Erzsébet Kovács

THE ENJOYMENT OF THE FOREIGN: "MUSLIM" AND "ITALIAN" RECIPES OF MEDIEVAL AND EARLY MODERN EUROPE

MA Thesis in Late Antique, Medieval and Early Modern Studies

Central European University

Budapest

June 2020

THE ENJOYMENT OF THE FOREIGN: "MUSLIM" AND "ITALIAN" RECIPES OF MEDIEVAL AND EARLY MODERN EUROPE

by

Erzsébet Kovács

(Hungary)

Thesis submitted to the Department of Medieval Studies,
Central European University, Budapest, in partial fulfillment of the requirements
of the Master of Arts degree in Late Antique, Medieval and Early Modern Studies.

Accepted in conformance with the standards of the CEU.

_____
Chair, Examination Committee

_____
Thesis Supervisor

_____
Examiner

_____
Examiner

Budapest
June 2020

THE ENJOYMENT OF THE FOREIGN: "MUSLIM" AND "ITALIAN" RECIPES OF MEDIEVAL AND EARLY MODERN EUROPE

by

Erzsébet Kovács

(Hungary)

Thesis submitted to the Department of Medieval Studies,
Central European University, Budapest, in partial fulfillment of the requirements
of the Master of Arts degree in Late Antique, Medieval and Early Modern Studies.

Accepted in conformance with the standards of the CEU.

_____

External Reader

Budapest
June 2020

THE ENJOYMENT OF THE FOREIGN: "MUSLIM" AND "ITALIAN" RECIPES OF MEDIEVAL AND EARLY MODERN EUROPE

by

Erzsébet Kovács

(Hungary)

Thesis submitted to the Department of Medieval Studies,
Central European University, Budapest, in partial fulfillment of the requirements
of the Master of Arts degree in Late Antique, Medieval and Early Modern Studies.

Accepted in conformance with the standards of the CEU.

_____

External Supervisor

Budapest
June 2020

I, the undersigned, **Erzsébet Kovács**, candidate for the MA degree in Late Antique, Medieval and Early Modern Studies, declare herewith that the present thesis is exclusively my own work, based on my research and only such external information as properly credited in notes and bibliography. I declare that no unidentified and illegitimate use was made of the work of others, and no part of the thesis infringes on any person's or institution's copyright. I also declare that no part of the thesis has been submitted in this form to any other institution of higher education for an academic degree.

Budapest, 8 June 2020

_____

Signature

Abstract

Medieval and Early Modern European cookbooks record a considerable number of recipes, which could be termed ethnonymic, because the dishes' names refer to ethnic and national groups. Out of these texts, the functional and contextual analysis of the "Muslim" and "Italian" recipes reveals a different relationship to ethnic and national identities. The use of modern national dishes tends to be exclusive and conservative (evidenced by, for example, the use of "Croatian," Serbian," and "Bosnian" dishes at peace talks before the start of Yugoslav Wars). As opposed to these modern attitudes, medieval and Early Modern ethnonymic dishes appear to have been transcending boundaries. Their enjoyment does not seem to have threatened the identities of their noble and royal consumers. While they appear to have belonged to the international high fashion of medieval and Early Modern cuisines, the locally and temporally different varieties of "Muslim" and "Italian" dishes show how concepts of the Other changed both in space and time.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Gerhard Jaritz, for all the discussions and his help with German recipes. Little did I know, when he suggested me this research topic, that I was about to begin a journey both in space and time. I also want to thank all my other teachers, not least Katalin Szende, for her kindness and swift assistance in matters paleographic and otherwise.

Heartfelt thanks go to my mother, Kovács F. Gáborné. Her care packages reminded me what home tastes like and how much home-cooked food could mean. In the midst of the Covid-19 epidemic, when even going to the library could be judged inadvisable, eating her stuffed cabbage rolls (made in the Ruszin way, with sweet cabbage leaves) helped to ease the stress and anxiety.

Last but not least, I want to thank my best friends: Andrea Allina Bern, for the chats and her wise observations on history, nationalism, and everything else; and Dávid Horváth, for his personal touch.

Table of contents

Introduction: National Foods, National Identities

In 2009, Slovakian born filmmaker Péter Kerekes's documentary, *Cooking History* (Hungarian title: *Gulyáságyú*),[1] premiered. The movie consists of a string of interviews with military cooks of various nationalities and persuasions; interspersed with short clips in which a helicopter carries a Gulaschkanone to the tunes of Wagner's "Ride of the Valkyries" (well known from Francis Ford Coppola's movie about the Vietnam War, *Apocalypse Now*).

Among German, Russian, and Jewish survivors of the Second World War, French army cooks serving in the Algerian War, and a Hungarian army cook recalling the Hungarian Revolution of 1956, Branko Trbovic, the personal chef to Josip Broz Tito, also gave an interview. The old colonel wistfully reminisces how "Tito was sophisticated. Tito was a gentleman. Everything about him was of the highest standard. His diet, his dining room, how he liked to be served."[2] Curiously resembling medieval royal custom, Colonel Trbovic was employed not just to cook, but also to personally assay all the dishes as regards lack of poisons, dietary value, and not the least, Tito's individual tastes. This is how the disintegration of Yugoslavia looked like from his (the cook's) point of view:

> After [Tito] was gone, a new administration came into power. It was like going backwards to a peasant diet again. They liked village food: a heavy, fatty diet. It wasn't about high standards anymore. […] In 1991 everything started to disintegrate. Even the cuisine turned nationalistic. The diet changed and so did the governments. The state leaders were working on a plan to keep Yugoslavia together. They first met in Split on 28th March 1991. Franjo Tudjman invited them for lunch, and the nationalist games kicked off immediately. He served Dalmatian ham[3] with olives, Croatian village pasta[4] and Dalmatian pot roast.[5] Pretty much all Croatian dishes, things that Serbs would hardly ever eat.

[1] https://www.imdb.com/title/tt1436000/ (accessed May 28, 2020)
[2] I copied this quote (and the following, longer quotes) from the official subtitles released with the movie.
[3] When I watched the movie, I heard him naming *pršut*.
[4] This is how the subtitles translate *Zagorski štrukli*, which is what I heard him saying.
[5] This is how the subtitles translate *Dalmatinska pašticada*, which is what I heard him saying.

The interviewer interrupts him: "Did the Serbs eat the lunch?" Trbovic answers, "I guess so. Everyone has to eat," and goes on with a cook's story of how the Yugoslav Wars started:

> In Belgrade, the Serbs strike back. So Slobodan Milosevic and his wife organise a stereotypical Serbian lunch to get even with the Croats. They start with sour curds, Zlatibor cheese and Serbian polenta, followed by a Karageorgevich steak, named after the exiled Serbian king.[6] And the third meeting was in Sarajevo at Alija Izetbegovic's. He serves Balkan filo pastries, Ottoman-style soup with okra, roast baby goat, and *tufahije*, a sweet Bosnian apple dessert, to finish. The menus show how far they got with their negotiations. From one meeting to the next, it was getting more and more about nationalism and separation and less and less about their meeting to keep Yugoslavia whole.

Even if nationalistic cuisine should equal peasant food according to Colonel Trbovic, could a pan-Yugoslavian meal (say, one specific dish from each state) have symbolically preserved peace, maybe? And yet, in the same segment of the movie, a Croatian army cook, who previously served in the Yugoslavian army, complains about the official cookbook which was used as a guideline for army cooks:

> *Recipes for Military Catering in the Yugoslav National Army*.[7] Everything was in Serbian and that's not my language, my language is Croatian. Roast liver, for instance, they call *restovana džigerica*, while we call it a different name. Or here, sautéed green beans… we have a different name for them. Those are not the Croatian names of the dishes. We, Croats, could never write a book like this. Because the Croats were always second class citizens in the Army. The experts here who got to write this, they were all Serbs.

So, are there, really, no national dishes in the strict sense? Is it, in fact, the different language or the name which would make the same dish either Croatian or Serbian? In the very same segment, Kerekes asked this Croatian cook and two Serbian cooks to choose and make a dish each. While the Croat baked *teleće pečenje*, the Serb women cooked паприкаш/*paprikaš* (cf. Hungarian *paprikás*). As we watch them cook, we slowly realize that both 'nationalistic' dishes are made with nearly the same ingredients: meat, potatoes, onions, oil, paprika, salt. All three cooks added Vegeta, too. This seasoning (a mixture of dried vegetables, salt, and monosodium glutamate) was invented and produced by Podravka, which, even though founded

[6] That is, Карађорђева шницла/*Karađorđeva šnicla*.
[7] *Recepture za pripremanje jela u JNA* (Belgrade: Vojnoizdavački zavod, 1983).

by Croats, was a nationalized Yugoslavian company at the time. (And I do not think there are very many Hungarian cupboards, even now, without a bag of Vegeta, because its monosodium glutamate content gives every dish a more rounded, meaty taste.)

Or are the subtle yet essential nuances, such as the choice of one different ingredient or technique, which make up the national characteristics of a recipe? The Croatian cook chooses veal and cooks it *pod pekom* style, under a lid, in the embers, while the Serbian cooks use pork and make a goulash-style stew in a cauldron. We would not know, however, from this segment that such cooking under a lid and in the embers is practiced in Serbia, as well, but it is called вршник/*vrsnik* or cooking under a сач/*sač*. Neither would we know that meat is cooked in Bosnia in the same way, as well, called *ispod sača*. It is, in fact, a method used in Balkan countries, which may go back to Italian methods of cooking in a *testo*.[8]

The elusiveness of national dishes shows even in Tudjman's festive menu. *Zagorski štrukli* is, in fact, a close relative to Slovene *štruklji*, while the name *pašticada* comes from the Italian, as does the name *pršut*. It would seem that a national dish is, sometimes, a concept, an invention or a performance of national stereotypes rather than a concrete reality.

But then, as Hobsbawm cites Benedict Anderson, the modern nation is an "imagined community."[9] For this Croatian cook, the language and name of a recipe seems to have constituted belonging to the community. As opposed to this modern practice, Hobsbawm proposes that proto-nationalism was rather based on regional or local customs and habits (e.g., religions), 'the holy icons,' and the person of the ruler.[10] Where should we place food on this theoretical grid? Does food have the potential to become a 'holy icon'?

Arguably, only the Jewish dietary rules of *kashrut* would fit Hobsbawm's categories. However, if strict avoidance of other peoples' "symbols and rituals or common collective

[8] See Chapter 2, p. 56.

[9] E. J. Hobsbawm, "Popular Proto-nationalism," in E. J. Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism Since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 46-79: 46.

[10] Hobsbawm, "Popular Proto-nationalism," 68, 71-72.

practices"[11] is what makes a people, the separate identification of all the Christian nationalities of medieval Western Europe will become problematic. Certainly, Jews and Christians held each other unclean. But what to make of the "Parma tarts" of medieval French cookbooks? Or for that matter, the "Saracen soups" and "Turk's heads" of medieval Italian, French, English, and German cookbooks?

Capatti and Montanari have noted that identity may not mean just "belonging to a particular place," but also a "difference in relation to others." Thus, local habits, and also local food transcend boundaries of countries and states assigned by political history, because the very notion of local identity is created at the point of contact and exchange with other cultures.[12] This "permeability of boundaries between countries, regions, places, and products" was also noted by Ferguson.[13] If cross-cultural exchange is already inherent in local or national identity, both cultures have a say in shaping that identity. Capatti and Montanari rightly mention not only contamination and hybridization,[14] but also "that adjectives evoking nationality belong to an outsider's perspective, and it would be more natural for a foreigner in a foreign country to use the expression 'spaghetti all'italiana' (Italian spaghetti) than for an Italian to do so."[15]

It would seem that there are two, different perspectives from which identity can be construed. If nationalism is "a set of idioms, practices, and possibilities available in cultural and political life, delimited by social or physical boundaries" by which the distinctiveness of a nation's people is defined or self-defined,[16] dishes can get national labels in two ways. A Croat

[11] Hobsbawm, "Popular Proto-nationalism," 71.

[12] Alberto Capatti and Massimo Montanari, "Introduction: Identity as Exchange," in Alberto Capatti and Massimo Montanari, *Italian Cuisine: A Cultural History*, trans. Aine O'Healy (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), xiii-xx.

[13] Priscilla Parkhurst Ferguson, "Culinary Nationalism," *Gastronomica: The Journal of Food and Culture* 10: 1 (2010): 102–109.

[14] Capatti and Montanari, "Introduction: Identity as Exchange," xv.

[15] Capatti and Montanari, "Introduction: Identity as Exchange," xix-xx.

[16] Michaela DeSoucey, "Gastronationalism: Food Traditions and Authenticity Politics in the European Union," *American Sociological Review* 75: 3 (2010), 432-455: 434 using the definition for nationalism by Rogers Brubaker, *Nationalism Reframed: Nationhood and the National Question in the New Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 10.

or a Jew may self-define and avoid dishes defined as Serb or *treif*. On the other hand, a modern-day tourist or a customer in a restaurant may gladly reach for a bowl of "Italian pasta."

Trying to apply a structuralist framework on meals in general and Jewish dietary rules in particular, Mary Douglas has pointed out that "whenever a people are aware of encroachment and danger, dietary rules controlling what goes into the body would serve as a vivid analogy of the corpus of their cultural categories at risk."[17] In a more general sense, DeSoucey recalls "the revitalization of practices or items considered traditional during times when old identities are perceived to be in jeopardy."[18]

I believe that these are the circumstances when foods are able to become 'holy icons,' national dishes as the ones expressly chosen and made by the Croatian and Serbian cooks in *Cooking History*. It is the perception of danger which will get one to self-define by avoidance and deny the permeability of boundaries between such similar customs as baking under a lid in several Balkan countries. Similarly, South Korea's "appropriation of kimchi is also a way of asserting its victory over Japan and China in the 'Kimchi Wars'," [19] and the Japanese negative reactions to such hybridization of sushi as the California roll[20] may attest to similar fears.

But also, there might be a relationship between these two, different attitudes. In a somewhat personal essay, Richard Hosking emphasizes the importance of keeping one's own foods in a foreign environment for keeping one's personal identity. At the same time, he recalls, it is good to open up and enjoy foreign foods from time to time.[21] In a similar vein, Caldwell

[17] Mary Douglas, "Deciphering a Meal," in Carole Counihan and Penny Van Esterik, eds. *Food and Culture: A Reader* (New York and London: Routledge, 1997), 36-54.

[18] DeSoucey, "Gastronationalism: Food Traditions and Authenticity Politics in the European Union," 442.

[19] Voltaire Cang, "Policing *Washoku*: The Performance Of Culinary Nationalism In Japan," *Food and Foodways* 27: 3 (2019), 232-252: 238, citing Hong Sik Cho, "Food and Nationalism: Kimchi and Korean National Identity," *The Korean Journal of International Relations* 46: 5 (2006), 207–229.

[20] Cang, "Policing *Washoku*: The Performance Of Culinary Nationalism In Japan," 240.

[21] Richard Hosking, "'The Fishy and Vegetable Abominations Known as Japanese Food'," in Harlan Walker, ed., *Food on the Move: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium on Food and Cookery 1996* (Totnes: Prospect Books, 1997), 127-135: 134.

mentions “the appeal of the foreign,”[22] and Hiroko discusses the Japanese vogue for Western dishes as more refined, more elite than ordinary Japanese food.[23]

What might be the motives for a customer in a restaurant to enjoy Italian pasta, or for a Japanese women’s magazine to include Western or Westernized recipes? Hiroko borrows the concept of ’petit nationalism’ from Kayama Rika, and ’banal nationalism’ from Michael Billig[24] to describe how a liking for certain elements of the Japanese lifestyle (including food) can mean liking ’Japan’.[25] Although Hiroko speaks about the “young Japanese” partaking in this exercise, the underlying motives may be more general and applicable to other cases.

Ichijo and Ranta discuss how, in the national branding of food, they are constructed to convey particular images of what the product and the nation are.[26] In this way, they ’perform the nation’.[27] Although food choices are based on more complex negotiations than that, food projects an image, and nations can be constructed, reified, and reproduced through food.[28] To gain a better understanding of how this process works or might have worked in earlier times, modern analogies of cross-cultural or hybrid food items might be used.

For example, curry powder has been recognized as the simplified, homogenized, ’domesticated’ product of British colonial experience of several different Indian regional dishes prepared by locals.[29] Narayan went further in analysing the ’fabrication’ and use of curry

[22] Melissa L. Caldwell, “The Taste of Nationalism: Food Politics in Postsocialist Moscow,” *Ethnos* 67: 3 (2002), 295-319: 302.

[23] Takeda Hiroko, “Delicious Food in a Beautiful Country: Nationhood and Nationalism in Discourses on Food in Contemporary Japan,” *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism* 8: 1 (2008), 5-29.

[24] Michael Billig, *Banal Nationalism* (London: Sage Publications, 1995).

[25] Hiroko, “Delicious Food in a Beautiful Country: Nationhood and Nationalism in Discourses on Food in Contemporary Japan,” 8.

[26] Atsuko Ichijo and Ronald Ranta, “Introduction,” in Atsuko Ichijo and Ronald Ranta, *Food, National Identity and Nationalism: From Everyday to Global Politics* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 1-18: 6.

[27] Ichijo and Ranta,”Introduction,” 8.

[28] Ichijo and Ranta, “Introduction,” 10.

[29] Katarzyna Cwiertka, “Domesticating Western Food in Japan, a Comparative View,” in Walker, ed., *Food on the Move*, 64-74: 69-72.

powder as a form of eating the 'imagined Indias'.[30] Based on Zlotnick's description,[31] Narayan writes that the British were thus "incorporating the Other into the self, but on the self's terms. They were incorporating not Indian food, but their own 'invention' of curry powder."[32]

Moreover, Narayan makes an interesting point, which recalls the advice given by Richard Hosking on the safe enjoyment of foreign foods. Citing Chaudhuri,[33] Narayan makes a distinction between British colonial officers and their families living in India, and the British residing in England. The same dish had different meanings in the two situations, because the colonisers, "confronted with the proximity of Indians, had to keep their distance."[34] As opposed to their need for separation and avoidance, "[m]aking curry part of native British cuisine in England did not expose British curry eaters to the risk of 'going native'."[35]

Finally and more generally, Narayan arrives at the conclusion that eating ethnic food may sometimes be nothing else than 'food colonialism'. Consumption of exotic food items does not require a detailed knowledge and deep understanding of all the circumstances in which they were produced. Even if an eater makes the effort, "[t]he relationship between 'knowledge' of Others and respect for their cultural differences"[36] does not become an easy matter. Since "a mainstream western eater's cultural knowledge about 'ethnic foods' could be used to constitute herself as a 'colonial savant', adding to her worldliness and prestige," "a superficial sort of intellectual curiosity about the cultural contexts of ethnic foods could, paradoxically, serve to add another element to 'food colonialism'."[37]

[30] Uma Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," *Social Identities* 1: 1 (1995): 63–86.

[31] S. Zlotnick, "Domesticating Imperialism: Curry and Cookbooks in Victorian England," presented at the Interdisciplinary Conference on Food and Culture, University of New Hampshire, March 1994, cited by Narayan, "Eating cultures: incorporation, identity and Indian food," 65.

[32] Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," 65.

[33] N. Chaudhuri, "Shawls, Jewelry, Curry and Rice in Victorian Britain," in N. Chaudhuri and M. Strobel, eds., *Western Women and Imperialism: Complicity and Resistance* (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1992), cited by Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," 66.

[34] Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," 66.

[35] Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," 66.

[36] Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," 77.

[37] Narayan, "Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food," 77.

Reflecting on the rise of curry houses, and newer, more upscale Indian restaurants in Britain, and the origins of the hybrid, Anglo-Indian dish chicken tikka masala, Buettner traces the multiple meanings of Westernized Pakistani and Bangladeshi dishes in a postcolonial, multicultural Britain. It appears that 'going for an Indian' could be, at times, an exercise in nostalgia after the lost Raj, or a superficial expression of "tokenistic,"[38] or (borrowing Stanley Fish's phrase) "boutique multiculturalism,"[39] just a "consumer practice."[40] In the term used by Metro-Roland, it is the "Taco Tuesday dilemma."[41]

In this process, the 'Indian' food served by curry houses as a "hybrid, syncretic cultural form" may be said to reflect more on British than Indian identities.[42] In the experience of eating this food, "a generic, homogenized 'Indianness' is deployed to attract white customers."[43] On the other hand, Buettner also notes that "[f]oreign cuisines not associated with large immigrant groups whose members commonly arrived to work in factories [i.e., Pakistani and Bangladeshi textile workers in Northern England] may well stand better chances of gaining a reputation as cosmopolitan and upscale."[44]

Meanwhile, we should bear in mind that Narayan and Buettner analysed, mostly, those cases when ethnic food was being made, Westernized, and served by ethnic cooks and waiters. However, the originators of the ethnonymic recipes in medieval Western cookbooks might not

[38] Elizabeth Buettner, "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain," *The Journal of Modern History*, 80: 4 (2008), 865 –901: 867.

[39] Buettner, "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain," 869.

[40] Buettner, "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain," 898.

[41] Michelle Marie Metro-Roland, "Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation," *Journal of Heritage Tourism* 8: 2-3 (2013) 172-181: 173.

[42] Buettner, "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain," 870.

[43] Buettner, "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain," 899.

[44] Buettner, "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain," 897, n. 131.

have been ethnic cooks. The recipes for curried dishes in English cookbooks[45] might provide a better analogy in this respect.

Returning to the Gulaschkanone mentioned at the beginning of this Introduction, we may also consider the great number and many variations of goulash recipes in cookbooks other than the ones written by Hungarian authors. The analysis of such recipes led Metro-Roland to notice that even those variations adulterated to, say, American tastes are still held to be Hungarian fare. Still, "the fact remains that within the borders of the country what is recognized as *gulyásleves* is far different than what is recognized outside the borders."[46] Using the American philosopher Charles Sanders Peirce's sign theory, she proposes that food is able to "function synecdochically."[47] Foods can "become significant carriers of culture,"[48] indeed, food can become a sign of culture. Even though paprika came from the Balkans to Hungary, "in the global marketplace […] it is considered an iconic object of the country."[49]

Metro-Roland's article is also a useful reminder that "food is not a cultural object that can be set aside in a vitrine, frozen, so to speak, in space and time at an Ur moment of authenticness [*sic*]."[50] If, as Capatti and Montanari, and Ferguson recognized, geographical boundaries are permeable, (national) foods are fluid in time, too. Looking for the history of the supposedly great French taste for snails, Philip Hyman concluded:

> If indeed 'national' foods exist, their importance can vary from one period to another, and any tendency to generalization based on current tastes is very dangerous business indeed. No permanence can be attributed to taste without thorough investigation even if, perhaps especially if, we are dealing with those that seem to be well established. Neither the availability of a food, nor current attitudes toward it suffice for an understanding of attitudes in the past; hence one must constantly question the stereotypes that cloud our impressions of national food preferences in order to understand the complex relationships that exist between a people and 'their' food.[51]

[45] See those cited by Cwiertka, "Domesticating Western Food in Japan, a Comparative View," 69-72.
[46] Metro-Roland, "Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation," 174. My italics.
[47] Metro-Roland, "Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation," 174.
[48] Metro-Roland, "Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation," 175.
[49] Metro-Roland, "Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation," 177.
[50] Metro-Roland, "Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation," 179.
[51] Philip Hyman, "Snail Trails," in Alan Davidson and Helen Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy: Twenty Years of the Best Food Writing from the Journal* Petits Propos Culinaire (Ten Speed Press, 2002), 196-206: 205.

We have seen from this survey of literature how many and varied, but still nationalistic meanings modern food can take. However, Hyman's observation is also a warning that modern analogies may not be of much use. Since nationalism in its current sense did not exist before modernity, this means that (as Hobsbawm states) medieval peoples had other ways for conceiving and marking their identiti(es). The difference of identity markers and definitions would surely result in different relationships between medieval and Early Modern Europeans, and their 'ethnic foods'.

In the following two chapters, I will analyse two groups of recipes found in medieval and Early Modern Italian, French, Spanish, English, German, Dutch and Hungarian cookbooks. Although there are ethnonymic recipes purporting to derive from more than two ethnicities in these cookbooks, I have chosen the so-called "Muslim" and "Italian" foods, because these two seem to have been the most prominent. For practical reasons, I limited my research from the earliest known European recipe collections to the first Renaissance cookbooks. By way of comparison, I used English translations of Islamic cookbooks. I regret to say that the comparative analysis of Polish or Russian cookbooks awaits someone well versed in these languages (or at least, an English translation).

By reading the recipes as a matter-of-fact list of practical and meaningful instructions, I wanted to understand how the dishes were made on the basis of these recipes. Although the exact provenance or authorship of early cookbooks is often unclear or anonymous, nearly all of them seem to have been composed and/or used in royal, princely, noble or elite burgher households. I considered this, as well, when I wanted also to understand how the dishes functioned and what they could have meant for their 'upper crust' consumers. Similarly to how Thomas A. Wilson mentioned the role of social eating in identity formation, I wanted to see if

this might happening in the Middle Ages, too.[52] In a few cases, I contextualized the recipes by considering literary texts and contemporary popular culture, too. But mostly, I wanted to see if the recipes themselves reveal anything about the complex relationships between medieval and Early Modern Christian Europeans, and their genuine experiences, or just stereotypes of the (Christian or Muslim) Other.

[52] Thomas A. Wilson, "Food, Drink and Identity in Europe: Consumption and the Construction of Local, National and Cosmopolitan Culture," in Thomas A. Wilson, ed., *Food, Drink and Identity in Europe* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2006), 11-30.

Chapter 1. Eel soup and "Turk's head": The "Saracen" foods of the medieval Christian West

Did medieval Western cooking get the inspiration anywhere from? The sudden taste for sugar, almond milk and a variety of exotic spices in medieval Western foodways (as attested by the earliest recipes, written in royal courts) certainly hints to borrowing from Arabic culinary traditions.[53] Moreover, the mere names[54] of recipes such as *mamonia* in the fourteenth-century Italian cookbook *Liber de coquina,* and *maumenee*[55] in English cookbooks indicate that these were, in fact, Western adaptations of the Arabic dish *ma'munia*.[56] Another food scholar, C. Anne Wilson went as far as suggesting that nearly all the characteristics of medieval Western cuisine derive from contact with the Muslims. According to her, techniques such as "frying before boiling," colouring food (to white, green, yellow, red), and endoring; the preference for sweet and sour sauces; and using oranges, lemons, almonds and making marzipan all come from Islamic dishes.[57]

And yet, the pastries, sauces and pease puddings specifically called "Saracen" or "heathen" in medieval Western cookbooks present a thorny problem. For starters, several of these recipes require pork, animal blood or wine, the consumption of which would have been forbidden or problematic for Muslims.[58] This prohibition would have been known to at least some Westerners. For example, Arnold of Lübeck's *Chronica Slavorum* expressly points out

[53] Claudia Roden, "Early Arab Cooking and Cookery Manuscripts," in Davidson and Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy*, 96-108: 101.

[54] Lilia Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World: A Concise History with 174 Recipes*, trans. M. B. DeBevoise, California Studies in Food and Culture (University of California Press, 2007), 44-45.

[55] Constance B. Hieatt and Robin F. Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii.," *Speculum*, Vol. 61, No. 4. (Oct., 1986), 859-882: 872.

[56] C. B. Hieatt, "How Arabic Traditions Travelled to England," in Walker, ed., *Food on the Move*, 120-126: 122.

[57] C. Anne Wilson, "The Saracen connection: Arab cuisine and the medieval West: part 1," in Alan Davidson and Helen Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy*, 109-118.

[58] Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 29-34.

that the original Assassins were allowed to consume pork "despite the law of Saracens."[59] Even if we allow for adaptation, hybridization, or creolization necessitated by a difference of foodstuffs available and tastes present in different geographic locations,[60] none of these recipes seem to really correspond to the ones found in medieval Islamic cookbooks.[61]

Where do we locate the perceived "Saracen"-ness of these recipes, then? Firstly, it should be noted that these recipes are exclusive to Italian, Catalan, English, French and German cookbooks. More precisely, Italian, Catalan, English, and French collections will only have two categories of these recipes: the "Saracen" sauces or soups, and the "Turk's heads." While we find one recipe for "Turk's head" in just one German cookbook, the *buoch von guoter spise*, this and the other German recipe collections will have "heathens' cakes" and "heathens' peas" not found elsewhere. This, in itself, indicates that there might have been a difference of perception of "Saracen"-ness in different Christian countries.

"Brouet Sarrasinois"

According to the definition proposed by Barbara Santich, "'[b]rouet' was the French name for a particular class of dishes which were composed of meat, poultry or fish cooked in a thickened and spiced sauce."[62] We may narrow down this definition. The word occurs in English and Italian recipes, as well, some of which specify that the food is to be poured upon and served with meat. Brouets are recommended in the first and second courses, along with

[59] Cited by Geraldine Heng, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages* (Cambridge University Press, 2018), 131: "carne quoque porcine vescitur contra legem Saracenorum."

[60] Cf. Carol Helstosky, "Introduction: Food and the historian," in Carol Helstosky, ed., *The Routledge History of Food* (London and New York: Routledge, 2015), xxiii.

[61] As a comparison, I used Zaouali's selection and translation of recipes (representing the Baghdad, Syrian, Egyptian, North African and Andalusian styles of medieval Islamic cooking). I also used translations of a Baghdad and an Andalusian cookbook: A. J. Arberry, "A Baghdad Cookery Book," *Islamic Culture* 13 (1939), 21-47 and 189-214; and Charles Perry, trans., "An Anonymous Andalusian Cookbook of the Thirteenth Century," in *A Collection of Medieval and Renaissance Cookbooks, II.* Society for Creative Anachronism, 6th ed., (1993), A1-A80.

[62] Barbara Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," in *Food in the Middle Ages: A Book of Essays*, ed. by Melitta Weiss Adamson (New York and London: Garland, 1995), 78.

roast meat, in the menus some cookbooks contain. It would seem that a brouet could be either a soup or a sauce for meat.

One of the first recipes for Saracen soup is recorded in MSS. A and B of the fourteenth-century Italian cookbook *Liber de coquina*.[63] The Latin recipe requests roast capons, which should be cut up and cooked in wine and sour or bitter juices ("succis agris"),[64] thickened with the livers of the capons and toasted bread, flavoured with unspecified spices and further enriched by adding dates, Greek raisins (or more exactly, Zante currants?), whole blanched almonds and lard. It should be coloured, as well, upon the cook's discretion.[65]

While the use of spices, almonds and dates seems to point towards Arabic origin, the use of wine and lard puts paid to that. Compared with the other soup recipes here (especially nros. 4 and 9), "provincial" or "Provençal" and "Spanish" soup also need to be thickened with poultry livers.[66] Interestingly, the "subtle English soup" recorded in French cookbooks has boar livers for the same purpose.[67] But, the culinary techniques seem to be similar to the ones used

[63] See Bruno Laurioux, "I libri di cucina italiani alla fine del Medioevo: un nuovo bilancio," *Archivio Storico Italiano* 154: 1 (567) (January-March 1996), 33-58 for the *Liber*'s stemma.

[64] The vague expression may denote verjuice (i.e., juice of unripe grapes), or as Capatti and Montanari, *Italian Cuisine*, 94 understand, bitter orange juice.

[65] "II. 8. -- De brodio sarracenio: pro brodio sarraceno, accipe capones assatos et ficatella eorum cum speciebus et pane assato tere bene, distemperando cum bono uino et succis agris. Tunc frange membratim dictos capones et cum predictis mite ad bulliendum in olla, suppositis dactilis, uuis grecis siccis, amigdalis integris mondatis et lardo sufficienti. Colora sicut placet." Thomas Gloning, "Liber de coquina," "Text based upon: Mulon, Marianne: Deux traités inédits d'art culinaire médiéval. In: Bulletin philologique et historique (jusqu'à 1610) du Comité des Travaux historiques et scientifiques. Année 1968: Actes du 93e Congrès national des Sociétés savantes tenu à Tours. Volume I: Les problèmes de l'alimentation. Paris 1971, 369-435; the text of the *Liber de coquina* on p. 396-420."), accessed February 25, 2020, at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/mul2-lib.htm

[66] Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

[67] "Soutil brouet d'Angleterre" in the *Viandier*: "Prené chastaingnez cuitez et pelés, et moiaux de eufs cuis, et ung pou de foie de porc; broier tout ensemble, destrampés d'un pou de eaue tiede; coulez; affinez ingembre, girofle, canelle, ganigal, poivre long, graine de saffren; fetez boullir emsemble." Thomas Gloning, "Viandier -- Bibliothèque cantonale du Valais, Sion, S 108," based upon "Paul Aebischer: Un manuscrit valaisan du 'Viandier' attribué à Taillevent. In: Vallesia 8 (1953) 73-100, hier Seite 85-100."), accessed March 3, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/viandier-sion.htm, and "Sutil brouet d'engleterre. Des chataingnes pellées cuites, et moyeux d'oeufs cuis, et un pou de foye de porc tout broié ensemble, destrempé d'un pou d'eaue tiède ensemble, coullés; affinés poivre lonc, de saffren, et faites boullir tout ensemble." Jérôme Pichon, Georges Vicaire, eds., *Le Viandier de Guillaume Tirel dit Taillevent* (Paris: Techener, 1892), 9.

for poultry and recorded in *Tractatus de modo preparandi et condiendi omnia cibaria* (Italian, fourteenth century).[68]

Still in MSS. A and B of the cookbook *Liber de coquina,* we find a second, alternative recipe for Saracen soup. It is, in fact, a variation on the previous recipe. "If, along with [the previously mentioned ingredients] you also add whole blanched almonds, Greek raisins, dates and such fried along with the previously mentioned onions, it will be called Saracen soup. You can also put in apples and pears," instructs the cookbook.[69] These ingredients are familiar from the first recipe for Saracen soup in the book. Are dates, raisins, in short, fruits, where we should locate "Saracen"-ness? Most importantly, the previous recipe to which they should be added in order to make Saracen soup, is a dish with a distorted Persian name. Fish *scapeta*, "scapeta piscium" seems to be a version of the genuine Persian-Islamic dish *al-sikbāj* with its characteristic method of adding vinegar to fried fish (or meat), then making it sweet and sour with added sweeteners.[70]

In MSS. A and B of the *Liber*'s version, onion rings are to be fried in the oil used for frying the fish, then added along with raisins and prunes, and fried some more. In a characteristically Western method, a sauce is made by pounding blanched almonds or bread crumbs moistened with wine, "selected" spices (depending upon individual taste and availability?), wine or vinegar, then adding it to the fish and boiling altogether. The recipe notes

[68] Thomas Gloning, "Tractatus de modo preparandi et condiendi omnia cibaria," based upon "-- Text: Marianne Mulon: Deux traités inédits d'art culinaire médiéval. In: Bulletin philologique et historique (jusqu'à 1610) du Comité des travaux historiques et scientifiques. Année 1968: Actes du 93e Congrès national des Sociétés savantes tenu à Tours. Volume 1: Les problèmes de l'alimentation. Paris 1971, 369-435. (Tractatus: p. 380-395.)"), accessed March 3, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/mul1-tra.htm

[69] "IV. 3. -- Si cum eisdem addideris amigdalas mondatas integras, uuas grecas passas, dactilos, et similia frissa cum predictis cepis, uocabitur brodium sarracenicum. Potes etiam ponere poma et pira." Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

[70] Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 77. Cf. a thirteenth-century Egyptian recipe for fish *sikbāj* on p. 98.

that it should not be too sour (one can even add grape syrup or sugar, if a sweet and sour taste is wanted); and that one should pour the sauce on the fish when plating the dish.[71]

Adding whole almonds, dates and other fruits would not significantly alter this sweet and sour taste. Although wine would still make this second Saracen soup unsuitable for Muslims, there seem to be common features with these two recipes. Both would have a sweet and sour taste achieved with the combination of sweeteners (raisins, dates, prunes, apples, pears, grape syrup, sugar, even the fried, and possibly, caramelized onions) and souring agents (wine, "succis agris," vinegar). And both would combine this Islamic taste with the Western way of adding pounded almonds or bread crumbs to thicken the sauce. So, did they invent Saracen soup in thirteenth or fourteenth-century Naples by adapting *al-sikbāj*?

A survey of the *Liber*'s other copies and translations may go some way towards answering this question. If these other texts retained the relationship between "scapeta piscium" and Saracen soup established by MSS. A and B, we could say that medieval Western Saracen soup has a genuine claim for authenticity and cross-cultural exchange of foodways.

On his stemma, Laurioux has placed V next to A and B. According to his note and explanation, V denotes MS. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Pal. lat. 1796, which was copied between 1461-1465 by a professor of medicine of Heidelberg.[72] However, this numbering is surely a typographical mistake, since the manuscript containing a version of the *Liber* is actually MS. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Pal. lat. 1768. A read-through reveals that some recipes are missing and their order is jumbled compared to MSS. A and B. MS. Pal. lat. 1768. breaks off after "brodium theotonicum" on fol. 170r, and continues with the fish galantine

[71] "IV. 2. -- De scapeta piscium : ad scabetiam, recipe piscem bene lotum, sicut decet, et cum oleo habundanti frige. Postmodum infrigidatur. Deinde, cepas incisas per transuersum frige in oleo remanenti. Postea, habeas uuas siccas, zenula et pruna, et frige cum cepis predictis simul, et oleum superfluum tollatur. Accipe ettiam electas species et safranum: tere bene simul cum amigdalis mondatis et distempera cum uino et aceto moderato posito, ne sit nimis acrum. Tunc misce simul cum aliis. Et loco amigdalarum, potes ponere micam panis in uino madefactam et postea trittam. Postea, pone super ignem quousque bulliat et statim depone. Et cum piscis in cissorio concauo ordinatus fuerit, saporem predictam sparge desuper. Quod si uolueris ipsum acrum dulce facere, ponas mustum coctum uel zucaram competenter." Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

[72] Laurioux, "I libri di cucina italiani alla fine del Medioevo: un nuovo bilancio," 37-38.

which comes only much later (in IV. 1) in MSS. A and B. In MS. Pal. Lat. 1768, on fol. 170r, only the marginalia inform us that the next recipe is "de scabecia piscium."

There are, mostly, small differences in this recipe compared to the one found in MSS. A and B. According to the text of MS. Pal. Lat. 1768, the blanched almonds are to be fried along with the onions, raisins, and prunes. Here, no pounded almonds would thicken the sauce, so breadcrumbs are recommended. Also, pepper is singled out among all the spices.[73] But most importantly, here, there is no additionary remark about Saracen soup like the one we saw in MSS. A and B.

MS. Pal. Lat. 1768 continues with the recipe for roasted peacocks on fol. 170v. On fol. 171r, we find a recipe for Saracen soup. The marginalia tell us that it is Saracen soup with chickens, "de brodio sarracenico cum gallinis." The recipe is basically identical to the first Saracen soup recipe found in MSS. A and B.[74] But now, this version of the text adds that "in a similar way, make [it] with seawater fish; you can put apples and pears in all the soups."[75] It looks like a notion of Saracen soup made with fish *scabecia* has crept into this text, since it mentions seawater fish and the apples and pears to be added. But also, there is uncertainty: the addition doesn't even name *scabecia* and it would like to have apples and pears added to *every* soup.

[73] "Item aliter recipe piscem bene lotum sicut decet et cum oleo habundanti frige postmodum infrigidatur deinde cepas incisas per transuersum frige in oleo remanenti postremo habeas amigdulas mundas uuas siccas Ienula [?] et pruna et frige cum cepis predictis simul et oleum superfluum tollatur Accipe etiam piper cum zafrano et alijs speciebus electis bene tritis et distempera eas et cepas predictas cum uino et aceto moderate posito ne sit nimis forte et potes ponere micam panis in uino madefactam et postea tritam bene postea pone super ignem quousque bulliat et statim depone Talis super [sapor?] in alio uase ponatur et cum pisce predicto et speciebus ad solarium ordinetur Et si uolueris ipsum acrum dulce facere ponas mustum coctum uel zucaram conpetenter" Fol. 170r-v, accessed April 26, 2020 at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768

[74] "Pro brodio sarracenico Accipe capones assatos et ficatella ipsorum cum speciebus et pane assato tere in mortario distemperando cum bono vino et succis agris tunc frange membratim dictos capones et cum predictis mitte ad bulliendum in olla suppositis dactilis uiuis [!] grecis siccis amigdalis integris mundatis et lardo sufficienti colora sicut placet et da comedere" Fol. 171r-v, accessed April 26, 2020 at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768

[75] "Simili modo fac de piscibus marinis poma et pira potes ponere in omnibus brodijs." Fol. 171v, accessed April 26, 2020 at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768

On Laurioux's stemma, Z is one rung below MSS. A, B, and V. According to Laurioux's note, MS. Z is *Libro de la cocina,* an Italian translation held in Bologna (MS. Biblioteca dell'Università, 158).[76] This translation speaks of just "fish soup," *del brodo del pesce* (two recipes), without any mention of *scabecia* or Saracen soup.[77] Actually, the recipe for Saracen soup seems to come much later in the book. *Del brodo sarracenico* instructs one to cook roasted and dismembered capons in a sauce made with their livers, spices, bread, white wine, "bitter juices," dates, Greek grapes, prunes, whole blanched almonds, lard. It also can be made with seawater fish and added apples and pears.[78] But the name itself turns out to be Zambrini's conjecture. The codex reads just *sarta cenito,*[79] as if, by the time or place of translating the Neapolitan *Liber,* the name Saracen did not make much sense to the translator or the scribe.

The *Libro de la cocina* has a separate recipe for "galantine of fish made without oil." Fish is to be cooked in wine and vinegar, then (raw?) onion rings are boiled in the cooking liquid along with saffron, cumin, and pepper. The resulting cold dish is called *schibezia di tavernaio*.[80]

[76] Laurioux, "I libri di cucina italiani alla fine del Medioevo: un nuovo bilancio," 38. Fol. 93r-102rb are ed. by Francesco Zambrini, *Il libro della cucina* (Bologna: Presso Gaetano Romagnoli, 1863) and Frankwalt Möhren, *Il libro de la cocina: Un ricettario tra Oriente e Occidente* (Heidelberg University Publishing, 2016).

[77] "Del brodo del pesce. Pesce bene lavato, quanto si conviene: friggilo con l'oglio abbundantemente, poi lassa freddare: poi abbi cipolle tagliate per traverso; friggile con oglio rimanente del pesce: poi prendi amandole monde, uva secca, ienula secca e prugne, e friggi con le dette cipolle insieme, e leva via l'oglio che avanza, e togli pepe e zaffarano, e altre spezie elette, bene trite, e distempera con le cipolle predette, e vino e aceto; e, distemperato fortemente, metti a fuoco fino che bolla: poi levalo dal fuoco, e poni in altro vaso, e mettilo ordinatamente a solaio col pesce predetto. E se 'l volessi dolce, ponvi o vino cotto, o zuccaro competentemente. Altramente. Togli buono vino e un poco d'aceto e bolla insieme e sciuma: poi mettivi il pesce a cocere; e, cotto, cavalo; e il vino tanto bolla, che torni al terzo: poi mettici alloro, zaffarano e spezie fine, e fà riscaldare il pesce, e cola il vino e ponvi spico, e lassa freddare il pesce." Zambrini, *Il libro della cucina,* 29-30.

[78] "Togli caponi arostiti; e i fegati loro, con le spetie e pane abrusticato, trita nel mortaio, e distempera con buono vino biancho e succhi agri; e poi smembra i detti capponi, e metti a bollire con le predicte cose in una pentola; e mettivi su dattali, uve grece, prugne secche, amandole monde intere, e lardo sufficiente; e dà a mangiare. Simile modo fa de pesci marini. Pome e pere poi ponere nei detti brodi." Möhren, *Il libro della cucina,* 155.

[79] Zambrini, *Il libro della cucina,* 94.

[80] "De la gelatina di pesci senza oglio. Metti a bullire vino con aceto, e mettivi dentro a cocere i pesci bene lavati; e, cotti, cavali e poni in un altro vaso. E in lo detto vino e aceto metti cipolle tagliate per traverso, e fà tanto bullire, che torni alla terza parte: poi mettivi dentro zaffarano, comino e pepe, e getta tutto sopr' al pesce cotto, e lassa freddare. Questa è schibezia di tavernaio." Zambrini, *Il libro della cucina,* 75.

This distinction between *schibezia* and Saracen soup is also characteristic of MS. Sankt Florian, Augustiner-Chorherrenstift Stiftsbibliothek, XI. 100 (MS. S on Laurioux's stemma and in Adamson's edition).[81] The separate recipes for *schibecia*[82] and *brodum saracenicum*[83] both leave out the sweet fruits; the recipe for the latter keeps only the dates, whole, as a spectacular garnish.

Not only does the characteristic sweet-and-sour taste disappear by the time the latest copies of the *Liber de coquina* were made, it would also seem that only the earliest MSS., that is, A and B make the connection between Westernized *al-sikbāj* and Saracen soup. This connection may have been either an adaptation of the Islamic recipe or a locally characteristic substitution for the genuine article. Be as it may, the disappearance of the sweet-and-sour taste raises the question: which ingredients or method were seen as "Saracen" by the time of the latest manuscripts?

Possibly, the use of exotic spices might have indicated "Saracen"-ness. Still, most recipes in the *Liber de coquina* MSS. do not specify which spices are to be used exactly, while the recipe for "provincial" or "Provençal" soup in MSS. A and B expressly asks for such Eastern spices as cinnamon, cloves, nutmeg, cardamom, galingale, and ginger. Some of these spices and raisins are still used for a Venetian "salsa sarasinesca" in the fourteenth century.

[81] Laurioux, "I libri di cucina italiani alla fine del Medioevo: un nuovo bilancio," 37-38.; Melitta Weiss Adamson, "Mediterranean Cuisine North of the Alps," in Katharina Boll and Katrin Wenig, eds., *kunst und saelde: Festschrift für Trude Ehlert* (Würzburg: Königshausen & Neumann, 2011): 239-258.

[82] "35. Ad schibecias de carnibus castratinis ad comedendum calidas accipe et suffrige carnes sicud supra et superpone cepas incisas per transuersum et ponatur ad sufficientiam superposito pipere et cum Croco et aqua cum aceto sufficienter et cum mica panis fac spissum et comede et cum fuerint bene decocte super addantur cum pitella de cepis paruulis et fac decoqui etc." Adamson ("Mediterranean Cuisine North of the Alps," 254) notes that the recipe is parallel with recipe 43 in MS. C (Châlons-sur-Marne, Bibliothèque Municipale, MS. 319) and recipe 25 xxiii in MS. M (MS. L in Laurioux's stemma, Sorengo (Lugano), Biblioteca Internazionale di Gastronomia, inv. 1339, ed. by Ingemar Boström, *Anonimo meridionale: Due libri di Cucina*, Acta Universitatis Stockolmiensis, Romanica Stockolmiensia, 11 (Stockholm, 1985)).

[83] "38. Ad faciendum brodum saracenicum accipe capones assatos et feccata eorum cum speciebus et pane assato tere in mortario distemperato cum vino bino et succis agrestibus tunc frage membratim dictos capones et cum predictis mitte ad buliendum in olla et superpositis dactilis integris mundatis et lardo sufficienti et zucora et colora sicud vis et commede etc." Adamson ("Mediterranean Cuisine North of the Alps," 254) notes that the recipe is parallel with recipe ii 8 in MSS. A and B, recipe 63 in MS. C, recipe 27 xxv in MS. M (MS. L in Laurioux's stemma), recipe 74 in MS. T (MS. Z in Laurioux's stemma), and recipe 61 in MS. V.

The *Anonimo Veneziano*'s version for Saracen sauce asks for almonds, raisins, ginger, cinnamon, cloves, grains of paradise, cardamom, galingale, nutmeg, and verjuice.[84]

Meanwhile, French recipes for Saracen soup from the 1300's also omit sweeteners. The "brouet Saraginois" of two MSS. of the *Viandier,*[85] "brouet Sarrasinois" of the *Ménagier de Paris*[86] and the "sarraginée" of the *Enseignements*[87] are almost identical. Both the *Viandier* and the *Ménagier* ask for eels salted and fried in oil, then spiced with ginger, cloves, cinnamon, grains of paradise, galingale, and long pepper, made sour with verjuice (and the *Viandier* adds wine, as well), and yellow with saffron. The recipe of the *Enseignements* is a bit different, though, in its flavouring: it uses cinnamon, spikenard, and cloves, and it adds bread and sugar. Out of all these exotic and expensive spices, a French preference for grains of paradise has already been noted.[88]

But, eels as an ingredient in these French recipes is even more puzzling. There do not seem to be very many Islamic recipes for eels.[89] The thirteenth-century Andalusian cookbook *Kitāb Fadālat al-khiwān fī tayyibāt al-taʿām wa-l-alwān* ("Book of the Excellent Table

[84] "LXXXVIII. Salsa sarasinesca. Se tu voy fare salza sarasinescha toy mandolle, uva passa, zenzevro, cenamo e garofalli e melegette, gardamono, galanga e noce moscate; masena ogni cossa inseme e distempera con agresta; questo è bon savore." Ludovico Frati, ed., *Testi antichi di gastronomia: Libro di cucina del secolo XIV*. (Livorno: Arnaldo Forni, 1899).

[85] "Brouet saraginois. Escorchiez anguillez, poudrez de cel ; frisiez en huille ; prenez gingembre, girofle, canele, graine, garingal, poivre long, saffren, deffaite de vin et de verjus ; faitez boullir emsemble, et vos anguillez avec : et ne soit pas trop liant : il ce lie de ly mesmez." (Gloning, "Viandier -- Bibliothèque cantonale du Valais, Sion, S 108.") and "Brouet Sarrasinois. Prenez canelle, poivre long, et saffren pour luy donner coulleur, deffait de vin et de verjus, et faictes tout boullir ensemble, et vos anguilles avec; et ne soit pas trop liant; car il se lye de luy mesmes." (Vatican MS., see Jérôme Pichon, Georges Vicaire, eds., *Le Viandier de Guillaume Tirel dit Taillevent* (Paris: Techener, 1892), 238.)

[86] "Brouet Sarrasinois. Escorchiez l'anguille et découppez par bien menus tronçons, puis pouldrez de sel et frisiez en huile; puis broyez gingembre, canelle, giroffle, graine, garingal, poivre long et saffran pour donner couleur, et de vertjus, et boulir tout ensemble avec les anguilles qui d'elles mêmes font lioison." (Jérome Pichon, ed., *Le Ménagier de Paris, traité de morale et et d'économie domestique composé vers 1393 par un bourgeois Parisien* (Paris: Société des Bibliophiles François, 1846).), accessed March 3, 2020 at https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k83110x

[87] "Se vos volez fère sarraginée, prenez anguilles, si les escorchiez e puis si les depechiez par morsaus, e les salez, e frisiez ensemble; puis prenez pain e çucre, e bréez tout ensemble et destrempez de vin e de verjus, e metez tout boullir oveques les anguilles, puis prenez canèle, e espic, e girofle, e tout ce bréez ensemble, e le destrempez d'un poi de vin aigre, puis le metez ovec les anguilles, e couvrez bien, e traez arrière du feu." (Bibl. Nationale Ms. Lat. 7131, see Pichon and Vicaire, eds., *Le Viandier de Guillaume Tirel dit Taillevent,* 123.)

[88] Bruno Laurioux, "De l'usage des épices dans l'alimentation médievale," *Médiévales* 5 (1983): 15-31.

[89] Cf. Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World,* 96-105; Arberry, "A Baghdad Cookery Book;" and Perry, "An Anonymous Andalusian Cookbook of the Thirteenth Century."

Composed of the Best Foods and the Best Dishes"), written by Ibn Razīn, includes "*murūj*: a recipe for every type of fish," instructing the cook to "[t]ake some fish, big or small, with scales or without." The chopped and salted fish is to be cooked in a sauce of vinegar, *murrī*, olive oil and spices. "Another way," adds the cookbook, "with sardines and eels, do the same thing but with a sauce of coriander [seeds], crushed garlic, and a little vinegar."[90]

Their lack of scales would have made them unclean under Jewish dietary law, certainly. This seems to have been a problem for Muslims, too, because "the Iranians, […] having their own opinion on this subject, had to devise a *fatwa* making it lawful to eat sturgeon, which caused offense for its lack of scales)."[91] On the other hand, eels were not mentioned in Qurʾanic prohibitions. "Ambiguous creatures such as lizards and eels have long been the subject of Islamic legal debate."[92] Ibn ʿAbbās could say: "The Jews do not eat the eel, but we do."[93] Apparently, eels were a problematic ingredient for Muslims, just as wine was. Depending on local authorities and customs, their use could be tolerated; and maybe this was the case in Andalusia.[94]

But I believe that here, we may be faced with a stereotype evidenced also in literary sources. The fifteenth-century English romance *Sowdane of Babylone* (a heavily rewritten version of older French *chansons de geste*) has its Sultan, Laban, sack the city of Rome with his son, Ferumbras, then eat serpents fried in oil back home, at the victory feast:

> Ferumbras to Seinte Petris wente,
> And alle the Relekes he seased anooñ
> The Crosse, the Crowñ, the Nailes bente;
> He toke hem with him everychone.
> He dide dispoile al the Cite
> Both of tresoure and of goolde, 668
> And after that brente he

[90] Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 99.

[91] Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 30.

[92] Rose Wellman, "In a Basiji Kitchen: Halal Jello, Biomorality, and Blessing in the Islamic Republic of Iran," *Gastronomica* 20: 1 (2020), 23–33: 24, referring to Cook, "Early Islamic Dietary Law."

[93] Michael Cook, "Early Islamic Dietary Law", *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, 7 (1986), 218–277: 243, cited by Shaheed Tayob, "Consuming, Producing, Defining Halal: Halal Authorities and Muslim Consumers in South Africa," MA thesis, University of Cape Town (2012), 7. I could not access Cook's article.

[94] Ibn Razīn's cookbook has another recipe for "fillets of fish with cumin and saffron," which expressly instructs to "[u]se fish without scales." (Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 102.)

Alle þat ever myght be tooled.
And alle the tresoure witħ hem þai bare
To the Cite of Egremour᾽.
Laban the Sowdoñ soiourned there
Thre monþes and thre dayes more
In myrtħ and Ioye and grete solas.
And to his goddes offrynge he made,
He and his sone Sir Ferumbras
Here goddis of golde dide fade,
Thai brente Frankeñsense,
That smoked vp so stronge,
The Fume in her presence,
It lasted alle alonge.
Thai blewe hornes of bras,
Thai dronke beestes bloode.
Milke and hony ther was,
That was roial and goode.
Serpentes in Oyle were fryed
To serve þᵉ Sowdoñ with alle,
(lines 664-688.)[95]

Note that the Muslims of the poem also feast on animal blood, forbidden under Islamic dietary law. There is also milk and honey, which appear to have been considered stereotypically Muslim enjoyments by the Spanish.[96] Although eels seem the perfect edible substitute for snakes, they feature only in these three French recipes, not in the English ones for the Saracen soup or sauce. If there is a connection, did the earlier French *chanson de geste* have this feast description? If not, is the later English text a back-formation based on the already existing eel soups? *Non liquet*.

Considering that two of the French varieties need to be saffron yellow, it is even more surprising that the first English recipe of this sort is for "browet Sarasyneys blanc," that is, "white Saracen soup" (in the B.L. MS. Royal 12.C.xii).[97] This variety of Saracen soup is made with cow milk, thickened with eggs and spiced with lots of ginger powder. The recipe points

[95] Emil Hausknecht, ed., *The Romaunce of The Sowdone of Babylone and of Ferumbras his Sone who conquerede Rome*. Re-edited from the unique MS. of the late Sir Thomas Phillipps, with Introduction, Notes, and Glossary, The English Charlemagne Romances, Part V (London: Published for the Early English Text Society, 1881). Cf. Heng, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages*, 219.

[96] Olivia Remie Constable, "Food and Meaning: Christian Understandings of Muslim Food and Food Ways in Spain, 1250-1550," *Viator* 44, 3 (2013): 199-236. Cf. Heng, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages*, 132 on the description of the Quranic paradise in Mandeville's *Travels*.

[97] Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii.," 867.

out that it is made "in the season of new apples" and it is white.[98] The recipe is practically the same in the later (but still fourteenth-century) collection of B.L. MS. Additional 46919,[99] although this one mentions only "in time of appleen."

The use of cow milk is quite unusual in the context of other medieval Western recipes, which mostly requested almond milk. This dairy substitute had all the healthfulness of almonds (listed in dietetic texts) and none of the disadvantages of animal milk, which would have gone sour quickly. We may pinpoint fresh cow milk as a distinctly luxury (since perishable) ingredient – and also (in light of the *Sowdane of Babylone* feast description) one having Saracen connotations.

Since the recipe mentions no colouring ingredient, the use of milk would make it white, of course (although this colour would present problems, as we shall see with the later recipes for Saracen soup), but what do we make of the "in time of appleen" part? Hieatt and Jones believe that the allusion may mean that apples are also an ingredient.[100] Since the recipe does not expressly say so, and apples do not feature in any of the English "Saracen" recipes, I interpret it as alluding to autumn. The fall season is not only when apples are fresh, it would also have been an intermediate time between summer and winter, when contemporary dietetics (based on humoral theory) advised the consumption of heating foodstuffs, such as ginger. A white dish would also have been suitable for this intermediate season, as opposed to the red dishes recommended for winter consumption (as we shall see later).

Still in the fourteenth century, we have three English recipes for "Bruet of sarcynesse" (in the Douce MS. 257), "Sawse Sarzyne" (in *The Forme of Cury*), and "Saunc Sarazine" (in

[98] "Let de vache lyé ou eofs, gingyvre triee grant plenté; en temps de poumes neoves; colour, blaunk." Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii.," 867.

[99] "Bruet Sarazineys blanc. Milke of cow ilied wyþ ayren & gyngeer itried gret plentee; in time of appleen, þe colour qwyt." (Constance B. Hieatt and Sharon Butler, eds., *Curye on Inglysch: Middle English recipes*,)

[100] Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii.," 872.

the B.L. MS. Sloane 468). The "Bruet of sarcynesse" has none of the previously mentioned ingredients. The recipe asks for fresh beef to be cut up and fried in fresh grease, along with bread. Then the pre-fried meat and bread pieces are boiled in wine spiced with sugar and powder of cloves, just until the wine evaporates. It is then cooked ready in almond milk flavoured with cubebs, mace, and cloves. No colouring is mentioned, but the toasted bread added to it at the start would have made it brownish and also quite thick. Here, the text makes it explicit that it is intended as a sauce poured upon the pieces of beef that were cooked in it.[101]

"Sawse Sarzyne" has similarities and differences both. In a quaint English way, it requires a local ingredient: rose hips. The cleaned hips are to be pounded in a mortar with blanched almonds that were previously fried in oil. The resulting paste (presumably rose coloured) is made thin with strong, sweet red wine, spiced with sugar and *poudre fort*, then thickened with rice flour so that it should not be runny. It is, then, coloured with alkanet, although the recipe does not instruct to previously fry the *Alkanna tinctoria* root in oil, as in other recipes (since the dye does not take in water). Possibly, the oil content of the almonds might have been just as good for the purpose. Alkanet makes a blue colour in an alkali environment, while it turns red in an acidic environment – presumably, the ascorbic acid content of the rose hips would have provided just that. The instruction that the sauce (or mush) is garnished with pomegranate seeds may indicate that it is also red. The recipe specifies that this is a Lenten dish; on flesh days, boiled capon meat can be added to it.[102]

[101] "Tak the lyre of þe fresch buf & bet it al in pecis, & bred, and fry yt in fresch gres; tak it up & drye it, and do yt in a vessel, wyth wyn, and sugur, and powdr of clowys; boyl yt togedere, tyl the flesch have drong the liycour, and tak the almande mylk, and quibibz, macis, and clowys, and boyle hem togeder; tak the flesch, and do therto, and messe yt forth." Richard Warner, *Antiquitates Culinariae, or Curious Tracts relating to the Culinary affairs of the Old English, With a preliminary discourse, Notes, and Illustrations* (London, 1791), 44. (I omitted Warner's interjections.)

[102] "Take heppes and make hem clene. Take almandes blanched. Frye hem in oile and bray hem in a mortar, with heppes. Drawe it up with rede wyne, and do thereinne sugar ynowhg with powdor fort. Lat it be stondyng, and alay it with floer of rys, and color it with alkenet and messe it forth; and florish it with pome garnet. If thou wilt, in flesshe day, seeth capons, and take the brawn, and tese hem smal, and do thereto, and make the lico of this broth." Warner, *Antiquitates Culinariae*, 17. (I omitted Warner's interjections.)

"Saunc Sarazine" reads like a simplified version of this previous recipe. Here, only blanched almonds are required, fried in olive oil and pounded in a mortar, mixed with good, thick almond milk and wine. If it is still runny, rice flour or starch is added to it. It is coloured with alkanet again, and re-heated, but since no mention is made of ingredients such as rose hips (or of flavouring), one wonders about the colour of the finished dish. In any case, it is garnished with pomegranate seeds, as well.[103]

A fifteenth-century English recipe for "Browet sarsyn" (in the B.L. MS. Arundel 335) presents a variation of the above. Here, the almond milk is made with the pre-fried, blanched almonds and beef broth to begin with. Spiced with cloves, mace, minced ginger, pine nuts, and Zante currants, thickened with bread (which was previously moistened in sweet, not acidic wine), sweetened with sugar, this serves as a sauce for parboiled and fried *volailles* such as coney rabbit or partridge. The text does not forget to add that commoners get only pieces of meat, but the lord should be served the whole rabbit or bird. In both cases, the meat is cooked ready in the sauce, then the dish is coloured with red sandalwood and saffron. Vinegar and a solution of cinnamon powder and wine is added to it, presumably as a final correction of taste, and re-heated. Note that this sauce needs to remain runny, and it now has lots of ginger powder sprinkled upon.[104]

Still in the fifteenth century, "Bruette Sareson" (in the Harleian MS. 279) reads like a skeleton version of this recipe. Rice flour, pork, and boiled capon or ground chicken meat is

[103] "Tak blaunched almaundes & frye hem in oyle dolyf & þan bray hem wel in a mortere & tempere hem with thikke almound melk & with wyn & þe thridde part cuegre; & if it be noȝt þikke ynow, lye it with floure of rys or with amodyne & coloure it with alconet, & boyle it. & whan it is dressed florsche it aboue with pumme garnet." (Hieatt and Butler, *Curye on Inglysch*.)

[104] "Browet sarsyn. Take almondes and bray hom, and tempur up with brothe of beef, and make gode thikke mylk, and do hit in a pot; and do therto clowes, maces, and pynes, and raisynges of corance, and mynced gynger, and let hit sethe; and take bred, and stepe in swete wyne, and drawe hit up and do therto, and put therto sugur; then take conynges and parboyle hom, or rabettes, or squerelles and fry hom, and partriches parboilet; also fry hom al hole for a lorde; and elles choppe hom on gobettes, and when thai byn almoste fryet, cast hom into the pot, and let hom boyle al togedur, and colour hit with saunders and saffron; and do therto vynegur, and pouder of canel streynet with wyn, and gyf hit a boyle; and then take hit from the fyre, and loke the pottage be rennynge, and cast therein a gode dele of poudur of gynger, and serve hit forth, a hole conynge, or a rabet, or a squerel, or a partriche, for a lorde." Warner, *Antiquitates Culinariae*, 60.

cooked in almond milk. It is garnished with a sprinkling of ginger powder and sugar only when served.[105] The other recipe for "Sauke Sarsoun" in the same manuscript is more detailed, if quite different from the first one. Here, blanched almonds are to be fried in oil, pounded in a mortar, and mixed with almond milk, wine, and one-thirds of sugar. If this gruel is not thick enough, instructs the recipe, thicken it with alkanet (!) Then serve it with a garnish of pomegranate seeds.[106] This instruction is, surely, a confusion of the correct recipe given for "Saug saraser" in the Laud MS. 553.[107]

The Wagstaff Miscellany (in the Beinecke MS. 163) has no less than three recipes for Saracen soup or sauce. The first one in the manuscript, "pylets yn sarcene," is especially interesting because it seems to show how one can innovate on a well-known, traditional recipe. The dish consists of meatballs, "pylets" or pellets, made with pork or mutton, spiced with pepper, saffron, and salt, held together with eggs and cooked in a broth. The innovation is precisely that these meatballs are then served "yn sarcene," in a Saracen sauce, which seems by now to be a category distinct enough to hold on its own. Its recipe is familiar, too: almond milk is made with broth, the same as in which the meatballs were cooked, then flavoured with pepper powder, cinnamon, cloves, mace, ginger, made sour with verjuice, sweetened with Zante currants, sweet wine, sugar and coloured with red sandalwood. It is especially interesting

[105] "lxvj. Bruette Sareson.—Take Almaundys & draw a gode mylke, & flowre of Rys, & Porke & Brawen of Capoun y-sode, or Hennys smale y-grounde, & boyle it y-fere, & do in-to þe mylke; & þan take pouder Gyngere, Sugre, & caste a-boue, an serue forth." Thomas Austin, ed., *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books: Harleian MS. 279 (ab 1430), & Harl. MS. 4016 (ab. 1450), with extracts from Ashmole MS. 1439, Laud MS. 553, & Douce MS. 55* (London: Published for the Early English Text Society, 1888; repr. London: Oxford University Press, 1964), 19.

[106] "Take Almaundys, & blaunche hem, & frye hem in oyle oþer in grece, þan bray hem in a Mortere, & tempere hem with gode Almaunde mylke, & gode Wyne, & þen þe þrydde perty schal ben Sugre; & ȝif it be noȝt þikke y-nowe, a-lye it with Alkenade, & Florche*. [Flourish; garnish.] it a-bouyn with Pome-garned, & messe it; serue it forth." Austin, *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books*, 30.

[107] "Tak Almandes, frye hem in oille, & bray hem, tempre hem with almand mylke & red wyn, & ye thrudde perty shal be sugur / & if hit be noȝt thikke ynow, lie it with amydoɲ or with flour de rys; colour hit with alkinet, boille hit, dresse it, florissh hit aboue with pomme-garnet, and ȝif forth." Austin, *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books*, 113.

that this red colour is, by now, also a distinct category on its own: "sarcene colour." The recipe instructs the cook to "loke thy most colour be of hys owne kynde."[108]

The other two recipes for Saracen soup in the Wagstaff Miscellany read as variations on how to make this sauce. "Bruet sarcenes" uses venison broth for drawing the almond milk, cloves and "poudyr" for the strong, spicy taste, wine and sugar to make sour and sweeten, and alkanet for the red colour. Onions are added (raw or fried, it is not known, though) and rye (or rice?) flour to thicken.[109] "Sauce sarcenes" combines almond milk, broth, rye (or rice?) flour, sugar, ginger, mace, cubebs, cinnamon. Interestingly, no souring agent is present in the recipe, and its colour is just yellow with saffron.[110]

This last recipe has a better parallel in the fifteenth-century manuscript Holkham MSS. 674. In it, "sauce sairsnet" requires almond milk, broth or wine, rice flour, sugar, ginger, mace, cubebs, cinnamon. Vinegar gives a more sour taste, saffron and alkanet provide colour.[111]

On the other hand, John Crophill's Commonplace Book (in the Harley MS. 1735) has a recipe for "Browet of Sarasynes" without the use of almond milk. A substitute liquid is drawn

[108] "Pylets yn sarcene Take fresch porke or motyn sodyn peke out the bonys hew the flesch small & grynd hit smal yn a morter and temper hit with eyron yn the gryndyng put ther to pepyr safferyn & salt take fresch broth clene tryed set yt on the fyre in large vessell lete hit boyle then sesyn hit with the same colour then make smal rounde ballys put hem yn a boylyn broth & lete hem boyle ther yn tyll they be y now then take hem vp lete hem drye lete thy broth keyl blow of the fat take almondys wesch hem temper hem vp with the same broth draw ther of a kynd mylke put the mylke in a swete potte set hit on the fyre put ther to powdyr of pepyr & canel & a pertyon of sawndrys to colour hit sarcene colour loke thy most colour be of hys owne kynde put ther yn clowys macys reysons of coraunce lete hit boyle as thu seyyst that good ys yf hit be tt thike a lay hit with swete wyne and do ther to sigur when thy spycez beth tender put yn peletys in the same broth ȝyf hym atarage of poudyr of pepyr of gynger and vergys & serue forth the pelets with the bruet iij or iiij yn a dysche as a potage for the secunde course" Fol. 58v-59r accessed April 26, 2020 at https://brbl-zoom.library.yale.edu/viewer/1013023 and https://brbl-zoom.library.yale.edu/viewer/1013024

[109] "Bruet sarcenes Take venyson boyle hit trye hit do hit yn a pott take almond mylke drawyn vp with the same brothe cast ther yn onyons & a ley hit vp withe floure of rye & caste yn clovys aftyr the boylyng take hit don sesyn hit vp with poudyr wyn & sygure & coloure hit with alekenet." Fol. 62r accessed April 26, 2020 at https://brbl-zoom.library.yale.edu/viewer/1013030

[110] "Sauce sarcenes Make a thykke mylke of almondys do hit in a pot with floure of rye safron gynger macys quibibis canel sygure & rynse the bottom of the disch with fat broth boyle the sewe byfore & messe hit forth" Fol. 62v accessed April 26, 2020 at https://brbl-zoom.library.yale.edu/viewer/1013031

[111] "Sauce sairsnet To mak sauce sairsnet tak thik almond mylk and put it in a pott with flour of rise saffron maces guingere quybibes canelle and sugur and wet the botom of the disshes with swet brothe or withe wyne and put ther to hole maces and sesson it up with sugur venygar good pouder and guinger strawed with alkened and serve it." Mrs Alexander Napier, ed., *A Noble Boke off Cookry Ffor a Prynce Houssolde or Eny Other Estately Houssolde*: Reprinted Verbatim from a Rare Ms. in the Holkham Collection (London: Elliot Stock, 1882), 94.

with ground bread crust, blood, and broth. This liquid is mixed with red wine, and thickened (but with what?) to provide a cooking liquor for roasted and quartered small birds. It is flavoured with powder of cloves and cubebs, sweetened with sugar, and has grease added to it.[112]

As we have seen, the so-called "Saracen" sauces are made with diverse and quite often, luxury ingredients such as fresh cow milk, sugar, strong, sweet wine or a variety of exotic, imported spices. In some cases, fancy meats such as capon are used. With one exception, all English sauces are to be coloured deep red. I believe that all of these will factor in the perception of the dishes as something exquisite and this might, then, be perceived as exotic, Eastern, wondrous, "Saracen." The colour red itself was associated with the Saracens,[113] but there are also other indications as to this colour.

The previous recipe in the B.L. MS. Arundel 335 collection, for "Tuscan soup," notes that the cook may want or need to change the colour. If so, add red sandalwood and saffron (the same as used for the next recipe, the Saracen soup in the same collection), and "make the pottage blood red [as appropriate] for the winter."[114] Contemporary dietetics would have advised the consumption of heating (spicy, sweet, red, Eastern, "Saracen") food in the cold season. But also note how fluid these categories are. The ingredients for "Tuscan" soup are

[112] "Browet of sarasynes Tak crustes of qwyt bred & blood & do it in a morter & grynd it & tempre it with swet broth & draw it thorow a clotz & do it in a pot & do yer in red wyn set it on ye fyer & lye it & boylle it tak perterkes & wodekokes & oyer smale brydes & rost hem & qwirter hem & do hem in a pot & do yer to god poudre of clowes & qwybybes & sugre & sethz it do yer in wyth grece & tast it & dresse it." Fol. 24r-24v accessed April 27, 2020 at http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/Viewer.aspx?ref=harley_ms_1735_f001r

[113] Paul Freedman, *Out of the East: Spices and the Medieval Imagination* (Yale University Press, 2008) and C. M. Woolgar, "Medieval food and colour," *Journal of Medieval History* 44:1 (2018), 1-20.

[114] "Browet tuskay. Take almondes blaunchet, and bray hom, and tempur hom up withe gode freshe brothe, and make the mylk thyk, and put hit in a faire pot, and let hit sethe, and do therto clowes, maces, and pynes, and raisynges of corance, and gynger mynced; then take felettes of porke, and sethe hom, and do therto pouder of pepur, and rawe ȝolkes of eggus, and colour hit with saffron, and when thai byn almoste sothen, take hom up, and do hom into the pot to the syrip, and let hit boyle al togedur, and in the settynge doun do therto a lytel vynegur and serve hit forthe; and if thow will chaunge the colour, take saunders and saffron, and make the potage of sangwayn colour for wyntur season." Warner, *Antiquitates Culinariae*, 60.

almost the same as for the "Saracen" soup (except for the pork instead of *volailles*, and pepper plus raw yolks instead of cinnamon), and they can be made the same red colour.

Lastly, however, the geographical and temporary distribution of these recipes needs to reckoned with. As we have seen, "Saracen" sauces feature only Italian, French and English cookbooks, and even then, with widely varying ingredients. For the majority of the Italian recipes, sweet-and-sour taste seems to be essential, spices and colours not so much. On the contrary, French recipes require several exotic spices and one special ingredient, eels. While the so-called "Saracen" sauces seem to disappear from Italian and French cookbooks by the fifteenth century, English cookbooks still have a large number of these recipes in that time. For most English recipes, some sweetener, but mostly, red food colouring seems to be essential for "Saracen"-ness. And by the sixteenth century, the "Saracen" dishes appear to drop out of fashion even in England.

"Turk's heads"

As mentioned at the beginning of this chapter, dishes such as the Western adaptations *maumenee* and *mamonia* of the Islamic dish *ma'munia* indicate that there had to be cross-cultural contact and borrowing between the two cultures. Now, where and when to locate these contact zones? In between two sieges, did the crusading Franks live in peace with local Muslims? Or did it happen in Andalusia? As Nasrallah points out: "Just how this apparent fusion of cuisines happened is still not clear."[115]

[115] Nawal Nasrallah, "The Historiography of Arab Cuisine: Issues and Perspectives," in Kyri W. Claflin and Peter Scholliers, eds., *Writing Food History: A Global Perspective* (London and New York: Berg, 2012), summarizing the arguments by C. Anne Wilson, "The Saracen connection: Arab cuisine and the medieval West: part 1" and "The Saracen connection: Arab cuisine and the medieval West: part 2," *Petits Propos Culinaire*, 7 (1981), 13–22 and 8 (1981), 19–28; and the counterarguments by Clifford A. Wright, *A Mediterranean Feast* (HarperCollins, 1999). I was able to consult only the first part of Wilson's article, re-published in Alan Davidson and Helen Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy*, 109-118.

A geographical and contextual analysis of the "Turk's head" recipes may go some way towards answering this conundrum. Hieatt has noticed the difference in content between Northern French cookbooks versus Italian and English ones. She observes that only Italian and English cookbooks have recipes that show an Arabic influence or borrowing. While "Turk's head" recipes appear only in the English collections B.L. MS. Additional 32085 and B. L. MS. Royal 12.C.xii, she connected them to the Italian *Liber de coquina*'s "monk's head" and Andalusian "monkey's heads." (She even went as far as twentieth-century *Kugelhopf* or *Gugelhopf* and Sicilian *testa di Turco*.)[116]

However, the English cookbooks in B.L. MS. Additional 46919 and B. L. MS. Cotton Julius D. viii[117], fol. and the German cookbook *Daz buoch von guoter spise* also have recipes for "Turk's heads." A comparison of the ingredients and instructions of these recipes will reveal that very different dishes could be called a "Turk's head."

The thirteenth-century B.L. MS. Additional 32085 has two recipes. The first one is, interestingly, a Lenten dish. The recipe instructs to pound rice, and mix it with almond milk, spices, saffron, and sugar. The cook is told, then, to clean and chop eels, and to pound parsley, sage with some meat broth in a mortar, and add saffron and powdered spices. Presumably, these mixtures are then layered in a pastry case, covered with the same "past," and baked in an oven. This seems to be an old-fashioned pie; moreover, it is very similar to the second recipe for "torta parmissa" in the *Modus*.[118] However, the scribe must have been in a rush, since he did not finish the recipe. The last words are "and so on;" we are not told why this dish "is called Turk's head."[119]

[116] Hieatt, "How Arabic Traditions Travelled to England," 120-126.

[117] Fol. 105v, cited by Nicola McDonald, "Eating People and the Alimentary Logic of *Richard Cœur de Lion*," Nicola McDonald, ed., *Pulp Fictions of Medieval England: Essays in Popular Romance* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), 144. I was unable to consult the manuscript.

[118] See Chapter 2, pp. 49-50.

[119] "23. Teste de Turke. A fere meymes cele viaunde per jur de pesson ou en kareme ke l'em apele teste de Turke. Pernez rys triez e festes les laver, e sechir, e pus le braez bien; e pus festes temprer oue let des alemaundes espessé, e metez dedenz especes e seffran, si cum avant est dist, e sucre. Festes un cofin de past, e pus festes escauder des anguilles, e festes oster les fimys, e pus festes goboner; e pernez persil e sauge e del bro,

Interestingly, almost the same ingredients and instructions turn up later, in the Bodleian MS. Laud Misc. 553, in a recipe called "Teste de cure." To make it, the cook should pound rice and mix the resulting fine flour with almond milk, powdered spices, saffron, and sugar. He should then chop pike, turbot, and eels; and add sage and parsley. This filling is put into a pastry case, sprinkled with powdered spices and sugar, and baked.[120] Since the recipe does not instruct to cover the pie, it may be a new-fashioned, open tart with the final sprinklings for the filling.

But again, we get no explanation as to why it is a "head," *teste*. The second word, *cure*, is taken for a misspelling of "Turk," *turc* by the Middle English Dictionary.[121] There may be, however, an alternative meaning. Although the word *curé* (meaning a "parish priest in France or a French-speaking land") is quite late to the English language,[122] the French word itself goes back to the fourteenth century, at least.[123] Could it be that, along with the other Anglo-Norman recipes, along with the "Teste de Turke" recipes, this also comes from the French and should mean "priest's head"? But then, where are the corresponding "head" recipes in French cookbooks? This question goes in the face of Hieatt's observation.

Just three recipes later in the B.L. MS. Additional 32085, the second recipe for "Turk's head" is definitely for a flesh-day dish. It is, in fact, an early version of haggis or headcheese: a pork's stomach is to be filled with a mixture of pounded pork, spices, saffron, eggs, bread, and almonds. When the stuffed stomach has been cooked, the recipe instructs, the cook should

e festes braer en un morter, e metez seffran e pudre; e pus coverez le, e metez en furn, &cetera." Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii," 865.

[120] "Teste de cure.—Nym rys, whas hem / drie hem / & bray hem al to doust in a morter, & amydoñ therwith: tempre it vp with almand mylk / cast therto poudur and safroñ / & sugur / nym luys, turbot, and elys / & gobete hem in mosselys, & sauge & perceli / mak coffyns of thi past / do thy fissh therynne; cast aboue goud poudur & sugur; kerue it, bake it, and ȝif hit forth." Austin, *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books*, 112.

[121] *Middle English Dictionary s.v.* Turk n.

[122] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* curé, *n.6*

[123] *Dictionnaire du Moyen Français (1330-1500) s.v.* curé (accessed May 21, 2020 at http://www.atilf.fr/dmf/)

prick it (maybe to reduce the quantity of liquids inside?) and "make the skin fall away."[124] Then, in the usual medieval fashion, it is to be endored with egg yolks. Again, the recipe finishes with a mere "and so on," and we are not told why it "has the name Turk's head."[125]

The recipes of B.L. MS. Royal 12.C.xii are also written in Anglo-Norman. So, we find among them a recipe for "Teste de Tourk." This time, the reasons for such a name are quite obvious. The cook is told to make an elaborate pastry by filling a sheet of "paste" with a mixture of rabbits, poultry, dates (peeled, sweetened with honey), new cheese, cloves, and cubebs. We may gather that this was an open tart, too, because sugar and a lot of coloured (red, yellow, green) pistachio marzipan are to be added on top. And finally (as Hieatt and Jones conjecture)[126] a black bowl should be put on top to resemble a woman's black hair. The pastry should have a man's face – maybe (as Hieatt and Jones conjecture) this is what the pistachio marzipan is for?[127]

The B.L. MS. Add 46919 has an English translation[128] of this very recipe, although not without some misunderstanding on the part of the translator.[129] It also has a second recipe for

[124] *Dictionnaire du Moyen Français (1330-1500)* s.v. ôter (accessed May 24, 2020 at http://www.atilf.fr/dmf/) Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii," 877 translate it as "remove the skin."

[125] "26. Teste de Turk. E une viaunde k'ad a noun teste de Turk. Pernez char de porc e de gelines e festes couper menu, e pus braer en un morter; e metez lenz bons especes e seffran; e metez dedenz de oefs bon partie e du payn; e metez des alemandes entieres; e tuz ces avaunt ditz choses seient braez en un morter ensemble mout bien; e pus pernez un estomak de porc bien lavé, e pus metez cele fassure dedenz le estomak, e festes quire mout bien; e pus kaunt il est quit, pernez une broche e festes percer parmy, e festes oster la pel; e pus pernez les moeles des oefs e braez les bien en un esquele oue sucre, e oingnez cel rost entur, &cetera." Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii," 865-866.

[126] Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii," 873.

[127] "27. Teste de Tourk. Fueille de paste, bon farois: plaunté dedenz, chonys e volatyle, dates plumees souceez en miel, formage nowe plaunté dedenz, clous, quibibes, sucre desus, pois une couche de fars festicade grant plenté; colour de fars, soré, jaune e vert. La teste serra neir adressé a la manere de chevels de femme en un neyr esquele, une face de houme desus." Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii," 868.

[128] "27. Test de Turt. Foille de pastee bon sarrays, & iplaunted þrin conynges & volatils, dates ywaschen & isouced in hony, chese neowe icoruen þryn; clouwes, quibibes, sucre abouen. Soþþen on legge of fassyng of festigade gret plentee, þe colour of þe farsure red, ȝolou & grene. þat hed schal beon blake adressed oþe manere of hier of wymmon on a blake dische, & a monnes visage abouen." Hieatt and Butler, eds., *Curye on Inglysch*, 48.

[129] Hieatt and Jones, "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii," 873: "while *en un neyr esquele* might equally well mean 'in the shape of

"Teste de Turt,"[130] which seems to be, interestingly, an English translation of the "Teste de cure" in the Bodleian MS. Laud Misc. 553. It would seem that there was a huge demand for "Turk's heads" in England, both for the flesh-day and Lenten variety.

Although continental recipes for "Turk's heads" remain to be found in as great a number as the English ones, the fourteenth-century German cookbook *Daz buoch von guoter spise* has an even more elaborate recipe for "heathen's head." As opposed to the majority of Italian, French and English cookbooks previously mentioned, which appear to have come from royal or noble households, this German cookbook is part of a miscellany manuscript (2º Cod. MS. 731, in the university library in Munich), which "was compiled by the patrician lawyer Michael de Leone […] of Würzburg," and was intended "as a type of home companion, which was to be passed on to his family together with his home, the *Löwenhof*."[131]

The recipe is found in the second part of the cookbook, which Adamson identified as a section addressed for more professional cooks.[132] This might be the reason why the instructions found in this recipe are not always obvious. Nonetheless, I take it that a meat-topped flat cake should represent the base of the Turk's shoulders. The topping should be one-fourths chicken, instructs the recipe, to which spices, eggs, and (with a German touch) diced apples are added. The use of chicken meat was interpreted by Adamson as "indicative of an urban cuisine."[133]

When this meat-topped cake has been baked, two skewers should be stuck in it instead of a neck. Its head is a pie with chicken filling *plus* a boiled, roasted and endored calf's head.

a black bowl,' the M.E. translator did not so understand it, and rendered the passage as 'þat hed schal beon blake adressed oþe manere of hier of wymmon on a blake dische'."

[130] "43. Teste de Turt. To make þilke mete on ȝeolue day of vische þat me clepeþ teste de Turt. Nim rys itried & wahs am veyre, & soþþen druen, & soþþen grind in an morter al to poudre, & do a lute amydon wiþinnen. & soþþen nim luce oþur turbet oþur eles, & boill am & soþþe tempre wiþ milke of alemauns & do wiþinnen speces, saffron & sucre. & make a coffin of past, & soþþen let scaldeen & soþþen do awey þe fulþ & make to gobouns; and soþþen nim percil & saugee & of þe broþ, and mak grinden togedere, & do saffron poudre; & soþþen do into þe ouene." Hieatt and Butler, eds., *Curye on Inglysch*.

[131] Melitta Weiss Adamson, "Medieval Germany," in Melitta Weiss Adamson, ed., *Regional Cuisines of Medieval Europe: A Book of Essays* (New York and London: Routledge, 2002), 153-196: 167.

[132] Adamson, "Chapter Six: Medieval Germany," 167-168.

[133] Adamson, "Chapter Six: Medieval Germany," 170.

Such combination of flatcakes and pies occurred (according to Adamson) "on special occasions."[134] This monstrous *Schauessen* with an animal's face is made complete with stuffing its mouth full of hard-boiled egg yolks, decorating its head with flowers cut out of the egg whites and garnishing it with little baked cakes on skewers, to make up the shoulders in height and maybe also to hide the skewers of the neck.[135]

While the *Liber de coquina* (MSS. A and B) has a recipe for stuffed pork's stomach,[136] which is very similar to the one in the B.L. MS Additional 32085, there is another recipe in it for "monk's head." Similarly to the recipes in the B.L. MS. Add 46919 and Bodleian MS. Laud Misc. 553, this is also an elaborate pastry for Lenten consumption. Confusingly, however, it is to be made in the shape of a castle.[137] The pastry cook is instructed to alternate layers of pastry either fried in oil or boiled with various fillings: fried *ravioli* with a spiced hazelnut and almond filling; fried figs; a mixture of honey, spices, pine nuts, dates, nuts, crushed hazelnuts, raisins, plus some onions caramelized in oil. Some of the pastry case should remain white, some should be coloured with saffron.[138]

[134] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 172.

[135] "[A95] Wilt du heidenische haubt. Die heidenisschen haubt gemaht einen schoenen fladen von fleische von vierteil huenren wol gestrauwet wuerfeleht epfele drin gesniten. vnd wuertzez genuoc wol vnd mengez mit eyern. vnd schuez ez in eynen ofen vnd daz ez werde gebacken vnd legez vf ein schiben zwene starke spizze drin als einen vinger mitten drin gestecket ein bastel kopf druf gesetzet mit huenren wol gefuellet. kalbes haubt drue gesoten geleit gantz. [fol. 165vb] vf einen roest wol beslagen mit eiern. daz es schoene werde von saffrane gesetzet vf einen fladen vnd eyers totern herte drin gestoezzen in sin munt bluomen gesniten von wizzen eiern wol gestrauwet in die haubt cleine gebacken kuochen an spizze gestoezzen vemme den fladen wol besetzet." Melitta Weiss Adamson, ed., transl. *Daz buoch von guoter spise*, Medium Aevum Quotidianum, herausg. von Gerhard Jaritz, Sonderband IX, (Krems, 2000).

[136] "56. -- De uentre porcino implendo: ad uentrem porcinum implendum, accipe herbas odoriferas, piper, safranum, carnes porcinas, caseum recentem. Tere omnia simul. Postea, imple uentrem. Et inde, potes facere salcicias uel rauiolas uel tortam. Mite ad coquendum. Et si non uis, lixa, pone ad frissandum." Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

[137] Cf. the Parma tarts of the *Viandier*, discussed in Chapter 2.

[138] "5. -- De capite monachi: pro capite monachi, recipe bonam quantitatem paste albe et fac in bona quantitate laganas; et reserua aliquantulum de illa pasta quam colora cum croco. Et 3am partem ipsarum laganarum frige aliquantulum cum oleo. Aliam partem lixa in aqua et aliquantulum infrigida eas. De residua parte tertia fac penulas ad modum rauiolorum et impleas auellanis trittis et speciebus et amigdalis ad sufficientiam et bulliantur in patella cum oleo ut supra. Et de residuo paste predicte fac pecias subtiles et latas et coque in predicto oleo. Postea, eas parum inungas de melle. Hoc facto, ordina solaria: in primo solario, pone ficus frissas per medietatem incisas; in alio solario, pone mel, species cum pineis mundatis et dactilis incisis per medium et nucibus, auellanis male trittis, uuis passis, addito ibidem parum de cepa suffrissa cum oleo. Et poteris consequenter alia solaria facere de laganis elixis, et poteris facere cum crenellis, sicut castrum. Et fac eum decoqui in prunis cum multo oleo. Et cum fuerit decoctum, depura oleum quod est ibi. Et comede in ieiuno." Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

MS. V has an almost identical version of the recipe for this huge concoction, except that here, the recipe lacks the very last instructions about baking in coals with a lot of oil, then pouring away the excess oil, and eating on Lenten days. The recipe stops at the words *et poteris facere cum crenellis sicut castrum et fac*;[139] and the manuscript continues with the recipe for "lost eggs" on fol. 187r. MS. Z does not have this recipe, and neither does, apparently, MS. S. Should we take the omission of this detail by the other scribes as an indication that with its top shaped as a castle, the Sicilian "monk's head" was originally a dish intended for a king?

Nonetheless, on the suggestion of Rudolf Grewe, Hieatt proposes that both the "Turk's heads" and the "monk's head" derive from the Arabic recipes for *ras maimun*, "monkey's heads" found in a twelfth- or thirteenth-century[140] Andalusian cookbook (called, after its Spanish translation, *Manuscrito Anónimo*).[141] According to Charles Perry's translation,[142] the two recipes could not be more different. The first recipe is for a sweet cake:

> Monkey's Head. It is made with semolina, the same as before to the letter. Add some clarified butter, and to every *ratl* put in four or five eggs as we have said, and go on beating it continuously with water and butter until all the lumps are gone. Take a new, glazed pot with a belly and a neck, and sprinkle it with oil and butter until it is soaked. Then place the dough in the pot, only to the neck, and take a segment of cane, pierced at both ends, and place it in the middle of the pot, having greased it with clarified butter. Then leave the dough to rise, and the sign that it is done is making an indentation in it, as we have said. .. . [p. 30 recto] And when it rises, send it to the oven, put it far from the fire, and leave it until it is cooked and browned. When it comes from the oven, shake the pot well and carefully to separate the head from it. Then break it little by little so that the shape comes out in its proper form, and if it resists, pour in some honey and clarified butter, and continue being careful with it until it comes out whole, for the intent in this case is that it come out in the form of a human head. Then have care also in removing the cane, and fill the hole with honey and clarified and fresh butter, and put it, just as it is, in a dish and stick peeled pine-nuts and pistachios in it. Then pour melted clarified butter over it, sprinkle it with ground sugar and present it, God willing.

[139] Fol. 186r-186v, accessed April 26, 2020 at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768

[140] Claudia Roden, *The Food of Spain* (Harper Collins, 2011) writes, in the subchapter "A Hispano-Moorish Cuisine," that she found "a Spanish translation by Ambrosio Huici Miranda of a twelfth- or thirteenth-century Arabic culinary manuscript of Al-Andalus […] entitled *Kitab al Tabikh fil Maghrib wal Andalus (Cookbook of the Maghreb and Al-Andalus*)," which was then translated by Charles Perry.

[141] Ambrosio Huici Miranda, *Traducción española de un manuscrito anónimo de siglo XIII sobre la cocina hispano-magribi* (Madrid: Maestre, 1966). See Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 11.

[142] Charles Perry, trans., "An Anonymous Andalusian Cookbook of the Thirteenth Century," in *A Collection of Medieval and Renaissance Cookbooks, II.* Society for Creative Anachronism, 6th ed., (1993), A1-A80.

This seems to be a variation on another Andalusian (Ibn Razīn's) recipe for "*isfunj al-qulla*: sponge cake cooked in a jar."[143] Although the ingredients (with the exception of eggs and the garnish) and the instructions are the same, Ibn Razīn mentions no monkey's or human head:

> Knead semolina or extra-fine flour, making a soft, light dough. Take a small new jar and pour into it quite a lot of oil, enough to coat the walls and the bottom. When the dough has risen, fill up the jar [with it], almost as far as the neck, and stick a palm rib inside, or a reed without knots that has been soaked in oil, and take the jar to the oven. Leave it far from the fire until the cooking [is done]. At this point, remove it from the oven and gently shake it to pull out the reed. Into the space occupied by the reed pour some honey and *samn* or melted butter, let it sit for a moment, and then delicately break the jar so that the contents remain perfectly intact. Sprinkle with cinnamon, moisten again with *samn* and honey, and eat, may it please God.

The existence of this alternative recipe indicates that this may have been an Andalusian pastry, but it does not support Hieatt's proposition about the origins of medieval Western "Turk's heads." On the other hand, the *Manuscrito Anónimo*'s second recipe is for a stuffed "monkey's head" – a stuffed pigeon, in fact:

> Stuffed Monkey-Head. Take a *ratl* of wheat flour and knead it until it is a little soft, then mash it with half a *ratl* of clarified butter, water and ten eggs, and beat all this together gently until it softens. Then take a young pigeon and clean it, take out its innards and pound with a little onion, breadcrumbs and peeled almonds. Beat together five eggs, pepper, cinnamon, Chinese cinnamon, lavender, and some cilantro juice. Fill the young bird with this, insert a boiled egg in the stuffing and sew it up; put it in a pot with water, salt and oil. And when it is cooked, take a second pot with belly and neck, and put oil and rosewater in it; make meatballs of mutton or of chicken breast and cook with the necessary salt, water, crushed onion, citron leaves, and fennel stalks until it is cooked, and when it is done, cover the contents of the pot with six eggs, cold breadcrumbs, and wheat flour. Make four stuffed eggs and dot yolks over them, and when the cooking is done and the covering is wrinkled, take a frying pan to a weak fire with some oil, beat an egg with some pepper and salt, and spread it over the frying pan, which should be temperate of heat, until it fries and becomes very thin. Loosen it and put it in the bottom of the dish and make another egg [p. 30 verso] according to the same recipe. Then ladle the almonds and put the [egg] *raghîfa* (into the dish) and garnish with its meatballs and stuffed eggs, after cutting the latter in fourths. Put the stuffing between these and cover with another [egg] *raghîfa* so that none of the almond shows, and plant "eyes" of mint in it, and toasted almonds and pistachios, and present it, God willing.

While the ingredients and techniques advised are so different as to produce, arguably, a wholly different taste and dish, the *Manuscrito Anónimo*'s both recipes also emphasise that the dishes should look like a man's head, with spices and nuts imitating the eyes and the face. Should we take these two Andalusian recipes as a possible source or inspiration for all the

[143] Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 136.

Western "Turk's heads"? And also, should we take them as an indication that it was in Andalusia where Christians and Muslims got a taste for each other's food?

A medieval Spanish cookbook, "Enrique de Villena's *Tractado del Arte de Cortar del Cuchillo* or *Arte Cisoria* (Treatise of Carving with the Knife, or The Art of Cookery) […] written in the early fifteenth century,"[144] mentions *la cabeza del Turco*, "Turk's head" as a dish which needs very little carving (because it is already chopped up) among small and tender birds, such as partridge.[145] Does this mean that the Spanish borrowed the Andalusian "monkey's head" made with pigeon (as described in the *Manuscrito Anónimo*)? De Villena's cursory comment makes it hard to tell.

Moreover, a comparison of Western recipes has shown that they do not match the Andalusian ones, and they do not even match each other. The problem of widely different ingredients and techniques seems to be the same as with the many varieties of "Saracen soup." For the English, a fish pie or a pork haggis could have the same name. Why call both (and the pastry with a human face, too) a "Turk's head"?

The reasons may lie not in the dishes' origins, but in the way they were used. Just as the Saracen soup made with eels may, or may not have evoked the snakes eaten by the Sultan of Babylon, the "Turk's heads" may have recalled another literary experience. In the romance *Richard Cœur de Lion,* Richard the Lionheart does not only eat Saracen flesh in lieu of pork,

[144] Rafael Chabrán, "Medieval Spain," in Adamson, *Regional Cuisines of Medieval Europe: A Book of Essays*, 141.

[145] "E à las Perdices que se dan en agua sal, ò en adouo del vinagre con su pluma, este mesmo faga tajo, saluo que non son menester poner sal nin zumos, è los mienbros, que se apartan, luego poniendolos enteros; è sy fuere encapirotada, ò en dobladura non há menester cortar, sy non poner sus piezas con la Broca de dos puntas, è tal mesmo con perdigada, porque viene en piezas departidas, è estas se cortan mas en anresas, que las aves ante ellas puestas por ser pequeñas, è tiernas, è zumosas, è tomarien del sauor del cuchillo ferrugiena, sy menudo las cortasen, è por eso ponen en ellas el cuchillo lo menos que puedan, que quando las ponen ansi como en la cabeza del Turco, è en las figuras, è maldades, è tales viandas conpuestas, porque uan picadas, non es menester de partir su cortar." Enrique de Villena, *Arte cisoria*… (Madrid, 1766), accessed June 7, 2020 at https://digibug.ugr.es/handle/10481/34817

he has the Saracens's heads served as an *entremets*.[146] It remains to be seen if there is a German literary context for the even more spectacular recipe in the *buoch von guoter spise*.

"Heathens'" cakes and "Bohemian" peas

Although the recipe in the *buoch von guoter spise* does not name it so, the description of the meat-topped cake used for the shoulders recalls another recipe in this cookbook. *Diz heizzent heidenisse kuochen*, "these are called heathens' cakes," tells the cookbook. The so-called "Muslim" cakes are made by flattening a dough of unknown composition quite thin, and baking it with a topping made with boiled meat, chopped bacon, apples, and eggs, spiced with pepper. *Versirtez niht*, "don't spoil it," warns the recipe. Maybe the dough was to be rolled out so thin as to quickly burn?[147]

The simplicity of this recipe is astounding after all the English, Italian, and Andalusian "Turk's heads." Unfortunately, other German recipes do not offer much help. We find a recipe for "heathens' cake" in the *Inntalkochbuch*, one of the "smaller cookbooks that circulated in the Alpine region in the mid- to late fifteenth century."[148] It "was probably written in Mühldorf in the Lower Inn Valley," and Adamson found a connection to the *Kochbuch Meister Hannsens*, the *Mondseer Kochbuch*, and the *Wiener Kochbuch*.[149]

The recipe in the *Inntalkochbuch* seems to call for a wholly different sort of cake as the one in the Würzburg cookbook. A pastry dough is to be made with eggs, as hard as it can be

[146] McDonald, "Eating People and the Alimentary Logic of *Richard Cœur de Lion*," 148, n. 35.

[147] "[A5a] Heidenische kuochen. Diz heizzent heidenisse kuochen. Man sol nemen einen teyc vnd sol dunne breiten. vnd nim ein gesoten fleisch. vnd spec gehacket. vnd epfele. vnd pfeffer. vnd eyer dar in. vnd backe daz. vnd gibes hin vnd versirtez niht. [B6] Heydenisch kuchen / Heydenisch kuchen / Man sal nemen eynen teyck / vnd sol den dünne braten / vnd nym ein gesoten fleisch vnd speck / gehackt / vnd oppfel / vnd pfeffer / vnd eyer darein / vnd back das / vnd gibs hin" Adamson adds the note: "Figurative meaning of *versirten* suggested by [Hans] Hajek [*Das buoch von guoter spise. Aus der Würzburg-Münchener Handschrift* (Berlin, 1958)], 47, is "to spoil"; maybe a misspelling of *versaltz es nicht*, the phrase used in M5.] "

[148] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 176.

[149] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 176.

possibly done. Then, it is to be fried in lard in small and thin pieces. These little cakes are, then, to be eaten with a sauce made of honey and wine.[150]

Another fifteenth-century cookbook, "a Basel collection of sixty-four recipes written between 1462 and 1467 in the area between Straubing and Innsbruck," which Adamson connected to the same 'Tyrolean' tradition as the *Inntalkochbuch*, has three relevant recipes.[151] Interestingly, all the three recipes for "a dish of stricken (or striped?) pastry,"[152] "cake on a spit made with a heathens' dough,"[153] and "a baked dish"[154] speak of "heathens' dough" without any further ado, as if it were common and well known by anyone.

According to Adamson, the recipe collection found in the manuscript R 605 (housed at the Tiszántúli Református Egyházkerületi és Kollégiumi Nagykönyvtár, in Debrecen) and "written between 1469 and 1474 (or earlier) in Bavaria or Austria," also belongs to the

[150] "Zu haidnischen kuchen Mach ainen taig mit eiteln aiern, so du aller hertist mügst, värb den taig, walg in, das ein platten daraus werd als ein pfanzelten vnd pach das in smalcz. Nim guten wein, halb so vil honig, erwell das vndereinander vnd zeuch das pachen dardurch, so dus wild anrichten." Thomas Gloning, "Danner (ed.), Kochrezepte." Based upon Berthilde Danner, "Alte Kochrezepte aus dem bayrischen Inntal," *Ostbairische Grenzmarken* 12 (1970), 118-128. (= Cod. 793 der Donaueschinger Hofbibliothek, Bl. 27v-28v und 96r-98r). Accessed May 30, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/kb-dann.htm)

[151] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 179.

[152] "16. Ein essen von gestricken pachen. Wiltu machen ein gestrickes paches von einem taig so mach ein hert alczer zu einem haidischen pach vnd mach auch pletter sam haidinisch pletter vnd snid ein snitten dy sinbeller sein denn ein vinger vnd nÿm ein smalcz in ein pfan en oder in einen morser vnd secz in daz er haisz werd vnd wellig vnd nym einen koch loffell oder ein holczlein do mit reich an dy pletter vnd leg ye eins hin vnd uber leg daz ander vnd wirffs an dem holcz in dy pfannen vnd la es pachenn vnd ker ez vmb in dem morser vnd mach den ein gutte suppen dor zu von honig vnd von gutem gewurtz vnd dor zu ein wenig weins vnd ein wenig essigs daz ez durch daz honig piczel vnd strew dor ein ein wenig wein per vnd geusz dy suppen den ausz des packes vnd richt ez an vnd versalcz ez nit" Thomas Gloning, *Das Kochbuch der Handschrift >ÖB Basel D II 30< (15. Jahrhundert)* (Tübingen/Gießen, 1993), accessed May 30, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/kochbuch_basel-d-ii-30_gloning-1993.pdf I omitted the ſ's from his transcriptions.

[153] "32. Wiltu machen einen kuchen an einem spisz von einem haidinischen teig So nym vnd bereitt in wol von zweyen oder von zweyerley varben vnd leg sie neben ein ander noch der leng daz einer den andren nit beruren mug vnd besneide denn einen tail mitt dem messer an einem ortt vnd wint es vmb ein holczlin spisz vnd besla ez mit ayren tottern an den ortten so pleibt er dir gantz vnd pratt in nit zu haisz vnd versalcz in nit" Gloning, *Das Kochbuch der Handschrift >ÖB Basel D II 30< (15. Jahrhundert)*.

[154] "41. Ein essen von gepackenn Jtem wiltu machen ein pachens heisset pfifferling so mach einenn taig als zu einem haidnischen taig als du ein vrhab wolst versee sein nicht so mach darauch clein pletter als dy pfifferling eins merer daz ander mÿnder vnd wenn du dy pletter gemacht hast so wart daz sie dick sein vnd an den orten nit zu dún sein vnd thu sie in ein pfannen mit smalcz vnd pack sie dorjnnen vnd uber schrenck dy pletter zu ein ander auff deiner hant als ein crape vnd sturtz sie dann zu samen mit den zipfen so hastu zwir gesturtz vnd wirffs jnn dy pfannen vnd lasz packenn" Gloning, *Das Kochbuch der Handschrift >ÖB Basel D II 30< (15. Jahrhundert)*.

'Tyrolean' tradition of medieval German cookbooks.[155] Indeed, this collection has a recipe for "stricken (or striped?) pastry"[156] quite similar to the one in the Basel manuscript. Although both the Debrecen and Basel recipes have a different title, they appear to be a variation on how "heathens' cakes" were instructed to be made in the *Inntalkochbuch*. In a similar way, the hard, stiff "heathens' dough" (made with eggs, adds the Debrecen manuscript) is cut into strips and fried in hot lard. Also, a sauce or soup made with honey and wine is poured on them when they are served. The only difference, it seems, is that this sauce has also spices, some vinegar and (based on the Debrecen and Basel manuscripts) raisins added to it.

The difference made by Adamson between the medieval German cookbooks representing the 'Würzburg' and 'Tyrolean' tradition is borne out by the difference in the 'Würzburg' and 'Tyrolean' ways of making "heathens' cakes." As we have seen, the *buoch von guoter spise* adds a meat-based topping, while the other, 'Tyrolean' cookbooks fry them in lard and serve with a sweet and spicy sauce.

Still, the stiff, egg-based dough seems to be common with both traditions, and assumed to be well known. Even the recipe for this pastry in the *buoch von guoter spise* is found in the first part of the book, which Adamson identified as a section intended for novice cooks, teaching, as it were, the basics of cooking.[157]

Interestingly, this dough seems to have been well known both in Southern and Northern Germany. A "collection of 103 recipes in Low German from the fifteenth century," which "was

[155] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 178-179.

[156] Fol. 89v-90v "Wie man ein gestrichtz pachen macht Wildw machen gestrichtz pachen von einem taig von aÿern so mach in hertt als czu einem haydnischen pachen vnd mach auch pletter als haÿnische [!] pletter vnd sneÿd ein snitten die smeler seÿ den ein vinger vnd versneÿdt an thainen ordt dÿ pletter nicht vnd lass dÿ gantz vnd nÿm ein smaltz in ein mosrer [!] vnd setz es dan das es haÿss oder wellig werdt vnd nÿm ein choch loffel oder ein holtzel das das da seÿ als gross da mit raich an dÿ pletter von dem plat das dw gesnitten hast vnd leg ye ains hin vnd vber leg das ander vnd wirff es ab dem holtz in dÿ pfannen vnd lass es pachen vntz das es sein genueg gewnig Seÿ ym sein not so ther es vmb in dem morsrer [!] vnd mach dan ein guettem suppen [*added marginalia*: von honig vnd gewurtz vnd] darzue nÿm ein wenig wein vnd ein wenig esseich das es durch das honigk pizel vnd strä darein wenig weinper [!] vnd gews dÿ suppen ausen das pachen wenn dw es wellest an richten da mit ist es peraÿtt"

[157] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 167-168.

copied in Eastphalia and probably belonged to the nuns of a local convent,"[158] has three recipes referring to this dough. One of them, a recipe for a pike roe concoction intended for Lent, instructs the cook to have good wheat flour and "make a good dough with it, as if you were baking heathens' cakes."[159] A recipe for peas uses the phrases "as if you were making a thin dough" and "as if you were making heathens' cakes."[160] Another recipe for pike roe also refers to them.[161]

The fact that a century later, we find a recipe in the 'Tyrolean' tradition may be taken as an indication as to the common status of "heathens' cakes." Balthasar Staindl's Renaissance

[158] Adamson, "Medieval Germany," 180-182.

[159] "9. Item wyltu maken worste yn der vasten, so nym roghen van velen hekeden, jo du des meyst kryghen kanst. Stot on yn eyneme moser. Strick en den dor eynen reynen do:eck edder male on van eyner molen. Nym levere van den hekeden unde nym derme van vysschen unde van hekeden, wat du kryghen kanst. Make dy reyne unde make se gar. Hacke se cleyne unde do darmangk ghesoden rys unde des roghens, den du ghestot hest in deme moser edder ghemalen. Mack eyn gud wulsel, io du meyst kanst. Unde crude dat aff myt peper unde myt safferane. Do dar ok yn rosyn edder vyghen, de cleyne synt. So ror dat aff, dat id nicht alto harte werde. Nym gud wetenmel unde nym des ghestotten rogens. Make daraff eynen guden deych, also du woldest backen heydenysche koken. Unde nym unde menghe den deych dunne, also du dunnest kanst, unde so smal dryer vyngher breyt unde so langk, also dy dunket, also eyn worst wesen schal. Make der, wo vele du dorvest. Unde legge dat wulsel darup unde dreye tohope, dat dat worste werden. Hebbe gud sedendych water unde legge se daryn. Unde lat se seden ore mathe. Make dartho eyn gud soet, also syck to worsten behort. Unde gyff se hen." Thomas Gloning, "Mittelniederdeutsches Kochbuch." Based upon Hans Wiswe, ed., "Ein mittelniederdeutsches Kochbuch des 15. Jahrhunderts," *Braunschweigisches Jahrbuch* 37 (1956): 19-55. Accessed June 7, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/mndk.htm

[160] "40. Item wiltu maken ghevulde erweten, so nym der erweten, de dar synt ghestot. Make de wol myt tzuckere. Nym cleynghestot rys, also mel. Des nym des verden deyl so vele also der erwyten ys. Menghe den rys darmangk. Make se so starke, so du kanst. Nym unde legge se up eyn slicht bret, also du woldest maken eynen dunnen dech. Man del se, also du woldest maken heydenische koken. Make der twe. Legge darup, wat du hest van guden mosen van beren, van eppellen edder van kerseberen edder van lactuarium, Dat vulle up eyn blat unde decke dat ander darover. So heten dat ghevullede erweten. Snyt se denne vyngherlanck unde vyngherbreyd. Backe dat denne wol thomathe yn reyneme ole. Unde giff se hen." Gloning, "Mittelniederdeutsches Kochbuch."

[161] "43. Item wyltu maken mennygherleyge in der vasten, dat dar sy stalt also so eygere, so mostu hebben hekedesroghen also vele, also du behovest. Dat schaltu stoten yn eyneme moser. Male ene denne cleyne van eyner sennepmolen. So machstu backen heydenische koken, struven, gesken, rorkoken, morkeln, rosinspeckenne salvienbledere. Du macht van den starken deghe maken posteydengropen unde must dy laten hart werden in eyneme cleynen deghele, de het sy. So vulle den darin, wat du hest van guden vischen, van groneme ale, van neghenoghen, rosin unde beren, saffran unde peper unde neghelken. Dar ghut up eynen guden wyn syne mathe. Dat dat fulsel tovorne gar sy, so lat dat tohopeseden unde thohopebacken. Giff em vu:er, undene unde bovene, syne mathe. So giff on hen." Gloning, "Mittelniederdeutsches Kochbuch."

cookbook still instructs to make thin sheets out of stiff, egg-based dough, fry them in lard and serve the "heathens' cakes" with a sauce of wine and honey.[162]

Where should we look for the origins of this elusive "heathens' dough"? As we have seen, it was made with eggs to a stiff, hard consistency; it was fried in lard and (except for the *buoch von guoter spise*) served with a sweet sauce. Following just these ingredients and instructions, we find several recipes for fritters in Islamic cookbooks. Although the majority of these are made with leavened dough[163] or puff pastry, all of them are drenched in honey or sugar syrup after frying. The *Manuscrito Anónimo* has a recipe which may be the closest to "heathens' dough":

> Recipe of the Necessities of Bread and Confection[164]
> Take a *ratl* of wheat flour and knead it with twenty egg yolks, a little water and oil. Then make small, very thin round flatbreads of it, and as soon as they are made, fry them in plenty of oil until they are close to browning. Put them in a dish, boil honey a little and clean it of its foam, and cut almonds and walnuts into the honey, pour it into the dish, sprinkle with sugar, set whole pine-nuts about, and present it.

Another Andalusian cookbook, the one written by Ibn Razīn, has a recipe for "pancakes with pistachios and pine nuts,"[165] which differs only in adding cheese to the dough:

> Knead a pound of extra-fine flour and a pound and a half of fresh cheese so that they are well mixed together, then work [the mixture] some more with five eggs, salt to taste, and add a little water if necessary. Make some very thin layers of dough. Fry in a pan with a large amount of oil; they must remain white. Next, boil honey together with some crushed walnuts and pour [the mixture] on top [of the layers of dough]; also crumble over them some pine nuts and pistachios, sprinkle some sugar, and it will be ready to serve, may it please God.

Since Islamic cookbooks of other (Egyptian, Syrian, Baghdad) traditions do not seem to have exactly this kind of pastry, the egg-based, thin, unstuffed fritter may be an Andalusian

162 "Heydnische Kuᵒchen zumachen. lvij. Mach ein teig von ayren/ auff das haᵉrtest so du kanst haben/ machs vnnd woᵉlg dünne bletter darauß als ein pfanzelten/ bachs im schmaltz/ dann nimb ein guᵒten wein/ halb souil Honig/ durch einander/ zeüch das bachens dardurch/ wann du es wilt anrichten." Thomas Gloning, " Das dritt Buoch sagt/ wie man von Ayrmilch/ vnd gemueß kochen soll." Based upon Balthasar Staindl, *EJN sehr Künstlichs vnd nutzlichs Kochbuoch* (Augsburg, 1569). Accessed June 7, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/staind3.htm

[163] Cf. Habeeb Salloum, "Medieval and Renaissance Italy B. Sicily," in Adamson, *Regional Cuisines of Medieval Europe: A Book of Essays*, 113-123: 118.

[164] Note by Perry: " The word translated as "necessaries" (*hawâ'ij*), which can also mean "things," is used in some cookery writings to mean ingredients other than spices added for flavoring." (Perry, "An Anonymous Andalusian Cookbook of the Thirteenth Century," n. 69.)

[165] Zaouali, *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World*, 108.

invention. This would mean that, as with the "Saracen soup" made with eels, and the "Turk's head," traces seem to lead from medieval Western to Andalusian cooking. If so, contrary to Wilson's proposition, cross-cultural contact and borrowing of recipes, tastes, and ideas happened during a prolonged and (more or less) peaceful co-existence in Andalusia,[166] not between two battles in the Holy Land during the Crusades. It remains to be seen if there was a connection (maybe through Moorish and German merchants?) between Andalusia and German-speaking countries to provide the inspiration for "heathens' cakes."

On the other hand, the *buoch von guoter spise* has a recipe the likes of which we do not find in any other medieval German or Islamic cookbook. While the title of the recipe is "heathen peas," the recipe itself asks for pounded almonds, one-thirds honey, and the very best spices.[167] Moreover, one version of the text of the *buoch von guoter spise* adds the alternative name "Bohemian peas." What should Bohemia have to do with Muslims? The fact that Sabina Welserin's cookbook has a recipe for "Bohemian peas" (made with real peas) does not offer much help – even if Welserin's peas are flavoured with wine, spices, and sweetened with sugar.[168]

How could these names been used to denote a sweet and spicy almond concoction devoid of any peas? One possible explanation is the medieval tradition of imitation dishes served during Lent. Sweetened almonds would resemble pease pudding (made with split peas)

[166] Cf. Rafael Chabrán, "Medieval Spain," in Adamson, *Regional Cuisines of Medieval Europe: A Book of Essays*, 125-: 131.

[167] "[A63] Heidenische erweiz. Wilt du machen behemmische erweiz so nim mandelkern. vnd stoez die gar cleine. vnd mengez mit dritteil als vil honiges. vnd mit guoten wuertzen wol gemenget so erz allerbeste hat. die koste git man kalt. oder warm.

[B60] Heydenisch erbeyß Nym mandelkeren / vnd stoß die gar clein / vnd menge sie mit dritteil als vil honiges / vnd thu darunter gute würcze ßo man sie am besten hat / dise kost isset man kalt oder warm " Adamson, *Daz buoch von guoter spise*.

[168] "Bemisch erbis zú Machen Nim 3 lot erbis, seuds trucken, das sý nit zú nasß send, vnnd stoß woll jm morser, das sý fein miessig werden, thú gúten wein daran/ thú jmber, rerlen, pariskerner vnnd zucker, gib es kalt, beses mit zúcker, jst ain gút herrenessen." Thomas Gloning, "Das Kochbuch der Sabina Welserin (c. 1553)." Based upon Hugo Stopp, ed., *Das Kochbuch der Sabina Welserin*. Mit einer Übersetzung von Ulrike Gießmann (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag C. Winter Heidelberg, 1980). Accessed June 7, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/sawe.htm

in looks, certainly. Indeed, even Welserin's highly spiced and sweetened version can be interpreted as a more elite take on the "behamysch arbaissn," the ordinary, humble pease pudding made with pork.[169] In the sixteenth-century cookbook used by the monastery of Tegernsee, we find a recipe for "white or Bohemian peas," whose ingredients are peas, wine, mead, and honey.[170] Maybe for a sweet, Lenten soup? The set menu recommended for fasting days lists "behamisch arbaißen" for a Saturday meal.[171]

Alternatively, Hundsbichler recognized *Türkischer Honig* in the version made according to the *buoch von guoter spise*.[172] If so, then "Bohemian" can be taken as a synonym for "oriental" or "heathen," as Hundsbichler thought. Although modern-day *Türkischer Honig* does seem to be close to both Arabic and Turkish *halwa* and Spanish *turrón*, the history of this commodity still needs to be written.

Conclusion

Except for maybe an Italian variety of "Saracen soup," and the German "heathens' cakes," which might possibly have some Islamic origin, the so-called "Saracen," "Turk," and "heathen" dishes of the medieval Christian West seem to be genuinely Western creations. Made of ingredients which had the connotations of the exotic East only for the Westerners whose tables they graced, they appear to be the edible embodiments of contemporary fantasies.[173] In an age when the Crusades were a distant memory, Saracens suddenly became fashionable. In

[169] Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, MS. vind. 2897; fol. 9v – 10r. See http://kulinarisches-mittelalter.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/09/erbsengruetze.pdf and https://nahrhaftesmittelalter.com/2018/11/12/boehmisches-huhn-ein-herzhafter-grenzgaenger/ (accessed June 8, 2020)

[170] "weiß oder behamisch arbas: ein kar vol arbas, 1 maß wein, 3 maß meth und honig." Anton Birlinger, ed., "Kalender und Kochbüchlein aus Tegernsee," in Franz Pfeiffer, ed., *Germania: Vierteljahrsschrift für Deutsche Alterthumskunde* 9 (Vienna, Carl Gerold's Sohn, 1864): 192-207: 207.

[171] Birlinger, ed., "Kalender und Kochbüchlein aus Tegernsee," 199.

[172] Helmut Hundsbichler, "Nahrung," in *Alltag im Spätmittelalter*, ed. Harry Kühnel (Graz: Styria, 1984), 231. I would like to thank Gerhard Jaritz for this citation.

[173] Cf. Jeffrey Jerome Cohen, "On Saracen Enjoyment: Some Fantasies of Race in Late Medieval France and England," *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 31:1 (Winter 2001): 113-146.

the context of chivalric tales such as the *Sowdane of Babylone* and *Richard Cœur de Lion*, and "masques, pageantry, processions, and balls,"[174] these made-up dishes appear to be tailored to the specific needs and desires of their Western consumers – hot, sensuous, and exotic, just as the temperament of Saracen lands and peoples were according to received wisdom.

[174] Heng, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages*, 190-191.

Chapter 2. "Italian" pies in medieval and Early Modern Europe

Even today, phrases like "as American as apple pie" and baked goods such as Hungarian *almás pite* will recall something not entirely dissimilar. Although regional culinary traditions, names in the vernacular and some ingredients may vary, the basics of the recipe appear to be just the same: wrap shortcrust or puff pastry around sweet or savoury filling (either raw or pre-cooked), and bake it. It is, then, to be served sliced (such as with apple pie or Hungarian *pite*) or in individual portions (such as with Cornish pasty or Chilean *empanada*) and eaten altogether. The pastry crust is enriched with butter, lard, or vegetable shortening, eggs, milk, sour cream and even powdered sugar (depending upon national tastes and traditions) so that it would be enjoyable enough to eat with the filling.

It may seem that the simplicity of combining an edible pastry with a tasty filling requires no explanation as to its origin(s) or inventor(s). However, according to Barbara Santich, medieval pies were, originally, just another method for containing and preserving meat. A hard, flour-and-water-only pastry case was designed to keep the meat from burning while in the oven; or from spoiling, since the baked pastry case effectively insulated the meat from air. This hard, maybe even burnt pastry case was meant to be discarded.[175] A sixteenth-century Transylvanian cookbook still has the instruction to "put the chick in the cooking pot made of pastry," shaping the pastry in the same way a potter builds an earthenware vessel.

Even though it was recorded as late as the sixteenth century, the Transylvanian recipe is more detailed than other chicken pie recipes. Its description may make it easier to understand how these pies were made:

[175] Barbara Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," in *Food in the Middle Ages: A Book of Essays*, ed. Melitta Weiss Adamson (New York and London: Garland Publishing, 1995), 61-81. See especially pp. 68-74 on the newfangled "torte and tourtes."

Tenth. Chick with pastry. Plucking and disemboweling thereof should be as before. When you disembowel it, break the little bone in its wing with a small stick, but just so as it is not torn apart, and its leg bones likewise. This is usually broken so that when you put it in the clean pot [of pastry], it would not make a tear in the sides. Shove it in with the beef, let it cook there a little while, only so long as it is parboiled. While it cooks [i.e., it is being parboiled], chop a few parsley leaves with some fat lard, have lemons brought in with its leaves, if no lemons can be had, then marjoram; add some pepper to it, you can make it with citron, too. Knead a dough with eggs and flour, as hard as it can be. With the rolling-pin, as usual, roll it out, let the middle be 'hillier' than the sides. Just keep on pushing that little hill down with your thumb. While you keep pushing the middle with one hand, with the other hand lift the edge ever higher and higher, [and] when you are able to draw the dough onto the back of your hand, like the potter draws up the pot or pipkin, leave some [dough] for a lid, as well. Now then, put the chick in the cooking pot made of pastry, at the same time add a little bit of salt to it. Cut the lemon into round [slices], put it [in], pour some of its juice upon, as well, put the lard on top, smear it on then, cut tender marjoram into it for its good smell, and pour some beef broth on it, too. Stretch the lid nice and thin. It should be only as large as the opening of pastry pot, wet the edge with clear water, so that the lid should stick, as is proper, take it in then nicely. In the middle of the lid, make a little chimney, make the likeness of a chick's head out of pastry for it, it should have a neck, too, and so put it in the chimney; paint this also with water, so it should stick to it all the better, pinch the edges, so that it should be prettier, the sides of the [pastry] pot, too, when you stand it up. Now then, this is done, just cook it well in a pinnata,[176] if you do not have a pinnata, it can be done in an oven, but you need to be more careful then. When you want to serve it, cut the lid off nicely, taste the broth, whatever is missing, correct it, put the lid back on while it is still hot. [177]

It should be noted that Santich might have been drawing upon a familiar concept. English cuisine used to put so-called "huff paste" (made of flour and water, sometimes also suet) on meat and fruit as a protective cover against direct heat. Does it, possibly, go back to medieval usage? The Oxford English Dictionary knows of it only as an eighteenth-century

[176] This was a sort of baking equipment much used in sixteenth and seventeenth-century Hungarian recipes for gentle baking. Its name seems a misnomer, because functionally, it must have been closer to an Italian *testo*.

[177] Béla Radvánszky, Báró, ed., *Régi magyar szakácskönyvek*, Vol. 1. Házi történelmünk emlékei… Második osztály, Szakácskönyvek (Budapest: Athenaeum R. Társulat, 1893), 100-101: "Tizedik. Tyúkfi pástétommal. Mellyesztése, beli kivetése, mint azelőtt, úgy legyen. Mikor kiveted az belit, az szárnya csontocskáját törd meg egy kis fácskával, csakhogy egymástól el ne szakadazzon, az szára csontja csontját is azonképen. Ezt azért szokták megtördelni, hogy mikor az tiszta fazékban rakod, ki ne szaggassa az oldalát. Nyomd az tehénhús közzé, hadd főjjön ott kevéssé csak az abállásig. Az mig fő, addig vágj kevés petreselyem-levelet össze kövér szalonnával, hozass lemonyát levelestül hozzá, ha lemonya nincsen, majoránnát, borsold, czitrommal is megcsinálhatod. Tyikmonyból, lisztből gyúrj tésztát, mennél keményben lehet. Azt nyujtófával, az mint szokták, nyujts el, az közepit dombosabban hagyd az szélinél. Azt az dombocskát nyomogasd alá az hüvelykeddel. Mikor egyik kezeddel nyomogatod az közepit, az másikkal az szélit feljebb, feljebb emeld, mikor az kezed fejére felvonhatod az tésztát, mint az fazokas az fazokat avagy csuprot felvonsza, födélnek valót is hagyj. Immár az tészta fazékban rakd be az tyúkfit, ugyanakkor kicsinynyé megsózzad. Az lemonyát kerekdeden metéld meg, rakd, az levében is tölts réá, rakd reá felűl az szalonnát, kenegesd reá aztán, gyenge majoránnát vágj belé az jó szagáért, és egy kis tehénhús levet is tölts reá. Az fedelet szép vékonyan nyujtsd el. Csak annyi legyen, mint az pástétom fazeknak az szája, tiszta vizzel aztán az körületit megértessed, hogy az fedele oda ragadjon, mint annak az módja, szedd be aztán szépen. Az fedelének az közepére egy kis kürtőt csinálj, abba egy tyúkfű formát csinálj tésztából, nyaka is legyen, s úgy tegyed az kürtőben; ezt is vízzel megkenjed, hogy inkább hozzá ragadjon, meg is csipkéld az szélit, hogy szebb legyen, az fazéknak az oldalát is, mikor felállatod. Ez itt immár kész, csak szépen pinnatában főzd meg, ha pinnatád nincs, kemenczében is meg lehet, de arra nagyobb vígyázás kell. Mikor fel akarod adni, az fedelét szépen felmessed, az levét megkóstoljad, mi hija vagyon, eligazítsad, az fedelét ismét jó melegen reá tegyed." I modified the translation by Bence Kovacs.

local word.[178] According to the Middle English Dictionary, though, the word "paste" appears to have meant not only bread dough, or (as "swete paste") unleavened dough;[179] but also a pastry cover in the fourteenth[180] and fifteenth[181] century. But still in the fifteenth century, it could also mean a dough flavoured with sugar and saffron, as well.[182] And it still could mean just a combination of flour and water even in the sixteenth century.[183]

So, when and where might edible pie crust have been invented? The multiplicity and fuzziness of meanings, as we have just seen at the English terms, makes it difficult to pinpoint. Alberto Capatti and Massimo Montanari trace this innovation to Renaissance Italy,[184] while Santich goes even earlier: it "occurred in the fifteenth century, and [it is] associated with Maestro Martino – whether or not he was the originator."[185] According to her, the growing number of "torte," "tourte," and "tartes" recipes, first in the *Libro del cuoco* and Maestro Martino's cookbook, then in French cookbooks, shows the spread of this innovation from "particularly […] Italy."[186]

---

[178] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* huff, *n.* "6. *local*. (See quots.) 1787 F. Grose *Provinc. Gloss.* Huff, light paste enclosing fruit or meat whilst stewing, so called from its huffing or puffing up in the operation. Generally made with yeast. *Glouc.* 1890 J. D. Robertson *Gloss. Words County of Gloucester* Huff, light pastry, or pie crust." Accessed May 17, 2020 at https://www.oed.com/

[179] *Middle English Dictionary s.v.* paste n. (1) "1381 *Pegge Cook.Recipes (Dc 257)*p.121 : Make a thynne Paast of Dow and make therof as it were ryngis; tak and fry hem in oyle de Olyve.

(a1398) **Trev.Barth.(Add 27944)*226b/b : Past ymade oonly of mele and of water hatte zima, as it were sine zima, wiþoute sourdowe.

(a1399*) Form Cury (Add 5016)*p.30 : Take flour of payndemayn and make þerof past with water.

a1400 *Lanfranc (Ashm 1396)*274/20 : He schal ete no swete breed, & al maner mete þat is maad of swete past [L pasta azima]." Accessed May 17, 2020 at https://quod.lib.umich.edu/m/middle-english-dictionary/dictionary

[180] *Middle English Dictionary s.v.* paste n. (1) "c1380 *Firumb.(1) (Ashm 33)*2763 : Capouns y-bake also tok he..& iij pecokkes y-bake on past."

[181] *Middle English Dictionary s.v.* paste n. (1) "a1425(?a1400) *RRose (Htrn 409)*7048 : He wole do come in haste Roovenysoun bake in paste.

c1450 *Hrl.Cook.Bk.(2) (Hrl 4016)*74 : Cover the coffyn with a lyd of þe same paste.

c1450 *Hrl.Cook.Bk.(2) (Hrl 4016)*75 : Make a large coffyn of faire paste.

?a1475 *Noble Bk.Cook.(Hlk 674)*53 : Tak pouder of pepper and canelle..meld it well with the fische, then close it up in the foile or paiste and bak it."

[182] *Middle English Dictionary s.v.* paste n. (1) "?a1475 *Noble Bk.Cook.(Hlk 674)*58 : Make a paiste of pured flour knodden with faire water, sugur, saffron, and salt."

[183] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* paste, *n.* and *adj*. "1526 W. Bonde *Pylgrimage of Perfection* ii. sig. Liiiv Mixtyng water with floure and werkyng it in to paste."

[184] Alberto Capatti and Massimo Montanari, "*Torte* and *Tortelli*," in Capatti and Montanari, *Italian Cuisine*, 60.

[185] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 66.

[186] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 71.

Santich admits that "torte" may have existed earlier: "the word was apparently first documented in Italy in the thirteenth century, and in Spain around the same time."[187] However, tart and *torta* (the Latin word and its descendants: Italian *torta*, French *to(u)rte*, German *Torte*) have an even longer history and a contested etymology.

Latin *torta* and *tortula* first occur in the Vulgate (Exodus 29: 23, Numbers 11: 8, 1 Chronicles 16: 3), where they appear to mean a kind of bread. In this sense, it means a "round cake (of bread)," and it has nothing to do with the past passive participle of the Latin verb *torquere* 'to twist.'[188] As the earlier, Hellenistic grammarian Erotianus glosses a Hippocratic word as a sort of bread baked hidden in embers, "which is called *turta*,"[189] an Egyptian etymology has been proposed.[190] The same word, "turta," appears on one of the Vindolanda tablets.[191] Be that as it may, by the eleventh century, *torta* meant rye bread (to be divided into quarters) and *tortula* a special treat given beyond the usual *libra* of bread at the five major holidays of the liturgical year for the monks in Cluny.[192] As for the English *tart*, it comes from thirteenth-century French *tarte*, which may or may not derive from Old French *torte*.[193] Later, Bartolomeo Platina derived the word from the "twisted" herbs in the tart's filling. Thus, in what seems to have been a characteristically Italian folk etymology, he made a difference between original Italian, or "Pythagorean" tart and the meat-filled, "Gallic" tart.[194]

---

[187] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 71.

[188] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* torte, *n.*

[189] Joseph Klein, ed., *Erotiani Vocum Hippocraticarum conlectio* (Leipzig: Libraria Dykiana, 1865), 56, s.v. ἄρτον ἐγκρυφίαν· […] εἰκὸς δὲ λέγειν τὸν ἐν θερμοσποδιᾷ ἐγκρυβέντα ὀπτηθῆναι, ὃν τοῦρταν καλοῦσιν.

[190] Henry Kahane and Renée Kahane, "The Role of the Papyri in Etymological Reconstruction," *Illinois Classical Studies* 3 (1978): 207-208.

[191] "*Vindolanda Tablet*, 2.180 is an account of the distribution of measures of wheat to named recipients, some of which was to be used for making twisted loaves (*turta*)." (Carol A. Déry, "Food and the Roman Army: Travel, Transport, and Transmission (with Particular Reference to the Province of Britannia," in Walker, ed., *Food on the Move*, 93.)

[192] Kirk Ambrose, "A Medieval Food List from the Monastery of Cluny," *Gastronomica* 6: 1 (Winter 2006): 16. "Pro signo panis sigalini et, qui torta vulgariter appellatur, iterum generali signo premisso hoc adde, ut crucem per medium palme facias pro eo, quod id genus panis dividi solet per quadrum. Pro signo tortule, que preter solitam libram datur in quinque principalibus festis, duos digitos, qui pollicem sequntur, paululum divisos pone oblique super duos alteros digitos eorum similes de altera mau [!] similiter divisos."

[193] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* tart, *n.*

[194] "Pulmentum quod vulgo tortam appellamus et hoc nomen a tortis et concisis herbis: ex quibus fere sit accepisse putarim […] Totam [!] igitur sive illa pythagorea [!] sit sive gallica [!] deinceps appellabimus." *Platyne*

As we can see, there was a similar multiplicity and fuzziness of meanings as with pie paste. Although Santich made a difference between old style pies, "pastez," and new style "torte" and "tourtes,"[195] both words could mean just a simple, flour-and-water dough or bread, and more refined, enriched crusts in different periods and places. The mere mention of these words in a recipe, without more detailed instructions as to ingredients, makes the two kinds of pastry difficult, even impossible to identify. To further complicate the matter: fifteenth-century Catalan "pasta" meant a combination of flour and oil.[196] Also, English "paste" seems to have contained butter, or butter and eggs in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.[197]

It would seem that Santich's method of tracing these words is not enough. Can we test her theory by looking at ethnonymic pie recipes, then? Do the numerous recipes for varieties of "Italian pies" reveal traces of this innovation and spread in European cookbooks? As we shall see, the expression "Italian pie" is a bit of a misnomer, except for the German cookbooks. Most recipes of this group claim to originate from one Italian regional cuisine or the other.

Parma tarts, and a tart from Romagna

Outside Italy, we find the first recipes for "torta premissana" and "tourtes Parmeriennes" in the fourteenth-century French *Modus viaticorum*[198] and in the Vatican MS. of the *Viandier*, respectively. The *Modus viaticorum* instructs to have a thick crust, "spissas crostas" out of pastry, "de pasta bene mazerada," and paint it with egg yolks, "dabis cum

De Honesta Voluptate (Cividale di Friuli, 1480), accessed June 5, 2020 at https://www.loc.gov/resource/rbc0001.2011thacher64760/?sp=134

[195] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 66.

[196] *Libre del Coch*: "Et après fes pasta qui sia feta de bella farina e pasta-la ab oli qui sia molt fi," cited by Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 72.

[197] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* pie paste "?1578 W. Patten *Let. Entertainm. Killingwoorth* 49 Butter for theyr pastiez, and pyepast.

1688 R. Holme *Acad. Armory* iii. iii. 84 Pie-paste, is fine Flour, Butter, Eggs, Kneaden, or Moulden together."

[198] BNF Paris MS. latin 8435, 27v-28r, accessed May 17, 2020 at https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10036651f Edition: Carole Lambert, "Trois réceptaires culinaires médiévaux : Les Enseignementz, les Doctrine et le Modus. Edition critique et glossaire détaillé," unpublished PhD diss., University of Montreal, 1989 (which I was unable to consult).

modulis ovorum." This is to contain a filling made with pre-cooked and deboned hens, cooked and chopped fat pork and salted meat, cheese, and egg yolks, flavoured with ginger, pepper, cloves, some mint and marjoram, and parsley.[199] The second recipe for "torta parmissa" asks for "sal oleum sucre et fac tuas crostas de pasta dura," salt, oil, and sugar in the stiff crust for a filling of various greens, de-boned, cooked fish, and eels (flavoured with pepper and saffron).[200]

While the *Modus* presents two, widely different recipes for the same "torta premissana" and "torta parmissa," both are, apparently, elaborate concoctions. And both defy Santich's distinctions to some extent. On the basis of a chicken pie recipe from the *Ménagier*, she posited that the old-fashioned pies contained raw, whole meat, which would have needed long hours of baking, "by which time the pastry would be tough, hard and inedible."[201] As opposed to this, the new "tortes" were filled with a mixture of various pre-cooked meats, vegetables, eggs, cheese, spices and other flavourings, "which required very little cooking."[202] The two recipes for "torta premissana" and "torta parmissa" certainly instruct to prepare this second kind of filling.

According to Santich, the shorter cooking time for the new "tortes" also meant that their rich crust could be endored with eggs or saffron, and sprinkled with sugar and spices. She adds, emphatically, "[t]hat this type of pastry was intended for consumption is indisputable; the sugar and spices scattered over the top crust were too valuable to be discarded."[203] However, the first

[199] "Si vis facere torta premissana decoque carnem porci recentem pinguem et carnem salsam Recipe gi[ngibre], pe[bre], giro[fle] mo[le] cum mente et modicum maiorane et julverti mo[le] totum cum caseo et dum cum madulis ouorum accipe postmodum carnem fractam minuter et dismembra ipsas gallinas coctas et coniunge totum deinde habeas de pasta bene mazerada et fac spissas crostas et dabis cum modulis ouorum" *Modus viaticorum.*

[200] "Si vis facere torta parmissa Recipe grelecos caulium et spinargia et borages et bladas et julvertum et de qualibus tenerimum quod inueniri poteris et parbollys hoc totum deinde Recipe piscem coctum mundum a ossibus et habeas pe[brum] sa[fran] mole cum pomis paratis post modum habeas piscem et herbas et mole totum et pone sal oleum sucre et fac tuas crostas de pasta dura deinde Recipe anguillam et fac de ipsa partes et fac tuum hey lieg… de l… pars supra crostam et asperge ipsas partes cum aqua crocea et coque" *Modus viaticorum.*

[201] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 69.

[202] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 73.

[203] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 72.

recipe for "torta premissana" instructs to make a thick crust (thick enough to hold the filling?)[204] *and* endore it with egg yolks. Also, the second recipe for "torta parmissa" requires a final wash of saffron and water.

These contradictions are even more palpable in the *Viandier*'s recipe.[205] On the one hand, the pastry case should be thick enough to hold the filling, and raised higher than other pies. The instruction to form crenellations in the pastry makes sense when it appears that partly, the filling will bear the banners of France and of the noblemen present. On the other hand, the elaborate filling is made of cooked and quartered chickens, or roasted or cooked pork or mutton pieces, which sit in a mixture of fried mutton, veal, or pork hash. This "tourte," supposedly of Parma or Parma style, might be, in fact, an imitation of a French castle, designed to be wondered at and eaten by royal and noble guests. If it is so, the lack of a top crust will mean that the endoring with eggs and saffron, and the (optional) scattering of pine nuts, Zante currants, and sugar will reach only the meat filling. Should we interpret this as evidence that the bottom crust served as a bowl out of which the guests removed and ate the meat?

At the end of this recipe, we find instructions for making golden toast – something similar to twentieth-century French toast, in fact. These instructions at the end of a pie recipe might be interpreted to mean that golden toast was intended to serve as sops. The guests might

[204] Cf. Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 70.

[205] "Tourtes Parmeriennes Prenez chair de mouton ou de veau ou de porc, et la hachiez competemment; puis fault avoir de la poulaille, et faire boullir, et despecier par quartiers; et fault cuire ledit grain avant qu'il soit hachié, puis avoir poudre fine et l'en espicier très bien raisonnablement, et frire son grain en sain de lart, et, après, avoir de grans pastez descouvers, et qu'ilz soient plus hault dreciez de paste que autres pastez et de la grandeur de petitz platz, et faictz en manière de creneaulx, et qu'ilz soient fortz de paste affin qu'ilz puissent porter le grain; et, qui veult, on y met du pignolet et du roisin de Corinde meslez parmy le grain, et du succre esmié par dessus, et mettre en chascun pasté iii ou iiii quartiers de poullaille pour fichier les bannières de France et des seigneurs qui seront en la presence, et les dorer de saffren deffait pour estre plus beaulx. Et qui ne veult pas tant despendre de poullaille, ne fault que faire des pièces plates de porc ou de mouston rosty ou boully. Et quant ilz sont rempliz de leur grain, les fault dorer, par dessus le grain, d'un petit d'oeufz bastuz ensemble, moyeulx et aubuns, affin que le grain se tiengne plus ferme pour mettre les bannières dedans. Et convient avoir du fueil d'or ou d'argent ou du fueil d'estain pour les dorer avant les banières.

Pour faire tostées dorées, prenez du pain blanc dur et le trenchiez par tostées quarrées, et les rostir ung pou sur le grail, et avoir moyeulx d'oeufz batuz, et les envelopez très bien dedans iceulx moyeulx. Et avoir de bon sain chault et les dorer dedans sur le feu tant qu'elles soient belles et bien dorées, et puis les oster de dedans la paelle, et mettez ès platz, et du succre dessus." Vatican MS., see Jérôme Pichon, Georges Vicaire, eds., *Le Viandier de Guillaume Tirel dit Taillevent* (Paris: Techener, 1892), 261-262.

have picked up these glorified pieces of bread to spoon up the spiced meat hash and eat it with. In that case, the crust need not have been eaten. No wonder the recipe does not specify the ingredients for the crust. It only has to be strong and raised high.

Decades later, Master Chiquart instructs to make a "tortre parmysine" which is no less elaborate and complicated as the *Viandier*'s version. His extremely detailed description helps in getting a much clearer picture than with many other cookbooks' recipes. For a flesh-day supper,[206] which is also a large feast, he recommends using the meat of three or four pigs, three hundred pigeons, two hundred chicks or one hundred young capons, and six hundred small birds of, apparently, other kind. All this meat should be cooked, the pork should be chopped small, and the birds should be quartered, then sautéed in lard. Master Chiquart instructs to have also six pounds of figs, dates, pine nuts and prunes each, plus eight pounds of raisins. These fruits and nuts, chopped small, are added to the hashed pork, along with sage, parsley, hyssop, and marjoram, plus a mixture of a quintal of cheese and six hundred eggs. This flavoured puree of pork, cheese, eggs, herbs, fruits and nuts will make the filling, but it needs to be cooked and stirred over a fire first. Spices (ginger, "poudre fine," grains of paradise, saffron, cloves) and sugar will be added to the filling only when it has been cooked.[207]

So, Master Chiquart's Parma tart has the elaborate, pre-cooked filling which, according to Santich, new-fashioned "tortes" should have. However, the description of the tart's assembly provides other details, too. Here, the crust is not made of dough or paste; it is composed of "nebles ensucrees," sugared wafers. The tart will be baked in "casses ou conchetes de terre," pans or earthenware vessels, which should be lined with lard first. Then, Master Chiquart instructs to make the bottom crust by laying down four or five layers of wafers. The spiced,

[206] "Pour le soupper: roustz de toutes manieres, ung buchat de connins, tortre parmysine, et la daudine des oyseaux de riviere, et ung boulli lardé." Terence Scully, ed., "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart, 1420 (Ms. S 103 de la bibliothèque Supersaxo, à la Bibliothèque cantonale du Valais, à Sion)," *Vallesia* 40 (1985), 101-231: 155.

[207] Scully, ed., "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart," 156-158.

sweetened pork mixture and the quartered birds should be also layered, but without any crust between the layers, it seems. Finally, a top crust should be put on in the same way, using four or five layers of wafers, and some cold lard put on top before sending it "au four qui soit bien trempé," to a well-heated oven.[208]

The use of an earthenware vessel and a hot oven reads like a combination of Italian and continental methods for baking. Maybe this is the reason why Master Chiquart has advice also for saving a ruined product. Although lard may have functioned as a protective cover at the bottom and a softening additive for the top crust, the pastry could still get burnt. In that case, advises Master Chiquart, scrape off the burnt pieces and have spinach and chard leaves at hand to replace the top crust. Only then will the pie be gilt and sprinkled with sugar. Just as with the *Viandier*'s version, this Parma tart should be decorated with the banner of the lord to whom it is served.[209]

In a controversial way, Chiquart's Parma tart has the characteristics of both the old-fashioned pies and the new "tortes." On the one hand, it is baked in an oven and it can get burnt. On the other hand, it has an elaborate, pre-cooked filling, its crust is made of sugared

[208] "Et sy faictes que vous ayés de belles casses et nectes, ou se vous trouvés conchetes de terre belles et nectes si en prennés tant que mestier en haurés pour faire vostres tortes parmeysines en tant grant quantité que vous en hayés de /47r/ remenant; et puis quant vous haurés vostres casses ou conchetes de terre belles et nectes si faciés que vous hayés .xx. ou .xxxm. de nebles ensucrees, et puis prennés vostres casses ou vostres conchetes et prennés du lart en quoy vous avés frit vostres oysellons et la poullaille si mectés dedans vostres cassetes ou conchetes de terre, et puis prennés vostres nebles et si mectés en chescune casse ou conchete de terre sur les fons et en l'environ ung lit des dictes nebles en tant qu'il en ait .iiii. ou .v. l'une sur l'autre; et sur lesdictes nebles si prennés de ladicte farce et en faictes ung lit, et puis dessus la farce sy mectés des oysellons et les mectés cza et la et non pas ensemble; et si mectés en my de deux oysellons ung quartier de pijons et d'autre part ung quartier de poullaylle en [my] de deux oysellons, et face cecy en maniere que des oysellons, quartiers de pijons que de quartiers de poullaille, soit fait bien et adroit ung /47v/ lit sur le lit de la farce ja posee; et dedessus ce lit fait de oysellons, quartiers de pijons et quartiers de poullaille si se face ung autre lit de la dicte farce, et dedessus ce lit fait de farce si mectés nebles sus par le mode et maniere qui est dist dessus comme elles sont mises sur le fons de la dicte casse ou conchete de terre; et, estre ce fait, qu'elle soit couverte bien et appoint des dictes nebles. Si prennés du lart froit et mectés par dessus, et puis mectés vostres tortes au four qui soit bien trempé" Scully, ed., "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart," 158.

[209] "et si soyés bien advisés que quant elles cuiront que vous ayés de feulles d'espinars et de blectes bien nectoiés et lavees affin que, se les dictes nebles brullent riens, que vous en meisiés par dessus. Et puis traisiés vostres tortes parmeysines et les rasclés bien et appoint en tant qui n'y demeure riens de brulé, et puis les mectés en beau platz; et, elles estans en platz, si prennés vostre or party et le mectés par /48r/ dessus vostres tortes parmeysines en maniere d'un eschaquier, et de la poudre du succre par dessus. Et quant l'on en servira, que sur chescune torte soit mise une banderete des armes d'un chescun seigneur qui de cestes tortes parmeysines sera servi." Scully, ed., "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart," 158-159.

wafers, softened with lard, and it is endored (with gold leaf, no less) and sprinkled with sugar before serving. All these details, but especially the use of gold leaf, make it highly unlikely that the crust should have been thrown away. Indeed, we have seen that Master Chiquart advises scraping off the burnt, inedible parts of the crust.

Do these French royal and princely *pièces de résistance* have any forebears in Italy? What was "torta" like in Parma? In stark contrast to this French recipe, we find mention of a dire concoction in the local chronicles. In the year 1247,[210] the *Chronicon Parmense* adds that, in the same time, there was a famine. Inhabitants of Parma ate linseed bread, raw greens, roots and fruit, and "there were *turtae* with two, four, or five crusts."[211]

Instead of a local recipe, we may take this an indication that "turta" was as common in thirteenth-century Parma as was bread. This description of "turta" as having multiple crusts or layers is also a new feature compared to the fourteenth-century French recipes; and may be interpreted as a tart without filling.

But it is another royal recipe,[212] the one found in the *Liber de coquina* that describes how was truly Italian "torta parmesana" like. The version in MSS. A and B[213] must have been

[210] Cf. Capatti, Montanari, "Introduction: Identity as Exchange," xvii. for dating it to the year 1246.

[211] "Item eodem tempore fuit fames valida in Civitate Parmae, ita quod panis factus ex farina sementis lini comedebatur pro bono & optimo pane. Et fiebant turtae in duabus crustis, quatuor, & quinque. Herbae crudae, radices, & fructu comedebantur ibi plenarie, & multi propter famem cum familiis eorum recedebant de Civitate, & ibant ad standum alibi." My translation. See Ludovicus Antonius Muratorius, ed., *Rerum Italicarum Scriptores ab anno aerae Christianae quingentesimo ad millesimumquingentesimum*… Vol. 9 (Milan: Societas Palatina, 1726), 772-773.

[212] Capatti, Montanari, *Italian Cuisine*, 7 mention "the Angevin kingdom of Naples."

[213] "V. 6. De torta parmesane: ad tortam parnesanam, accipe pullos bene depilatos et incisos uel demembratos et suffrige eos cum cepis bene cisis cum lardo in bona quantitate. Et decoctis ipsis pullis, pone desuper species trittas cum sale ad sufficientiam. Accipe etiam herbas odoriferas in bona quantitate, tere fortiter et super pone de safrano. Postea, accipe uentrem porci; elixa fortiter; excoria eam, in pinguedinem eius fortiter percute cum cutello et misce cum herbis predictis et aliquantulum de caseo grattato et distempera cum ouis. Et fac inde rauiolas albos. Et si in eisdem addideris petrosillum et alias herbas odoriferas, potes facere rauiolas uirides. Item, accipe amigdalarum mondatarum aliquam quantitatem et tere eas fortiter. Et diuide per medietatem, in quarum una parte pone de speciebus in bona quantitate et in alia ponas zucaram et de utrisque facias rauiolos semotim. Item, accipe budella porcina bene pinguia lota et imple ea de bonis herbis et caseo et lixa. Item, recipe presucum et ettiam salcicias et inscinde subtiliter et oua fracta commisce cum eis et ibi pone pullos prius dictos et sepe misce cum cocleari, donec sit spissum. Postea, remoue ab igne et assapora cum sale. Vltimo, recipe farinam albam mondatam et fac inde pastam solidam. Postea, forma ad modum testi et appone farinam parum inter pastam et testum cum cocleari. Postea, de brodio dictorum pullorum inunge pastam et facias in predicta pasta plura solaria. In primo solario pone carnes pullorum; in secundo solario pone rauiolos albos et saporem desuper; in tertio solario, pone presuccum et salcicias; in .4o. solario, de eisdem carnibus; in .5o. solario, de ceruellatis; in .VIo. solario, de

difficult to make and fit for a king, just as the last sentence reminds us. It is a complex pastry consisting of six levels of various fillings. It would seem that there is no pastry between the layers of filling, only a sprinkling of dates and spices. "Lastly," the recipe instructs, "take clean white flour and make a strong paste with it. Then, shape it so that it would fit the earthenware vessel, and with a spoon, put some flour between the paste and the earthenware vessel. Then, paint the paste with the broth of the foresaid chickens and make several levels in the foresaid paste… Then, cover it all with paste and put it over coals and an earthenware [lid] over it. And then, cover it with coals from above and in a subtle way and often take off [the lid] and paint it with lard."[214]

The elaborate, multi-leveled filling would certainly fit Santich's distinction between "pastez" and "torte." And yet, the paste proves a puzzle. It needs to be strong, certainly, to withstand the weight of all the filling. We get no further details as to its ingredients; it might be just flour-and-water. But it receives a very careful treatment. I suspect that the flour spooned in between the pastry and the baking vessel would act as a protective cover so that the surface of the pastry should not be burnt. Moreover, the finishing touches of chicken broth and lard should add some softness to the paste.

But most importantly, this pastry is baked in the Mediterranean manner, under a lid, between coals,[215] which makes for a more gentle baking. Santich describes the difference between the Northern French method of baking in an oven, and the Mediterranean way of baking under a "testo."[216] The implications of using a *testo* would, however, mean that the

rauiolis amigdalarum; et sic deinceps si habeas fercula. Et in quolibet solario, pone dactilos et species ad sufficientiam. Postea totum cooperias pasta et pone super prunas et testum desuper. Et postea, cooperi de prunis super et subtiliter et frequenter dictam tortam discooperias et unge cum lardo. Et si forte frangatur dicta torta, accipe pastam subtiliter operatam et balnea cum aqua et pone super fracturam et pone testum calidum desuper. Postea, quandoque uidebitur esse cocta, porta coram domino cum magna pompa." Thomas Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

[214] My translation.

[215] Cf. my Introduction, p. 3.

[216] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 72-73. Cf. Santich, "*Testo, Tegamo, Tiella, Tian*: the Mediterranean Camp Oven," in Tom Jaine, ed., *Oxford Symposium on Food & Cookery 1988: The Cooking Pot*, Proceedings (London: Prospect Books, 1989), 139-142.

pastry would not get burnt so easily. Sally Grainger has even found a similarity in making the crustless, ancient Roman *patinae* and medieval pies. Although she is also of the opinion that medieval "torte" shells were not necessarily eaten,[217] the slow and gentle cooking in the special earthenware vessel certainly did not burn the crustless *patinae*.

If not an evidence, this certainly goes some way against her assumption that strong pie paste must necessarily have been thrown away. In fact, we will see that German cookbooks and the sixteenth-century Transylvanian cookbook, which I have cited at the beginning of this chapter, have the same instructions for baking in a special vessel and painting the paste with lard or butter. This may also prove the international (French and German) popularity of the *Liber de coquina*.[218] The other versions of the *Liber*'s recipe for "torta parmesana" in MSS.

[217] Sally Grainger, "The *Patina* in Apicius," in Richard Hosking, ed., *Eggs in Cookery: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium of Food and Cookery 2006* (Totnes: Prospect Books, 2007), 76-84.

[218] Capatti, Montanari, *Italian Cuisine*, 8.

V,[219] S,[220] and Z[221] are not much different from each other, except that the Sankt Florian and Bologna copy sensibly omit the final instruction to present His Highness with the "torta."

In the Biblioteca dell'Università di Bologna MS. 158, where fol. 93r-102r contain MS. Z of the *Liber de coquina*, the preceding fol. 86r-91v preserved a fragment of another fourteenth-century cookbook. The index of this *Frammento* lists a recipe for "torta parmigiana." Unfortunately, the text itself ends after recipe CXXVII ("Se vuoli rinfuso"), and the recipe for Parma tart, which should follow, was not included.[222] However, another fourteenth-century Italian recipe indicates that regional Italian Parma tarts might have been similar to the one described in the *Liber de coquina*.

The fourteenth-century collection called *Libro per cuoco* (*Anonimo Veneziano*), found in Biblioteca Casanatense MS. 225, has a recipe for a "good Parma tart." For twenty-five persons, eight pounds of pork, twelve new and six hard cheeses, six chicken and four capons,

[219] MS. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Pal. lat. 1768., 174v-175v at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768 (See Chapter One, p. 5 on MS. V.)

[220] Sankt Florian, Codex XI. 100, ed. Adamson, "Mediterranean Cuisine North of the Alps," 246-247: "[fol. 216ra] 1. Ad faciendum tortam parmesanam [A v 6, B v 6, C 47, M 1 I, T 122, V 80] Accipe pullos bene depilatos et incisos uel demembratos et suffrige eos cum cepis bene tritis et cum lardo. in bona quantitate et decoctis illis pullis ad sufficientiam pone desuper species quod sufficiant et de sale / accipe etiam herbas odoriferas in bona quantitate et tere fortiterer [!] et super pone de Croco Accipe ventrescam porcinam et lixa fortiter et excoria eam et appone medullam siue pigwedinem eiusdem et percutias cum cutello spisse et fortiter et misce cum herbis predictis et cum aliquantulo de caseo gratato et accipe de hijs aliquam quantitatem et facias inde rauioloos albos. Accipe petrocillos et alias herbas odoriferas et caseum recentem et fac inde rauiolos virides et omnes superius dictas distempera cum ouis / / Accipe etiam amidalarum quantitatem mundatarum et tere ea [A v 6, B v 6, V 80 *eas*] fortiter et diuide per medietatem in quo vna parte ponas de speciebus in bona quantitate. Et in alia ponas zuccarum de vtrisque quantitatibus facias rauiolos semotim Recipe oua et fac ea plena Accipe etiam budella porcina bene pingwia et lota et imple ea de bonis herbis et caseo et lixa bene / / Recipe presucum crudum et incide subtiliter et sal similem [M 1 i *salcizias simili modo*] facias et ova fracta uel trita uel dilazata et misce cum quantitate herbarum primo superius dictarum et distemperato hec misce cum pullis predictis et in vase [Following *in* is deleted.] pone in prunis et misce frequenter cum cocleari donec sit spissum et postea distrahe ab igne et apporta de sale recipe farinam mundam et albam et fac inde pastam solidam et fac inde formam admodum teste et appone farinam paulisper inter pastam et testam et cum cocleari recipe de brodio predictorum pullorum et invnge eam pastam et facias in predicta pasta solarium carnium ipsorum pullorum In secundo solario pone rauiolos albos et saporem desuper. Et in tertio Solario pone persucum et sal [M 1 i *salicas*, V 80 *salcicias*] / In quarto solario de eisdem carnibus. In quinto de rauiolis amigdalarum et in quolibet solario. [fol. 216rb] ponantur daptile et etiam pone desuper de predictis carnibus et sapore in quolibet solariorum ponas species ad sufficientiam postea ponas pastam desuper quod. sufficiat et habeas prunas et frequenter discoperias et invnge cum lardo et si forte frangeretur torta predicta accipe pastam subtiliter operatam et balnea eam cum aqua et pone super fracturam et ponas testam calidam desuper et comede etc."

[221] Francesco Zambrini, ed., *Il libro della cucina* (Bologna: Presso Gaetano Romagnoli, 1863), 59-61: "De la torta parmesana."

[222] Olindo Guerrini, ed., *Frammento di un libro di cucina del sec. XIV* (Bologna: Nicola Zanichelli, 1887), 17.

twenty-four eggs, and one pound of dates are used, along with twenty-six and a half pounds of "sweet spice," and various herbs. If nothing else, the large number of persons and the comparatively great quantity of spices (more than one pound per person) indicates that this pie must have been extraordinary and maybe, intended for a feast. At the end of the recipe, it is even pointed out that the pie "needs to be … heavy with spice." Just as in the recipe for "torta parmesana" in the *Liber de coquina*, the cook is instructed to make white and green *ravioli* with some of the cheese, eggs, and herbs. These *ravioli,* the dismembered chicken, and the meat puree made with pork appear to make up the filling of the pastry, in different layers, just as in the recipe in the *Liber de coquina*. We are not told how to make the crust; only that the tart "needs to be yellow, and fat with lard." The recipe adds that it can be baked in a copper or earthenware vessel.[223]

Was a hard crust intended or assumed, similar to the one in the *Liber de coquina*? Or should we take the words "yellow, and fat with lard" as an indication that this was a new-fashioned tart, using crust with added lard and saffron? The same Venetian cookbook has a recipe also for "torta de Romania," which specifies that its crust has to be thin and yellow.

But this "torta de Romania" provides an interesting comparison to all the other Italian and "Italian" recipes, since the name does not appear in any other cookbook. According to this recipe, a "tart from Romagna" for twelve persons is made with six chicken, four fresh or aged cheeses, twelve eggs, thirty dates, a pound of raisins, a pound of sloes, half an ounce of

[223] "CXII. Torta parmesana bona. Torta parmesana per XXV persone. Toy octo libre lonza de porcho e toy XII casi freschi e toy VI caxi passi e XXVI e meza libra de specie dolze e VI polastri e quatro caponi, e toy la lonza del porco, alessala bene e quando l' è cocta batilla e batilla con essa quantità de menta e de petrosemolo; e toy VI caxi freschi e XXIIII ova de quelle che tu ay e lardo insalato tanto che basta e ben batuto, e specie e zafarano assai e de queste cosse fa un bon batuto e ben zallo. E tolli do caxi freschi e biancho d' ova e pestalo e fane rafioli bianche infina a VIIII con croste de pasta, e toy do caxi freschi e uno passo e menta e petrosemolo e pesta insieme e fane XII rafioli verdi. Toy IIII caxi e fane belle fette per traverso e toy li polli e smenbrali e fay de uno menbro doy e mitilli a friger in lardo insalato e ben distruto e ben collato e specie dentro a sofriger e anchora .I. datalli bene festugati de cinamo e de zenzevro e garofalli e miti questi rafioli a lessare in aqua; quando sono trati fuora polverizialli de specie dolze, o miti dentro a solo e poni crosta di sopra. Questa torta vole essere zalla e ben grassa de lardo e ponderossa de specie, e posse fare per piú o per meno persone e se tu la fa in testo de ramo, la vole pocho foco; in testo de terra ge volo assai foco." Ludovico Frati, ed., *Testi antichi di gastronomia: Libro di cucina del secolo XIV*. (Livorno: Arnaldo Forni, 1899), 57-58.

cinnamon strips, half an ounce of ginger, an eights of an ounce of cloves, half an ounce of saffron, two ounces of pine nuts, and four ounces "sweet yellow spices." The quantity of spice, and especially of cloves, seems more sensible than the one given for, previously, Parma tart. Although some of these ingredients are different (and may represent a different, regional taste), the methods seem to be just the same. As with Parma tart, the cook is instructed to make *ravioli* and dismember the chicken. Along with the fruits, nuts, and spices, these will be layered upon a thin bottom crust, "crosta sutille in lo testo." Its top crust should be also thin, "sotille," and yellow.[224]

Given these instructions, it would seem that Northern Italy started using enriched crust earlier than Naples whose practices the *Liber de coquina* documents. But all the Italian tarts appear to have been complex, multi-layered concoctions.

Parma tarts, Lombard tarts and custards

Such complex and refined pastries might have been tantalizing for commoners, as well. We find the first recipe for "tourtes Pisaines" or "tourtes Lombardes" in the *Ménagier de Paris*. In the book, a set menu for a flesh-day dinner recommends Pisan or Lombard tarts as a second course. They are called Lombard tarts "in several places," adds the author, because Pisa is in Lombardy. These contains chicks in the filling,[225] which seems to resemble the Italian recipes'

[224] "CXIV. Torta de Romania. A ffare torta de Romania per XII persone, togli VI polastri e 4 caxi freschi o passi e XII ova e XXX datali e una libra de uva passa e una de sosina e meza onza de cinamo intriego e meza onza de zenzevro e mezo quarto di garofalli e mezo de zafarano e do onze de pignoli mondi e quatro onze de specie dolze ben zalle; toy questi polastri ben lavati e smenbrati e mitili a sofrigere in lardo distruto e colato e la prima volta che tu li meti con li polastri sea specie dolze, e toy lo caxo fresco che tu ay e fa rafioli quanti ne pol ensier e lessali in aqua. Quando sono cocti polverizage de spesie fine e quando li polastri sono sofriti assay mitige uno meiole d' aqua, e quando sono apresso cocti, metige uno caxo strito e colato e VIII rossi d' ova e cinamo e zenzevro rosso; toy garofalli e pignoli mondi e uva passa bene lavate e di specie e zafarano assay e guarda queste cosse del tropo foco tanto che siano ben cocte e mitige de la crosta sutille in lo testo, e meti queste cosse dentro e rafioli e ogni cossa dentro a solo; e poni una crosta de sopra sotille e ben zalo. Questa torta vuol poco foco e sono a coxere may le croste a incorporare lo batuto, etc." Frati, ed., *Libro di cucina del secolo XIV*, 60-61.

[225] "…d'oiselets tourtes Pisaines (*id est* de Pise en Lombardie, et dit-l'en tourtes Lombardes, et y a des oiselets parmi la farce, et en plusieurs lieux cy-après dit tourtes Lombardes)" (Pichon, ed., *Le ménagier de Paris*, 93.)

way of adding chicken pieces. However, the *Ménagier*'s meaning of this will become apparent only in its recipe for chicken pie.

According to the *Ménagier*, ordinary chicken pie is made by having the chicken lie in paste, on its back, with its breast upwards, covering its breast with large pieces of lard, and covering it (with more paste?).[226] This is also the recipe Santich primarily bases her theory on.[227] But, the *Ménagier* goes on, chicken pie "à la mode Lombarde" is also made by larding a chicken and covering it with paste; except one now adds beaten egg yolks and whites, verjuice and powdered spice, as well.[228]

Note that we get no instruction as to the ingredients of the paste or the preferred baking method. Neither are the chickens pre-cooked (they are just cleaned). If Santich is right and ordinary chicken pie represents the old method, one suspects that the *Ménagier*'s recipe for Lombard chicken pie is just a poor, commoner's imitation of the genuine delicacy. Here, the filling is nowhere near the elaboration required in "torta parmesana." If anything, it rather resembles the fourteenth-century recipe for simple chicken or bird pie, "copum de pullis" from the *Liber de coquina,* made with stiff paste.[229] It is even possible that the *Ménagier*'s recipe used the appealing name of the new "tortes," but made do with an old pie.

The fact that the *Ménagier*'s "tourtes Lombardes" are also recommended as a fourth course in a fish-day dinner adds to the mystery.[230] If, similar to the two recipes found in the

[226] "Poucins soient mis en pasté, le dos dessoubs et la poictrine dessus, et larges lesches de lart sur la poictrine; et puis couvers." Pichon, ed., *Le ménagier de Paris,* 185.

[227] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 69.

[228] "Item, à la mode Lombarde, quant les poucins sont plumés et appareillés, aiez oeufs batus, c'est assavoir moyeux et aubuns, avec vertjus et pouldre, et mouillez vos poucins dedans: puis mettez en pasté et des lesches de lart comme dessus." Pichon, ed., *Le ménagier de Paris,* 185.

[229] MSS. A and B: "23. -- De copo auium: ad faciendum copum de pullis uel aliis auibus, depluma et monda eos; et demembrentur uel integre remaneant; sed magis proprie sunt demembrate. Postea, accipe pastam albam ualde duram et fac formam copi et ibi pone aues predictas cum agresta non tritta, safrano et speciebus trittis et paruo de aqua frigida et paruis larcellis. Postmodum claudatur de pasta desuper et coquatur in furno uel testo. Et da comedere." Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

[230] Pichon, ed., *Le ménagier de Paris*, 102.

Modus viaticorum, there was also a fish-filled variety of Lombard tart, the *Ménagier* does not give us the recipe for it.

Since Master Chiquart has an alternative, Lenten recipe for "tortres parmeysines," it is indeed likely that two pies made with different fillings were still called Parma tart. Because Master Chiquart recommends this one also for a supper course (just as he did with the meat-filled version), it seems that the difference was perceived as simply functional. "For the supper of those who do not eat meat … Parma tarts," writes Master Chiquart.[231]

In fact, the same fruits, nuts, herbs, spices and sugar are used for making "tortres parmeysines de poyssons." One just needs to exchange pork for tuna or carp, pike and eels; oil for lard; almond milk and "amidon" for cheese and eggs. The making of the crust is not described. But the final instructions are certainly interesting. Before the tarts are covered and sent to the oven, the cook has to put in three or four pieces of pre-boiled and fried eels. This has to be done "l'un cza et l'autre la, entant qu'ilz ne soient point ensemble;"[232] in the same

[231] "Pour le soupper de ceulx qui ne menguent point /65r/ de char: le poisson blanc en lieu de roust, ung broet de verjust sur le poysson frit, les tortres parmeysines, le poisson frit et le saupiquet sus, et ung boullir lardé de grosses tenches." Scully, ed., "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart," 170.

[232] "Or je, Chiquart, vueil donner a entendre a celluy qui sera ordonné a fayre les tortres parmeysines de poyssons, qui prenne les ventreches de tons s'il est en lieu ou il puisse avoir poissons de mer, et si non qu'il prenne tant plus de celluy de eaue doulce, c'est assavoir grosses carpes fendisses, grosses anguilles et lucz gros fendis, et de cela prenne tant grant quantité que il lui sera ordonné a faire desdictes tortes; et prennés de raisins confitz, prunes, figues, dactes, pignions, et de cela prennés d'une chascune ce que luy semblera de prendre selon la quantité desdictes tortes; puis, pour lesdictes tortres, qui soient despiecés, nectoiés et lavés et mis cuire bien et nectement ; et, estre bien cuis, si le tirés hors sur belles et nectes tables ou postz et qui soit estaillés des ossees et des arrestes tresbien et appoint affin qu'il n'y demoure nulz ossellez, et si les chapplés bien et minument; et les raisins dessusditz soient tresbien espicollés, le pignions tresbien nectoiés, les figues, prunes, et dactes soient taillees par minuz dees; et, toutes ces choses ainsi faictes, fors le grein, soient tresbien lavees en vin blanc et esgoutees, et puis les meslees avecques le grein du poisson dessusdit. Et encour plus fault avoir, selon la quantité desdictes tortres que avés a faire, que vous hayés de percy, de margellaine et de salvi, et d'une chescune herbe et de ceste herbe la quantité selon la force d'une chescune, c'est assavoir du percy mais et des autres mains; et qu'elles soient bien nectoyees, lavees et tresbien achiees et puis les mesclés avecques le grein dessusdit. Et, estre ce fait, ayés de bel oyle cler et nect et bien affiné et puis ayeés une belle poille grande et necte et soit assise sur beau feu cler et tout cela mectés dedans, et que vous ayés ung bon compaignion atout une belle, grande et necte cuillier qui mene tresbien et fort par ladicte poile; et faictes que vous haiés vostre lait d'amendres bien espés et coulés par l'estamine, et de l'amidon grant foyson selonc la quantité des tortres que vous avés et mectés tout dedans pour le lier; et puis mectés voz espices parmy vostre grein tousjours en broiant et menant parmy la poile, c'est assavoir gingibre blanc, granne de paradis et du poyvre pou, et du saffrant qui lui donne couleur, et du giroffle entier et du succre pisié en poudre grant foyson, et du sel pour raison. Et faictes que vous partissiés ait fait bien et appoint les crotelletes desdictes tortes et, estre faictes, si prennés de la farce dussusdicte et mectés en chescune ce que s'en devra faire. Et puis faictes que vous haiés tres grande quantité de bons et beaux trençons d'anguilles belles et bonnes qui soient bien et appoint cuictes en eaue et, estre cuictes, mectés les frire et essuier en de bel oyle et necte; et, estre frit, si en tirés dehors les arestes; et puis en une chescune torte si en mectés troys ou .iiiie. tros, l'un cza et l'autre la, entant

phrase that Master Chiquart has already used for sticking the birds in the pork hash used in his previous recipe for Parma tart. So, the exchange of quartered birds for eels still preserves the visual design of the Parma tart. Maybe this is the reason for the same name?

And yet, a few of the recipes for Lombard tarts or (according to the English way of naming them) custards are for meatless *and* fishless pies. For example, in the fifteenth century, *Le vivendier de Kassel* instructs to make a filling with eggs, cheese, sweet cream, and wine, flavoured with cinnamon and sugar.[233] Since the English word *custard* (which means just a concoction of milk, eggs, and sugar now) derives from French *croustade* and Italian *crostata*, both meaning "pie,"[234] the evolution of the English word's meaning may reflect the changes in the English pie's content.

The fifteenth-century Harleian MS. 279 has a recipe for "crustade lumbard," which is filled with just a mixture of cream, eggs (both the yolks and whites), bone marrow, dates and prunes, flavoured with parsley, sugar and salt.[235] In the same collection, the previous recipe for "crustade" is, actually, closer to the Parma tarts we have discussed so far, because it contains pieces of boiled veal "couched" in the egg-based filling.[236] And yet, this "crustade lumbard" is not Lenten fare, because the recipe instructs to omit the eggs and marrow, "ȝif it be in lente."

---

qu'ilz ne soient point ensemble; et puis couvrés les tortres et mectés ou four et, estre cuictes, mectés les par voz platz et en alés servir." Scully, ed., "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart," 171-172.

[233] Bruno Laurioux, ed., "Le vivendier de Kassel," in Bruno Laurioux, *Le Règne de Taillevent: Livres et pratiques culinaires à la fin du Moyen Âge* (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 1997), 305: "Pour faire une torte lombarde. Prenez oes fres, fin fromage fondant, gratté ou hachié menu ou par dez quarez, cresme doulce et vin, canelle et chucquere; batez tout ensamble puis ayez bure fres, fondu chault, mettez dedens, en retournant dilligemment qu'il narde."

[234] *Oxford English Dictionary s.v.* custard, *n.* and † crustade, *n.*

[235] "xvij. Crustade lumbard.—Take gode Creme, & leuys of Percely, & Eyroun, þe ȝolkys & þe whyte, & breke hem þer-to, & strayne þorwe a straynoure, tyl it be so styf þat it wol bere hym-self; þan take fayre Marwe, & Datys y-cutte in .ij. or .iij. & Prunez; & putte þe Datys an þe Prunez & Marwe on a fayre cofynne, y-mad of fayre past, & put þe cofyn on þe ovyn tyl it be a lytel hard; þanne draw hem out of þe ouyn; take þe lycour & putte þer-on, & fylle it vppe, & caste Sugre y-now on, & Salt; þan lat bake to-gederys tyl it be y-now; & ȝif it be in lente, lef þe Eyroun & þe Marwe out, [leaf 40, back.] & þanne serue it forth." Austin, *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books*, 51.

[236] ".xvj. Crustade.—Take vele, an smyte in lytel pecys in-to a potte, an wayssche yt fayre; þan take fayre water, & lat yt boyle to-gedere with Percely, Sawge, Sauerey, & Ysope smal y-now an hew; & whan it is on boylyng, take pouder Peper, Canell, Clowys, Maces, Safroun, & lat hem boyle to-gederys, & a gode dele of wyne þer-with. Whan þe fleyssche is y-boylid, take it fro þe broþe al clene, & lat þe broþe kele; & whan it is cold, take Eyroun, þe whyte & þe ȝolkys, & cast þorw a straynoure, & put hem in-to the broþe, so many þat þe broþe be styf y-now; þen make fayre cofyns, & cowche .iij. pecys or .iiij. of þe fleyssche in a cofyn; þan take Datys, & kytte

Another fifteenth-century collection, in the Harleian MS. 4016, includes a very similar recipe for "custard lumbarde,"[237] and a recipe for "custarde" (also with veal). This recipe for "custard lumbarde" also offers an alternative for Lent – the eggs and marrow should be exchanged for imitation cream, made with almonds. Both recipes for Lombard custard need a crust "y-mad of fayre past," and blind baked until it gets "a lytel hard" (as the recipe in the Harleian MS. 279 puts it). This combination of filling and crust seems to contradict Santich's distinction between the characteristics of the old pies and new "tortes."

The Wagstaff Miscellany (Beinecke MS. 163) also has a recipe for "crustad lumbard," which reads like a combination of English and continental recipes. As we have seen with the French recipes, Parma tarts (but certainly not Lombard pies) are usually filled with a puree in which larger pieces of meat or fish are set. In this English recipe, a "syrip" is made with cream (of cowmilk) and egg yolks, flavoured with spice powder, sugar, and salt, coloured with saffron and red sandalwood. The cook is instructed to "set … yn ther own syrip" dates, bone marrow, rabbits and small birds parboiled in broth, cloves, mace, raisins, and pre-fried pine nuts.

In Lenten time, the cook needs to exchange the cream and eggs for a thick almond milk. Interestingly, this Lenten version of the recipe does not use eel pieces (or other fish) instead of the meat pieces, but whole pears, boiled, filled with the same spice mix as used for the dates, and (optionally) even battered and fried. The substitution for pears is an English touch on the recipe. Certainly, the recommendation to gild the pear stalks is a curious one.[238] The sight of

hem, & cast þer-to; þan take pouder Gyngere, & a lytel verious, & putte in-to þe broþe & Salt; & þan putte þe broþe on þe cofyns, bake a lytel with þe fleyssche or þou putte þin lycoure þer-on, & lat al bake to-gederys tyl it be y-now; þanne *take [supplied by ed.]* yt owt, and serue hem forth." Austin, *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books*, 50-51.

[237] "Take good creme, *and ffoiles of [deleted in MS]**. and yolkes And white of egges, and breke hem thereto, and streyne hem alɬ þorgħ a straynour tiɬ hit be so thik that it woɬ bere him self; And take faire Mary, And Dates, cutte in ij. or iij. and prunes, and put hem in faire coffyns of paast; And theñ put þe coffyñ in añ oveñ, And lete hem bake tiɬ thei be hard, And theñ drawe hem oute, and putte the licoure into þe Coffyns, And put hem into þe oveñ ayeñ, And lete hem bake till they be ynogħ, but cast sugur and salt in þi licour whañ ye putte hit into þe coffyns; And if hit be in lentoñ, take creme of Almondes, And leve the egges And the Mary." Austin, *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books*, 74.

[238] "Make large cofynys take datys pyke out the skynnys & yf thu wilte thu may cut thy datys or els stop hem with blanch poudyr with yn & do ther to grete gobets of marye & couch ther yn rabets with the marye &

the gilt stalks sticking out of the custard would have been spectacular. Since, however, stalks are inedible, this seems to contradict Santich, according to whom gilding and endoring indicates that the part was intended to be eaten.[239]

In the Holkham MSS. 674, another fifteenth-century English recipe for "custad lombard" also uses dates, marrow and small birds parboiled in broth, cloves, mace, raisins, pre-fried pine nuts. However, the procedure seems to be the other way around. These larger pieces are put in the crust first, then the cook is instructed to pour upon them a "coup" of cream and egg yolks, flavoured with spice powder and salt, coloured with saffron and red sandalwood. On fish days, these are to be exchanged for pears filled with a spice mix and a "coup" of imitation cream made with almonds. Again, the pear stalks should be gilt.[240]

Apparently, fifteenth-century English cooks and their lords liked a much more liquid filling for the puree which encased the characteristically large pieces in a Parma tart. Made with just milk and eggs, it seems to be the ancestor of modern English custards. Indeed, it would have been so runny as to require an old-fashioned pie crust to hold the liquid until it sets. While this custom made a difference between English and French or Italian recipes for the same tart, milk for a filling and stiff crust were already used by the *Liber de coquina*. However,

small bryddys perboylyd well in fat broth & couch in þer to clovis macys reysons of corauns & fry pynes & strew þeron & set hem yn ther own syrip of creme of cowmylke yolkes of eyron & good poudyr sygure saundres safron & salt fyl hem ther with and on fisch days boyle wardons tendyr or othir perys pare hem & hole hem at the crown fil hem full of blaunch poudyr & turne yn the poudyr of gynger that the poudyr lese ther yn & set hem in cofyns & the stalkes vpward & yf thu wilte thu may turne hem that they be hid yn bature & fry hem or thu couch hem let no flesch come ther to make thy syripe of thicke mylke of almondys make vp thy crustardys as thu dedyst on fisch days when they be bake yf thu wilte thy may gylte the stalkys of the perys & syve hem forth" Fol. 71r, accessed June 5, 2020 at https://brbl-zoom.library.yale.edu/viewer/1013048

[239] See Chapter 2, p. 50.

[240] "To mak custad lombard mak a large coffyn then tak dates from the stones tak gobettes of mary and smalle birdes and parboile them in salt brothe and couche ther in then tak clowes mace and raisins of corans and pynes fryed and strawe ther on and sett them in the oven to bak and luk ye haue a coup of cowes creme yolks of eggs good pouderes saffron sanderes and salt then fill the coffins ther with, and on fishe daies boille wardens or other peres paire them and hole them at the crown then fill them full of blaunche poudur and torn them in blaunche poudur and skoche them all about that the pouder may abid ther in then set the stalks upryght and ye may mak your coup of creme of almondes and shak up your custad as ye did of flesche and when they be bak gilt the stalkes of the peres and serue them." Mrs. Alexander Napier, ed., *A Noble boke off cookry ffor a prynce houssolde or eny other estately houssolde: reprinted verbatim from a rare ms. in the Holkham collection* (London: Elliot Stock, 1882), 53-54.

in the fourteenth-century Italian cookbook and its copies, this pastry was called *copum* or *pastillum* "made with milk."[241] According to Santich, the Italian words *pastero*, *pastello*, and *coppo* meant the old-fashioned pie.[242] As we have seen, the same old-fashioned milk pie, combined with the visual design of French "Parma" tarts, could be called, a century later, a Lombard custard by several English cookbooks.

As opposed to these English recipes, a fifteenth-century Dutch version of Lombard tart seems to have been made with solid ingredients. Found in the University Library of Gent MS. 1035, and titled *Wel ende edelike spijse* by its editor and translator Christianne Muusers, the collection includes a recipe for "tart from Lombardy." Its filling seems to defy the medieval custom of separating meat from Lenten fare, because it is made by layering pike, pork ribs, and capons, cooked in water and chopped, with candied spices. As to how its paste should be made, Muusers translates "make a cup of dough, well deep (or: high?) as if it were meant for a [raised] pasty." This, and the final instruction to "pour boiling fat over it"[243] reads as a somewhat simpler or rudimental, but just as luxury version of the *Viandier*'s and Master Chiquart's Parma tarts.

It appears that in France, Lombard tart underwent even more radical changes. An updated and re-edited version of the *Viandier*, printed in 1555, in Lyon,[244] gives two recipes for "tortue de lombardie." The first recipe instructs to make a mixture out of new cheese, egg

[241] MSS. A and B: "III. […] 4. -- De copo siue de pastillo de lacte: ad copum de lacte, accipe pastam duram et fac copum sicut panem unius pastilli; et pone in furno parum, ut aliquantulum dure fiat. Deinde, accipe lac cum ouis batutis simul mixtis et safranum et proice in dicto copo, sed non multum impleas. Et decoque competenter et comede." Gloning, "Liber de coquina."

MS. V: https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768 fol. 185r-v

[242] Santich, "The Evolution of Culinary Techniques in the Medieval Era," 68.

[243] ".x. Omme te maken taerten van lombaerdien die neemt snouke in water ghezoden Ghesneden in cleenen sticken zwijnen rebben Capoene in water ghezoden wel vercoelt ende dan hebt dragye ende maect eenen cop van deeghe wel diepe als oft ware teender pasteyen doeter in een bedde van dragien dan van snouken dan van capoenen bouen ende worpter wallende smout vp" (Fol. 2v; Muusers' edition and English translation accessed June 2, 2020 at https://www.coquinaria.nl/kooktekst/Edelikespijse1.htm#1.10)

[244] *Livre fort excellent de cuysine très utille et proffitable, contenant en soy la manière d'abiller toutes viandes, avec la manière de servir ès banquetz et festins, le tout veu et corrigé oultre la première impression par le grant escuyer de cuysine du Roy* (Lyon, 1555). We find the colophon at the end: "Cy finist le livre de cuysine nouvellement imprimé à Lyon par Olivier Arnoullet, le IX. jour de mars CCCCC LV". Accessed June 7, 2020 at https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b8626163t/f7.image

yolks, and cream, flavoured with marjoram. Instead of a bottom crust, a mere sprinkling of flour is used in an iron vessel well lined with butter. The cook should pour the raw filling upon this layer of butter and flour, cover with another vessel, and set it in the embers. This is, in fact, a version of the Italian *testo* method, because embers should be put upon the top vessel, too. The recipe warns the cook to take care that the "tortue" should not get burnt. While the final sprinkling of rose water and sugar makes this an elite dish,[245] the lack of a crust moves it farther away from medieval "tortes" and closer to ancient Roman *patinae*.

The second, alternative recipe in the *Livre fort excellent* uses different ingredients and methods. Resembling English tastes, beef marrow is cooked and mixed with bread crumbs and egg yolks. Flavoured with cinnamon and a lot of sugar, this will be the filling for what seems a common pie. As opposed to the previous recipe for "Tortue de lombardie" in the book, now "a little of your paste" (of unknown composition) is baked over a gentle fire in a vessel previously lined with butter or lard. Although this one, also called "tortue de lombardie," receives a final sprinkling of sugar, the two recipes stand in stark contrast to each other in the book.[246]

[245] *Livre fort excellent,* [iii]. "Tortue de lombardie. Pour faire vne tortue de Lōbardie a la poille prenez de la mariolaine et la broyez en vng mortier. Et vng fromaige tout nouueau faict mettez y dessus moyeulx doeufz et vng peu de cresme pour le faire prēdre et les broiez bien fort ensemble en vng mortier – puis prenez vne poille de fer et lengressez bien de beurre et quāt elle fera bien engressee iectez le beurre hors & puis ayez de la belle farine & la semez tresbien en vostre poille & alors iectez en icelle poille vostre faict & le mettez sur cendres chauldes. Et couurez bien icelle poille dune aultre ou dung bassin & mettez du feu par dessus & gardez quelle ne bruste. Puis les lauerez par les costez de beurre – affin quelle ne tienne a la poille – puis quant elle fera cuicte mettez les en vng plat seme de belle eaue rose et grant foyson de sucre dessus."

[246] *Livre fort excellent,* [vi]. "Tortue de lombardie en aultre maniere. Pour vne tortue de lombardie – prenez de la mouelle de beuf fort boully & puis le haches bien deslye pour les espices de la canelle et grant foison de succre hachez auec la mye de pain & moieux deufz & hachez tout ensemble – puis fondes du beurre ou du sain de porc en vne poelle mettes vng peu vostre paste dedās la poille sur charbons et puis le descendes aulcuneffois quelle ne tienne a la poille - & si elle tient aulcunemēt si lengresses dung peu de beurre. Et la seruez toute chaulde & a le seruir mettes du succre dessus."

Italian pastries and tarts, a Genoan and a Bolognese tart

Fifteenth- and sixteenth-century German cookbooks invariably use names such as "pastries made in the Italian way," or "Italian tart." The only exception to this, it seems, is Sabina Welserin, who included a recipe for "Genoan tart." She does not give the ingredients for the crust. Her filling, however, is unique, and may be genuinely Italian, as it contains chard or spinach, cheese, milk.[247]

Welserin's recipe for "Italian tart" is even more curious. She instructs to make a filling with twelve pears, baked and mashed with sugar and twelve eggs. "Make a thin dough with eggs," she continues, "pour in the hot pan, and let it cook, until it is firm." Now, the filling should be poured in and baked.[248] On the face of it, her "Italian tart" resembles rather a pancake or a French *clafoutis*.

About a decade later, in 1566, a cookbook printed in Frankfurt published a different recipe for "pasteten auff Welsche art." The pastries' filling seems to be made in the same way Parma tarts and Lombard custards were made, since a mixture of three eggs, chicken broth, milk or wine, salt and chopped parsley should hold roasted chicken or other birds, roasted or cooked pears and sausage. The wheatmeal crust should be hard, but the earthenware vessel used for baking should be lined with butter. It would seem that German cooks found a way (or borrowed from Italians) to make hard paste edible, since the recipe emphasizes that "the hot

[247] "Ain jenaweser torta zú machenn Nempt 36 lott mangoldt oder spinetkraút, 6 lott geriben kesß, 5 lott bamel, 12 lott gerente milich, das keslin darúon, vnnd das kraút brien, aúch klainhacken vnnd als vnnderainanderrieren vnnd ain torta daraús machen mit ainer deckin/." Gloning, "Das Kochbuch der Sabina Welserin (c. 1553)."

[248] "Ain welschen torten zú machen/ Nim 12 regelbiren vnnd brats gar behendt aúff ainer gar reschen glút, bis die schelff verprent wirt vnnd das ander lind wirt, darnach treibs dúrch vnnd thú zúcker, zimerrerlach darein vnnd 12 air/ mach ain tinn taiglin an mit airen vnnd geúsß jn die haisß torttenpfannen vnnd lasß bachen, bis es hert wirt, vnnd geús den zwer darein vnnd lasß bachen." Gloning, "Das Kochbuch der Sabina Welserin (c. 1553)."

butter should reach the bottom," and "sink in." The cook is warned that "the crust should not get burnt."[249]

We find nearly the same recipe in a 1530 cookbook printed in Augsburg.[250] The book is a translation of *De honesta voluptate* by Bartolomeo Platina, but the German recipe does not seem to correspond to any of Platina's "torta" recipes.

Platina does have a recipe for "torta Bononiensis," but his Bolognese tart does not contain any meat. Filled with a mixture of cheese, eggs, lard or butter, and herbs,[251] it is different to German recipes for "Italian pies." It can be said that only Sabina Welserin's "Genoan tart" bears some resemblance to it.

---

[249] "Pasteten auff Welsche art zu machen. KNitt Weitzen Mehl/ vnd stoß es hart/ mach einen Hafen daraus in ein ander [<einander] verglast scherben gerecht/ thu warme Butter darzwischen/ klopffs gar wol zum teig/ füll drein Eyer/ Hünerbrüh/ Milch oder Wein/ würtz ab/ Saltz/ vnd gehackte Peterlin/ thu gebrahten Hüner vnd Vögel geschicklich auch darein/ desgleichen Fleisch/ Birn/ oder derre Würst/ alles gebrahten oder gesotten. Also setz du den Hafen zu einer Gluot/ on rauch/ je lenger je neher/ geus je ein wenig buttern in Scherben/ das der Teig nicht anbrenne/ wenn die füll backt/ reib die scherben offt vmb/ das es gleiche hitze hab/ geus je ein halben löffel Buttern daran/ so hat sie messig feucht/ stich je mit eim Höltzlin [Hötzlin] bis an Boden/ das die heisse Butter zu grund gehe/ so wird die füll hart/ darnach thu es vom fewr/ wenn die Butter eingesuncken/ so heb den Teighafen aus in ein Schüssel/ trag es so verdecket für. Wenn du den Scherben ansetzest/ bedeck jn mit einer warmen Pfann/ die so weit sey/ das sie die Scherben vnd Teighafen begreiff/ oder mach ein blat vom Teig/ daraus der Hafen gemacht ist/ vnd decks darüber. Oder zwecks auff ein Bret/ das da nicht zerfalle/ vnd lug dazu wie sich die füll setzt/ vnd das der Teighafen nicht anbrenne."

Thomas Gloning, "Koch vnd Kellermeisterey 1566," accessed June 5, 2020 at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/kochkell.htm

[250] "Pasteten auff Welsche art zumachen. Knit weytzen mehl vnd stoß hart / Mach ein hafen drauß in einander verglast scherben gerecht / thu warm butter dazwischenn / klopff gar wol zuo einer fülle drein / eyer / hünerbrü / milch oder wein / würtz ab / saltz vnd gehackten peterlin / thu gebraten hüner vnd vögel geschicklich auch darein / des gleich fleisch / biren oder dürre würst alles gebraten oder gesotten / Also setz den hafen zu einer glut on rauch / ye lenger ye näher / Geuß ye ein wenig buttern in scherben / daz der teig nit anbrinn / wenn die füll bacht / reib die scherben offt vmb / daz er gleich hitze hab / geuß je ein halben löffel butterdran / so hat sy messig feuche / stich mit eim höltzlin biß an boden / das dye heyß butter ȝegrunndt gehe / so würt die fül hert / Darnach thus vom fewr / wenn der butter eingesuncken / so heb den tayghafen auß in ein schüssel / Trags so verdeckt für. Wenn du den scherben ansetzest / bedeck yn mit einer warmen pfann / die so weyt sey das sie die scherben vnd tayghafen begreyffe / oder mach ein blat vom teyg darauß der hafen gemacht ist / vnd decks drüber / Odder zwecks auff ein pret das da nicht zerfalle / vnd lug dartzu wie sich die füll setze / vnd das der tayghafen nicht anprenn." *Von allen Speisen und Gerichten*, accessed June 5, 2020 at https://daten.digitale-sammlungen.de/bsb00022997/image_31

and

https://daten.digitale-sammlungen.de/bsb00022997/image_32

[251] "Torta Bononiensis. Tantum pinguis casei quantum in alba *[sc. torta, ie., libram ac semissem casei]* posui concides ac conteres. Trito, bletas, petroselinum, amaracum, lotum concisum, ova quatuor bene disfracta, tunsum piper, parum croci, multum liquaminis, aut butyri recentis addes, miscebisque manibus, ut unum prope corpus fiant. Hanc item in textum subcrustatum ad focum pones. Semicocta, quo coloratior videatur, ovum cum croco disfractum suffundes. Cocta putato, ubi superiorem crustam levaverit. Haec & superiore deterior est." *Platyne De Honesta Voluptate* (Cividale di Friuli, 1480), accessed June 5, 2020 at https://www.loc.gov/resource/rbc0001.2011thacher64760/?sp=134 and https://www.loc.gov/resource/rbc0001.2011thacher64760/?sp=135

Around 1490, a cookbook printed in Nürnberg gives another recipe for "basteten … nach welschem sitten." The pastry case is made with wheaten flour and cold water only; it should be quite hard. It is baked in an earthenware vessel which is lined with butter beforehand. Again, its filling is made with eggs, chicken soup, milk or wine, spices, parsley, roasted or parboiled chicken, roasted pears, sausage. This recipe warns that the butter should "sink in," and that it should be served for a king or a prince.[252]

Conclusion

The dichotomy posited by Barbara Santich between the old pies and new-fashioned tarts has proved a useful start. However, the recipes for Parma, Romagnan, Genoan, Bolognese, Lombard tarts and custards, and Italian pastries recorded in Italian, French, English and German cookbooks show a much more complicated picture. The places (to which these ethnonymic recipes refer) are all found in Northern Italy. Thus, it is possible that these recipes preserved regional customs and innovations (e.g., the invention of enriched crust), which the

[252] "Jtem basteten zu machen nach welschem sitten. Nym gut weytzen melb dz knit mit kaltem wasser den buch unter dem henden dz er sich laß welgen den leg in einem morser und stoß in gar wol dz er hert werd und würff ye ein steüblein melbs dar zu und wen dz melb üzert wirt so thu in auß und mach ein hafenn darauß in ein alten hafen scherben oder in einem üglesten scherben dz teig und hafen ein weite haben. Der teig eingesetzt den scherben eben gleich mit einem warmen milchschmalz zwischen dem scherben und den teighafen. Nun gehort ein fül darein von ayren. hünerbrw. milch oder wein gar wol geklopfft durch ein ander mit gutten wurtzen abgemacht auch mit saltz und gehackten peterling. dz thu alles in den selbigen teighafen. Vnd stoß auch gebraten oder zu gerust walt vogel darein: Oder gebratten hünner oder gesotten. Jtem die selbigen hüner und auch gebraten zu leg schon also. von geliden zu geliden gantz und gerecht und stoß die auff gericht darein oder von gebraten fleysch oder gebraten birnen oder dür würst gebraten oder gesotten. des geleichenn was du hast. und wen der anstoß geschicht so setz den scherben zu einer roschen gludt on rauch. des ersten feer herdan und ye baß und baß hin zu so begint die füll weiß sein und der teighafen riechen. so geuß ye leicht zu dem teighafen warms milchschmaltz dz der teig nit an den scherben bund. und wen die fül wirt bachen so reib den scherben offt umb das er geleich hitz hab und geuß yeleicht ein halben loffel vol schmaltz an die fül dz die ful die feuchten hab wol zu massen mach ein sauber hultzen spißlein den stos yeleicht in hafen biß an den boden das dz heiß schmaltz zu grundt gee so wirt es bratzlen und sieden biß die fülle hert werde so ist sein genug. So setz es von dem feuer und las das schmaltz einsincken heb den den teighafen auß dem scherben in ein weitte schussel und bedeck in mit einer sauberen schusseln trag in also zu tisch einem konig oder einem fürsten Ich geschweig dem gemeinen man und armer leut die auch gerne darauß essen mocht in ein dych werden. Auch merck wen man den scherben zu dem feür setzt so bedeck in mit einer warmen pfannen die so weit sey das sie den scherben und teighafen woll begrif. Hastu der nit so mach ein blat von dem teig da der haffen außgemachet ist und deck das blat daruber oder zwick es auf ein bret das da nit zu fal und lug dar zu wie sich die fül setz und dz der teighafen nit bryn." *Kuchemaistrey*, accessed June 5, 2020 at http://diglib.hab.de/inkunabeln/276-quod-2/start.htm?image=00046

merchants of these cities might have shared with their French, English and German business partners or customers. Nearly all the recipes require complicated methods and a large number of luxury ingredients, which would have made these dishes ideal for feasts and representation. However, it is also clear that a Lombard custard made in England was different to a Lombard tart made by the Dutch. Depending on what was locally available or customary, and which ingredients seemed to represent "Italian"-ness, widely different concoctions could convey the image of luxuriously rich Parma, Bologna, Lombardy or even Italy to local consumers. It would seem that the use of enriched pastry was just one of those methods used to achieve this purpose. When, in the sixteenth century, Bartolomeo Scappi made a difference between *pasticcio, crostata*, and *torta*,[253] it might have been just a *post facto* effort to try and find something systematic in the bewildering array of temporal and regional customs and nomenclature.

[253] Capatti and Montanari, *Italian Cuisine*, 60.

Conclusion

Modern national dishes and foods considered characteristic of a nation(ality), such as those discussed in my Introduction, are surrounded by a culture of exclusive and conservative, sometimes even anachronistic practices. However, my analysis of "Muslim" and "Italian" recipes found in Italian, French, Spanish, English, German, and Dutch cookbooks from the fourteenth to the sixteenth century has revealed a different relationship between food and ethnic identity in the Middle Ages and Renaissance. If nothing else, the sheer number of these recipes testifies to the lack of fear and the very presence of desires felt towards eating the Other. These recipes, making up a part of cookbooks written by and for royal, princely, noble and elite burgher households, can be interpreted as means of representation and luxurious exoticism.

While these recipes seem to have belonged to the international *haute cuisine* of the Middle Ages and Renaissance, just as blancmange did, their widely different varieties show a state of flux. Regionally, locally, and temporally, different ingredients and methods could signal "Saracen"-ness and "Italian"-ness to consumers used to regional tastes and food items. "Italian" pie meant a concoction of different ingredients, achieved by different methods, to the Germans, than "Lombard" custard did to the English. This variety reveals more about the consumers, and their concepts of Otherness, than it does about the supposed Others.

At the same time, we could trace the rise and fall of fashion, too. Peaceful contact with Islamic hosts could result in a taste for "Muslim" food. Spreading from Italy and, possibly, Andalusia, the wave of fashion reached the peripheries (England and Germany), manifested in transformations which could be termed inauthentic (e.g., the inclusion of pork and wine), and eventually, died down. The fashion of "Italian" pies, possibly spreading from Northern Italy, had a longer shelf life. Pies, tarts, and custards, made with a crust that contained butter or lard,

or was smeared with it, and a highly spiced filling consisting of several quality food items, were all the rage in the Renaissance still.

However, many questions remain. This thesis has made a survey of only "Muslim" and "Italian" foods. The analysis of all the other ethnonymic recipes still needs to be done. The limitations of this thesis also meant that sources other than cookbooks could be rarely entertained. Contemporary accounts, chronicles, descriptions of feasts, private letters and journals could provide us more details as to how these ethnonymic dishes were really experienced and used to convey meaning. These details could be used to examine medieval and Early Modern dishes in the field of consumption studies. Last but not least, the provenance, authorship and intertextual relations of these recipes need to be researched further. The fourteenth-century Catalan cookbook *Libre de Sent Soví* has just such a lucky mention of a cook, who worked at the court of the King of England. Similar international food networks and influences may be discovered to have existed in medieval and Early Modern Europe.

Bibliography

Unpublished primary sources

Debrecen. Tiszántúli Református Egyházkerületi és Kollégiumi Nagykönyvtár
MS. R 605

London, British Library
Harley MS. 1735. Available at
http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/FullDisplay.aspx?ref=Harley_MS_1735

New Haven, CT, Yale University Library, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library
MS. 163. Available at https://brbl-dl.library.yale.edu/vufind/Record/3432728

Paris, Bibliothèque national
MS. latin 8435. Available at https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10036651f

Vatican, Biblioteca Apostolica
MS. Pal. Lat. 1768. Available at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1768

Published primary sources

Ambrose, Kirk. "A Medieval Food List from the Monastery of Cluny." *Gastronomica* 6: 1 (Winter 2006): 14-20.

Arberry, A. J. "A Baghdad Cookery Book." *Islamic Culture* 13 (1939): 21-47 and 189-214.

Austin, Thomas, ed. *Two Fifteenth-Century Cookery-Books: Harleian MS. 279 (ab 1430), & Harl. MS. 4016 (ab. 1450), with extracts from Ashmole MS. 1439, Laud MS. 553, & Douce MS. 55.* London: Published for the Early English Text Society, 1888. Repr. London: Oxford University Press, 1964.

Birlinger, Anton, ed. "Kalender und Kochbüchlein aus Tegernsee." In Franz Pfeiffer, ed., *Germania: Vierteljahrsschrift für Deutsche Alterthumskunde* 9. Vienna, Carl Gerold's Sohn, 1864: 192-207.

Frati, Ludovico, ed. *Testi antichi di gastronomia: Libro di cucina del secolo XIV*. Livorno: Arnaldo Forni, 1899.

Gloning, Thomas. "Danner (ed.), Kochrezepte." Based upon Berthilde Danner, "Alte Kochrezepte aus dem bayrischen Inntal," *Ostbairische Grenzmarken* 12 (1970), 118-128. (= Cod. 793 der Donaueschinger Hofbibliothek, Bl. 27v-28v und 96r-98r). Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/kb-dann.htm)

_____ *Das Kochbuch der Handschrift >ÖB Basel D II 30< (15. Jahrhundert).* Tübingen/Gießen, 1993. Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/kochbuch_basel-d-ii-30_gloning-1993.pdf

_____ "Das Kochbuch der Sabina Welserin (c. 1553)." Based upon Hugo Stopp, ed., *Das Kochbuch der Sabina Welserin*. With a translation by Ulrike Gießmann. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag C. Winter Heidelberg, 1980. Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/sawe.htm

_____ "Liber de coquina." Based upon: Mulon, Marianne, "Deux traités inédits d'art culinaire médiéval." *Bulletin philologique et historique (jusqu'à 1610) du Comité des Travaux historiques et scientifiques. Année 1968: Actes du 93e Congrès national des Sociétés savantes tenu à Tours.* Volume I: *Les problèmes de l'alimentation*. Paris 1971, 369-435. The text of the *Liber de coquina* on pp. 396-420. Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/mul2-lib.htm

_____ "Mittelniederdeutsches Kochbuch." Based upon Hans Wiswe, ed., "Ein mittelniederdeutsches Kochbuch des 15. Jahrhunderts," *Braunschweigisches Jahrbuch* 37 (1956): 19-55. Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/mndk.htm

_____ " Das dritt Buoch sagt/ wie man von Ayrmilch/ vnd gemueß kochen soll." Based upon Balthasar Staindl, *Ejn sehr Künstlichs vnd nutzlichs Kochbuoch*. Augsburg, 1569. Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/staind3.htm

_____ "Koch vnd Kellermeisterey 1566." Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/kochkell.htm

_____ "Tractatus de modo preparandi et condiendi omnia cibaria." Based upon: Marianne Mulon, "Deux traités inédits d'art culinaire médiéval." *Bulletin philologique et historique (jusqu'à 1610) du Comité des travaux historiques et scientifiques. Année 1968: Actes du 93e Congrès national des Sociétés savantes tenu à Tours.* Volume 1: *Les problèmes de l'alimentation.* Paris 1971, 369-435. The text of the *Tractatus* on pp. 380-395.) Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/mul1-tra.htm

_____ "Viandier -- Bibliothèque cantonale du Valais, Sion, S 108." Based upon Paul Aebischer, "Un manuscrit valaisan du 'Viandier' attribué à Taillevent." *Vallesia* 8 (1953): 73-100. Available at https://www.uni-giessen.de/fbz/fb05/germanistik/absprache/sprachverwendung/gloning/tx/viandier-sion.htm

Guerrini, Olindo, ed. *Frammento di un libro di cucina del sec. XIV*. Bologna: Nicola Zanichelli, 1887.

Hausknecht, Emil, ed. *The Romaunce of The Sowdone of Babylone and of Ferumbras his Sone who conquerede Rome*. Re-edited from the unique MS. of the late Sir Thomas Phillipps, with Introduction, Notes, and Glossary, The English Charlemagne Romances, Part V. London: Early English Text Society, 1881.

Hieatt, Constance B. and Sharon Butler, eds. *Curye on Inglysch: Middle English Recipes*. London: Early English Text Society, 1985.

_____ and Robin F. Jones. "Two Anglo-Norman Culinary Collections Edited from British Library Manuscripts Additional 32085 and Royal 12.C.xii." *Speculum*, Vol. 61, No. 4. (Oct., 1986): 859-882.

Klein, Joseph, ed. *Erotiani Vocum Hippocraticarum conlectio.* Leipzig: Libraria Dykiana, 1865.

Kuchemaistrey. Nuremberg: Wagner, 1490. Available at http://diglib.hab.de/inkunabeln/276-quod-2/start.htm?image=00046

Laurioux, Bruno, ed. "Le vivendier de Kassel." In Bruno Laurioux*, Le Règne de Taillevent: Livres et pratiques culinaires à la fin du Moyen Âge.* Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 1997.

Möhren, Frankwalt. *Il libro de la cocina: Un ricettario tra Oriente e Occidente.* Heidelberg University Publishing, 2016.

Muratorius, Ludovicus Antonius, ed. *Rerum Italicarum Scriptores ab anno aerae Christianae quingentesimo ad millesimumquingentesimum…* Vol. 9. Milan: Societas Palatina, 1726.

Muusers, Christianne. "Wel ende edelike spijse." Available at https://www.coquinaria.nl/kooktekst/Edelikespijse1.htm#1.10)

Napier, Alexander Mrs., ed. *A Noble Boke off Cookry Ffor a Prynce Houssolde or Eny Other Estately Houssolde*: Reprinted Verbatim from a Rare Ms. in the Holkham Collection. London: Elliot Stock, 1882.

Perry, Charles, trans. "An Anonymous Andalusian Cookbook of the Thirteenth Century." In *A Collection of Medieval and Renaissance Cookbooks, II.* Society for Creative Anachronism, 6th ed., (1993), A1-A80.

Pichon, Jérome, ed. *Le Ménagier de Paris, traité de morale et et d'économie domestique composé vers 1393 par un bourgeois Parisien* […] Paris: Société des Bibliophiles François, 1846. Available at https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k83110x

_____ and Georges Vicaire, eds. *Le Viandier de Guillaume Tirel dit Taillevent.* Paris: Techener, 1892.

Platyne De Honesta Voluptate. Cividale di Friuli, 1480. Available at https://www.loc.gov/resource/rbc0001.2011thacher64760/?sp=134

Radvánszky, Béla, Báró, ed.. *Régi magyar szakácskönyvek.* [*Old Hungarian cookbooks*.] Vol. 1. Házi történelmünk emlékei… Második osztály. Szakácskönyvek. Budapest: Athenaeum R. Társulat, 1893.

Scully, Terence, ed. "Du fait de cuisine par Maistre Chiquart, 1420 (Ms. S 103 de la bibliothèque Supersaxo, à la Bibliothèque cantonale du Valais, à Sion)." *Vallesia* 40 (1985): 101-231.

[Taillevent.] *Livre fort excellent de cuysine très utille et proffitable, contenant en soy la manière d'abiller toutes viandes, avec la manière de servir ès banquetz et festins, le tout veu et corrigé oultre la première impression par le grant escuyer de cuysine du Roy.* Lyon: Olivier Arnoullet, 1555. Available at https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b8626163t/f7.image

de Villena, Enrique. *Arte cisoria*… Madrid, 1766. Available at https://digibug.ugr.es/handle/10481/34817

Von allen Speisen und Gerichten… Augsburg, 1530. Available at https://daten.digitale-sammlungen.de/bsb00022997/image_31

Warner, Richard. *Antiquitates Culinariae, or Curious Tracts relating to the Culinary affairs of the Old English, With a preliminary discourse, Notes, and Illustrations.* London, 1791.

Weiss Adamson, Melitta, ed., transl. *Daz buoch von guoter spise.* Medium Aevum Quotidianum. Sonderband IX. Krems, 2000.

_____ "Mediterranean Cuisine North of the Alps." In Katharina Boll and Katrin Wenig, eds*., kunst und saelde: Festschrift für Trude Ehlert*. Würzburg: Königshausen & Neumann, 2011, 239-258.

Zambrini, Francesco. *Il libro della cucina.* Bologna: Presso Gaetano Romagnoli, 1863.

Zaouali, Lilia. *Medieval Cuisine of the Islamic World: A Concise History with 174 Recipes*, Trans. M. B. DeBevoise. California Studies in Food and Culture. University of California Press, 2007.

Secondary sources

Buettner, Elizabeth. "'Going for an Indian': South Asian Restaurants and the Limits of Multiculturalism in Britain." *The Journal of Modern History*, 80: 4 (2008): 865 –901.

Caldwell, Melissa L. "The Taste of Nationalism: Food Politics in Postsocialist Moscow." *Ethnos* 67: 3 (2002): 295-319.

Cang, Voltaire. "Policing *Washoku*: the Performance of Culinary Nationalism in Japan." *Food and Foodways* 27: 3 (2019): 232-252.

Capatti, Alberto and Massimo Montanari. *Italian Cuisine: A Cultural History*. Trans. Aine O'Healy. New York: Columbia University Press, 2003.

Cohen, Jeffrey Jerome. “On Saracen Enjoyment: Some Fantasies of Race in Late Medieval France and England.” *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 31:1 (Winter 2001): 113-146.

Constable, Olivia Remie. “Food and Meaning: Christian Understandings of Muslim Food and Food Ways in Spain, 1250-1550.” *Viator* 44, 3 (2013): 199-236.

Cwiertka, Katarzyna. “Domesticating Western Food in Japan, a Comparative View.” In Harlan Walker, ed., *Food on the Move: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium on Food and Cookery 1996.* Totnes: Prospect Books, 1997, 64-74.

Déry, Carol A. ”Food and the Roman Army: Travel, Transport, and Transmission (with Particular Reference to the Province of Britannia,” In Harlan Walker, ed., *Food on the Move: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium on Food and Cookery 1996.* Totnes: Prospect Books, 1997, 84-96.

DeSoucey, Michaela. “Gastronationalism: Food Traditions and Authenticity Politics in the European Union.” *American Sociological Review* 75: 3 (2010): 432-455.

Douglas, Mary. “Deciphering a Meal.” In Carole Counihan and Penny Van Esterik, eds. *Food and Culture: A Reader*. New York and London: Routledge, 1997, 36-54.

Ferguson, Priscilla Parkhurst. “Culinary Nationalism.” *Gastronomica: The Journal of Food and Culture* 10: 1 (2010): 102–109.

Freedman, Paul. *Out of the East: Spices and the Medieval Imagination.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2008.

Grainger, Sally. “The *Patina* in Apicius.” In Richard Hosking, ed., *Eggs in Cookery: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium of Food and Cookery 2006*. Totnes: Prospect Books, 2007, 76-84.

Helstosky, Carol. “Introduction: Food and the historian.” In Carol Helstosky, ed., *The Routledge History of Food.* London and New York: Routledge, 2015, xii-xlvi.

Heng, Geraldine. *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018.

Hieatt, Constance B. “How Arabic Traditions Travelled to England,” in Harlan Walker, ed., *Food on the Move: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium on Food and Cookery 1996.* Totnes: Prospect Books, 1997, 120-126.

Hiroko, Takeda. “Delicious Food in a Beautiful Country: Nationhood and Nationalism in Discourses on Food in Contemporary Japan.” *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism* 8: 1 (2008): 5-29.

Hobsbawm, E.J. *Nations and Nationalism Since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Hyman, Philip. “Snail Trails.” In Alan Davidson and Helen Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy: Twenty Years of the Best Food Writing from the Journal* Petits Propos Culinaire. Berkeley: Ten Speed Press, 2002, 196-206.

Ichijo, Atsuko and Ronald Ranta. *Food, National Identity and Nationalism: From Everyday to Global Politics.* London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016.

Kahane, Henry and Renée Kahane. ”The Role of the Papyri in Etymological Reconstruction.” *Illinois Classical Studies* 3 (1978): 207-208.

Laurioux, Bruno. “De l’usage des épices dans l’alimentation médievale.” *Médiévales* 5 (1983): 15-31.

_____ “I libri di cucina italiani alla fine del Medioevo: un nuovo bilancio.” *Archivio Storico Italiano* 154 (1996): 33-58.

McDonald, Nicola. “Eating People and the Alimentary Logic of *Richard Cœur de Lion*.” In Nicola McDonald, ed., *Pulp Fictions of Medieval England: Essays in Popular Romance.* Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004.

Metro-Roland, Michelle Marie. “Goulash Nationalism: the Culinary Identity of a Nation.” *Journal of Heritage Tourism* 8: 2-3 (2013): 172-181.

Narayan, Uma. “Eating Cultures: Incorporation, Identity and Indian Food.” *Social Identities* 1: 1 (1995): 63–86.

Nasrallah, Nawal. “The Historiography of Arab Cuisine: Issues and Perspectives.” In Kyri W. Claflin and Peter Scholliers, eds., *Writing Food History: A Global Perspective.* London and New York: Berg, 2012.

Roden, Claudia. “Early Arab Cooking and Cookery Manuscripts.” In Alan Davidson and Helen Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy: Twenty Years of the Best Food Writing from the Journal* Petits Propos Culinaire. Berkeley: Ten Speed Press, 2002, 96-108.

_____ *The Food of Spain.* New York: Harper Collins, 2011.

Santich, Barbara. “*Testo, Tegamo, Tiella, Tian*: the Mediterranean Camp Oven.” In Tom Jaine, ed., *Oxford Symposium on Food & Cookery 1988: The Cooking Pot*, Proceedings. London: Prospect Books, 1989, 139-142.

Tayob, Shaheed. “Consuming, Producing, Defining Halal: Halal Authorities and Muslim Consumers in South Africa.” MA thesis, University of Cape Town, 2012.

Weiss Adamson, Melitta, ed. *Regional Cuisines of Medieval Europe: A Book of Essays.* New York and London: Routledge, 2002.

Wellman, Rose. “In a Basiji Kitchen: Halal Jello, Biomorality, and Blessing in the Islamic Republic of Iran.” *Gastronomica* 20: 1 (2020): 23–33.

Wilson, C. Anne. “The Saracen Connection: Arab Cuisine and the Medieval West: Part 1.” In Alan Davidson and Helen Saberi, eds., *The Wilder Shores of Gastronomy: Twenty Years of the Best Food Writing from the Journal* Petits Propos Culinaire. Berkeley: Ten Speed Press, 2002, 109-118.

Wilson, Thomas A. “Food, Drink and Identity in Europe: Consumption and the Construction of Local, National and Cosmopolitan Culture.” In Thomas A. Wilson, ed. *Food, Drink and Identity in Europe*. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2006, 11-30.

Woolgar, C. M. “Medieval Food and Colour.” *Journal of Medieval History* 44:1 (2018): 1-20.