

INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR CHILDREN WITH DISABILITIES IN UKRAINE

by Tetiana Palamar

MA Capstone Thesis
SUPERVISOR: Petra Bard
Central European University

© Central European University
June 3, 2020

Abstract

For a long time, many foreign discussions have focused on finding effective and efficient strategies for implementing such a phenomenon as inclusive education. Despite the widespread use of the notion “school for all” around the world, this concept is quite new for Ukraine, and therefore comes across many difficulties and obstacles.

Taking into account the legislative changes in Ukraine regarding the development of education for children with disabilities, this thesis is aimed at analyzing existing approaches both in Ukraine and abroad and to develop possible recommendations for improving the situation in the country.

Comparative examination of legislation and relevant social policies and practices in both Ukraine and the EU countries is the basis for the analysis. The first part of the thesis describes the general concept of inclusive education for Ukrainian legislation and presents the main approaches that prevail in educational institutions. The second part is devoted to international norms and standards regarding education and focuses on international documents and treaties concerning the right to education of children with disabilities. Meanwhile, the third part of the work is devoted to the analysis of compliance of Ukrainian legislation with international norms and standards of EU countries. Examples include countries such as France, Spain, Turkey, Slovakia and others. Finally, the thesis proposes to consider certain conclusions that can be drawn from the above-presented analysis and offers certain guidelines for possible improvement of the situation regarding access to education for children with disabilities in Ukraine.

The desk research and analysis will be used as main methods in the development of my Capstone Project.

Table of content:

INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 1. UKRAINIAN LEGISLATION AND POLICIES ON EDUCATION.....	5
1.1 DEVELOPMENT OF THE CONCEPT OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN UKRAINE.....	5
1.2 THE PROBLEMS STILL EXIST.....	7
CHAPTER 2. INTERNATIONAL NORMS AND STANDARDS ON RIGHT TO EDUCATION	9
2.1. INTERNATIONAL TREATIES	9
2.1.1. <i>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</i>	9
2.1.2. <i>Declaration on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons</i>	10
2.1.3. <i>Declaration on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities</i>	10
2.1.4. <i>Convention on the Rights of the Child</i>	11
2.1.5. <i>United Nations Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities</i>	12
2.1.6. <i>Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education</i>	14
2.1.7. <i>European Convention on Human Rights</i>	15
2.2. NATIONAL LEGISLATION ON EDUCATION IN SPAIN, AS AN EXAMPLE OF EU COUNTRY	16
CHAPTER 3. ANALYSIS OF COMPLIANCE OF UKRAINIAN LEGISLATION AND POLICIES WITH INTERNATIONAL NORMS AND EU COUNTRIES' STANDARDS	17
3.1. PROHIBITION OF DISCRIMINATION AS THE BASIS TO ACHIEVE INCLUSIVENESS.....	18
3.2. ARCHITECTURAL ACCESSIBILITY OF PUBLIC PLACES	21
3.3. PSYCHOLOGICAL PERCEPTION OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES IN THE SOCIETY	21
3.4. LEGISLATION ON EDUCATION FOR ALL CHILDREN DESPITE THE TYPE OF DISABILITY	22
CONCLUSIONS	24
ANNEX.....	27
BIBLIOGRAPHY	34

Introduction

The new conceptual foundations of social development, as stated in the UN Declaration on Social Development, are the ability of modern society to develop on the basis of tolerance, prohibition of discrimination, respect for human diversity, equality of opportunities, solidarity and security. These approaches are driven by the definition of the main goal of social development – the creation of the “society for all” that provides protection and full integration of all segments of population, including people with disabilities. Such integration is based on the concept of a holistic approach, which opens the way to the realization of rights and opportunities for each person and, above all, provides for equal access to quality education. Thus, the medical model of disability, which primarily looks at people’s disabilities and differences, is being replaced by the social one, according to which disability is caused just by the way society is organized. Therefore, the principle of accessibility shifts the emphasis from the medical aspects of disability and creates the basis for the protection and assistance for people with disabilities in order to reform the society and the environment, which, in turn, should be adapted to the needs of each person.¹

Accordingly, the medical model considers a person with a disability through the prism of his or her pathologies and focuses on the inability to perform the functions that non-disabled one can typically perform. Adherents of this model see people with disabilities as eternal patients, who cannot attend regular educational institutions, work or have a family. They simply do not consider such individuals to be full members of the society, and argue for the need of compensation only, for the losses that result from the limited capabilities of disabled individuals to participate in social life. Such compensation depends of various factors and is subject to a much lower constitutional

¹ А.А. Колупаева, ‘Інклюзивна Освіта: Реалії Та Перспективи [Inclusive Education: Realities and Perspectives]’, Monograph, *Summit Book, Inclusive Education Series*, p 5.

scrutiny than equality laws. Therefore, followers of the medical model perceive the solution to the problem of disability mainly through diagnosis, treatment and prevention. This again results in certain stereotypes regarding the social significance of such people.²

Thus, the medical model assumes that society should invest resources in health and social care in addition to other related services in an attempt to cure or cope with disability from a medical point of view. This is done in order to improve the functionality of the individuals and allow people with disabilities to live a life familiar to most members of society.³ Therefore, the medical model had influence over the legislation and policies for people with disabilities at the national level of some countries. China could serve as an example.⁴ Since medical care is the main issue for this model, the only answer at the political level is to change and adjust the healthcare system as a whole.⁵

The social model of disability, in turn, focuses on and wishes to alleviate barriers created by the society, which ultimately lead to the isolation of people with disabilities. Thus, equal rights and opportunities of people with disabilities, enshrined in legislation – often even constitutionally embedded – and implemented in all areas of life, are the basis of this model.⁶ The equality model is the basis of anti-discrimination laws protecting people with disabilities (i.e. the Disability Discrimination Act in the United Kingdom, the Americans with Disabilities Act of the United States, the Spanish disability law⁷, etc.). These laws focus on changing the society and its perception of disability in general.

² M. Retief, R. Letšosa, 2018, 'Models of disability: A brief overview', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, AOSIS, p 3.

³ *ibid.*

⁴ Arlene S. Kanter, *The Development of Disability Rights Under International Law. From Charity to Human Rights* (Routledge 2015), p 38.

⁵ Linda Waimarie Nikora, Rolinda Karapu, Huhana Hickey, Ngahuia Te Awekotuku, 'Disabled Maori and Disability Support Options' (Maori & Psychology Research Unit, University of Waikato and the Ministry of Health, 2004), p 5.

⁶ M. Retief, R. Letšosa (n 2).

⁷ Arlene S. Kanter (n 4).

Most countries follow a mixed model of disability. Ukraine is no exception (i.e. the law “On the basics of social protection of persons with disabilities in Ukraine”⁸). Nevertheless, the principle of equality recently has become an essential basis for our society, which, in turn, cause a lot of changes in providing social protection for citizens, especially for the most vulnerable ones, in particular Children with Special Educational Needs (SEN). The relevance of inclusive education is linked above all to the fact that the number of children in need of special education is steadily increasing. Today, only a small proportion of children with disabilities have the opportunity to attend schools and receive education⁹, which is why finding approaches to activating inclusive education is an important state issue.

To ensure the right to quality education for children with disabilities, international practice offers Children with SEN a wide variety of available forms of education: individual or distance learning, external studies, “schools of counseling classes”, “schools of second chance”, evening schools, and inclusive forms of learning. The latter allow children with disabilities to study together with their non-disabled peers, which effectively influence the level of their socialization.¹⁰

Inclusive education is a comprehensive process of ensuring equal access to quality education through the organization of activities in educational institutions based on the application of personally-oriented teaching methods, taking into account individual characteristics. Determination of optimal ways and means of implementation of inclusive education is based on the appropriate legal, educational, methodological, personnel, logistical and information support.¹¹

⁸ Verkhovna Rada, Закон України ‘Про основи соціальної захищеності осіб з інвалідністю в Україні’ [Law of Ukraine ‘On the basics of social protection of persons with disabilities in Ukraine’] 1991.

⁹ O.V. Zaiarniuk, ‘Інклюзивна Освіта в Україні: Проблеми та Шляхи їх Вирішення [Inclusive education in Ukraine: problems and solutions]’ (2016) Vol. 3, No. 2-3, p 190.

¹⁰ I. Gevko, ‘Інклюзивна Освіта в Україні: Сучасний Стан та Проблеми Розвитку [Inclusive Education in Ukraine: Current State and Problems of Development]’, Scientific bulletin of the Mykolayiv National University named after V. O. Sukhomlinsky. *Pedagogical Sciences* p 53.

¹¹ E.A. Danilavichyute, ‘Стратегії Викладання в Інклюзивному Навчальному Закладі: Навчально-Методичний Посібник [Strategies for Teaching in an Inclusive Educational Institution: a Teaching Manual]’. K.: Publishing Group "ASK", p 27

Thus, such an inclusive approach in education involves the creation of certain conditions to meet the generally accepted needs of each person in society, which is an essential basis for the social model of disability. It is worth noting here that these needs should be considered as the right of every person in any society, and not as something exceptional for an individual. Therefore, the presence of any type of disability should not entail the marginalization of an individual or a group of people as a whole. So, the basis of the inclusiveness model is the independent opportunity and the right of each person to participate in the social life of society and any other activity.¹²

Taking all above-mentioned into account, it can be assumed that the development of the concept of inclusive education is extremely valuable in the modern society. Thus, the main **purpose** of my research is to analyze the modified Ukrainian legislation on education and check its compliance with international standards.

The main **research question** of this Capstone Thesis is how the state can guarantee the inclusive education for children with disabilities in Ukraine considering all other challenges present in society. The subsidiary issues and questions following from the main research question will focus on discussing various concepts and recommendations regarding a possible improvement in the situation of access to education for children with disabilities. This applies not only to changes in legislation and policies of educational institutions in relation to people with disabilities, but also to changes in the perception and attitude of such children and adults in society in general.

¹² I. Dubkovetska, O. Budnyk, S. Sydoriv, 'Implementing Inclusive Education In Ukraine: Problems And Perspectives' (2016) Vol. 3, No. 2-3, p 100.

Chapter 1. Ukrainian legislation and policies on education

In the process of democratization of Ukrainian society, the idea of inclusive education is becoming more and more widespread. Thus, instead of the state-centric education system, where the main purpose was the formation of personality by certain standards and the subordination of person's own interests to the state, comes the so-called child-centered education system, which is dominated by orientation to the child's interests and attempts to meet its needs.¹³

Unfortunately, due to the Soviet upbringing, Ukrainian policy continued to ignore the problem of providing education for children with disabilities for a long time even after gaining independence. In a best-case scenario, specialized classes or boarding schools were created where children were isolated, which, in turn, caused irreversible psychological changes in the child's consciousness.¹⁴

1.1 Development of the concept of inclusive education in Ukraine

On July 5, 2017, President of Ukraine Petro Poroshenko signed the Law on amendments to the preceding law on education and implementation of an inclusive model.¹⁵ This Law establishes the right to education for persons with special educational needs and provides them with the opportunity to obtain education in all educational institutions, including free of charge education in state and municipal schools, regardless of the disability. Moreover, it is also possible to conduct distance learning and individual training, as well as participate in inclusive groups (classes) in general educational institutions.¹⁶ In addition, the concepts of “person with special educational

¹³ I. Gevko (n 10), p 52.

¹⁴ *ibid*, p 54.

¹⁵ Verkhovna Rada, 'Про внесення змін до Закону України 'Про освіту' щодо особливостей доступу осіб з особливими освітніми потребами до освітніх послуг' [On Amendments to the Law of Ukraine 'On Education' on the peculiarities of access of persons with special educational needs to educational services] 2017.

¹⁶ I. Gevko (n 10), p 54.

needs” and “inclusive education” were finally defined.¹⁷ Furthermore, according to the Law, children with disabilities from now on are given the opportunity to receive psychological-pedagogical and correctional-developmental assistance in educational institutions.¹⁸

Another important step initiated by the Ministry of Education and its partners in the direction of inclusive education is the creation of Inclusive Resource Centers (IRC).¹⁹ These are the fundamentally new institutions, which are built to address the special educational needs of children, not on the basis of the international classification of diseases, as previously, but on the basis of the international classification of the functions of children with special needs. This is a much more modern and less discriminatory approach.

In addition, in 2017, the Ministry of Education developed and approved the concept of a New Ukrainian School – a strategy for reforming secondary education by 2029. The main aim of the concept is to make teachers acquire new competencies in order to make the school environment more pleasant for the children with the help of partnership ideology – equality in cooperation between teachers, children and parents.²⁰ Consequently, every teacher will be able to work not only with non-disabled children, however, also with children with SEN.

Thus, one can assume, that the Law ‘On Education’ and further developments in this direction make a big accent towards the integration of children with disabilities into society and, therefore begins the fight against discrimination²¹ against people with disabilities, which they have been subjected to for a long time and, unfortunately, still are.

¹⁷ Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про освіту' [Law of Ukraine On Education] 2017, Section I Art.1.

¹⁸ *ibid*, Section IX Art. 76.

¹⁹ Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 'Про затвердження Положення про інклюзивно-ресурсний центр' [On approval of Regulations on the Inclusive Resource Center] 2017.

²⁰ Ministry of Education and Science, Концептуальні Засади Реформування Середньої Школи - 'Нова Українська Школа' [Conceptual Principles of Secondary School Reform - 'New Ukrainian School'] 2016, p 9.

²¹ Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про освіту' [Law of Ukraine On Education] (n 17), Section I Art. 6, Section III Art. 25, Section XI Art. 53-54.

1.2 The problems still exist

Nevertheless, a very low attention is paid to the architectural accessibility of educational institutions, which, in turn, is one of the main aspects in the ability of children with disabilities to receive education together with their peers.

Although large sums from the Ukrainian budget are earmarked each year to support children with SEN, subsidies are sent to schools and ministries for proficiency training of teachers and modification of educational curriculum, the most important problem – the problem of accessibility of educational institutions, remains open. During the 4 years of implementation of the reform, there are still very few institutions in Ukraine with architectural accessibility above the ground floor. According to operational information at the end of 2018, unimpeded access to the ground floor for persons with disability was provided in 11560 educational institutions, which is 74% of the total, but this result is still considered insufficient.²² Moreover, insufficient attention is paid to the accessibility of school areas: the presence of entrances and parking spaces for persons with disabilities, in particular for the carriage of children on wheelchairs; equipped sports grounds for children with disabilities and more. Very few educational institutions are equipped with special toilet rooms, which causes many problems in turn.²³ In addition, one should emphasize the inability of most educational institutions to teach children with visual or hearing impairments.²⁴ During my work at UNDP in the project “Mainstreaming Policies and Services for People with Disabilities in Ukraine”, I often came across the conviction of people that the institution can be

²² Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, ‘4 роки впровадження інклюзії: понад 12 тис школярів та майже 2,2 тис дошкільнят з особливими освітніми потребами навчаються разом з однолітками [4 years of implementation of inclusion: more than 12 thousand children and almost 2.2 thousand preschool children with special educational needs study together with their peers]’ (25 January 2019) <<https://mon.gov.ua/ua/news/4-roki-vprovadzhennya-inklyuziyi-ponad-12-tis-shkolyariv-ta-majzhe-22-tis-doshkilnyat-z-osoblivimi-osvitnimi-potrebami-navchayutsya-razom-z-odnolitkami>> accessed March 28, 2020..

²³ I. Gevko (n 10), p 55.

²⁴ N.N. Malofeev, *Западная Европа: Эволюция Отношения Общества и Государства к Лицам с Отклонениями в Развтии* [Western Europe: The Evolution of the Relationship of Society and the State to Persons with Developmental Disabilities] (M: Publishing House ‘Exam’, 2003), p 256.

considered accessible, if it is equipped with the toilet for people with disabilities and the necessary wheelchair ramp to enter the building. Many people forgot that people with disabilities are not only people with problems of the supporting-motor apparatus, it also applies to the visual and/or hearing impairments. In this case, special equipment is needed to educate such children. For example, tablets with built-in programs for reproducing what is happening on the screen; Braille books; Universal Design navigation; special audio equipment, etc.

In addition, if inclusive education in primary and secondary schools today is given special attention by the profile ministries, in connection with the favorable activities of former First Lady, Maryna Poroshenko, the situation in higher educational institutions is much more complicated. According to the statistics, from 2.5 million students of national educational institutions of the I-IV levels of accreditation, just over 10 thousand are people with SEN, which is less than 1% of the total number of people with disabilities of working age (up to 40 years).²⁵ One of the few things that the state has managed to do in this direction is to include children with disabilities of I-III groups²⁶ in the list of categories of people who receive the so-called “social scholarships”.²⁷ Other issues are resolved in the format of the administration of individual universities or local authorities.²⁸

²⁵ I. Gevko (n 10), p 55.

²⁶ Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 'Питання медико-соціальної експертизи' [Questions of medical and social expertise] 2009.

²⁷ Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про освіту' [Law of Ukraine On Education] (n 17), Section II Art. 21.

²⁸ I. Gevko (n 10), p 55.

Chapter 2. International norms and standards on right to education

A lot of theoretical and practical material has been produced in favor of inclusive education worldwide. Moreover, parents of children with disabilities, as well as public and charitable organizations that have a relevant profile of activity, extensively advocate for this concept. The experience of the principle of inclusion, which is widespread all over the world, shows a great prospect and a huge power in the direction of social development.²⁹

2.1. International treaties

The United Nations (UN) has been a recognized international lawmaker for almost a century, whose legislation has determined that disability issues concern not only the rehabilitation and social security, but also the human rights field.³⁰

2.1.1. Universal Declaration of Human Rights

The most fundamental embodiment of human rights at the international level is the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted in 1948. Although it did not directly address persons with disabilities, it proclaimed the equality of the rights of all persons “without distinction of any kind”.³¹ The preamble to this document states that “*recognition of the inherent dignity and of the equal and inalienable rights of all members of the human family is the foundation of freedom, justice and peace in the world*”.³²

²⁹ Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine (n 26).

³⁰ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 31.

³¹ Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948, Art. 2.

³² *ibid*, Preamble.

2.1.2. Declaration on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons

A significant and effective step in determining the rights of persons with disabilities was the adoption of the Declaration on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons by the United Nations General Assembly in December 1971. According to this Declaration, mentally retarded people have the same rights as all other members of society.³³ They have the right to medical care, financial support, education and training, living in the family ambience or in special institutions where the conditions are optimally approximated to normal living conditions, which affirms their right to full integration into society. The Assembly stated that legal safeguards should be put in place to protect persons with intellectual disabilities from any abuses, that may arise when their rights are restricted or revoked.³⁴

2.1.3. Declaration on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

In 1975, the Declaration on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was adopted. It states that: *“Disabled persons, whatever the origin, nature and seriousness of their handicaps and disabilities, have the same fundamental rights as their fellow-citizens of the same age, which implies first and foremost the right to enjoy a decent life, as normal and full as possible”*.³⁵ This regulatory document states that persons with disabilities should receive the necessary support to accelerate their integration into society.

At the same time, the international community has laid down the basic principles for policymaking for persons with disabilities, which made governments responsible for the implementation of a system that works to provide people with disabilities with the opportunity to achieve the same standard of living as other citizens, including the opportunity to receive education. The

³³ Declaration on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons, 1971, Art. 1.

³⁴ *ibid*, Art. 2-7.

³⁵ Declaration on the Rights of Disabled Persons, 1975, Art. 3.

international community condemned the marginalization of persons with disabilities and obliged the governments of the countries to eliminate conditions of discrimination in the society towards them.³⁶

2.1.4. Convention on the Rights of the Child

The issue of international regulation of the rights of children with disabilities is outlined in the Convention on the Rights of the Child. Ukraine has ratified the Convention in 1991.³⁷ It is based on the recognition of the rights of all children, the priority of universal values and harmonious development of personality, non-discrimination of a disabled child on any grounds.³⁸ For the first time in the history of international law, the priorities of the interests of the child in society have been identified, and the need for special care for disabled children has been emphasized.³⁹ Thus, Article 2 emphasizes that the presence of a child's disability is a basis for protection against discrimination.⁴⁰ However, the anti-discrimination principle does not limit the legal differentiation of children, since it permits the provision of special support for the education of children with disabilities or additional measures to fully open their potential. Article 3 of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child states that *"In all actions concerning children [...] the best interests of the child shall be a primary consideration"*⁴¹, which may also apply to the condition of not being isolated from their peers and society in general. Article 23 of the Convention states that *"[...] a mentally or physically disabled child should enjoy a full and decent life, in conditions which ensure*

³⁶ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 32.

³⁷ 11. Convention on the Rights of the Child

<https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=IV-11&chapter=4&lang=en> accessed April 2, 2020.

³⁸ Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1990.

³⁹ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 33.

⁴⁰ Convention on the Rights of the Child (n 38), Art. 2.

⁴¹ *ibid*, Art. 3.

dignity, promote self-reliance and facilitate the child's active participation in the community"⁴², as well as it has to be ensured that "[...] *the disabled child has effective access to and receives education, training, [...] in a manner conducive to the child's achieving the fullest possible social integration and individual development, including his or her cultural and spiritual development*"⁴³.

The right of all children to education is a key provision of this Convention, since education is recognized as a fundamental right of every person. The educational rights of children are addressed in Article 28, which holds that States Parties have to recognize the right of the child to education on the basis of equal opportunities, and taking this into account they have to proceed a number of functions, which consider, in particular, the availability and accessibility of education for all.⁴⁴

2.1.5. United Nations Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities

Ways to exercise the right of equal opportunities for education of persons with disabilities and the recognition of an integrated learning environment, was set out as a priority in the United Nations Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities. In particular, Rule 6. Education. states that "*States should recognize the principle of equal primary, secondary and tertiary educational opportunities for children, youth and adults with disabilities, in integrated settings. They should ensure that the education of persons with disabilities is an integral part of the educational system.*"⁴⁵

Thus, a number of conditions for education in an integrated environment have been identified. These include:

⁴² *ibid*, Art. 23(1).

⁴³ *ibid*, Art. 23(3).

⁴⁴ *ibid*, Art. 28.

⁴⁵ Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities 1993, Rule 6. Education.

- Education in regular schools involves the provision of interpreters and other relevant support services. Appropriate access and support services necessary to meet the needs of persons with various disabilities should be guaranteed;
- Responsibility for the education of persons with disabilities in integrated structures should rest with the comprehensive education authorities;
- Parents and organizations of persons with disabilities should be involved in the learning process;
- Education must be provided for all children with different forms and degrees of disability, including the most severe.⁴⁶

The education of persons with disabilities in integrated conditions provides the formation of appropriate educational policies, the development of scientific, methodological and educational support. Thus, “*States should:*

- *Have a clearly stated policy, understood and accepted at the school level and by the wider community;*
- *Allow for curriculum flexibility, addition and adaptation;*
- *Provide for quality materials, ongoing teacher training and support teachers.”*⁴⁷

Despite the fact that the “Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities” make integrated education a priority form for people with disabilities, they are not an alternative to special education at certain stages of educational reform. Thus, Rule 6, paragraph 8, states that the State may provide special education for persons with disabilities if the general education schools do not meet the above-described criteria for children with hearing or visual

⁴⁶ *ibid*, Paragraph 1-4.

⁴⁷ *ibid*, Paragraph 6.

impairments. However, it should be emphasized that such training should still be focused on the preparation for education in the general education system in the future.⁴⁸

2.1.6. Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education

Thus, these Rules provided the legal basis for developing further ways of improving the educational system for persons with disabilities. As a result, an innovative educational concept for all, set out in the Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education (1994), appeared.

Foremost, it holds that each child has unique characteristics, interests, abilities and learning needs, and that is why it is important to build education systems and modify curriculum accordingly in order to make it accessible for all. Children with SEN should have access to education in comprehensive schools, which should create the conditions for them, using pedagogical methods that focus primarily on children, their characteristics and needs. It is emphasized that regular schools with such inclusive orientation are the most effective means of combating discrimination, creating a welcoming atmosphere in communities, building an inclusive society and providing education for all.⁴⁹ All governments stressed that priority should be given to reforming the education system, enabling them to cover the education of all children, despite individual differences and difficulties; to legally recognize the principle of inclusive education; encourage in every possible way the exchange of experience with countries on inclusive education; to facilitate the participation of parents, communities, public organizations of persons with disabilities in the planning and decision-making processes related to meeting special educational needs; in every possible way contribute to the development of strategies for diagnosing and identifying special

⁴⁸ *ibid*, Paragraph 8.

⁴⁹ 'The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education', 1994, Art. 2.

needs of children, as well as to develop scientific and methodological aspects of inclusive learning; considerable attention should be paid to preparing teachers for work in inclusive education.⁵⁰

Moreover, the main claim of the Statement was that schools should accept all children, regardless of their characteristics (this also applies to children with mental or physical disabilities, gifted children, etc.).⁵¹ Therefore, it is schools that should become a model to focus on meeting the needs of people in a society where the differences are respected. Accordingly, education should be adapted to the needs of children, rather than “the child fitted to preordained assumptions regarding the pace and nature of the learning process”⁵². Schools must find ways to successfully educate all children, including those with severe physical or mental disabilities, and pedagogical activities that address the needs of students should be developed.

2.1.7. European Convention on Human Rights

With regard to the European Convention on Human Rights, Article 2 of Protocol 1 also enshrines the right of every individual to education.⁵³ Despite the fact that it cannot be interpreted as a requirement of Contracting States to create or finance the creation of special educational institutions, nevertheless, all countries must ensure effective access to already existing institutions, regardless of the gender, age or presence/absence of disability.^{54, 55} Moreover, this applies not only to access to primary education institutions, but also to secondary and higher education ones.^{56, 57}

⁵⁰ *ibid*, Art. 3.

⁵¹ *ibid*, Introduction (3).

⁵² *ibid*, Introduction (4).

⁵³ European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Protocol 1, Art. 2.

⁵⁴ *Çam v Turkey* App no. 51500/08 (ECtHR, 23 May 2016), para 43.

⁵⁵ *Catan and Others v the Republic of Moldova and Russia* App nos. 43370/04, 8252/05 and 18454/06 (ECtHR, 19 October 2012), para 137.

⁵⁶ *Çam v. Turkey* (n 54).

⁵⁷ *Leyla Şahin v Turkey* App no. 44774/98 (ECtHR, 10 November 2005), para 134-136.

2.2. National legislation on education in Spain, as an example of EU country

Considering and analyzing the national legislation of the EU countries, it can be noted that there are various kinds of documents that establish the basis of the functioning of the inclusive education system in a particular country. For example, in Spain, by Royal Decree-Law 334/1985 “On the Organization of Special Education” (March 20, 1985), children with disabilities were included in the general educational process (since the advantage and the need for joint integrated education in comprehensive schools for all people were proclaimed).⁵⁸ Despite the fact that before this Decree, children with disabilities could study in both comprehensive and special schools, after the introduction of the Law in 1990, it was legally stipulated that children with SEN should be included in the general educational process through the adaptation of each school curriculum to the individual capabilities of any of the students.⁵⁹ In 2006, a Law on Education was passed, according to which a school “without exception” was created, which meets the principles of equality and justice for every student, despite his/her conditions.⁶⁰

⁵⁸ European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education, ‘Country Policy Review and Analysis’, Spain, p 8.

⁵⁹ E. Pankova, ‘Нормативно-Правовые Основы Инклюзивного Образования в Странах Европейского Союза [Regulatory Framework for Inclusive Education in the European Union]’.

⁶⁰ European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education (n 58), p 6.

Chapter 3. Analysis of compliance of Ukrainian legislation and policies with international norms and EU countries' standards

Despite the fact that in many leading European countries (such as Italy, Austria, Germany, Sweden, etc.), the process of developing and supporting inclusion at state level is characterized by strong dynamics not only from the public but also from parents of children with disabilities. In Ukraine, today, it is still a pedagogical innovation which remains under implementation and is therefore characterized by many difficulties. First of all, it concerns the professional unpreparedness of local school teachers to work with children with SEN, compared to the teachers of special schools who unreasonably consider the services for children in their institutions more proper ones. Architectural inaccessibility of buildings, underdevelopment of the legal framework, the need for additional funding for inclusive educational institutions, academic overload of curriculum that is difficult to adapt to the needs of a child with mental disabilities, the negative attitude of parents of non-disabled children – all these complications significantly impede the process of development of inclusive education in Ukraine.⁶¹

As of today, special education in Ukraine has a complex, extensive and differentiated system of educational (correctional) institutions, rehabilitation and medical-pedagogical centers, educational-disciplinary complexes, special (correctional) classes at secondary educational institutions, etc. The development of the special education system is aimed at further differentiation and improvement of the existing network of special facilities, the opening of new

⁶¹ I. Gevko (n 10), p 53.

types of institutions, which will provide comprehensive assistance and support for children with SEN, as well as with the involvement of these children in a comprehensive school.⁶²

As the statistics show, at the beginning of 2019, only about 12,000 children with SEN were enrolled in general secondary education institutions, and nearly 2,200 in pre-school institutions.⁶³

Thus, the inclusion rate in Ukraine is only 7%. For comparison, in Lithuania this figure reaches 90%, Poland - 42%, Slovakia - 42%, Hungary - 57%, Italy - 99%, Norway - 90%, France - 25%.⁶⁴

As O. Zaiarniuk holds, the problems of Ukraine in the development of inclusive education can be divided into two levels: macro-level and meso-level. If the main obstacles of the macro-level relate directly to the legislation of Ukraine, then the problems of the meso-level are directly related to cultural stereotypes. Which relate not only to the reluctance of the existing education system to meet the individual needs of each child, but also to the lack of specific education standards and diverse educational programs for children with SEN.⁶⁵

3.1. Prohibition of discrimination as the basis to achieve inclusiveness

Analyzing the cases of the ECtHR regarding a violation of Article 2 of Protocol No. 1 (right to education) of ECHR⁶⁶, most of them go in conjunction with a violation of Article 14 (prohibition of discrimination)⁶⁷. For example, in *Çam v. Turkey*, which concerned the refusal to enroll the student to the music academy because of his disability (blindness), even despite his sufficient qualifications, the Court decided that there should be a clear consensus on the importance of the

⁶² I. Gevko, 'Значення Інноваційних Технологій При Здійсненні Інклюзивної Освіти [The Importance of Innovative Technologies in the Implementation of Inclusive Education]' (2018) No. 37, p 237.

⁶³ Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (n 22).

⁶⁴ I. Gevko (n 10), p 54.

⁶⁵ Zaiarniuk (n 9), p 191.

⁶⁶ European Convention on Human Rights (n 53).

⁶⁷ *ibid*, Art. 14.

principles of universality and non-discrimination in exercising the right to education, regardless of gender, age, religion or disability of a person.⁶⁸ In addition, the Court also emphasized that *“inclusive education has been recognized as the most appropriate means to guarantee those fundamental principles and that Article 14 of the Convention must be read in the light of the requirements of those instruments as regards reasonable accommodation”*.⁶⁹

Thus, there is a huge need to consolidate anti-discrimination legislation regards education. Analyzing the laws and policies of European countries, it can be concluded that this is exactly what distinguishes them from the Ukrainian system. First of all, the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights contains a prohibition of discrimination which gives the basis for EU countries on interpretation and implementation of this principle in their national legislations with regard to the education.⁷⁰ For example, in Slovakia, universities are places where non-discrimination laws must be enforced and the principle of equal treatment should be applied. Act No. 131/2002 on Higher Education guarantees all applicants and students equal treatment and the exercise of all the rights provided for in the Act. Disability discrimination is strictly prohibited.⁷¹ In Austria, universities are subject to the Federal Act on Equality of Persons with Disabilities.⁷² The National Higher

⁶⁸ *Çam v Turkey* (n 54), para 64.

⁶⁹ Frédérique Ast, Council of Europe consultant, ‘Study on Inclusive Education in Europe and in the Republic of Moldova: Reasonable Accommodation, Access to Education and Non-Discrimination’, p 13.

⁷⁰ The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, 2000, Art. 14.

⁷¹ 131/2002 of Law Code, Act of 21 February 2002 on Higher Education and on the Change and Supplement to Some Acts (Slovakia), Part Six Section 55 General Provisions (2) <https://www.unipo.sk/public/media/files/docs/u/eng/act_131_29_11_2005.pdf> accessed April 3, 2020.

⁷² Bundes-Behindertengleichstellungsgesetz – BGStG sowie Änderung des Behinderteneinstellungsgesetzes, des Bundesbehindertengesetzes, des Bundessozialamtsgesetzes, des Gleichbehandlungsgesetzes, des Bundesgesetzes über die Gleichbehandlungskommission und die Gleichbehandlungsanwaltschaft sowie des Bundes-Gleichbehandlungsgesetzes [Federal Act on Equality of Persons with Disabilities – FAEPD as well as Amendments to the Act on Recruitment of Persons with Disabilities, the Federal Act on Disability, the Federal Act on Social Services, the Act on Equal Treatment, the Federal Act on the Equal Treatment Commission and the Equal Treatment Advocate as well as the Federal Act on Equal Treatment] (Austria) 2005 <<http://ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/91145/105548/F1102195655/AUT91145%20Ger.pdf>> accessed April 3, 2020.

Education Act in Germany indicates that universities should make sure that students with disabilities do not experience any discrimination,⁷³ they have access to all academic services and courses, they receive support depending on their abilities in order to pass exams and meet the necessary requirements. All federal states have adopted relevant amendments to their laws on higher education. Similar anti-discrimination laws can be traced in many other European countries, in particular, in the Netherlands, Romania, Portugal, Sweden, the UK, etc.⁷⁴

Nevertheless, the importance of these laws is not only in their presence in the legislation of European states, but rather, their implementation by law enforcement agencies and citizens of the above-mentioned countries. Since, for example, in Ukraine, despite the fact that similar laws are also prescribed in country legislation,⁷⁵ due to the upbringing of the citizens and deliberate isolation of people with disabilities by society, the issue of discrimination is perceived in a completely different way. This can be seen even when traveling through European countries. The number of people with disabilities on the streets of European cities is much higher than in any of the cities of Ukraine. Based on this, one can conclude that such people simply do not exist in our society, although, in fact, they make up 6.1% of the population of Ukraine.⁷⁶ All this can be connected not only with stigma and discrimination, but also with the architectural inaccessibility of Ukrainian cities.

⁷³ Hochschulrahmengesetz (HRG) [National Higher Education Act] (Germany) 1999 Chapter 1 Section 1 General provisions para 2 Tasks (4) <<https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/hrg/HRG.pdf>> accessed April 3 2020.

⁷⁴ E. Pankova (n 59).

⁷⁵ Verkhovna Rada, 'Про засади запобігання та протидії дискримінації в Україні' [On the Principles of Preventing and Combating Discrimination in Ukraine] 2013.

⁷⁶ Charitable Foundation on Assistance to Disabled People of Ukraine, 'Статистика Инвалидизации в Украине [Disability Statistics in Ukraine]' <<http://ukrhelp.net/en/statistika-invalidizatsii-v-ukraine.html>> accessed April 3, 2020.

3.2. Architectural accessibility of public places

I already mentioned this aspect before, but I would like to emphasize again the importance of the principles of Universal Design in architecture,⁷⁷ which is set in the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities,⁷⁸ which Ukraine has ratified in 2009.⁷⁹ Since, first of all, this allows people with disabilities to attend any public places and enjoy life to the fullest, and more importantly, to participate in the social life of society as a whole. It is worth remembering that accessibility is not only ramps for people in wheelchairs, but also the proper navigation for people with visual impairments and mental disabilities, and much more.⁸⁰

With regard to the already-mentioned right to education within the Article 2 of Protocol No. 1 of ECHR, the accessibility of educational institutions is extremely important. For example, case of *Enver Şahin v. Turkey* raised the issue of access to university facilities⁸¹. Since the student got disabled during the period of his studies, and the university authorities insisted on the need for sufficient funds to carry out adaptation work, the ECtHR did not find this argument on behalf of the state acceptable, even despite the certain margin of appreciation granted to the national authorities in such issues. Thus, the Court hold the violation of Article 14, taken together with Article 2 of Protocol No. 1.⁸²

3.3. Psychological perception of people with disabilities in the society

There is an acute problem of psychological unreadiness not only of teachers, but of society as a whole, in the possibility of inclusive education of children with disabilities and their non-disabled

⁷⁷ National Disability Authority, 'What Is Universal Design' <<http://universaldesign.ie/What-is-Universal-Design/>> accessed April 3, 2020.

⁷⁸ Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) 2006, Art. 2, Art. 9 (1-2).

⁷⁹ Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про ратифікацію Конвенції про права осіб з інвалідністю і Факультативного протоколу до неї' [Law of Ukraine 'On ratification of the Convention on Rights Persons with Disabilities and Optional protocol to it'] 2016.

⁸⁰ National Disability Authority, 'The 7 Principles' <<http://universaldesign.ie/What-is-Universal-Design/The-7-Principles/>> accessed April 3, 2020.

⁸¹ *Enver Şahin v Turkey* App no. 23065/12 (ECtHR, 02 July 2018).

⁸² Frédérique Ast (n 69).

peers. Thus, a vicious circle, that must be fought, arises. As mentioned above, given the early introduction of young children with disabilities into society, they are perceived by other participants as individuals who deserve equal and high-quality treatment, like any other members of the community. Then again, it is worth noting the policy of European countries on this issue. Since inclusive education includes teaching children of all ages, from kindergarten to professional higher education, a child with a disability appears in the society, learns to establish contacts and communicate with others. Thus, it is extremely important to cultivate tolerance and respect for children with disabilities, to bear and forbear of human differences from a very young age.⁸³

3.4. Legislation on education for all children despite the type of disability

It is also worth noting the importance of ensuring proper prescribed legislation on education for children despite the type of disability. This mainly concerns the children with visual and/or hearing impairments. Unfortunately, in Ukraine this aspect of the education law is not covered, while in France, in accordance with the Education Code, deaf students have the right to receive education in two languages (both in French and French Sign Language) if their parents express such a desire. Thus, the Act of February 11, 2005 on equal rights and opportunities, participation and citizenship of persons with disabilities led to significant progress in educating children with hearing impairments. It is also worth mentioning the importance of popularization of sign language as a whole. For example, in France, students can choose the French Sign Language “as an optional subject for exams and competitive examinations, including in vocational training”.⁸⁴

Also, Decree No. 2005-1617 provides for special measures for students with hearing impairments during exams. Thus, they can get “extra time, examination secretaries, specific Braille equipment

⁸³ I. Dubkovetska, O. Budnyk, S. Sydoriv (n 12), p 102.

⁸⁴ Frédérique Ast (n 69), p 18.

(personal) or microcomputers, test items and exam subjects in Braille, sign language interpreters etc.”.⁸⁵ In addition, the French Ministry of Education regularly provides active support in the development and distribution of digital resources that can be used in the educational process and teaching practice on working with children with disabilities. Thus, within the framework of the Programme “Accessibility and Adaptability of Digital Resources for Schools” (*Accessibilité et adaptabilité des ressources numériques pour l’École – A2RNE*) created by the Ministry, all the necessary recommendations are regularly published for authors and publishers so that they can create digital resources accessible to people with disabilities from the very beginning.⁸⁶

⁸⁵ *ibid*, p 19.

⁸⁶ *ibid*.

Conclusions

Inclusive education is a fairly natural stage in the development of the education system, which is associated with a reinterpretation of society and the state's attitude not only to people with disabilities, but to each member of the public.

Today, this process, which is still new for Ukraine, acquires specific features and forms of implementation in individual communities, countries and regions, while having universal humanitarian origins and orientation. Until recently, the involvement of people, including children with disabilities, in the general educational environment was characterized only by spontaneous and informal nature, but today this process is becoming increasingly popular in the society.

New approaches to education for people with disabilities are driven by trends that have prevailed in the field of social policy over the last two decades. These are trends of social integration, full participation in the social life of all members of the community and the fight against any alienation. In the field of education, this means developing strategies to promote equality of opportunities.

Nevertheless, despite certain shifts in legislation on access to education for children with disabilities in Ukraine, having analyzed the international experience of countries such as France, Spain, Slovakia and others, it can be concluded that the situation in Ukraine is still far from ideal. This primarily concerns not only the availability of proper legislation as such, but also the accuracy of its implementation.

The analytical materials provided by many countries in the preparation of the Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on SEN demonstrated that the integration of children and young people with developmental disabilities is best achieved through education in inclusive schools in local

communities.⁸⁷ Mainly under these conditions children with SEN can achieve the best results in education and social integration. However, to achieve success in inclusive learning, efforts have to be made not only by teachers and school staff, but also by peers, parents, family members, etc.⁸⁸ Thus, there is a number of factors that compose the process of implementation of principles of inclusive education in society. Considering the basic principle of an inclusive school, which is that all children should study together whenever possible, without worrying about any difficulties or differences between them, the different needs of the students should be recognized and taken into account by developing appropriate curriculum, implementation of organizational measures, development of teaching strategies, use of necessary resources and connections with local communities. Children with SEN should receive the necessary additional support they may need to ensure effective learning.⁸⁹ Integrated education of children with disabilities and their peers guarantees mutual understanding and solidarity between children.⁹⁰

In addition, the prohibition of discrimination on any basis is considered to be the most important aspect in international practice, namely in issues regarding education for children in the EU countries. Undoubtedly, the international experience is much richer in this matter, however, the issue of discrimination is obviously acutely present in today's Ukrainian society. Despite the existence of a legislative framework that prohibits discrimination and promotes the principles of equality of all members of the society, due to inherited Soviet values and upbringing, it is still difficult for Ukrainian citizens to accept the differences of other people. Thus, the policy of the so-called "forced isolation" of people with disabilities still continues to prevail in the society. For

⁸⁷ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 39.

⁸⁸ 'The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education' (n 49), I. New Thinking in Special Needs Education (6).

⁸⁹ *ibid*, I. New Thinking in Special Needs Education (7).

⁹⁰ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 40.

the most part, it is worthwhile to understand that from this problem all the following follow, which irreversibly affect the development of a liberal and humane society.

All in all, the experience of foreign countries will serve as a good example for further improvement of the concept of inclusive education and changes in the society as a whole. Based on the above-mentioned analysis, it can be concluded that these reforms are inevitable for Ukrainian society, not only due to the strong influence of international norms in the context of European integration, but also in light of changes in the values of the younger generation.

Annex

Given that there are still some shortcomings in the education of children with disabilities in Ukraine, the following ways of improving the education system in the form of **guidelines** can be proposed.

1. Human rights education

Children from the very young age have to understand the importance of human rights issue and that is why they have to receive the proper and comprehensive education about their rights from the first classes of school.

2. Organization of the inclusive education centers

Given that staff in the special education institutions for children with disabilities are fairly knowledgeable and experienced in working with children with SEN, inclusive education centers or vocational training centers and coordinating centers for professionals, who work in regular schools, can be organized on the basis of such educational institutions.

3. Development of special training programs for inclusive school staff

Comprehensive training programs for inclusive school staff, as well as the provision of necessary support services, should be developed and implemented.⁹¹

4. Assistant in the development and preparation of inclusive curriculum

Specialized school staff can assist in the development and preparation of curriculum, the use of methodology to meet the specific educational needs of students.

⁹¹ 'The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education' (n 49), C. Recruitment And Training Of Educational Personnel (41).

5. Flexibility and accessibility of the inclusive curriculum

In order to ensure the successful education of all children at school, it is necessary to envisage the flexibility of the curriculum to meet the needs of children with different capacities and abilities. Children with SEN should receive the necessary additional support in the context of implementing a comprehensive curriculum, rather than using a specially designed one.⁹² In this way, only those students with mental and physical disabilities who cannot obtain education in a regular school because of the exceptional cases can still study in special schools.

6. Development of national, regional and local actions plans on inclusive education

Although the approaches outlined in the international instruments clearly outline the educational planning for children with disabilities, they still need some state adaptation. Therefore, in order to increase their effectiveness, they should be complemented by national, regional and local action plans, which should be based on the desire of society to provide education for all.

7. Implementation of the principles of inclusive education in all areas of the country

Analytical data show that special services are mainly provided to children with disabilities living in urban areas, and children from rural areas do not enjoy special services at all.⁹³ That is why government planning for education should concentrate on the education of all persons in all regions under all economic conditions, both in public and private institutions. Particular attention should be paid to participating in the educational programs of girls and women with disabilities, as gender-based violations contribute to additional difficulties.⁹⁴

8. Encourage the desire of schools to implement the inclusive education programs

⁹² *ibid*, Curriculum flexibility (32).

⁹³ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 41.

⁹⁴ 'The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education' (n 49), I. New Thinking in Special Needs Education (13).

The implementation of programs to assist those schools that have already expressed their desire to implement inclusive education and to start piloting projects in specific areas should be initiated in order to gain experience and to gradually implement it further.

9. Operation of the principle of equality

Despite the legally recognized principle of equality of opportunities for all citizens of Ukraine⁹⁵, education policy at all levels should provide that every child with a mental or physical disability will have the opportunity to attend a comprehensive school at the place of residence. Each case that violates this rule needs to be considered separately and considered permissible only when the needs of the child can only be provided in a specialized institution, however, even such education should be integrated as far as possible.

10. Consideration of abilities to receive education of every child

Particular attention should be paid to children and young people with complex and combined mental and physical disabilities, they must receive education adapted to their abilities. Thus, the individual differences and characteristics of each child should be taken into account, in particular one can mention sign language⁹⁶ as a means of communication between with children with hearing impairments or the availability of materials printed in Braille⁹⁷ for children with visual impairments.

11. Proper work on formation of perception of people with disabilities in the society

11.1. Integration of children with disabilities into the society with the help of promotion of positive examples

⁹⁵ Constitution of Ukraine, 1996, Section II Art. 24.

⁹⁶ The Outreach Center for Deafness and Blindness, 'Educational Service Guidelines for the Students Who Are Deaf and Hard of Hearing', p 51.

⁹⁷ Guy Le Fanu, 'Inclusive Teaching and Learning for Children with Visual Impairments. Teachers' Guide', USAID, p 32.

The development of inclusive schools requires some action, in particular, effective efforts to inform society in order to eliminate prejudices and to form a positive public opinion on the opportunities of persons with disabilities. Therefore, a significant attention should be paid to the dissemination of influence of public organizations, whose members are persons with disabilities, in particular by attracting the mass-media, as they can play a significant role in designing a positive attitude towards the integration of children with disabilities into society by introducing inclusive education through the promotion of positive examples.⁹⁸

11.2. Prohibition of discrimination

The development of inclusive schools requires some action on the part of effective informing of the society in order to eliminate prejudices and to form a positive public opinion on the opportunities of persons with disabilities. Mainly, it concerns the change of consciousness of the population as a whole regarding discrimination on any grounds.

11.3. Anti-bullying trainings

Special anti-bullying trainings should be development for all school staff including administrators in order to meet the requirements of inclusive school.

11.4. Educational support services

All students both in schools and higher educational institutions must have access to sufficient and proper support services.

11.5. Systematic data collection

Statistical data on bullying, dissemination of stigma and discrimination have to be collected systematically in order to have the opportunity to identify and monitor the nature of the problems.

⁹⁸ UNESCO, 'Open File on Inclusive Education: Support Materials for Managers and Administrators', 2001, p 28.

12. Encourage further work on new innovations in inclusive education on national and regional levels

Considerable attention should be paid to conducting research, both at national and regional levels, to develop innovative educational technologies that contribute to the successful education of children with disabilities.⁹⁹ Thus, the development of innovative technologies for teaching children with SEN should be included in the research programs of research institutes and centers, involve practitioners and joint experimental studies in foreign countries.

13. Recognition of ensuring inclusive education as the key area of governmental policies

The development of inclusive schools as the most effective means of ensuring the education of all children must be recognized as a key area of governmental policy. Moreover, this approach should be highlighted as a priority in the country's development Programmes and that is why all the measures of supporting the government in order to find effective and acceptable solutions should be encouraged. Only in such a way the appropriate resources can be mobilized.

14. Development of the educational programs for children of early age

Among the priority components of inclusive education is the upbringing and education of small children, since the successful operation of inclusive schools largely depends on the early identification, diagnosis and provision of assistance to small children with disabilities. Particular attention should be given to the development of educational programs for children under the age of 6, taking into account their potential for physical, intellectual and social development in preparing them for school.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁹ European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education (n 58), p 30.

¹⁰⁰ Kolupaeva (n 1), p 44.

15. Mobilization of community and NGOs in order to support the principles on inclusive education

The main governmental strategy should be to rehabilitate people with disabilities by mobilizing community and NGOs resources to support inclusive education. Such support should be provided jointly with persons with disabilities, their families, charities, etc.¹⁰¹ Nevertheless, public funding should still support and encourage inclusive schools; reorganize the overall administrative structure; remove barriers when moving from special school to the regular one; monitor students who have special educational needs and require appropriate support. Coordination between educational and health sectors, social security and employment agencies should also be organized, taking into account the assistance that specialized organizations and funds can provide.¹⁰²

16. Joint cooperation of parents and teaching staff

It is important to understand the impact of cooperation of teaching staff with parents, since it is the parents who have a decisive right in choosing educational services for their child, based on information about their child's special needs and opportunities. Therefore, parents should be seen as the most active partners in educational process, as they have the ability to control, monitor and participate in it. Therefore, they should be encouraged in every possible way.¹⁰³

17. Creation of a favorable educational environment

First of all, this concerns the development of legislation regarding the architectural accessibility of public places. All principles of Universal Design must be applied in order to consider the educational institution accessible. This concerns the proper navigation in and out of the building;

¹⁰¹ UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, 'Guidelines for Inclusion: Ensuring Access to Education for All', p 21.

¹⁰² 'The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education' (n 49), II Guidelines for Action in National Level (17).

¹⁰³ Guy Le Fanu (n 97), p 26.

access to materials printed in Braille; specially equipped classes and toilets for a comfortable use of all children, etc.

In addition, teachers and staff of the educational institution should be knowledgeable and possess high levels of special skills for communicating with children with hearing and / or visual impairment or any other disability and be able to behave with modern assistive technologies needed during the studying process.

Bibliography

- 131/2002 of Law Code, Act of 21 February 2002 on Higher Education and on the Change and Supplement to Some Acts (Slovakia)
<https://www.unipo.sk/public/media/files/docs/u/eng/act_131_29_11_2005.pdf>
accessed April 3, 2020.
- A.A. Kolupaeva, 'Інклюзивна Освіта: Реалії Та Перспективи [Inclusive Education: Realities and Perspectives]', Monograph, Summit Book, Inclusive Education Series.
- Arlene S. Kanter, *The Development of Disability Rights Under International Law. From Charity to Human Rights* (Routledge 2015).
- Bundes-Behindertengleichstellungsgesetz – BGStG sowie Änderung des Behinderteneinstellungsgesetzes, des Bundesbehindertengesetzes, des Bundessozialamtsgesetzes, des Gleichbehandlungsgesetzes, des Bundesgesetzes über die Gleichbehandlungskommission und die Gleichbehandlungsanwaltschaft sowie des Bundes- Gleichbehandlungsgesetzes [Federal Act on Equality of Persons with Disabilities – FAEPD as well as Amendments to the Act on Recruitment of Persons with Disabilities, the Federal Act on Disability, the Federal Act on Social Services, the Act on Equal Treatment, the Federal Act on the Equal Treatment Commission and the Equal Treatment Advocate as well as the Federal Act on Equal Treatment] (Austria) 2005
<<http://ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/91145/105548/F1102195655/AUT91145%20Ger.pdf>> accessed April 3, 2020.
- Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 'Питання медико-соціальної експертизи' [Questions of medical and social expertise] 2009.
- Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, Про затвердження Положення про інклюзивно-ресурсний центр [On approval of Regulations on the Inclusive Resource Center] 2017.
- Çam v Turkey* App no. 51500/08 (ECtHR, 23 May 2016).
- Catan and Others v the Republic of Moldova and Russia* App nos. 43370/04, 8252/05 and 18454/06 (ECtHR, 19 October 2012).
- Charitable Foundation on Assistance to Disabled People of Ukraine, 'Статистика Інвалідизації в Україні [Disability Statistics in Ukraine]'
<<http://ukrhelp.net/en/statistika-invalidizatsii-v-ukraine.html>> accessed April 3, 2020.
- Constitution of Ukraine, 1996.
- Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), 2006.
- Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1990.
- Declaration on the Rights of Disabled Persons, 1975.
- Declaration on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons, 1971.
- Е. Ранкова, 'Нормативно-Правовые Основы Инклюзивного Образования в Странах Европейского Союза [Regulatory Framework for Inclusive Education in the European Union]'.

- E.A. Danilavichyute, 'Стратегії Викладання в Інклюзивному Навчальному Закладі: Навчально-Методичний Посібник [Strategies for Teaching in an Inclusive Educational Institution: a Teaching Manual]'. K.: Publishing Group "ASK".
- Enver Şahin v Turkey* App no. 23065/12 (ECtHR, 02 July 2018).
- European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education, 'Country Policy Review and Analysis', Spain.
- European Convention on Human Rights, 1950.
- Frédérique Ast, Council of Europe consultant, 'Study on Inclusive Education in Europe and in the Republic of Moldova: Reasonable Accommodation, Access to Education and Non-Discrimination'.
- Guy Le Fanu, 'Inclusive Teaching and Learning for Children with Visual Impairments. Teachers' Guide', USAID.
- Hochschulrahmengesetz (HRG) [National Higher Education Act] (Germany) 1999 <<https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/hrg/HRG.pdf>> accessed April 3 2020.
- I. Dubkovetska, O. Budnyk, S. Sydoriv, 'Implementing Inclusive Education In Ukraine: Problems And Perspectives' (2016) Vol. 3, No. 2-3.
- I. Gevko, 'Значення Інноваційних Технологій При Здійсненні Інклюзивної Освіти [The Importance of Innovative Technologies in the Implementation of Inclusive Education]' (2018) Pedagogical Almanac: Collection of Communal Higher Educational Institutions Kherson Academy of Continuing Education, Kherson Regional Council. Kherson, No. 37.
- I. Gevko, 'Інклюзивна Освіта в Україні: Сучасний Стан та Проблеми Розвитку [Inclusive Education in Ukraine: Current State and Problems of Development]', Scientific bulletin of the Mykolayiv National University named after V. O. Sukhomlinsky. Pedagogical Sciences.
- Leyla Şahin v Turkey* App no. 44774/98 (ECtHR, 10 November 2005).
- Linda Waimarie Nikora, Rolinda Karapu, Huhana Hickey, Ngahuia Te Awekotuku, 'Disabled Maori and Disability Support Options' (Maori & Psychology Research Unit, University of Waikato and the Ministry of Health, 2004).
- M. Retief, R. Letšosa, 2018, 'Models of disability: A brief overview', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, AOSIS.
- Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, '4 роки впровадження інклюзії: понад 12 тис школярів та майже 2,2 тис дошкільнят з особливими освітніми потребами навчаються разом з однолітками [4 years of implementation of inclusion: more than 12 thousand children and almost 2.2 thousand preschool children with special educational needs study together with their peers]' (25 January 2019) <<https://mon.gov.ua/ua/news/4-roki-vprovadzhennya-inklyuziyi-ponad-12-tis-shkolyariv-ta-majzhe-22-tis-doshkilnyat-z-osoblivimi-osvitnimi-potrebami-navchayutsya-razom-z-odnolitkami>> accessed March 28, 2020.
- Ministry of Education and Science, Концептуальні Засади Реформування Середньої Школи - 'Нова Українська Школа' [Conceptual Principles of Secondary School Reform - 'New Ukrainian School'] 2016.

- N.N. Malofeev, Западная Европа: Эволюция Отношения Общества и Государства к Лицам с Отклонениями в Развитии [Western Europe: The Evolution of the Relationship of Society and the State to Persons with Developmental Disabilities] (M: Publishing House 'Exam', 2003).
- National Disability Authority, 'The 7 Principles' <<http://universaldesign.ie/What-is-Universal-Design/The-7-Principles/>> accessed April 3, 2020.
- National Disability Authority, 'What Is Universal Design' <<http://universaldesign.ie/What-is-Universal-Design/>> accessed April 3, 2020.
- O.V. Zaiarniuk, 'Інклюзивна Освіта в Україні: Проблеми та Шляхи їх Вирішення' [Inclusive education in Ukraine: problems and solutions] (2016) Vol. 3, No. 2-3.
- Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities, 1993
- The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, 2000
- The Outreach Center for Deafness and Blindness, 'Educational Service Guidelines for the Students Who Are Deaf and Hard of Hearing'.
- The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education, 1994.
- UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, 'Guidelines for Inclusion: Ensuring Access to Education for All'.
- UNESCO, 'Open File on Inclusive Education: Support Materials for Managers and Administrators', 2001.
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948.
- Verkhovna Rada, 'Про засади запобігання та протидії дискримінації в Україні' [On the Principles of Preventing and Combating Discrimination in Ukraine] 2013.
- Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про освіту' [Law of Ukraine 'On Education'] 2017.
- Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про основи соціальної захищеності осіб з інвалідністю в Україні' [Law of Ukraine 'On the basics of social protection of persons with disabilities in Ukraine'] 1991.
- Verkhovna Rada, Закон України 'Про ратифікацію Конвенції про права осіб з інвалідністю і Факультативного протоколу до неї' [Law of Ukraine 'On ratification of the Convention on Rights Persons with Disabilities and Optional protocol to it'], 2016.
- Verkhovna Rada, Про внесення змін до Закону України 'Про освіту' щодо особливостей доступу осіб з особливими освітніми потребами до освітніх послуг [On Amendments to the Law of Ukraine 'On Education' on the peculiarities of access of persons with special educational needs to educational services] 2017.