer for visiting their relatives.

“In Canada most people are renting their houses. You are looking for advertisements and you choose which fit the best to your personality. At home (Hungary) you live your whole life in one house, but in Canada no way. (...) So, in Canada you are not restricted.” (Melanie, 32)

Mehta’s article (2018) on Indian migrants housing practices writes that owning a house can strongly contributing to have the sense of belonging. “When migrants come to a new country, they want to take a stake in that county so that the migrant can have the sense of belonging. As a general migrant once you have your home, now you feel OK, I own a home here - now I belong here”. (Mehta 2018, 2) Similarly, my experiences and my participant observation prove that in the Hungarian Roma community having a house is a matter of prestige and a sign that the man is responsible for his family. After I have been in my fieldwork in Canada and in Hungary, I was able to compare how my informants are thinking about the connection between home and house. I believe that there are different views in the two countries about owning a house.

After Gyula and his family moved back to Hungary, he felt that he is an outsider in his own community. They were living at her mother’s house for two years, then he bought a house in the village and moved there.

“You know the people will respect you, if you have money and you own a house, car and you have a family.” (...) When we came home to Hungary we lived in the countryside with my mother. I hated it. Only when God helped us we bought a small house in the same village. I have renovated the house, my children helped me... I enjoyed building my own house. After we finished to renovate the house, I was very proud. For now, I think I belong here again in a different way but... I belong.” (Gyula, 40)

From Gyula’s case we can see that he defined his position as an outsider, when they have returned to Hungary. He had problems with the reintegration to the community and his coping strategy was related with home making. Since he bought a house in the village, he feels the belonging to the community which shows how important is for him to own a house.

On the contrary, as Eta and Melanie who are living still in Canada have different opinions regarding owning a house. In their interviews they were saying, in Canada owning a house is not the main achievement in somebody’s life. People with various social and economic background are renting houses, they are moving from one city to another if the circumstances

(housing, employment, education) are better than in the previous place. In that sense the Canadian society is more mobile than the Hungarian, moreover there is no judgement linked to the ownership of a house and to mobility. My informants were formulating that the Canadian point of view is closer to their personality. In Hungary they were also mobile persons, because most of them were commuting between the countryside and Budapest where they were renting houses. They have different feeling regarding being mobile in Canada and in Hungary.

“You know in Hungary if you are moving from one place to another, people don’t respect you, because you don’t own a house. (...) In Canada most of the people are renting the houses, except those who are doing business with the flats”. (Melanie, 32)

“All my life I was moving. In my childhood I was living in three villages but Hodász was my home. But not because of the house (...) I call Hodász my home, because the church, the memories from the kindergarten and my grandparents were there. Also, in Budapest I was moving a lot and I did not feel comfortable. (...) In Canada everybody is moving, and I like that, because I prefer changes”. (Eta, 51)

From their interpretation of owning a house we can see that Eta and Melanie have different home concepts as Gyula has. Instead of connecting home with owning a house, Melanie and Eta relate the feel at home with mobility. As they were formulating they used to move a lot in Hungary and they are still moving from place to place in Canada if it is needed. The difference is that they don’t feel uncomfortable by their moving, because the Canadian society has a different angle on mobility. They are not judged by their environment, while Gyula struggled from critiques concerning not owning a house and being mobile. A possible explanation regarding the different home concepts can come from gender. In the community creating financial security and home for the family is the men’s responsibility. If someone cannot provide them, it will affect his role and his prestige in the community. While Eta and Zsuzsa don’t have these responsibilities, their concept of home is linked to mobility.

During my research in Canada I had a possibility to visit the places where my informants are living. There were very interesting narratives regarding materiality, how they have furnished the houses and how it can be related to temporality and the sense of home. According to my findings the migrants in Canada prefer to furnish their houses in a similar way as they did in Hungary.

Before Eta's migration, I had a chance to visit their place in Hungary which was in the suburb area of Budapest. When I arrived at their house in Montreal I felt, that I am at the same home. Eta's way of furnishing did not change during the years. She prefers modern furniture and likes to make decorations by herself.

"You know, I always loved to decorate my homes in Budapest as well. I like the process when I buy something, then I am thinking a lot where and how to put it, then I found a place where it is perfect. (...) I know it is childish, but at the end I feel like it is my home... like in Budapest." (Eta, 51)

Eta is trying to create home in Canada by using the furniture and the decorations in the same way as she used to in Budapest. It shows her liminal status both in time and space. When she is putting a tablecloth with Hungarian motives on the table she is between the past and the present and between Montreal and Budapest.

Gyöngyi and his husband were also mentioning which objects they connect to home. In their narrative they were telling how a negative experience with a mattress influences their feel at home. Gyöngyi said that when they migrated to Canada and rented a house they had a mattress for a long time.

"We did not have money for a long time to buy a new one. In Canada if you don't need your furniture, you leave it on the street. So, we went to the street and took home the mattress. (...) When we returned to Hungary, we used to live at my mother-in-law's house. I did not love it. In the mornings, I have opened my eyes and the first thing I realized was a mattress. For a few minutes I did not know where I am. (...) Now, we have an own house, thanks God. The funny thing is that although we have beds, we still have a mattress somewhere. We hate the mattresses but somehow it reminds us to Canada." (Gyöngyi, 42)

2.2. Temporality and the Senses of Home

For most of informants the angle of time affected their concept of home. Their search for home has started in the past back in Hungary. Their minority status and the political context affected their social, economic situation which did not allow them to find their home neither in their country of origin nor in Canada. During my fieldwork I had a chance to speak with my

informants (both in Canada and in Hungary) about their present sense of home -which is impacted by their past experiences. I found that the Roma migrants don't belong fully to one society. They are floating between past and present, "somewhere between the two countries". Their strategy is in the future because their search for home is still ongoing. In that part of my thesis is to show how temporality impacts the Roma migrants feel at home.

In my theoretical part I was writing that according to some theories the length of residence can help to create home. In the case of Roma migrants, the sense of home is not linked with the length of residence. Unfortunately, their marginal situation in both places has stronger effects than the length of residence. We can see from Melanie's interview that despite she is living in Canada for more years than she used to in Hungary, she cannot belong there.

I am here in Canada since 2001. I was 15 when my mother and father took me to Montreal. You know I speak French fluently, I usually help new Roma families in the Immigration Office concerning translation. I have everything in Montreal... my husband, my two lovely sons. But... I will never feel that I belong here. Neither here, nor to Hungary. I am homeless and rootless. (Melanie, 32)

When my interviewees were mentioning home, they were highlighting experiences and memories from their past. Rykwert's (1951) argument can be applied to the Roma migrants' home concept because he states that home is connected to origin and memories from the childhood, where everything has started. My interviewees connected their sense of home to childhood experiences and very interestingly they highlighted some senses which helps them to recall their homes. Sounds, vision and smell were the main tool through which they connected their present situation to their feel at home in the past.

As I mentioned in the last chapter, Eta and her daughter got the permission to settle down in Canada. From 2010 they are living in Montreal. Eta was highlighting the importance of visibility by saying that if she sees pansies⁴ on the street, she always remembers to her home in Hungary. She was sharing a story from her childhood. Her grandfather, who raised her up, bought her pansies which she was planting on the street. She was so happy when she came back from school because the street was full of flowers and her grandfather was proud to her. A small flower immediately connected Eta's present situation with a home experience in the past. "My

⁴ In Hungarian language the translation of the pansy is 'árvaska' which means 'orphan' or 'lonely'. My interviewee did not speak about the link between the name of the flower and her position as a migrant. But she was referring several times to her position as being 'lonely' in her childhood and, also in Canada.

favorite flower is the pansy, I don't know why, I just like it. It reminds me to my home village in Hungary. (...) If I see these flowers here, in Canada I become homesick..." (Eta, 51) For Eta, the flowers are signs of home which was in Hungary. When I asked her whether the pansies help her to feel at home in Canada, she said the following:

The flowers impact me in different ways. Sometimes it is good to see them, nice memories are coming to my mind and I feel for a moment that I am at home here. But sometimes, I become sad and I just want to fly to Hungary. I don't know where I belong to... (Eta, 51)

As we can see from Eta's narrative she relates home with an experience in the past through visibility. When she sees a flower her liminal belonging increases and she feels at home between Hungary and Canada. Another example to connect the home concepts with the past, is Attila's case, who is affected by smells. "My nose usually reminds me to the smell of home. My grandparents had a stove and I can still remember the smell of the wood". (Attila, 38) Attila in his narrative talked about his negative emotions in terms of home. After he told this story, he was speaking about hopelessness and the feeling of not belonging anywhere. He told me that after their migration to Canada, slowly they stopped speaking with their friends and relatives in Hungary. "When we stopped sending money to them, it turned out that we don't have anyone in Hungary. They thought that we became rich and arrogant." (Attila, 38)

It was very interesting for me to recognize how a sound can remind me to home. Sometimes it makes me happy and I am smiling when I hear the bells of the church. My family, my old house and all the memories are coming to my mind. Sometimes, when I wake up earlier and hear the bells, for a second, I cannot decide where am I. The daily routine, my coffee and the bells are the same, but the country is not... It depends on my mood. If I am happy, the bells give me the feeling of home here. If not ... then I always start to count when can I fly to Hungary. (Eta, 51)

Sounds appeared with the same importance in the migrants' concept of home. In Eta's narrative the bells of the church are understood as the sound of home. As she was formulating it, the church has always played a significant role in her life. During her childhood, the church was a place of education and spare time. In that church she had a possibility to practice her Roma identity because the liturgy was in Romani language. Before their migration she and her daughters were living next to a church in Budapest. Lawrence (1985) argues that the everyday routines can help the migrants to create a sense of home in their dwelling place. Eta relates the

sounds of the bells with the everyday routine which reminds her to memories in the past. Lawrence's theory cannot be fully applied in her case, because according to her mood, the sounds of the bells impact her sense of home differently.

The return migrants' concept of home is also affected by the everyday activities. It was very interesting to hear that their memories are related not only to Hungary but to Canada as well. As Eta's and Attila's case, the returnees' sense of home regarding temporality is also related with liminality. They feel themselves at sometimes in Canada and sometimes in Hungary. They are between past and present and between Canada and Hungary. Gyöngyi and his husband were mentioning how the everyday activities reminds them to Canada and how they practice them in Hungary. Fishing and going to the nature were mentioned by Gyöngyi. She really likes to be in the nature because it reminds her both to her childhood in Hodász and on her fishing in Canada. Although these memories can help her to recreate a sense of home, but this feeling is uncertain. As she is expressing her search for home is still an unfinished process which is maybe in the future.

“When we came home to Hodász, I really missed Canada. I did not find my place and one day I decided to walk to the forest which is near to my grandmother's house. You know, I like to be there among the trees... I don't know why... memories from my childhood are coming to my mind. (...) And you know what when I am in the forest and close my eyes sometimes it is like in Canada when I was sitting on the riverside and fishing with my husband. Sometimes I am confused... I don't find my home. Maybe it is in the future, who knows.” (Gyöngyi, 42)

When I was speaking with my interviewees about the connection between home and temporality, it was very interesting that those who remained in Canada highlighted one topic. It was about the issue how they can preserve the Roma identity in their children's case. They were emphasizing that for them it is very difficult since they don't have their relatives in Canada, further there are very few places which relate to Roma culture and traditions. In other words, they link Roma identity with their experiences in the past. Since they don't have links with the past, they try to build their children's identity in the present. Due to the lack of opportunities of practicing Roma culture, they believe that in the future the next generations' identity will change a lot. In my first example I would like to compare how Melani and Zsuzsa are thinking about the next generation, since both ladies were giving birth in Canada.

They left Hungary when they were 15 years old and migrated to Montreal. They don't have problems with speaking French, furthermore they have acquired the knowledge of English and Spanish as well which they are using every day. Both women have given birth to their children in Canada but despite Zsuzsa, Melanie doesn't consider it as a turning point which affects her sense of home.

My sons were born here, in Montreal. Their future is here but... for me Canada is not a home. I will stay here only to protect them and to see my grandchildren. (Melanie, 32)

My daughter was born here, in Montreal. After one week my husband and me brought her home to this house. This is my daughter's first home. If we leave Canada, I will miss this memory how we introduced her our home. (Zsuzsa, 26)

As we can see Zsuzsa relates her home to her daughter's home and considers her house in Canada as a new starting point. In the following parts I will emphasize more Zsuzsa's opinion about home and show how her daughter contributed to see Canada as a home. But at the same time, she still links home to Hungary.

I am speaking in Hungarian with my daughter and a little bit Romani. Unfortunately, I cannot speak fluently Romani. It is a pity that I cannot raise her among our relatives and cousins. She would socialize in another way, if she would be in Hungary among our relatives, because she would know what is to be a Roma. Her Roma identity will be limited because only me and my mother can teach her. But you know... it is another thing when you hear about Roma identity and when you can experience it in your everyday life. (Zsuzsa, 26)

I think my children must know where they are coming from, they must know that they are Roma. For me it is quite hard because I don't speak Romani. My grandmother was the last person who was speaking but then she decided not to teach their children because it was not an advantage at that time in Hungary... But you know I always say to my sons when they are behaving badly: Among Roma people it is not nice! Don't do that anymore it is shame! Also, they can make a difference what is Roma and what is Hungarian music. (Melanie, 32)

In terms of preserving identity both ladies are thinking that it is a very important issue. Although they don't speak fluently Romani, they aim to give a sense of Roma culture to their children. As we can see they are linking Roma identity to a place, to Hungary where their relatives are

living and where are more possibilities to practice the language and culture. When I was in Canada and visited the two ladies, it was very interesting how they positioned me. As they said, I represented so many things for them: Hungary, the countryside, the Roma identity and language. During my fieldwork I had a chance to play with their children and they were asking me mostly about Roma related topics or about Hungary. It was a new experience to represent home to somebody and I have never thought that my informants will link their home concept with me.

We are so glad that you came to us! You are like a piece of our memories, our home and a piece of Hungary! (Zsuzsa, 26)

I do believe that in terms of Roma identity, the migrants are living in a liminal situation. When I was asking them how they would identify themselves, they said that they are neither Hungarian nor Canadian Roma people. They are between, so they are Canadian Hungarian Roma persons.

2.3. The Politics of Home

As Heller (1995) and Boccagni (2018) point out home making is not just a private issue, because the broader political and economic factors also impact one's sense of home. The different policies in Hungary and in Canada were introduced in my thesis. The hostile attitude towards Roma people and the presence of domopolitics were similar in both societies. Their migration and the home making process is a strategy through which they react on the political phenomena. In this part of my thesis I will illuminate how the native inhabitants' recognition and the usage of public spaces have influenced the Roma migrants' feel at home. Because of their marginal status the migrants don't feel a fully belonging neither too Canada, nor to Hungary. Similarly, to the spatial and temporal angles, the politics' impact on their home making resulted a liminal situation.

The existence of domopolitics is similar in both societies. In Hungary during 2008-2009 the hostile attitude towards Roma people was very high, which resulted the death of 6 Roma people. The killings were organized by the members of the Hungarian far-right party, Jobbik and its paramilitary organization, the Magyar Gárda. In this period the second wave of the Roma

migration to Canada started. In the following part, I will shed light on how the native inhabitants' discourse and the political contexts affected the migrants' identity.

As I wrote in the theoretical part according to Arnold (2016) the pluralization of identities and the translocal concept (cultural hybridization) of home are the two main identity strategies- pluralization of identities and cultural hybridization- which are utilized by the migrants in recreating home. According to the pluralization of identities a person practices different identity in different locations and has multiple belongings and feelings of home which are separated. In our case it would mean that the migrants identify themselves as Hungarians in Hungary and Canadians in Canada. Seeing the narratives and thinking about my participant observation, I cannot apply this theory. But the cultural hybridization close to the Roma returnees' situation because it says that the multiple identities are overlapping on one another and these 'cosmopolitan' people can mingle between the different countries and the feelings of home. Maya migrated to Canada in 2008, when the Roma killings were happening. As she was saying in her narrative, her parents divorced in her childhood and her father migrated to Canada in the first migration wave. Therefore, she migrated to Montreal and lived with her father's new family. She married in Canada and gave birth there. After the Bill C-31, she was forced to come back to Hungary. Furthermore, she had to come alone, as her husband and daughter have received the permission to stay there.

"I did not find any jobs here in Hungary. When the boss saw me, they realized that I am Roma. So, they said that the job has been filled already. (...) My dad was living in Canada... and I was afraid what happened here in Hungary... the racism increased... it was horrible. So, I gave myself a chance and migrated to Canada".

"If I am thinking about myself, for now I am a Hungarian-Canadian Roma both in Hungary and in Canada. But you know not in a 100% because nor in Hungary neither in Canada I feel that I would belong to the majority. (...) I don't feel myself at home neither in Canada nor in Hungary. I am between somewhere. It would be the best if Hungary and Canada were one country". (Maya, 32)

As we can see in the quotation Maya's identity are overlap. In her interview she was saying that mostly because of the discrimination against Roma people she cannot belong 'fully' to the majority. As a child in Hungary she was facing discrimination which impacted significantly her sense of belonging. "I had to face with discrimination in the primary school. It was terrible... I don't like those memories". (Maya,32)

Hence, I would not call her a cosmopolitan person as the theory writes, because then she could belong to different societies and cultures at the same time with more dimensions of home. The other interviewees had the same ideas about their identity because they were referring to their situation as a minority and emphasizing cases in which they were struggling with prejudice. Rather I would identify Roma return migrants' identity and social situation with liminality (Turner 1967).

The liminal persons are "neither here nor there; they are betwixt and between the positions assigned and arrayed by law, custom, convention, and ceremony." (1969: 95) Turner writes, with reference to Mary Douglas' *Purity and Danger*, that liminal individuals are polluting, and thus dangerous, to those who have not gone through the liminal period. In addition, liminal individuals *have* nothing: "no status, insignia, secular clothing, rank, kinship position, nothing to demarcate them structurally from their fellows" (1967: 98). He also mentions the term marginality, by which he means the state of simultaneously belonging to two or more social or cultural groups and highlights that marginality is not equal with true outsiderhood. Examples of outsiders are: "shamans, diviners, medium, priests, those in monastic seclusion, hippies, hoboes, and gypsies." (1974: 233) Though Turner's theories on marginality and outsiderhood depends on how he defines the Roma community about which I don't have any data. Considering my interviewees' narratives, they identify themselves sometimes with marginality as we saw in Maya's case. She feels that she is at home between Hungary and Canada. On the contrary Gyula says that sometimes he feels as an outsider in the community. As I wrote it in the chapter about spatiality, when he bought a house, his status changed. After he owned a house, the people started to involve him in the everyday activities and he felt that he belongs to the community.

In terms of the changes in the Canadian policies the Bill C-31 also affected the migrants' concept of home and the sense of belonging. As I mentioned Eta and her daughter got the permission from the Canadian state and they have been living in Montreal since 2012.

"In the last 2-3 years it is harder to find a job. I am very sad about it because I have been working all my life. When we came here, I had opportunities to work but now there is nothing." (Eta, 52)

Eta did not refer explicitly to the connection between the policy and the lack of jobs. But a possible explanation can be the majority's discourse on Roma people after the C-31. As I

showed it in my thesis, several articles prove that in Canada the stereotypes against Roma are increasing.

János and his wife Klaudia migrated to Canada in 2010 and they also got the permission to stay there. They are living now in Toronto. Despite Eta, János has a clear opinion about politics. It was very interesting that though he lives in Toronto, he refers only to the Hungarian policies. According to him in Hungary the prejudices against Roma are increasing every day.

“If I won the lottery, I would take all Roma people from my county to Canada. I feel very bad that they face with stereotypes and I cannot help them. The politics in Hungary is about to increasing the fear and find scapegoats again and again. (...)”

As János was saying in his interview he misses Hungary a lot. When he is thinking about home he is between the two places. The memories and relatives are related to his village in Hungary, but he found safety in Canada. Therefore, he would apply his own strategy in all Roma people’ case-making home in Canada-as a reaction to the political situation in Hungary.

The usage of the public spaces plays a crucial role in the migrants’ home making. These are the places, where they can interact with the “native” inhabitants and have chances to (re)integrate into the community. Both for the migrants in Canada and the returnees in Hungary, the theory cannot be applied fully. The discourse on domopolitics impacted their usage of public spaces. “The home is our place, where we belong naturally, and where by definition, others do not.” (...) (Walters 2004, 241) Since they have faced many times with prejudices they rather prefer to attend places where are mostly Roma people. Both in Canada and in Hungary the migrants aim is to reintegrate to the Roma community. Because of the existence of antigypsyism, they could not feel a fully belonging to the majority, they rather try to recreate home among Roma people.

In Hungary, in Hodász the church is a place where the members of the Roma community meet weekly. In the Pentecostal church the pastors, the musicians are mostly Roma, and the liturgy is in Romani language as well. As I was attending this church I recognized that this place helps the return migrants to reintegrate to the community. All my interviewees were attended the church before their migration and in Canada too. When they came back to Hodász they continued going to the church but only after a while.

Since we came back to Hungary, I don’t have so many friends... in the first period I did not want to go to the church because there I had conflicts with some people before we left

Hungary. But then I decided that I will continue to attend the church because I enjoy being there. It is a place where I don't have to prove anything. It is just me and the Lord. (Gyöngyi,42)

The importance of religion and its advantages are significant in migrants' situation. Heckmann (2005) writes about the immigrants' situation in the U.S. after the second world-war and states that these people become more religious than they used to because it helps them to handle the "trauma" which was caused by the migration.

"Immigrants search refuge for physical safety as well as psychological comfort after the trauma of losing the family, language and homeland community. Churches can also provide respectability or opportunities for status recognition and social mobility that is denied in the broader society. Moreover, churches and temples become central to the lives of immigrants by catering to their needs through the provision of resources, services and communication networks for every social demographic group". (Heckmann 2005, 5)

In Gyula's situation the church is a place in which everybody has the right to enter. Since he left the community he left his social status as well. In his narrative he was speaking about that 4-5 years were needed to refresh his networks and recreate his position in which the church played a crucial role. He and his family came back to Hungary in 2014 and for now he can say that he possesses those relationships which he had before the migration hence finding a job is becoming easier.

"Sometimes I feel that I am an outsider. We are not so rich, and some people are looking down on us because of our situation. It was more common when we came back to Hodász and we had to live in my mother's house... If you don't have money, you are no one. (...) Now thanks God I refreshed my network and I can find jobs also. These people were not even knowing that I have returned from Canada..." (Gyula, 40)

Regarding the Roma returnees in Budapest the social place which helps them to reintegrate are the places of the Roma folklore concerts. During my participant observation I tried to follow the participant free time activities and they were attending these concerts which are taking place in the 7th district in Budapest. The audience here is a mix of Roma and non-Roma individuals. The entry is free for everybody. The music bands are advertising the concerts on the social media platforms and through their social network. As I mentioned in the case of Hodász, in Budapest the migrants have also lost their relationships in the Roma community. This is the

reason why they are not invited to weddings or birthday parties but can attend these concerts. As the churches in the countryside, the concerts give the possibility to refresh a social network, find jobs and housing and to recreate the sense of home.

“These concerts help me to protect my identity. Here I can meet with Roma people whom I did not see for a long time. It reminds me to the period before I left my home (Hungary)”. (János, 52)

Furthermore, the importance of these concerts is the most visible in those families’ life who were migrated from the countryside to Budapest in the 1990s and then to Canada in 2009 and came back to Hungary.

“Oh, I like these concerts... because there I can live my identity outside of my family... I like to sing and dance... it reminds me to my roots where I came from. To my parents and grandparents. I remember these concerts helped me a lot when I moved to the capital city from the countryside. In the village it is very different to be a Roma... When I came to Budapest in the 1992 I missed my community, my relatives... everything. But when I have heard about the concerts... I felt that I am at home. (...) It was so nice to have Roma music bands in Canada as well, but you know the audience was not the same. (...) When we came back to Hungary it was so strange. Firstly, I did not know where I belong. (...) After 4 years of being at home (in Hungary) I do think that without these concerts my identity would not be the same.” (János, 52)

Conclusion

In my thesis my aim was to shed light on how the Roma migrants in Canada and the returnees back in Hungary create home. I have utilized three main dimensions through which I have interpreted the concept of home. These angles were the spatiality, temporality and political context. During my fieldwork my main questions were: How do Roma people imagine home as a community living on the margins? Have Roma persons ever felt themselves at home in Hungary? How do they create a new home in Canada and in Hungary? How spatiality, temporality and politics impact their sense of home?

In terms of spatiality I have found that both the Roma migrants in Canada and the returnees back in Hungary delink their home concept from a fixed place. Despite connecting home with one special house in one country, they highlighted the importance of family, memories, mobility and the ownership of a house. In terms of owning a house and the mobile characteristic of home the return migrants and the Roma who are still living in Canada have different opinions. As the informants pointed out the Hungarian and the Canadian society have different views on mobility and ownership, which affect their feel at home. Despite in Canada, in Hungary being mobile and not owning a house are barriers to create home. As Gyula, a return migrant, emphasized, if somebody doesn't possess a house it is judged by the environment, further the individual can hardly reintegrate to the society. Regarding materiality, I have experienced that some of the families try to furnish their homes in a similar way that they used to either in Hungary or in Canada. These objects sometimes "confuse" them because they cannot decide where they are. It refers to their liminal situation in terms of home because as they formulated, they don't feel at home neither in Canada, nor in Hungary, rather between the two countries.

In the chapter about temporality and home I have also found a liminal status, because the migrants are living between the past and the present. Moreover, their sense of home is related to the future which means that their search for home is an ongoing process. Some cases show that the length of residence help the migrants to feel at home in the receiving society. On the contrary, this factor doesn't count in the Roma migrants' situation. Their minority status and its impacts have stronger effect on the concept of home as the length of residence. As I have illuminated in my thesis, in both societies they are outsiders which don't allow them to feel at home. As several theories point out, people usually link their sense of home with their memories from the past. It was true in the case of Roma migrants, because they shared have their

childhood experiences regarding home. Interestingly all my informants have mentioned how the different senses help them to recall memories. Concerning the everyday routines, for the migrants, these activities also increased their liminal concept of home. A good example was Eta's case, who formulated that her routine is the same but the sound of the church bell makes her confused, as she cannot decide where is she belonging. The Roma identity among the next generation has an important role in the Canadian Roma migrants' life and it has several temporal aspects. To sum up, they connect the Roma identity with the past, to which they don't have access, since they miss the relatives and cultural places where they could practice their identity. Although they try to provide Roma culture for their children, they believe that the next generations' identity will be very different from the Hungarian Roma people's identity. In terms of identity they are also living in a liminal situation as they are defining themselves as Canadian Hungarian Roma people.

As I wrote it earlier, the political environment impacted significantly the Roma people's concept of home. Because Roma were living on the margins facing with prejudices before their migration, they have reacted to the political context by leaving the country. Their coping strategy was the home making in a new environment. Despite many migrants' cases, the Roma migrants' situation was more difficult, because their minority status and the majority's stereotypes were the same in both countries. The issue of the domopoitics appeared in both societies with the same effects on Roma people and their concept of home. In Hungary the 'Us vs. Them discourse' was the highest in 2008 and 2009, during the Roma killing and in 2015 when Syrian refugees came to Hungary. The populist political discourses highlighted that Hungary belongs to the Hungarians and the native inhabitants need to protect their home from the outsiders- who were either migrants or Roma people. Similarly, in Canada after the Bill C-31 the stereotypes against Roma people increased a lot. As my informant highlighted, she cannot find a job in Montreal, although she has many years of work experience, speaks French fluently and from 2012 she is a Canadian citizen. As the theories pointed out the majority's point of view has a significant impact on the migrants' concept of home. In terms of the Roma migrants it means that they don't feel themselves at home neither in Canada, nor in Hungary. They are between. Therefore, their usage of public spaces are limited to those churches and concert places, where there are mostly Roma people.

As my findings show the Roma migrants' concept of home is liminal from spatial, temporal and political point of view. Due to the political contexts, they are floating between the two

countries, between past and present. Their search for home is a coping strategy but until now they have not found it. Their sense of home is related to the future, so their search is continuing.

As a possible future research, I would like to continue understanding the Roma migrants' concept of home. My aim is to broaden my target group with the migrants' relatives who have stayed in Hungary. I believe that their sense of home has also changed a lot, further their narratives can help to understand better the migrants' concept of home.

Bibliography:

Abu-Lughod, L. Recapturing anthropology: working in the present. School of American Research.1991

Ahmed, S. Uprootings/regroundings: questions of home and migration. New York: Berg Publishers, 2003.

Al-Ali N. and K. Koser. New Approaches to Migration? Transnational Communities and the Transformation of Home. London: routledge.2002

Arnold, G. Place and space in home-making processes and the construction of identities in transnational migration. In: Transnational Social Review. Volume 6, 2016

Blunt, A. and R. Dowling. Home. Oxon: Routledge.2006

Blunt, a. and a. Varley. 2004. introduction: Geographies of home. Cultural Geographies. 2004

Basch, L., Glick Schiller, N. and Szanton Blanc, C. Nations Unbound Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments and Deterritorialized Nation-States. Langhorne, PA: Gordon & Breach. 1994

Bauman, Z. Globalization: The Human Consequences. Columbia University Press, 1998

Boccagni P. Migration and the Search for Home. Mobility & Politics. Palgrave Macmillan, New York. 2017

Castles, Steven. Towards a Sociology of Forced Migration and Social Transformation. 2003

Durst, J. „Félünk, hogy miattuk hazaküldenek minket is”: Elias „beágyazottak és kívülállók” figurációjának különböző szintjei a Magyarországról kivándorolt romák esetében.Erdelyi tarsadalom, 12 (2), 2014

Farber, B. Will Bill C-31 Reject More Romas? Huffingtonpost. 2012

https://www.huffingtonpost.ca/bernie-farber/roma-refugee_b_1673647.html?guccounter=1&guce_referrer=aHR0cHM6Ly93d3cuZ29vZ2xlLmNvbS8&guce_referrer_sig=AQAAAM-M9tJHlbNz4YR9VsbbNf77vzUt4d-AVDGmFNcz0hqz9VwU-T2ilo67Fazuqv8Bo2vtm0JYMt3SRC0Q471KrHfYGwPRq-YaTOjm6Kxf81fgz1YJ4S_XhAg4n_yC9TPVdz6tmhHoNocp8OAlaH7pEkEoU39RhYNguhOsuub6mGio

Fiorito, J. Our message to the Roma: Your money or your life. The Star. 2012
https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2012/11/12/fiorito_our_message_to_the_roma_your_money_or_your_life.html

Feldman, Gregory. If ethnography is more than participant-observation, then relations are more than connections: The case for nonlocal ethnography in a world of apparatuses. In Anthropological Theory. 2011

Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture. Ed. Cary Nelson and Lawrence Grossberg. Urbana: U of Illinois P, 1988

- Georgiou, M. *Diaspora, Identity and the Media: Diasporic Transnationalism and Mediated Spatialities*, Cresskill, NJ, Hampton Press. 2006
- Glick Schiller, N., Basch, L. and Blanc-Szanton, C. (eds). *Toward a Transnational Perspective on Migration*. New York: New York Academy of Sciences. 1992
- Glick Schiller, N. 'Transnational Perspectives on Migration: Conceptualizing Simultaneity,' *International Migration Review*, vol.38, no.3. 2004
- Hajnal, L. *Roma kanadaban*. In Sik, E. *Roma migracio*. Budapest. MTA. 2002
- Heller, A. *Where are we at home? Thesis Eleven*. 1995
- Kocze A., Rovid M.: *Roma and the politics of double discourse in contemporary Europe*. *Identities*. 2017
- Oakley, A. *Experiments in Knowing: Gender and Method in the Social Sciences*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2000.
- Olwig, K.F. *Travelling makes a home: Mobility and identity among West Indians*. In T. Chapman, & J. Hockey (Eds.), *Ideal homes?* London: Routledge. 1999
- Rolshoven, J. *The Temptations of the Provisional. Multilocality as a Way of Life*. In: *Ethnologia Europa*. Museum Tusculanum Press :: University of Copenhagen. 2017
- Rykwert, J. *House and home*. *Social Research*, 1991
- Saile, D. *The ritual establishment of home*. *Home Environments: Human Behaviour and Environment*. 1985
- Sørensen, N.N., and T. Gammeltoft-Hansen. Introduction. In T. Gammeltoft-Hansen, and N.N. Sørensen (eds), *The Migration Industry and the Commercialization of International Migration*. London, Routledge. 2013
- Skierski, B. *When Hungarian extremists approve: The Harper government vs. the Roma*. *Ipolitics*. 2013 <https://ipolitics.ca/2013/06/20/when-hungarian-extremists-approve-the-harper-government-vs-the-roma/>
- Szelenyi I., Emigh Jean R.: *Poverty, Ethnicity and Gender in Eastern Europe During the Market Transition*. London. Praeger. 2001
- Toth, J. *The Incomprehensible Flow of Roma Asylum-Seekers from the Czech Republic and Hungary to Canada*. CEPS. 2010
- Turner, V. *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure*. Transaction Publishers. 1995
- Walters, W. (2004). *Secure borders, safe haven, domopolitics*. *Citizenship Studies*. 2004
- Yuval-Davis, N. *Press discourses on Roma in the UK, Finland and Hungary*. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 2017