

“VICTIMS OR PERPETRATORS?”

Social Media Users’ Perception of Maternal Filicide-Suicide in Kazakhstan

by

Gulnara Miribayeva

Submitted to

Central European University

Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Sociology and Social

Anthropology

Supervisors: Dr. Alexandra Kowalski, Dr. Vlad Naumescu

Vienna, Austria

2022

Those, who are interested in the study of suicide,
please, don't forget to spread awareness in the meantime

Suicide Hotline in Kazakhstan: 1414

Austria: 017133374

Hungary: (46) 323 888

The United States: 988

Table of Contents

0.0 Introduction	1
1.0 Literature Review	4
1.1 Suicide and Social Structure	4
1.2 Suicide and Its Cultural Meaning	6
1.3 Suicide and Intentionality	9
2.0 Research Methodology	10
2.1 Research Questions	10
2.2 Description of Cases	11
Case#1	12
Case #2	13
2.3 Data Collection	16
2.4 Data Analysis	17
3.0 Results	18
3.1 The Codebook	19
3.2 The Numerical Distribution of Comments	24
4.0 Discussion	26
4.1 Connection Between the Article Content and the Comments Content	26
4.2 Sharing and Comparing One's Personal Experience	28
4.3 Mourning Online - The Casual Ways to Express Sympathy	29
4.4 The Mental Health Tension: Perpetuating the Stigma	31
4.5 The Religious Argument Tension: Between Heaven and Hell	34
4.6 The (Anti) Government Tension: A Sign of The Times	35
4.7 The Financial Hardship Tension: "But I Had It Worse"	38
4.8 The Gender Tension: Men, Traditional Values and Motherhood	40
5.0 Conclusion	42
6.0 Reference List	43

List of Tables

Table 1. Data Sources	20
Table 2. The Codebook	27
Table 3. Distribution of comments according to the emotional attitude	28
Table 4. Distribution of comments according to the intended purpose of the poster	28
Table 5. Number of mentions of the identified themes	225

0.0 Introduction

There are perhaps few news stories as disturbing as those of the cases of maternal filicide-suicide. Maternal filicide-suicide is the intentional killing of a child or infant by mother, who dies by suicide afterwards. In the last months of 2021, people in Kazakhstan were shocked by two similar cases of filicide-suicide. In October 2021 a young woman in Nur-Sultan attempted to jump from a high-rise residential building with an infant in her hands, but, to a great relief, was rescued by a passing-by police officer. In November 2021, in Almaty a 28-year old woman pushed her three children from a balcony of a high-rise building and then jumped herself. Reports on both cases, multiple investigations and psychological autopsies were posted by news channels on various social media. People were actively discussing the cases and sharing their opinions and feelings in the comments on open media platforms, such as Telegram, YouTube, and Instagram.

Filicide-suicide is, no doubt, a challenging object of research due to the lack of large enough sample sizes and very private nature of the investigation. 90% of violent homicides followed by suicide are committed by men¹, and most psychiatrists and criminologists agree that maternal filicide-suicide is caused by psychopathologies, which are triggered by extreme psychiatric disturbances.² Also, the propensity to filicide-suicide is highly associated with past suicide attempts.³

¹ Nikunen, M. Murder-suicide in the news: Doing the routine and the drama. n.p.: European journal of cultural studies, 14(1), 81-101, 2011.

² Debowska, A, D Boduszek and K Dhingra. Victim, perpetrator, and offense characteristics in filicide and filicide-suicide. n.p.: Aggression and violent behavior, 21, 113-124, 2015.

³ *ibid.*

In the news reports of the two above mentioned cases, the tragic incidents were framed primarily as suicide cases. The article titles used the language pertaining to the women being suicidal, rather than being murderers. This can be partially explained by the fact that the homicide and suicide were committed rather simultaneously. Therefore, the investigation of these cases can provide an important insight into the relevant issue of suicide in Kazakhstan. According to the latest WHO report⁴, Kazakhstan ranked 7th in the world for suicide rate among both sexes with 22,5 suicides per 100, 000 people. The most vulnerable social group is middle-aged men (this trend can be observed in the majority of countries in the world). The focus on the cases when the person who died by suicide is an aging man is extremely rare, almost non-existent, in the public discourse. While researchers attribute this trend to the high level of substance abuse, unreported and stigmatized mental health issues, unemployment and poverty, the discussion rarely touches upon these aspects as commentary on the problems with larger social structure in Kazakhstan. The explanations seem to be less concerned with external factors surrounding the case, and put almost the entire responsibility on the person. Although there might be variations if gender is taken into consideration, since Kazakhstan is a largely patriarchal society with strong traditional value system, where women are oftentimes considered to be able to express their agency to a lesser extent than men, that may affect the way narratives around suicide are constructed. The understanding of the way such narratives are formulated among general population is a very important step in conceptualizing effective suicide prevention agenda.

The comments section under posts on social media are a valuable resource rich in data, since the way people make sense of the cases can be easily accessed and observed in real time.

⁴ Suicide in the world: global health estimates (No.WHO/MSD/MER/19.3). n.p.: World Health Organization, 2019.

The interface of social media platforms invites the audiences to share their opinions and participate in the discussions, while remaining anonymous, which prompts people to actively engage with such heavy and stigmatized topic as suicide. The aim of this research is to examine the way people make sense of the cases of filicide-suicide online; what factors they find significant in the evaluation of cases and what can it tell us about the relations between the notion of self-inflicted death and social environment.

The structure of the thesis is as follows. The first chapter is dedicated to the review of relevant literature, which focuses on suicide's connection to social structure and cultural meaning. Moreover, the theoretical framework on the tension of intentionality and victimization in the discussion of suicide is outlined. The second chapter describes the methodology employed in this research. The Computer-Mediated Discourse Analysis approach was applied to 1000 comments collected from publications about the cases on three media sources. The next chapter shows the results of data analysis. The fourth chapter discusses the results in more detail. I argue that the way filicide-suicide cases are made sense of by the audience can be understood as the series of conceptual "tensions", meaning that people would often have polarizing opinions about such notions as mental health, attitude towards government, handling of financial hardships and so on. However, despite the existence of a multitude of opinions, the overwhelming majority of commentators were convinced that the root cause of why someone would want to kill themselves is located in the systemic issues in the political and social structure in Kazakhstan. After the discussion, the fifth section of this work draws the conclusions and recommendations for future research.

1.0 Literature Review

1.1 *Suicide and Social Structure*

The foundation of the sociological understanding of suicide has been laid by Emile Durkheim, whose work *Suicide* (1897/1951) remains a potent source of thought-provoking concepts and inspiration for other social scientists and suicidologists. By conducting a large cross-cultural empirical study, Durkheim came up with two main principles of his theory of suicide. First, he claimed that the suicide rate in a society directly depends on the group structure or certain characteristics of people's social relationships. Second, he continued that those characteristics of social relationships revolve around the level of integration or (moral) regulation of an individual in the given society. Working with the concepts of regulation and integration, Durkheim proposed four types of suicide: egoistic (too little integration), altruistic (too much integration), anomic (too little regulation) and fatalistic (too much regulation). Both concepts and the typology had a great influence on many studies in the fields of sociology and suicidology. In his rendition of Durkheim's work and with the purpose of filling the gaps in the structural theorisation of the four types of suicide, Bearman (1991)⁵ defines integration as "the extent of social relations binding a person or a group to others such that they are exposed to the moral demands of the group" and regulation as "the normative or moral demands placed on the individual that come with membership in a group". Ideally, both integration and regulation are

⁵ Bearman, P S. n.p.: The social structure of suicide. In *Sociological forum* (Vol. 6, No. 3, pp. 501-524). Kluwer Academic Publishers-Plenum Publishers, n.d., 1991.

balanced in the life of an individual, but “abnormal” or, as Durkheim would put it, “deviant” forms are possible. Thus, Durkheim suggested that understanding the subjective causal reasons of why an individual decides to die by suicide is of lesser importance than treating suicide as a “collective breakdown in the society”, shifting the study of suicide from being a concern of only psychologists and criminologists, to the inquiry of a vast number of social scientists.⁶

Durkheim’s study was definitely not without limitations. I will focus on two directions of elaboration on and criticism of Durkheim’s work - structural and cultural - leaving the methodological and feminist criticism out of the scope of this paper. A further research into connection between social structure and suicide conducted by structuralist and social network theorists pointed at the shortcomings of Durkheim’s research regarding his attempt to create a grand theory of suicide, which ended up being artificial in some regards. The real world is much more messy and much harder to wrap into a very strict framework. Working with the concepts of integration and regulation and preserving the original types of suicide coined by Durkheim, social network theorists came up with a more complex and elaborate scheme of the typology of suicide. In the analysis of religion-suicide link, Pescosolido and Georgianna (1989)⁷ propose that Durkheimian “society” should be understood as “network” and claim that three aspects of networks - their structures, function and operation in larger cultural context should be always taken into account. The outcome of their research is a theoretical relationship between potential suicide and network density, where non-affiliated athesits have low religious network density and high risk of suicide; “greedy group” cults have high network density and high risk of suicide; and catholics are located in the middle on the network density scale with the lowest risk of

⁶ Mueller, A S., S Abrutyn, B Pescosolido and S Diefendorf. The social roots of suicide: Theorizing how the external social world matters to suicide and suicide prevention. n.p.: Frontiers in psychology, 12, 763, 2021.

⁷ Pescosolido, B A. and S Georgianna. Durkheim, suicide, and religion: Toward a network theory of suicide. n.p.: American sociological review, 33-48, 1989.

suicide.⁸ Importantly, social network theories about suicide avoid Durkheim's positive view on the significance of personal ties, proposing that an individual may be affected more profoundly by the presence of negative ties, rather than their absence.⁹ In addition, the findings of similar studies applying Durkhemian concepts and structuralist theoretical stance collectively articulated a very important insight into suicide that "connectedness is protective only to a point" and thus context-specific.¹⁰ This means that sociological structuralist comprehension of suicide should be realized in the synthesis with the cultural context of the social structure as well as the theoretical understanding of the phenomenon of suicide contagion or suicide clusters.

1.2 Suicide and Its Cultural Meaning

It took a while for the general line of theorisation in suicidology to provide relevant evidence and accept that culture matters to suicide, which is something that is completely absent in Durkheim's work. Taking Clifford Geertz's famous definition of culture as "web of significance" spun by a man in which he himself is suspended, and the quote that "the analysis of it (culture) to be therefore not an experimental science in search of law but an interpretative one in search of meaning" into consideration, it can be deduced that the meaning and belief ascribed to suicide in a given society can play an important role in the understanding of the phenomenon of suicide.¹¹ Theoretical account of the concepts of meaning and belief provide an opportunity to look with a wider lense on the phenomenon, rather than treating it as solely a result of abnormal

⁸ *ibid.*

⁹ Perry, B L., B A. Pescosolido and S P. Borgatti. *Egocentric Network Analysis: Foundations, Methods, and Models*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. n.p.: n.p., 2018.

¹⁰ *ibid.*

¹¹ Geertz, C. *The interpretation of cultures* (Vol. n.p.: 5019). Basic books, 1973.

distribution of social ties. For instance, Canetto (1993) analyzed the myths that can be constructed about suicide, thus looking closer at the cases where the suicide act could be morally justified.¹² Many of such studies are culture and subculture-specific, as they deal with meanings and beliefs shared by a supposedly finite number of people. Kitanaka (2012) in the analysis of depression in Japan discussed the way people can make sense of suicide as a normative option¹³; other researchers¹⁴¹⁵¹⁶ discussed distinctive beliefs and suicidal patterns practiced among urban sub-classes and communities. Furthermore, some scholars suggested that the meaning-making process is a necessary coping mechanism triggered by the shock of a sudden death caused by suicide in the psychology of bereavement. Neimeyer et al. (2006)¹⁷ claims that “meaning-making and bereavement always occur within the confines of a collective, as they build a coherent sense of why the death happened through each member’s individual meanings and more general societal ones”.

Similar to the cultural belief of suicide, the phenomenon of suicide contagion, also known as suicide clusters, “copycat suicides”, and Werther’s effect does not find a valid theoretical rendition in Durkheim’s study. A vast body of empirical research had established links between higher propensity towards suicide and exposure to media reports of notable suicide

¹² Canetto, S S.. She died for love and he for glory: Gender myths of suicidal behavior. n.p.: OMEGA-Journal of Death and Dying, 26(1), 1-17, 1993.

¹³ Kitanaka, J. Depression in Japan: Psychiatric Cures for a Society in Distress. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2012.

¹⁴ Tower, M. A suicide epidemic in an American Indian community. Am. Indian Alaska Nat. Ment. Health Res. 3, 34–44. doi: n.p., 1989.

¹⁵ Gulbas, L E., C Hausmann-Stabile, S M. Luca, T R. Tyler and L H. Zayas. An Exploratory study of nonsuicidal self-injury and suicidal behaviors in adolescent Latinas. Am. J. Orthopsychiatry. 85, 302–314. doi: n.p., 2015.

¹⁶ Chua, J L.. In Pursuit of the Good Life: Aspiration and Suicide in Globalizing South India. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2014.

¹⁷ In Perry, B L., B A. Pescosolido and S P. Borgatti. Egocentric Network Analysis: Foundations, Methods, and Models. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. n.p.: n.p., 2018.

cases¹⁸, and exposure to suicide or suicide attempts of friends or family members.¹⁹ This again points at not only density of social ties, or integration, but the specific context and the characteristics of social ties, although theorising the precise mechanism of suicide contagion remains to be a challenge for sociologists and social psychologists.

Both the importance of meaning ascribed to suicide in a given culture as well as the ability of suicide to spread throughout the society have found their place in Michael Kral's 1994 article *Suicide as Social Logic* where he postulates that suicide is inherently a social act, that has a certain cultural meaning to the person who dies by suicide, as well as to the (intended and unintended) audience who can and will also make sense of suicide, contriubuting and reinforcing the meaning ascribed to it in a given culture. Kral's main two points are that "suicide is caused by the idea of suicide and by nothing else", and that "we will better understand how suicide becomes an acceptable option for an individual or group, cohort, or culture, by examining and studying the phenomenon of the idea".²⁰ Kral proposes that suicide is a consious choice of an individual, and the reasons why she or he chooses to die by suicide are moderated by one's more general attitudes towards it. Thus, understanding the attitudes towards suicide in a certain culture are imperative in the study of the phenomenon.

¹⁸ Stack, S. "Copycat effects on fictional suicide: a meta-analysis," in *Suicide and the Creative Arts*, eds S. Stack and D. Lester (New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers), 231–244, 2009.

¹⁹ Fletcher, J M.. Gender-specific pathways of peer influence on adolescent suicidal behaviors. *Socius* 3, 1–10. doi: n.p., 2017.

²⁰ Kral, M J.. *Suicide as social logic*. n.p.: *Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior*, 24(3), 245-255, 1994.

1.3 Suicide and Intentionality

If we treat suicide as a social act, a conscious choice, the idea of intentionality and human agency comes into the picture, which I find significant in relations to the objectives of my study. Durkheim's work did not focus necessarily on the individual's agency, although he acknowledged it in the definition of suicide as "all cases of death resulting directly or indirectly from a positive or negative act of the victim himself, which he knows will produce this result".²¹ But he did not go further into the analysis of the role of intent in the suicide claiming that "it is too intimate a thing to be more than approximately interpreted by another" and placing the individual external to social relations, and paying more attention to the discussion of causes of suicide, which were also external.²² However, the discussion of causality in suicide is a peculiar undertaking, because it also intersects with the idea of intentionality. Karlsson (2002) states that any theory of agency pinpoints the distinction between *acting* and *suffering*, however this distinction is extremely blurred when talking about the acts of self-destruction.²³ Is suicide the ultimate expression of one's will and agency or a desperate act of a victim? The scientific attempts to make sense of this dialectic of agency and patiency (victimhood) is at the core of what Broz and Münster (2015) call the *tension of agency*. In their 2015 edited volume *Suicide and agency*, the authors state that the resolution of this tension is pointless.²⁴ However they

²¹ Durkheim, E. *Suicide: A Study in Sociology*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press. Translated by J. A. Spaulding and G. Simpson, n.d., 1897/1951.

²² Jaworski, K. *Suicide, Agency and the Limits of Power* 1. n.p.: In *Suicide and Agency* (pp. 183-202). Routledge, 2016.

²³ Karlsson, M M.. *Agency and patiency: Back to nature?*. n.p.: *Philosophical Explorations*, 5(1), 59-81, 2002.

²⁴ Broz, L., & Münster. *Suicide and agency: Anthropological perspectives on self-destruction, personhood, and power*. n.p.: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd, 2015.

believe that positioning suicide on the causality and responsibility, agency and patency range can be used as an indicative approach for better comprehending of local ontologies of suicide. To take James Staples's study of personhood, agency and suicide in neo-liberalizing South India as an example, one can see how ethnographical approach of studying cases of attempted suicides is helpful in the analysis of larger social and cultural notions. Staples's hypothesis rested on the notion that there are distinctions between the Western and non-Western idea of personhood: "South asian "dividuals," on the other hand, have been characterized as substantially connected to other people and things, literally transformed through their transactions in ways that Western "individuals are not".²⁵

2.0 Research Methodology

This chapter describes the way this research has been designed and conducted. The first section serves the purpose of reiterating the research questions that have been formulated based on the literature review provided in the previous chapter. The second section provides the relevant context regarding the two cases, which are located in the locus of this study. After that, the data collection process and data analysis method are described.

2.1 Research Questions

This study aims to answer the following research questions: How do people react to news about attempted and completed filicide-suicide on social media? Which factors in the filicide-

²⁵ Staples, J. Personhood, agency and suicide in a neo-liberalizing South India. n.p.: In *Suicide and Agency* (pp. 27-46). Routledge, 2016.

suicide case are deemed significant by social media users? How are the concepts of intentionality and victimhood framed in the perceptions of filicide-suicide?

In short, the main research objective is to add to the scholarly conversation on the way people generally feel and talk about tragic cases of suicide in their country, and whether it can help us learn about the currents of emotional dissent occurring in the society. In addition, another objective is to examine how these perceptions are expressed and precipitated in the comments sections on social media.

2.2 Description of Cases

Two cases (one of attempted filicide-suicide and one of completed filicide-suicide) that happened one month apart in Nur-Sultan and Almaty are analyzed in this research. The philosophy behind using a two-case study approach is based on the constructivist paradigm, which claims that while deriving a certain objectivity in the creation of meaning is possible, the truth, at the same time, is a relative concept and it depends on different perspectives.²⁶ According to Yun (2003), inclusion of several cases is appropriate in research that aims to answer “how” and “why” questions; with the low level of control of the research over the events or participants in the study; that focuses on contemporary phenomena as opposed to historical events. Moreover, analyzing more than one case provides room for replication and comparison.²⁷ Despite having a fundamental difference of the “completeness” of suicide, the cases were selected based on the similarity of an event - a young woman with her offspring attempting or

²⁶ Baxter, P and S Jack. Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. n.p.: The qualitative report, 13(4), 544-559, 2008.

²⁷ Yin, R K.. Case study research design and methods third edition. n.p.: Applied social research methods series, 5, 2003.

dying by suicide by jumping from a high-rise residential building. In addition, the cases had to be covered by at least one media source. The following paragraphs provide contextualization of the cases by describing the way events had been unfolding and what kind of information was provided by the media to the audience in relation to cases. This context would be highly relevant in the way people would react and comment the news online. The first (attempted suicide) case received much lower coverage by the media, thus, generally less details are known.

Case#1

The first case under investigation took place on October 22, 2021 in Nur-Sultan. At 17:30 on Kubrin Street, a local police captain noticed a woman with a child in her arms hanging her legs from the 12th floor on the balcony of a high-rise building. She sat on the railing, intending to jump out. The policeman immediately reacted, ran into the entrance and went up to the floor. Having made sure through the door gap that the woman did not notice him, he made a decisive breakthrough and managed to grab her. According to a popular media article²⁸, which reported roughly identical information as other sources, the woman decided on a desperate act after a family quarrel. At the same time, she had a one and a half year old child in her arms. The reports concluded that, in relation to the woman's husband, who allegedly brought the young mother to despair, a protective order was issued, and the family was taken under special control. A preventive conversation was held with the woman and psychological assistance was provided. A multi-platform media outlet TengriNews.kz posted the video of policeman accomplishing his

²⁸“Astana Resident Tried to Throw herself off the 12th Floor with her Child,” News | Caravan, October 23, 2021, <https://www.caravan.kz/news/astanchanka-popytalas-vybrositsya-s-12go-eh tazha-vmeste-s-rebenkom-784271/>.

deed on their Instagram account²⁹. The 1-minute video, which was watched more than 700,000 times, captures the moment of the policeman leaving the elevator and quickly pulling the woman and her child from the railing, and ends with the sounds of the woman sobbing in distress. Besides the aforementioned facts, no additional or follow-up information was provided.

Case #2

The second case, no doubt, received much more publicity and provoked a stronger reaction from the audience. It took place exactly one month after the first case, on November 22, 2021 in the city of Almaty. A 28-year-old woman with three children jumped out of a window on the 9th floor. According to eyewitnesses, she initially pushed her children, and then jumped herself. The children were born in 2015, 2016 and 2019. Numerous reports about the tragedy were released not only on social media news accounts, but also on national television. The incident attracted the attention of the audience over the next few weeks, acquiring more and more details, and in the process causing a stormy response from viewers and readers. In addition to the obvious shocking details of such a tragedy, this case also touched upon a whole list of topics that could not leave the audience indifferent. Initially, according to a local police report, a suicide note left by a woman was found in the apartment, but its contents were not disclosed. At the same time, “Sputnik Kazakhstan”³⁰, citing a source in law enforcement agencies, said that specific persons were not named in the suicide note: “The general meaning is that she could not stand the tests that were given, she was tired of life. She does not specifically blame anyone, but

²⁹ TengriNews.kz Instagram post (23 October 2021):

https://www.instagram.com/tv/CVXZ6sII80V/?utm_source=ig_web_copy_link

³⁰ Nikita Danilin, “‘Three Children Laid On Earth’. Why Women in Central Asia Commit Suicide Together with Their Children,” Mediazona Central Asia, November 26, 2021, <https://mediazona.ca/article/2021/11/26/tiredoflife>.

it is written that those responsible for this know themselves, and asks for forgiveness. However, an investigation into the case of incitement to suicide was launched. According to the preliminary version, the cause of the suicide was a quarrel with her husband, but at the time of the tragedy he was not at home.

The husband of the deceased, explained in an interview with an Informburo³¹ correspondent that “everything was normal” in his family. According to the husband, he and his wife moved from Shymkent to Almaty six years ago; she was a citizen of Uzbekistan, however she had a temporary residency permit in Almaty. The couple rented an apartment and experienced constant financial difficulties. Recently, the wife was at home with the children, and the man was trying to find a job. He assured that despite the difficulties, they lived happily and “the wife did not say anything.” The man claimed that the police version of the quarrel between the spouses was not true.

Further, it became known that due to financial difficulties in the family, the couple applied for social assistance to the Population Service Center, but was refused. This fact was commented on by representatives of the Department of Employment and Social Protection in the city of Shymkent: the refusal was justified by the fact that several months prior to filing the application, the husband of the deceased sold the car, in connection with which the income for each family member exceeded the minimum threshold required to receive social benefits³². Information about the financial situation in the family did not end there. It became known that three microloans were issued for the deceased, payments for two of which were overdue. The

³¹ “Husband of Almatinka Thrown Out Window: We Lived Happily, But Were Unemployed.” informburo.kz, November 23, 2021. <https://informburo.kz/novosti/muzh-vybrosivshejsya-iz-okna-almatinki-my-zhili-schastlivo-no-byli-bezrabotnymi>.

³² “Woman who jumped out of a window asked for ASP in October but was refused,” informburo.kz, November 24, 2021, <https://informburo.kz/novosti/vybrosivsayasya-iz-okna-zenshhina-prosila-asp-v-oktyabre-no-polucila-refusal>.

last microloan was 15,000 tenge (approximately 32 Euro), which was also not paid. Due to the non-payment of these loans, bailiffs banned her from leaving Kazakhstan.³³

However, the relatives of the deceased said that financial problems were not the main reason why she decided on such an act. They are convinced that the culprit of the tragedy was her husband, with whom they often clashed recently and lived separately. The older sister of the deceased told reporters that her husband had a second wife who was expecting a child from him, and this naturally negatively affected the mental state of the deceased. Fearing condemnation from relatives, the deceased decided to stay in Almaty and earn a living herself, but she did not manage to translate her plan into reality. The older sister claims that before the information about the betrayal became known to her, the deceased did not have suicidal thoughts before, and even more so the thought of killing children. However, in a state of emotional distress, she could no longer trust anyone and could not leave the children alone. The same report also indicates that, according to the police, the husband of the deceased was a gamer. The older sister stated that she often saw playing cards and casino chips in their house, and her husband periodically had large sums of money. She also said that her sister's husband called her after the incident and asked her not to tell the investigators anything.³⁴

After the incident a pre-trial investigation was launched under article 105 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Incitement to suicide”. After this information, despite an initial copious amount of reporting from various traditional and digital media outlets, no information on the case was released to the public.

³³ ‘Received Anaphylactic Shock Twice’. The Mysterious Death of a Woman Who Jumped Out of a Window with Her Three Children. ” YouTube. YouTube, November 23, 2021. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DS-S2vwNKN8>.

³⁴ Editorial, “Almaty Suicide Sister Told About Her Husband: Mistress, Children On The Side, Gambling,” Information and analytical portal Orda.kz, November 24, 2021, <https://orda.kz/sestra-almatinskoj-suicidnicy-rasskazala-o-ljubovnice-ejo-muzha-azartnyh-igrah-i-dolgah/#part=1>.

2.3 Data Collection

The source of data in this study was comments left by users on three social media platforms: Telegram, YouTube and Instagram. These posts are created by official journalist outlets, some of them are affiliated with the government, such as KTK TV news channel (1.56 million subscribers on YouTube), and some are independent, such as Zakon.kz (170, 230 subscribers on Telegram) and TengriNews (2 million followers on Instagram). All three platforms encourage audience's participation through the like/dislike system and unrestricted possibility to leave a comment under the post. Each of the platforms has its own unique features. YouTube is a video-hosting website, where content consists of visual media; Telegram is aimed at creation of concise informative textual content; and Instagram incorporates both visual and textual data. 500 newest, the most liked/engaged with and informative comments were selected for each case.

Case #	Media outlet	N of comments
1	Zakon.kz (Telegram) TengriNewsKz (Instagram)	120 380 N total = 500
2	Zakon.kz (Telegram) TengriNewsKz (Instagram) KTK TV (YouTube)	100 200 200 N total = 500

TABLE 1. DATA SOURCES

The comments were read and selected manually, disregarding those that had a single emoji or irrelevant information/words, which were quite numerous. Since a quantitative analysis of the user participation patterns, such as number and length of comments as well as frequency of engagement on these platforms is out of the scope of this study, only those comments that had at least 2 words and carried a certain meaning, message or expression were chosen for further analysis.

2.4 Data Analysis

One comment served as a single unit of analysis, which was based on the Computer-Mediated Discourse Analysis (hereinafter CMDA) method. CMDA makes use of methods from language-focused disciplines, such as linguistics, rhetoric and communication.³⁵ CMDA emerged as a separate approach in social sciences in the 1990s driven by the accelerating influence of the Internet on every aspect of people's lives and taking a lot of inspiration and founding principles from the discourse analysis. The first such principle is that discourse exhibits recurrent patterns, which may be produced consciously and subconsciously.³⁶ The second is that the discourse involves speaker choices, which can reflect cognitive and social factors so that it can provide an insight into a non-linguistic phenomena.

The comments were analyzed in line with the domains of linguistic interaction uncovered applying the CMDA approach. These domains include structure, meaning, interaction, social

³⁵ Herring, S C.. Computer-mediated discourse analysis: An approach to researching online behavior. n.p.: Designing for virtual communities in the service of learning, 338, 376, 2004.

³⁶ Goffman, E. Presentation of Self in Everyday Life. Garden City, NY: Anchor, 1959.

behavior and participation.³⁷ The structural linguistic phenomena include the use of special typography, orthography, and sentence structure. The meaning of the comments or “speech acts” is analyzed at the meaning level, and the way topics develop and meanings get exchanged and negotiated is evaluated at the interaction level. Social behavior of the participants in the discussion is examined by looking at the play, conflict, power, and group membership over multiple exchanges.

The comments were manually coded in order to identify recurrent themes. The manual coding was used due to convenience, since comments were often written mixing Kazakh and Russian languages together, using either Latin and Slavic alphabets or both. It is worth mentioning that the majority of comments were written in Russian language, since the original posts on the media platforms were also written in Russian language, which is, along with Kazakh, an official language in Kazakhstan. The authors of the comments remained anonymous and unidentifiable within data analysis due to the nature of interaction on social media, which provides an open space for commentary by users, who may have accounts with little to no personal information.

3.0 Results

This section shows the results of the data collection and analysis. Firstly, the way the comments have been coded and combined into themes is discussed. After that, the numerical proportions of each theme in the codebook in relation to both cases are demonstrated.

³⁷ Herring, S C.. Computer-mediated discourse analysis: An approach to researching online behavior. n.p.: Designing for virtual communities in the service of learning, 338, 376, 2004.

3.1 The Codebook

The comments were coded according to four characteristics: the number of replies or likes to the comment; the attitude of the user; the type of comment; and the main topic of the content.

If the comment received more than 10 likes and/or more than 2 replies, it was coded “ * ”. If more than 50 likes and/or more than 10 replies it was coded “ ** ”. Thus, it was possible to see which comments other users deemed important, correct and thought-provoking. Usually the engagement in the replies would start with a second user joining participation to disagree with the original comment, thus the tensions in the making of the meaning in relation to suicide cases could be observed.

Next, I identified two types of comments in relation to the function or purpose that the commentator had intended with it. The first type is a “*remark*”, meaning that it was used to assert a certain opinion, expression or explanation. Although all comments can be essentially understood as remarks, I also established a separate category in the typology called “*relatable experience*”. It means that in the comment, the poster did not just provide an opinion regarding the event, but also shared a personal experience or story relevant to the case. Both *remark* and *relatable experience* kind of comments could be written with a different emotional perspective: to sympathize with the women, or to berate them.

The attitude of the user refers to the affective response that is implied in the comment. The attitudes were allocated in three groups: *sympathetic*, *judgemental/condescending*, and *neutral*. The *sympathetic* category included short remarks such as “Rest in Peace” as well as longer texts that try to make sense of the struggles of the women, or reply to the *judgemental/condescending* commentators with an intent to prove them wrong.

Judgemental/condescending comments could include downright insults of the women or comments/replies that provide arguments on why people should not treat the women as victims. *Neutral* category contained the comments that did not fall into any of the previous categories, because it could not be stated conclusively what was the poster's attitude towards the incident. Usually such comments were posted with a purpose to criticize the way the media reports the story.

Furthermore, a list of themes was derived from closely reading comments in each category. *Sympathetic* comments could have *no content*; mention *mental health* issues or awareness; directed *against authorities / government* (institutions, the president, etc); talk about *financial struggles* (including the discussion of gambling, but unrelated to the husband); contain *religious sentiment* by directly bringing up religious dogma or use words that would indirectly indicate that; *blame the husband* by mentioning his alleged gambling habit, adultery, as well as the mentions of the patriarchy, traditional division of roles in the family, etc. *Judgemental / condescending* comments also revolved around the same themes, however instead of the *blame the husband* category, *blame the woman* category was added. In the judgemental group of comments people were prone to sharing their personal experiences only regarding financial struggles.

It is important to note that many of the identified themes were entangled with each other and many comments could permeate different categories. One comment could incorporate several themes, so instead of identifying one main theme, which was impossible in many cases, in coding a comment would be put in several thematic categories at once. As an example, the following comment can be used to demonstrate the way different themes are interwoven in the narrative that the poster wants to convey.

*** Unfortunately, in many families, only the issue of finances leads to depression and quarrels. It's hard to live, there is not enough money, and that's why (they) end their lives, if the insane did this before, now more than half of all people are on the verge ! I was fired from the service after a heart attack, with a clinical death, they threw me out like a dog and [I have to] pay the mortgage. It is very hard and they didn't give me disability, they ruined my work records, it's hard to get a job because they had written [in the work records] that I was fired for health reasons! That's it guys! It remains for us to survive*

This comment had 73 likes and 2 replies and was categorized as Sympathetic -> Relatable experience -> Financial Struggles, Mental Health, Against Authorities.

More examples can be found in the table below. The comments written in the original language are also included, however for the English version I added a miniscule amount of editing to make them more legible. Moreover, the emojis³⁸ were not erased for coding because in many cases they played an important part in identifying the emotional response of the commentator.

³⁸ For more information on the interactions between emoji and text in digital communication see, for example, Logi, L and M Zappavigna. A social semiotic perspective on emoji: How emoji and language interact to make meaning in digital messages. n.p.: New Media & Society, 14614448211032965, 2021.

Emotional Attitude	Purpose	Content	Example (English)	Example (Original)
<i>Sympathetic</i>	<i>Remark</i>	-	Poor children, what have they experienced ☹️ ☹️ ☹️	Бедные дети, что они испытали ☹️ ☹️ ☹️
		<i>Mental Health</i>	More psychologists should be free. More psychological centers for women of all ages. Could have been avoided. Where were the relatives?	Побольше психологов надо бесплатных. Побольше центров психологических для женщин всех возрастов. Можно было избежать. Где родственники были?
		<i>Against Authorities / Government</i>	The authorities are to blame , where are the allowances for each child ? The mother could at least survive on child benefits, a poor country and its inhabitants	Власти виноваты , где пособия на каждого ребенка ? Хотя мать смогла бы выжить на пособия для детей , нищая страна и такие же ее жители
		<i>Financial Struggles</i>	Now it is very difficult for women who are raising children alone. They do not receive alimony, benefits only up to a year. A woman should go to work, but who should she leave her child with?	Сейчас женщинам, которые одни воспитывают детей очень тяжело. Алименты не получают, пособия только до годика. Женщина должна выходить на работу, а ребёнка с кем оставлять?
		<i>Religious Sentiment</i>	Maybe it's good to let their soul go to heaven!!! In this life, nothing good shone for them. Only torment and slave labor for those in power and the struggle for survival !!!	Может и хорошо пусть их душа попадет в рай !!! В этой жизни им ничего хорошего не светило Одно лишь мучение и рабский труд на власть имущих и борьба за выживание !!!
		<i>Blaming the Husband</i>	If there was a normal husband, a woman would never do such a thing.	Был бы нормальный муж, женщина никогда на такое не пошла бы
	<i>Relatable experience</i> CEU eTD Collection	-	I feel sorry for the children, how could she ☹️ ☹️ ☹️. It's not easy for everyone right now. We don't live, we just exist. I won't judge. ☹️ ☹️ ☹️	Детей жалко, как она могла ☹️ ☹️ ☹️. Всем не легко сейчас. Мы не живем ☹️ , а просто существуем. Судить не буду. ☹️ ☹️ ☹️
		<i>Mental Health</i>	Very strong depression lately. I think everyone has this	Очень сильный депресняк в последнее время .Я думаю так у всех
		<i>Against Authorities / Government</i>	Our country itself will soon lead every second person to such decisions. I do not deny the fact that I often have thoughts of suicide	.Сама страна наша скоро каждого второго доведёт к таким решениям. Не отрицаю того факта что и у меня часто бывают мысли о суициде.

Judgmental / Condescending		Financial Struggles	Yes, it is survival in the country. I know women with children in apartments, and I myself stayed (with my 2 year old son) on the street in the lockdown. I called 103 and 102 and they cold bloodedly answered that they could not help. 😞	Да у нас в стране выживание. Знаю женщин с детьми по квартирам, и сама в логдауне осталась с 2 годовалым ребенком на улице. Звонила 103 и 102 хладнокровно ответили что ничем не могут помочь. 😞
		Religious Sentiment	My heart ached 😞 I remembered myself when I also wanted to do this, but thank God I changed my mind and just left the ex-boyfriend and then everything became fine with me. May Allah give this woman patience and health to the baby, may everything be fine with them 🙏🙏🙏🙏	Сердце заболело 😞 вспомнила себя когда я тоже так хотела поступить но слава Аллаху я одумалась и просто ушла от бывшего и тогда у меня все стало хорошо. Дай Аллах этой женщине терпения и здоровье малышу пусть всё у них будет хорошо 🙏🙏🙏🙏
		Blaming the Husband	Of course, the husband is guilty, I perfectly understand the young woman, how husbands drive her to despair with their shameless behavior. If there was someone nearby who would dissuade her ... it was an impulse on her part ... very sorry for the innocent children ...	Конечно муж виновен, прекрасно понимаю молодую женщину, как мужа своим безсовестным поведением доводят до отчаяния. Если бы рядом был кто-то, кто отговорил бы её...это был порыв с её стороны ...очень жалко невинных детей...
	Remark CEU eTD Collection	Blaming the Woman	No one forced her to live with him and give birth to three (children) 🙄	Не кто не заставлял ее жить с ним и рожать троих 🙄
		Blaming the Family	all the relatives knew that she was living badly, but at the same time they were all silent. And all to blame is just UYAT .All the problems due to this 🙄 And to bury the daughter with grandchildren is not UYAT ??	все родные знали что она живёт плохо,но при этом все молчали. А всему виной просто УЯТ .Все проблемы из-за этого 🙄 А хоронить дочь с внуками это не УЯТ??
		Mental Health	What a horror the children experienced before their death, I feel sorry for the children, and the mother apparently has problems in her head, how could she throw them away	Какой ужас дети пережили перед смертью, детей жалко, а у матери видимо проблемы в голове, как смогла их выкинуть
		Financial Struggles	If you are starving and dying and cannot provide for the children, please send them to orphanages, where they will be warm and well fed and dressed, but do not kill them and decide their fate for them, work as you can, then take the children back.	Если голодаешь умираешь и не можешь обеспечить детей пожалуйста отдайте в детские дома, там они будут в тепле и сыты и одеты но не убивать их и за них решать судьбу, сами работайте как устроетесь потом заберёте детей обратно.
		Religious Sentiment	I feel more sorry for the children who have not	Мне больше жалко детей, которые ещё не

			had time to live yet. If the conflict can be reconciled!!! Because of these two, children lost their lives, because of them, these innocent children who knows where heaven or hell is now ??? And let this woman be in hell, but even though she is already there. And let these angels be in paradise, kids, rest in peace to you♥♥	успели пожить. Если конфликт можно же помириться!!! Из-за этих двоих дети лишились жизни, из-за них эти невинные дети фиг знает где сейчас рай или ад??? А пусть эта женщина будет в аду, а хотя она и так там. А эти ангелочки пусть будут в раю детишки, земля пухом вам♥♥
	<i>Relatable experience</i>	<i>Financial Struggles</i>	Everyone has children, everyone lives somehow, it's better then not to give birth once the salary is meager! It was necessary to chip in and leave the children and not decide everything for them.	У всех есть дети, все как то живут, лучше тогда не рожать раз зарплата мизерная! Надо было самой скинуться а детей оставить а не решать всё за них.
<i>Neutral</i>	<i>Remark</i>	-	It is necessary to install lattices on the balconies of the entrances ... Otherwise... unfortunately, it will continue.	Надо устанавливать решетки на балконах подъездов... Иначе... к сожалению, это будет продолжаться.

TABLE 2. THE CODEBOOK

3.2 The Numerical Distribution of Comments

Based on the codebook, 500 comments in both cases were analyzed and the frequency of the types of comments was calculated. The results are presented in the tables down below.

Emotional attitude	Case #1 (attempted felicide-suicide)		Case #2 (completed felicide-suicide)	
	N of comments	% of total	N of comments	% of total
<i>Sympathetic</i>	178	35.6%	310	62.0%
<i>Judgemental / Condescending</i>	266	53.2%	142	28.4%
<i>Neutral</i>	56	11.2%	48	9.6%
		100%		100%

TABLE 3. DISTRIBUTION OF COMMENTS ACCORDING TO THE EMOTIONAL ATTITUDE

Purpose	Case #1 (attempted felicide - suicide)		Case #2 (completed felicide - suicide)	
	N of comments	% of total	N of comments	% of total
<i>Remark</i>	462	92.4%	444	88.8%
<i>Relatable experience</i>	38	7.6%	56	11.2%
		100%		100%

TABLE 4. DISTRIBUTION OF COMMENTS ACCORDING TO THE INTENDED PURPOSE OF THE POSTER

The content theme	Case #1 (attempted felicide-suicide)	Case #2 (completed felicide-suicide)
	N of mentions	N of mentions
SYMPATHETIC COMMENTS		
<i>No content</i>	43	65
<i>Mental Health</i>	40	51
<i>Against Authorities / Government</i>	54	120
<i>Financial Struggles</i>	42	58
<i>Religious Sentiment</i>	22	39
<i>Blaming the Husband</i>	29	88
JUDGEMENTAL / CONDESCENDING COMMENTS		
<i>Blaming the Woman</i>	50	15
<i>Blaming the Family</i>	30	21
<i>Mental Health</i>	105	38
<i>Financial Struggles</i>	67	46
<i>Religious Sentiment</i>	48	43

TABLE 5. NUMBER OF MENTIONS OF THE IDENTIFIED THEMES

It is worth mentioning again that the number of mentions of the identified themes is not calculated as a percentage of the total amount of comments that had been evaluated, since one comment could incorporate several themes. These numerical outcomes do not reflect the general attitude towards suicide cases that can be extrapolated on the population as a whole.

Nevertheless, counting the number of times each theme emerged in the data can be highly helpful in mapping out the way the perceptions of commentators can be understood.

4.0 Discussion

4.1 Connection Between the Article Content and the Comments Content

During the coding process, the first thing that emerged from data was the fact that the content of the comments left by social media users was largely influenced by the content of the original video or short article that has been posted on the platform. It is not surprising since people tend to respond directly to the information that has been provided to them. The original posts that were chosen to be analyzed were rather short, due to the nature of the content generation on such social media platforms as Instagram and Telegram. The YouTube video used for data collection was also a short excerpt from a daily news program broadcasted in the evening. All posts tried to employ an objective tone, however certain themes could already be observed in the posted text. For instance, the following passage shows the full text posted on the Zakon.kz Telegram channel in relation to Case #1 (the text was also accompanied with a 30-sec video of the rescue).

Astana resident tried to jump off the 12th floor with her child

The incident took place on the evening of October 22. Police captain Kairat Narimanov noticed a woman with a child in her arms on the balcony of a high-rise building, who was about to jump off.

“Returning with the children from the kindergarten, I saw excited citizens in the courtyard and a woman who was sitting on the railing of the balcony. Without hesitation, I rushed to the entrance. Fortunately, everything worked out, I managed to grab her and drag her inside,” he said.

21-year-old woman decided on a desperate act after a family quarrel. In relation to the spouse, who brought the young mother to despair, a protective order was issued, the family was taken under special control.

Here, although the text is aimed at matter-of-factly reporting on the event, the allegation that the husband is to blame has been prompted to the public, thus influencing the people’s

reaction in the comments. In another instance, the reporter in the YouTube video posted by KTK.TV news channel mentioned that in the last year there was a similar incident of felicide-suicide committed by a woman, who, as it turned out, was diagnosed with schizophrenia. And as the data has shown, the audience was more likely to discuss mental health issues, and, more specifically, bring up schizophrenia in the discussion.

According to “agenda - setting theory”, the news media has the ability to have an impact on the significance of certain topics on the public agenda.³⁹ Although the posts selected for this study had been released on social media, their source is well-established multi-media platforms, thus the discussion goes from top to bottom - the audience being the recipients of the story framed by reporters. Therefore, when shedding light on such sensitive and important topics as suicide and felicide cases, the news channels’ role is extremely significant. To note, none of the posts under investigation included any trigger warnings, or relevant information on possible ways to seek psychological help or reach out to suicide hotlines. This shows that the audience consumes news about such cases framed mostly by sensationalism rather than the urgency of the underlying social issues. This problem has been investigated by Quinn, Prendergast and Galvin (2019), who compared top-bottom agenda setting of traditional media with the potential for bottom-top agenda setting of Twitter, which is a popular microblogging and social networking service, where users can generate posts themselves and proliferate certain ideas with the usage of hashtags. The study was conducted within the context of the reportage on a felicide-suicide case in Ireland, where the media put a spotlight on the perpetrator and his motives while omitting mentioning the family members that had been brutally murdered. This prompted the audiences to react and initiate a hashtag campaign on Twitter aimed to shift the discussion and put emphasis

³⁹ McCombs, M. A look at agenda-setting: Past, present and future. n.p.: Journalism studies, 6(4), 543-557, 2005.

on the victims. The researchers conclude that the audiences “demonstrate a clear need for the media to view murder -suicide as an event which encompasses a wide range of complex social and individual factors, as opposed to the more conventionally framed ‘crime’ or ‘tragedy’ story to which misleadingly specific causal factors can be ascribed”.⁴⁰

4.2 Sharing and Comparing One’s Personal Experience

As it is displayed in Table 4, around one-tenth of the analyzed comments were telling some variation of a personal story, experience or sentiment in relation to the cases. The fact that people tend to find the discussion of suicide cases relatable, once again shows the importance of adequate coverage from the news media sources (such as inclusion of content warnings and relevant suicide-prevention cues). Several users disclosed suicidal tendencies, which shows the Werther effect in action aligning with numerous studies that claim that media coverage of suicide cases has the potential of the emergence of copycat suicides.⁴¹ Usually, such comments would get follow-up replies with other users trying to comfort and “talk out” the poster from taking their own life, however, again, a tangible support such as advice to reach out to mental health professionals or suicide hotline numbers, was not provided. It can be seen that there is an undeniable and urgent need to raise awareness among population on the ways to prevent suicide in Kazakhstan.




Sympathetic or, rather, empathetic comments such as “*Poor woman. I understand her so much ☹️*” were usually left by users, who then elaborated that they were in abusive

⁴⁰ Quinn, F, M Prendergast and A Galvin. Her name was Clodagh: Twitter and the news discourse of murder suicide. n.p.: Critical discourse studies, 16(3), 312-329, 2019.

⁴¹ See, for example, Stack, S. Suicide in the media: A quantitative review of studies based on nonfictional stories. n.p.: Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior, 35(2), 121-133, 2005.

relationships, suffered from their husband's drinking or gambling problems, or experienced economic hardships. Although the last point invited mostly negatively charged commentators, who felt that dying by suicide due to financial issues shows the person's weakness or incompetence. For instance, the following comment was left as a reply to a passage where another user discussed the difficulties with renting apartments: *"We lived in a barracks, we also had problems and loans! The diet was boring, We had patience, and now everything is fine! Children are alive, healthy and this is happiness !! Problems are not eternal, just need calmness"*. By comparing their experiences with the perceived 'whining' about money, the users condemned and disagreed with the legitimacy of the idea that economic issues can be a reason why the women would want to die by suicide with their children.

4.3 Mourning Online - The Casual Ways to Express Sympathy

A large amount of comments included short texts expressing words of concern or condolences but without any concrete content. The most common expression under the posts in Case #2 was a Kazakh language version of the phrase "Rest in Peace", and in Case #1 a variation of the phrase "God forbid!". In addition, many comments communicated the words of condolences directed specifically at children that passed away, such as "  what a pity for the children! It's impossible (to think about it) without tears....  " or "Poor little angels!  Light clouds for you!". As it can be observed, these comments overlapped a lot with the comments coded with *religious sentiments*, because the standard language of mourning in Kazakhstan is largely influenced by religious concepts. Within the context of this study, the comments that were categorized as strictly with *religious sentiments* in their content directly

brought up certain religious ideas to construct an argument or assert a concrete opinion, rather than a quick expression of grief.

Nonetheless, the abundance of comments that convey the language of mourning in one way or another reminds us that at the core of the discussion in both cases stand the shocking and staggering facts of death and dying. This fact adds to my critical stance on the way the news reportages about attempted and completed suicide cases are framed and given freely to the public. Today digital environments constitute a significant part of people's day-to-day life, thus the processes of dying and mourning that follow can become a part of a person's digital footprint. A study of Giaxoglou (2014)⁴² of the so-called Facebook RIP groups where participants commemorate and celebrate the life of the deceased, and communicate with each other while going through stages of grief together, has demonstrated that "such groups afford users the opportunity to give meaning to their individual expressions of grief in the context of their participatory entextualisation of moments of mourning". Digital media, thus, "brings death back into everyday life"⁴³ and has a capability to affect the continuation of bonds with the deceased as well as the construction and communication of the post-mortem identity of the deceased. While social networking sites and the Internet in general provide important tools for the bereaved friends and relatives to find support, it can also broadcast the tragic event to an uncountable number of spectators, who, in turn, are free to react and engage with the fact of death and dying in any possible way. It is imperative, therefore, to think about the more sophisticated and appropriate ways suicide as well as death, grief, and loss in general should be shared on social media. To the best of my knowledge, none of the examined comment sections

⁴² Giaxoglou, K. 'RIP man... u are missed and loved by many': entextualising moments of mourning on a Facebook Rest in Peace group site. *Thanatos*, 3(1), 10-28, 2014.

⁴³ Walter, T, R Hourizi, W Moncur and S Pitsillides. Does the internet change how we die and mourn? Overview and analysis. n.p.: *Omega-journal of Death and Dying*, 64(4), 275-302, 2012.

have been moderated (based on the spam messages that were posted among other comments), although, in my opinion, the news sources should be responsible for more ethical handling of such tragic cases.

4.4 The Mental Health Tension: Perpetuating the Stigma

The notion of mental health, manifested in many different ways, was quite significant in many people's attempts to make sense of the cases in the comments. The ways mental health could be mentioned included attempts to raise awareness, sharing one's own struggles, downplaying and/or demonizing certain diagnoses, and using it to insult the women. Although it was quite a polarizing theme, the discussions or conflicts regarding the mental health problems rarely appeared in the comment sections, and people were not particularly interested in trying to influence each other's attitude towards it.

The users usually brought up postpartum depression in Case #1, where some clearly held a sympathetic view towards the woman who had a 1,5- year child and wanted to attempt suicide. One user said: *"The girl has postpartum depression. This is not a joke to you...."* clearly indicating a level of familiarity and relatability to the condition, as well as the awareness that many people tend to downplay it. On the other hand, the deemphasizing and judgemental attitude towards postpartum depression can be seen in another user's comment: *"What kind of postpartum depression? Our parents gave birth to 8-10 children. You just need to teach young people that suicide is not a solution to problems. What if she remains crippled for the rest of her life?"* Such comparison of today's "weak" youth with older "stronger" generations was a

common trend across all themes (especially in relation to financial struggles, as it will be discussed later).

Another condition that was often alluded to, especially in Case #2, was schizophrenia, where people would sometimes throw around the diagnosis as an insult, or state that if the woman had schizophrenia, then her actions are self-explanatory. Nonetheless, some people reacted with suspicion towards the mentions of schizophrenia, proposing that the diagnosis had been mentioned in the original post in order to distract the audiences from other actors, who were in fact responsible (especially the government). For example, this sarcastic comment challenges the way Case #2 was covered: *“Well, of course, schizophrenia or the usual family quarrel. And everything else is great.”* implying that mental health issues are too easy of an explanation, which conceals some deeper or systemic problems underlying the case.

In other instances the commentators would usually use such words as “psycho”, “crazy” or “hysterical” to describe the women, or simply state that there is something wrong “in their head”. Persons with mental illness often suffer from public stigma, which is a complex phenomenon that involves negative or discriminatory attitudes.⁴⁴ Rüsch, Angermeyer and Corrigan (2005) state that there are three prevailing misconceptions about people with mental illnesses: that they are homicidal maniacs, that they are rebellious and free spirits; and that they have childlike perceptions of the world that should be marveled.⁴⁵ Schizophrenia is among the conditions that are stigmatized and demonized the most, which mostly stems from the lack of appropriate information about the condition being available to the general public.⁴⁶ Moreover,

⁴⁴ Corrigan, P W., S B. Morris, P J. Michaels and J Rafacz. Challenging the public stigma of mental illness: a meta-analysis of outcome studies. n.p.: Psychiatric services, 63(10), 963-973, 2012.

⁴⁵ Rusch, N, M C. Angermeyer and P W. Corrigan. Mental illness stigma: concepts, consequences, and initiatives to reduce stigma. n.p.: European psychiatry, 20(8), 529-539, 2005.

⁴⁶ Penn, D L., K Guynan, T Daily, W D. Spaulding, C P. Garbin and M Sullivan. Dispelling the stigma of schizophrenia: what sort of information is best?. n.p.: Schizophrenia bulletin, 20(3), 567-578, 1994.

the stigmatization of mental health can feed the stigmatization that is associated with suicidality. On the one hand, for those who suffer from mental disorders “perceived or internalized stigma produced by mental or physical disorders, or through belonging to a minority group, may represent a significant risk factor for suicide, being severely distressing, reducing self-esteem and acting as a barrier in help-seeking behaviors”.⁴⁷ On the other hand, those who are suicidal may avoid seeking help and sharing their issues and concerns due to the fear of being deemed “crazy”. Moreover, some studies have shown that maternal filicide-suicide was associated with “extreme psychological disturbances”⁴⁸, while others directly linked it to depression.⁴⁹

Nevertheless, the number of comments directly addressing the issue of low awareness of mental health hardships in Kazakhstan was quite considerable. They were often addressed to those who do not believe in the existence of mental disorders. For instance, one comment said *“Because depression is a real disease. And it should be treated by a psychiatrist/psychotherapist. And in Kazakh society, psychological problems are not being noticed.”* A similar comment said *“A direct consequence of “we don't need psychological help, it's all from the evil one, we invented it for ourselves”. I hope the family is properly checked. It is unlikely that a person living in love, harmony and mutual respect will take such a step”*. It shows that there is an urgent need for more information on mental health being available to the public, because there is a high risk of perpetuating the stigma associated with suicidality and mental illnesses.

⁴⁷ Carpiello, B and F Pinna. The reciprocal relationship between suicidality and stigma. n.p.: Frontiers in psychiatry, 8, 35, 2017.

⁴⁸ Alder, C and K Polk. Child victims of homicide (Vol. n.p.: 32). Cambridge University Press, 2001.

⁴⁹ Meszaros, K and D Fischer-Danzinger. Extended suicide attempt: Psychopathology, personality and risk factors. n.p.: Psychopathology, 33(1), 5-10, 2000.

4.5 The Religious Argument Tension: Between Heaven and Hell

So far little has been said on the challenging moral dilemma that the audiences have been presented with when they saw the posts on social media. That is the co-existence of murder and suicide in one case, which can make people to think of the women as either perpetrators or the victims. The simultaneity of the expression of such two extreme views is better demonstrated in the comments that had a religious sentiment in their content. The overwhelming majority of such comments alluded to Islamic dogma, since Muslims are the largest religious group in Kazakhstan. The comments ranged from sympathetic such as *“Let Allah open the best gates of paradise for these innocent children. A very, very big tragedy”* and *“Oo Allah forgive her sins 🙏🥺 take her with children to paradise 🙏🥺”* to sharply negative ones such as *“In all religions, suicide is a sin. And killing children is a triple sin. The woman is clearly sick in the head if she just decided on this”*.

The Quran and the collection of Prophetic traditions in Islam put an emphasis on sanctity of human life and openly condemn the perpetrator of such act as self-murder to “eternal retribution in the form of incessant repetitions of the act and the anguish of the mode of suicide”.⁵⁰ The intihar (suicide) cannot be forgiven even if the person was forced to kill themselves.⁵¹ Therefore, the attitudes of Muslim proportion of population in Kazakhstan is directly influenced by a very strong message conveyed in Quran that suicide is a sin.

However, the role of religious sentiments in the perception of suicide is not always that black and white, and the way suicide is approached in the religious practices in Kazakhstan in a more nuanced way can be seen by looking at the funeral practices. Regardless of whether a

⁵⁰ Lester, D. Suicide and islam. n.p.: Archives of suicide research, 10(1), 77-97, 2006.

⁵¹ *ibid.*

person had been religious or not during her/his lifetime, the funeral process would be often conducted according to the canons of the religion. The predominant religions in Kazakhstan are Sunni Islam and Orthodox Christianity. Christianity, like Islam, condemns suicide as an offense and act against the will of God, and state that the person died by suicide will not be granted entry to the heaven. Technically, a funeral service according to the proper religious canon must be denied to a person died by suicide. However, based on a discussion of suicide in one Russian language Islamic forum on whether or not Allah can forgive suicide, I observed a great level of flexibility and awareness of the situation demonstrated by the representatives of spiritual clergy. Acknowledging that there are high suicide rates in the post-Soviet countries, the representative admitted that it is more or less acceptable to bury the suicidé according to the canon. He also provided a rather optimistic remark (since the discussion was initiated by a person, whose father died by suicide and I believe the moderator aimed to console him) saying that a true Muslim will not reside in Hell for too long.⁵² Thus, it can be seen that there is a room for negotiation of the (in)acceptability of suicide even in such highly regulated spaces as religious institutions.

4.6 The (Anti) Government Tension: A Sign of The Times

One of the most surprising and probably the most significant outcome of the process of data analysis has been a very clear and very loud anti-government sentiment in the comment section. Looking at the shared opinions of people in retrospect can provide a valuable insight on the way tragic events trigger the public's voices of dissent with larger political and social

⁵² Magomedrassulov M. and Murzayev A. . My father hanged himself.. does Allah forgive suicide? 2013.

structures. As it can be seen from the results, the sympathetic comments that featured anti-government or anti-authority stance were the most numerous among all identified themes.

Both cases took place in the last months of 2021 about one and two months prior to the events that have been coined “2022 Kazakh unrest”, “Bloody January” or “January tragedy”. The unrest was in fact a series of mass dissents that started in Kazakhstan on 2 January 2022 after a sudden sharp increase in liquified gas costs following the lifting of a government-enforced cost cap on 1 January. The dissents started calmly within the oil-producing city of Zhanaozen and rapidly spread to other cities within the nation, particularly the nation's biggest city Almaty, which saw its showings turn into savage riots, fueled by rising disappointment with the government and financial inequality.⁵³ Amid the week-long savage distress and crackdowns, 227 individuals were murdered and over 9,900 were captured, according to Kazakh officials.⁵⁴ Growing discontent with the government and the past president, Nursultan Nazarbayev, who remained the chairman of the Security Chamber of Kazakhstan, impacted bigger demonstrations even more. This led to his removal from the position of chairman of the Security Council. The official version of the government frames the political and social chaos that many cities in Kazakhstan succumbed to for a week as a failed coup d’etat⁵⁵. However, the version that the unrest was an “inside job” of the government’s highest ranking officials does not explain that seemingly spontaneous protests had massive support from all kinds of population strata in many cities in Kazakhstan. According to independent reporters, “the protests have more deep-seated roots, including anger at social and economic disparities, aggravated by a raging pandemic, as

⁵³ Kantchev, Georgi. "Kazakhstan's Elite Got Richer on Natural Resources. Then Came the Unrest". *The Wall Street Journal*. ISSN 0099-9660. 7 January 2022.

⁵⁴ "Kazakh President Announces CSTO Troop Withdrawal, Appoints New PM". *RadioFreeEurope/RadioLiberty*. 11 January 2022.

⁵⁵ Lillis, Joanna. "Kazakhstan: Shoot to kill protesters, orders tough-talking Tokayev". *Eurasianet*. 7 January 2022.

well the lack of real democracy”⁵⁶ and that “there has been growing discontent among the people over rising income inequality, which has further worsened due to the coronavirus pandemic, and the lack of democracy [...].The average national monthly salary is just under \$600. The banking system has fallen prey to deep crises precipitated by non-performing loans. And rampant corruption has further added misery to the people’s lives.”⁵⁷

Many observers described the uprisings as “unexpected”, since there was no opposition voice prominent enough for the analysts to foresee the clashes. However, inspecting the comments, it is very noticeable how the common audience on the news portals constantly brings up their feelings of disappointment, resentment and hatred towards the government and authorities. Especially, in the Case #2, the news report incited the discussions of the government by emphasizing that the deceased woman suffered from poverty and asked for financial support from the Public Service Center, but was denied. This hit a nerve with the audiences who could relate to the experience. In addition, the involvement of the authorities in the case made many people suspicious about any other version of the reasons why the woman and her children died. One comment stated: *“Well, of course, it’s easier to declare an unfortunate woman and mother crazy than to try to understand the reason that prompted her to take such a desperate and drastic step. The authorities will now in every possible way deny their inaction or criminal anti-people action directed against a person, against people. The government is trying to whitewash itself”*. In another comment, the poster similarly had acknowledged that she/he is aware of the possible

⁵⁶ Dan Bilefsky, “Revolt in Kazakhstan: What's Happening, and Why It Matters,” The New York Times (The New York Times, January 5, 2022), <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/05/world/asia/kazakhstan-protests.html>.

⁵⁷ WION Web Team, “Explained: What Was the Cause of Massive Kazakhstan Unrest That Unnerved Prez Tokayev?,” WION (WION, January 13, 2022), <https://www.wionews.com/world/explained-what-was-the-cause-of-massive-kazakhstan-unrest-that-unnerved-prez-tokayev-444449>.

reasons or explanations why the tragic event happened, but anyway concluded that the government is absolutely to blame.

Some comments alluded to the former president, Nursultan Nazarbayev, saying that he should be ashamed for bringing the citizens of country to such misery or he should be tried for driving people in Kazakhstan to suicide. One user drew a curious parallel between the state of affairs in the country and the tragic case #2: *“Her husband's name was Nursultan. Irony of fate. Here you have entered the 50 developed countries.”* The last sentence is a sarcastic reference to the government’s propagandistic promise to enter the list of 50 most developed countries by 2015. It demonstrates that even a mention of the same name as the former president’s prompts people to make sense of the case through the lens of their exasperation with the authorities. Here the comment can be interpreted as a comparison of the deceased woman being driven to murder and suicide by her husband with the opinion that Nursultan Nazarbayev has caused the same kind of despair to the whole country.

In the discussion of people’s attaching anti-government attitude with the filicide-suicide cases, the idea that such acts as murder and self-murder are caused by external forces. The structural injustices in the social and political life in Kazakhstan are perceived as a sufficient factor to make someone want to kill themselves with their children. People connect shocking and tragic acts of violence and self-destruction with the systemic issues that they find the most pressing at the time, therefore a closer look at the way such discussions emerge and progress in the social media commentary might be very helpful in political and social science research.

4.7 The Financial Hardship Tension: “But I Had It Worse”

Although in the expression of negative feelings towards the government the commentators were almost unanimous, the debate around an adjacent issue of finances was quite polarizing. This is because people could relate the problems with poverty with their own lived experiences, and found that suffering from financial hardships cannot explain the violent acts of filicide and suicide. The debates usually emerged in the “reply” branches in the comments. Below is an example of such a back and forth argumentation.

“Absolutely everything in the country is getting more expensive, and even more so, the husband and wife lived in a rented one-room apartment with 3 children. If they had a normal standard of living, I think it would be unlikely that she would take such a step”

- *“We all lived in apartments. They should have found a cheaper apartment. Now everyone wants everything at once. Unfortunately, there are few people willing to work. I mean the father of these children. Yes, and the mother of these children could be asked to live in a cheap rented apartment. And now everyone on Instagram is posting their non-existent, well-fed and contented life. Everyone is out of touch with reality”*
- *“Don't judge, people. No one lived her life, and you don't know why it happened. How sad that this happened and is happening. The main problem is men who do not understand that women do not need much and mother-in-laws who think the bride is not a person. No need to get involved with your convictions, advice to your children, let them live as they want, and as they can. This is the main problem.”*
 - *“There is a way out of any situation, if you really want it. Only a schizophrenic is capable of this, she would feel sorry for her children, it's not for her to decide the fate”*
 - ...

This discussion not only demonstrates how structural factors (everything getting more expensive in the country) gets intersected with the notion of personal choice (the mother of children could have lived in a cheaper rented apartment), but also sheds light on the mechanism of people bringing up arguably unrelated concepts to the conversation. Commentator #3 brings up the involvement of mothers-in-law in the lives of brides to the dialogue about money, which is followed by commentator #4 talking about mental health issues. It can be deduced that, firstly,

the identified themes are highly intertwined in the process of making sense of filicide-suicide cases. Secondly, it shows that people prioritize one factor contributing to filicide-suicide above others.

4.8 The Gender Tension: Men, Traditional Values and Motherhood

A lot of attention has been paid to the husbands of the women in both cases, who, most of the time, were demonized and deemed guilty of driving women to suicide. As it could be seen in the example of discussion from the subsection above, people were likely to initiate talking about brides, and mothers-in-law quite offhand. This reflects the low, subservient and marginalized social status of daughters-in-law in “traditional” Kazakh families. Zhussipbek and Nagayeva (2021) who analyzed the family position and social status of daughters-in-law in Central Asia through the conceptual framework of international human rights principles, came to the conclusion that *kelins* (daughters-in-law) suffer from ‘structural oppression or systemic injustice, created and legitimized by informal, harmful traditional norms and practices’.⁵⁸ Many women in Kazakhstan can relate to this issue, and would find it as an acceptable and logical explanation of the reasons why a young mother would want to end her life. And the notion of being “driven to suicide” makes sense to the audience, because of the assumption that the woman in traditional Kazakh household has limited agency and is highly dependent on the surroundings. Thus, if something happens to the woman, there is always someone to blame.

⁵⁸ Zhussipbek, G and Z Nagayeva. Human rights of daughters-in-law (*kelin s*) in Central Asia: harmful traditional practices and structural oppression. n.p.: Central Asian Survey, 40(2), 222-241, 2021.

If the husbands were usually blamed and painted as villains in both cases, the attitudes towards mothers were different. The analysis above has shown that many condemned the women for suffering from mental illnesses or being sinners in the religious sense. Others, though, stated that they view the women as murderers, because a woman, who has maternal instinct by default cannot cause intentional harm to her children. If she willfully causes damage, that means she does not have the maternal instinct and there is something fundamentally wrong with her. This goes in line with the researchers, who, based on the attachment theory, claim that “filicide appears to originate from frustration building up as a response to the inability to bond with a child”.⁵⁹

Nonetheless, such attitude reflects only half of the story, since in both cases filicide was conjugated with suicide, which is associated with the so-called altruistic type of suicide as well as altruistic psychopathology. Those, in the comment section, who were sympathetic to the women’s actions often stated that they probably wanted to die by suicide with their children because they were, in fact, good mothers: *“sad as it may seem, but apparently the woman understood that there were no reliable people to whom to leave children, poverty and insecurity brought her to the brink of despair. Husband's relatives lie, they just protect their son”*.

The psychological research agrees with such sentiment, because maternal filicide was most often presented as a result of psychopathology “In the eyes of a mother suffering from psychiatric problems, killing her children means rescuing them from the cruel world, rather than causing them harm”⁶⁰. In the pathological category of filicidal mothers who are also prone to self-destruction, the driving force is altruistic motive. Thus, the notions of intention and

⁵⁹ Debowska, A, D Boduszek and K Dhingra. Victim, perpetrator, and offense characteristics in filicide and filicide–suicide. n.p.: Aggression and violent behavior, 21, 113-124, 2015.

⁶⁰ *ibid.*

structural pressure become intertwined here, since a woman desires to kill her children with herself, due to certain perceived structural issues.

5.0 Conclusion

To conclude, this study aimed at identifying the ways in which people make sense of the cases of familicide-suicide in Kazakhstan. Based on the analysis of 1000 comments left by users on news portals on social media platforms, a series of important themes was identified. These themes include the discussion of mental health; the negative attitudes towards authorities; financial struggles; religious sentiment and placing the blame on either the woman or her husband. The themes were conceptualized as “tensions” since regarding each of them there were strictly polarized opinions among the commentators, which demonstrates how the perception of suicide is a multi-faceted and sometimes contradictory endeavor. One exception would be the discussion of the government, since the overwhelming majority of users employed an anti-government stance and agreed that the poverty and lack of support from the authorities is a legitimate source of despair for many citizens in Kazakhstan. The structural issues, such as poverty, gender inequality in traditional households, lack of adequate mental health support resources, seemed to dominate the examination of the causes of filicide-suicide.

The current study opened numerous lanes for further research. Firstly, there is an urgent need to have a closer look at Kazakhstan's media resources' (inadequate) handling of triggering, sensitive and private tragic stories in the pursuit of sensationalist content. Secondly, the proliferation of the anti-government sentiment on social media one month prior to large-scale mass uprisings among populations can be an extremely generous area of political research.

6.0 Reference List

"Kazakh President Announces CSTO Troop Withdrawal, Appoints New PM".

RadioFreeEurope/RadioLiberty. 11 January 2022

“ ‘ Received Anaphylactic Shock Twice ’. The Mysterious Death of a Woman Who Jumped Out of a Window with Her Three Children. ” YouTube. YouTube, November 23, 2021. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DS-S2vwNKN8>.

““Екі Рет Анафилактикалық Шок Алған’. Үш Баласымен Терезеден Секіріп Қаза Болған Әйелдің Жұмбақ Өлімі.” YouTube. YouTube, November 23, 2021. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DS-S2vwNKN8>.

“Astana Resident Tried to Throw herself off the 12th Floor with her Child,” News | Caravan, October 23, 2021, <https://www.caravan.kz/news/astanchanka-popytalas-vybrositsya-s-12go-ehnazha-vmeste-s-rebenkom-784271/>.

“Астанчанка Попыталась Выброситься с 12-Го Этажа Вместе с Ребенком.” Новости | Караван, October 23, 2021. <https://www.caravan.kz/news/astanchanka-popytalas-vybrositsya-s-12go-ehnazha-vmeste-s-rebenkom-784271/>.

“Husband of Almatinka Thrown Out Window: We Lived Happily, But Were Unemployed.” informburo.kz, November 23, 2021. <https://informburo.kz/novosti/muzh-vybrosivshejsya-iz-okna-almatinki-my-zhili-schastlivo-no-byli-bezrobotnymi>.

“Муж Выбросившейся Из Окна Алматинки: Мы Жили Счастливо, Но Были Безработными.” informburo.kz, November 23, 2021. <https://informburo.kz/novosti/muzh-vybrosivshejsya-iz-okna-almatinki-my-zhili-schastlivo-no-byli-bezrobotnymi>.

“Woman who jumped out of a window asked for ASP in October but was refused,” informburo.kz, November 24, 2021, <https://informburo.kz/novosti/vybrosivsayasya-iz-okna-zenshhina-prosila-asp-v-oktyabre-no-polucila-refusal>.

“Выбросившаяся Из Окна Женщина Просила АСП в Октябре, Но Получила Отказ.” informburo.kz, November 24, 2021. <https://informburo.kz/novosti/vybrosivsayasya-iz-okna-zenshhina-prosila-asp-v-oktyabre-no-polucila-otkaz>.

Alder, C and K Polk. Child victims of homicide (Vol. n.p.: 32). Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Baxter, P and S Jack. Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. n.p.: The qualitative report, 13(4), 544-559, 2008.

Bearman, P S. n.p.: The social structure of suicide. In Sociological forum (Vol. 6, No. 3, pp. 501-524). Kluwer Academic Publishers-Plenum Publishers, n.d., 1991.

Canetto, S S.. She died for love and he for glory: Gender myths of suicidal behavior. n.p.: OMEGA-Journal of Death and Dying, 26(1), 1-17, 1993.

Carpiniello, B and F Pinna. The reciprocal relationship between suicidality and stigma. n.p.: Frontiers in psychiatry, 8, 35, 2017.

Chua, J L.. In Pursuit of the Good Life: Aspiration and Suicide in Globalizing South India. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2014.

Corrigan, P W., S B. Morris, P J. Michaels and J Rafacz. Challenging the public stigma of mental illness: a meta-analysis of outcome studies. n.p.: Psychiatric services, 63(10), 963-973, 2012.

Dan Bilefsky, “Revolt in Kazakhstan: What's Happening, and Why It Matters,” The New York Times (The New York Times, January 5, 2022),

<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/05/world/asia/kazakhstan-protests.html>.

Danilin, Nikita. ““On Earth Three Children Laid’. Why Women in Central Asia Commit Suicide Together with Their Children.” Mediazona Central Asia, November 26, 2021.

<https://mediazona.ca/article/2021/11/26/tiredoflife>.

Данилин, Никита. ““На Земле Три Ребенка Лежали’. Почему в Центральной Азии Женщины Идут На Суицид Вместе Со Своими Детьми.” Медиазона Центральная Азия, November 26, 2021.

<https://mediazona.ca/article/2021/11/26/tiredoflife>.

Debowska, A, D Boduszek and K Dhingra. Victim, perpetrator, and offense characteristics in filicide and filicide–suicide. n.p.: Aggression and violent behavior, 21, 113-124, 2015.

Durkheim, E. Suicide: A Study in Sociology. Glencoe, IL: Free Press. Translated by J. A. Spaulding and G. Simpson, n.d., 1897/1951.

Editorial. “Almaty Suicidal Sister Told About Her Husband: Mistress, Kids On The Side, Gambling.” Information and analytical portal Orda.kz, November 24, 2021.

<https://orda.kz/sestra-almatinskoj-suicidnicy-rasskazala-o-ljubovnice-ejo-muzha-azartnyh-igrah-i-dolgah/#part=1>

Редакция. “Сестра Алматинской Суицидницы Рассказала о Её Муже: Любовница, Дети На Стороне, Азартные Игры.” Информационно-аналитический портал Orda.kz, November 24, 2021. <https://orda.kz/sestra-almatinskoj-suicidnicy-rasskazala-o-ljubovnice-ejo-muzha-azartnyh-igrah-i-dolgah/#part=1>.

Geertz, C. The interpretation of cultures (Vol. n.p.: 5019). Basic books, 1973.

Giaxoglou, K. 'RIP man... u are missed and loved by many': entextualising moments of mourning on a Facebook Rest in Peace group site. *Thanatos*, 3(1), 10-28, 2014.

Goffman, E. Presentation of Self in Everyday Life. Garden City, NY: Anchor, 1959.

Gulbas, L E., C Hausmann-Stabile, S M. Luca, T R. Tyler and L H. Zayas. An Exploratory study of nonsuicidal self-injury and suicidal behaviors in adolescent Latinas. *Am. J. Orthopsychiatry*. 85, 302–314. doi: n.p., 2015.

Herring, S C.. Computer-mediated discourse analysis: An approach to researching online behavior. n.p.: Designing for virtual communities in the service of learning, 338, 376, 2004.

Jaworski, K. Suicide, Agency and the Limits of Power 1. n.p.: In *Suicide and Agency* (pp. 183-202). Routledge, 2016.

Kantchev, Georgi. "Kazakhstan's Elite Got Richer on Natural Resources. Then Came the Unrest". The Wall Street Journal. ISSN 0099-9660. 7 January 2022.

Karlsson, M M.. Agency and patiency: Back to nature?. n.p.: Philosophical Explorations, 5(1), 59-81, 2002.

Kitanaka, J. Depression in Japan: Psychiatric Cures for a Society in Distress. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2012.

Kral, M J.. Suicide as social logic. n.p.: Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior, 24(3), 245-255, 1994

Lester, D. Suicide and islam. n.p.: Archives of suicide research, 10(1), 77-97, 2006.

Lillis, Joanna. "Kazakhstan: Shoot to kill protesters, orders tough-talking Tokayev". [Eurasianet](#). 7 January 2022.

Meszaros, K and D Fischer-Danzinger. Extended suicide attempt: Psychopathology, personality and risk factors. n.p.: Psychopathology, 33(1), 5-10, 2000.

McCombs, M. A look at agenda-setting: Past, present and future. n.p.: Journalism studies, 6(4), 543-557, 2005.

Mueller, A S., S Abrutyn, B Pescosolido and S Diefendorf. The social roots of suicide: Theorizing how the external social world matters to suicide and suicide prevention. n.p.: Frontiers in psychology, 12, 763, 2021.

Nikunen, M. Murder-suicide in the news: Doing the routine and the drama. n.p.: European journal of cultural studies, 14(1), 81-101, 2011.

Penn, D L., K Guynan, T Daily, W D. Spaulding, C P. Garbin and M Sullivan. Dispelling the stigma of schizophrenia: what sort of information is best?. n.p.: Schizophrenia bulletin, 20(3), 567-578, 1994.

Perry, B L., B A. Pescosolido and S P. Borgatti. Egocentric Network Analysis: Foundations, Methods, and Models. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. n.p.: n.p., 2018.

Pescosolido, B A. and S Georgianna. Durkheim, suicide, and religion: Toward a network theory of suicide. n.p.: American sociological review, 33-48, 1989.

Quinn, F, M Prendergast and A Galvin. Her name was Clodagh: Twitter and the news discourse of murder suicide. n.p.: Critical discourse studies, 16(3), 312-329, 2019.

Stack, S. Suicide in the media: A quantitative review of studies based on nonfictional stories. n.p.: Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior, 35(2), 121-133, 2005.

Staples, J. Personhood, agency and suicide in a neo-liberalizing South India. n.p.: In Suicide and Agency (pp. 27-46). Routledge, 2016.

Tower, M. A suicide epidemic in an American Indian community. Am. Indian Alaska Nat. Ment. Health Res. 3, 34–44. doi: n.p., 1989.

Zhussipbek, G and Z Nagayeva. Human rights of daughters-in-law (kelin s) in Central Asia: harmful traditional practices and structural oppression. n.p.: Central Asian Survey, 40(2), 222-241, 2021.

WION Web Team, “Explained: What Was the Cause of Massive Kazakhstan Unrest That Unnerved Prez Tokayev?,” WION (WION, January 13, 2022), <https://www.wionews.com/world/explained-what-was-the-cause-of-massive-kazakhstan-unrest-that-unnerved-prez-tokayev-444449>.

Suicide in the world: global health estimates (No.WHO/MSD/MER/19.3). n.p.: World Health Organization, 2019.